

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

MICRC

20240221-1000 Meeting

Captioned by Q&A Reporting, Inc., [www.qacaptions.com](http://www.qacaptions.com)

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: I can hear you. Good morning.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Thank you Commissioner Lett, it looks like we have a quorum present so I'm going to begin the live stream so just giving everyone a heads up. And Madam Chair I will give you a thumbs up when we are ready to begin.

>> CHAIR ORTON: As Chair of the Commission I call this meeting of the MICRC to order at 10:03 a.m. This Zoom webinar is live streamed on YouTube on the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission YouTube channel.

For anyone in the public watching who would prefer to watch via a different platform than they are currently using visit our social media at redistricting MI.

Our live stream today includes closed captioning. Closed captioning, ASL interpretation Spanish, Arabic and Bengali translation services will be provided for effective participation in this meeting.

E-mail us at [redistricting@Michigan.gov](mailto:redistricting@Michigan.gov) for additional viewing options or details on accessing language translation services for this meeting.

People with disabilities needing other specific accommodations should also contact [redistricting@Michigan.gov](mailto:redistricting@Michigan.gov). This meeting is being recorded and will be available at [www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC) for viewing at a later date.

This meeting is also being transcribed and those closed caption transcripts will be made available and posted on the [Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://Michigan.gov/MICRC) website and written along with written public comment submissions.

There is a public comment portal at [Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://Michigan.gov/MICRC).

Members of the media who have questions before, during or after the meeting should direct those questions to Edward Woods III, Executive Director for the Commission at [Woods E3@Michigan.gov](mailto:Woods E3@Michigan.gov) or 517-331-6309.

For the public watching and the public record I will turn to the Department of State to take note of the Commissioners present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Good morning, Commissioners. That sounds better. Commissioners, please say present when I call your name. If you're attending the meeting remotely, please announce during roll call where you are attending the meeting remotely and unless your absence is due to military duty announce your physical location by stating the County, City, Township, Village and the State from which you are attending the meeting remotely.

I will begin alphabetically with Commissioner Andrade?

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Callaghan?

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: Present attending remotely from Mexico.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Curry?  
Commissioner Eid?  
Commissioner Kellom?  
Commissioner Lange?

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Present attending remotely from Reed City, Michigan.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Lett?

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Present attending from Lee county, Florida.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Muldoon?

>> MARCUS MULDOON: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Orton?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Szetela?  
Present attending from Wayne County, Michigan.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Vallette?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Wagner?

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Present attending remotely from Eaton Township, Michigan.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Weiss?

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Madam Chair, there are ten Commissioners present. You have a quorum, thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much. As a reminder to the public watching you can view the agenda at [www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC). I would now entertain a motion to approve the agenda.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: So moved.

>> CHAIR ORTON: It's moved and seconded that we approve today's agenda is there any discussion on the topic? Seeing none just a minute all in favor of approving today's agenda raise your hand and say aye.

>> Aye.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Any opposed raise your hand and say nay.  
The ayes have it and the agenda is approved.

Without objection I will ask MICRC Executive Director Edward Woods to present the purpose of the public hearing today. Please proceed, Mr. Woods.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Thank you, Chairperson. Let me take the opportunity to share my screen. All right. Good morning, Detroit. Good morning. We are very excited to be here at the Greater Grace Temple and we would be remiss if we did not thank Bishop Charles H. Ellis, III, for his gracious hospitality in having us here so that we can have great parking, great opportunity from 10:00 a.m. to 8:00 p.m.

to hear directly from those impacted by the reconfiguration of maps as mandated by the Court. We want to extend our heartfelt appreciation and gratitude to Bishop Ellis and the church and his team. His event team led by Veronica Phillips for allowing us to be here. And at this time if we could just give a round of applause.

Bishop Ellis, as a point of personal privilege, we would like you to provide greetings to the Commission and our audience that is here and coming later today.

>> Thank you so very kindly. Can you all hear me? Thank you so kindly to the Commission and all of those that are in charge and in authority. I certainly welcome you to Greater Grace Temple, the City of David. We call this our home, and we certainly hope you will feel the hospitality. We tried our best to roll out the red carpet so that you have everything that you need and all the accommodations that are needed for this event for today and make this your home for today and for this event. God bless you.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Thank you so much, Bishop Ellis. Appreciate you. Also I'd like to acknowledge the southeast Council of Government, City of Detroit Neighborhood Department, our community organizations where we were able to go into the community to provide presentations, our civic leaders, as well as the volunteers who are with us today for making this public hearing possible. We just want you to know that we are very, very, very, very interested in hearing from each and every one of you as it relates to public comments. For those who are coming in person, it is still not too late for you to come to Greater Grace Temple and to sign up and ensure your voice is heard. I want to remind you we are here from 10:00 to 1:00 and taking a lunch break from 1-2 and here from 2-5 and take a dinner break from 5-6 and then conclude in our evening session from 6-8. In 2018 Michigan voters passed proposal two a ballot initiative for voters and not legislatures to take responsibility for nonpartisan redistricting and created the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission. It's comprised of 13 randomly selected Michigan residents which includes four democrats, five independents, and four republicans.

The Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission is responsible for redistricting the U.S. Congressional, the Michigan House, and the Michigan Senate districts only. We are not responsible for Wayne, Oakland or Macomb as relates to the county redistricting process. Or the redistricting process that takes place within the City of Detroit. We only have the Michigan State House, Michigan State Senate, and the Congressional districts.

The redistricting criteria, unlike in the past, was based upon the Apoll standards. The Apoll standards focused on keeping County, City and Township boundaries whole. In the new redistricting that took place in 2021 there are seven ranked redistricting criteria. Seven ranked in other words we have to follow that in order as listed on your screen. One equal population in the Voting Rights Act. Two, geographically contiguous. Three, reflect the state's diversity and communities of interest. Four, no disproportionate advantage to any political party. Five, no favor or disfavor to an incumbent elected

official or a candidate. Six, reflect consideration of county, City and Township boundaries and then, seven is reasonably compact. The Commission does not have the authority or the luxury to change this seven ranked redistricting criteria at all. It has to focus per the Constitution in this order. The western Michigan Court southern division had a filing from the Agee case where it found the Commission drew maps focused on race in violation of the 14th amendment, the equal protection clause, and disenfranchised Black voters. I want to be very clear, there was no finding regarding the Voting Rights Act. As a result of Court ordered the Commission to reconfigure State House District 1, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12 and 14 and not focus on race. The Court told the Commission not to focus on race. As a result we did not do our voting rights analysis until the end of the process as relates to the 9 collaborative maps. We were specifically told do not focus on race by the Court and want to be very clear with you how this process has been followed why should you care about redistricting? It's a chance to make sure your voice and your community's voice is heard. As I shared with you on the slide the third ranked criteria is reflecting the state diversity and community of interest. When we talk about community of interest we are talking about historic characteristic, refer to neighborhoods. So many times in the past neighborhoods were broken up to keep County, City and Township boundaries together. In this process keeping the neighborhoods whole is more important than keeping county, City and Township boundaries together. We also have cultural characteristics, many of you know the Mena population we have the largest Mena population outside of the middle east in the Dearborn area. The Mena population is not considered a race. However in our redistricting criteria they do share cultural characteristics. Mena being middle east and north Africa. And so, therefore, in the redistricting process they are able to be kept whole as a community of interest.

And then last but not least economic interest which deals with the waterfront. It could be an art District. Whatever the economic interests may be we are able to keep those communities whole and in the redistricting process that is now the third ranked redistricting criteria whereas in the past none of them had voices of the past. They do have a voice and a criteria in this new redistricting process. Redistricting keep your community together. You know our tag line has been show up speak up. Show up speak up. On behalf of our community we encourage people as you see the info graphics to make sure that they provide comments on our public comment portal or mapping portal which is located at [www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC). Redistricting will help make sure your elected officials reflect your values on important issues such as healthcare, education, public safety and justice. That is why keeping communities of interest whole ensures a better representation not just for you but also for your community.

Why we are here. We are here to hear directly from you regarding the nine draft proposed maps and the one individual map. We want to understand what map best

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

represents you and your community of interest as is or with minor tweaks. We want to learn from your feedback to select the best map in compliance with the Court order and the seven ranked redistricting criteria. Public comment guidelines. You have up to 90 seconds to speak. Whether you are in person or remote. You address the Commission as a whole and not an individual member. According to our rules and procedures, any person making personal, impertinent or slanderous remarks or who shall become boisterous or disruptive while addressing the commission may be requested to leave the microphone.

If any person disrupts the orderly progress of a meeting, sorry about that, I clicked too soon, or refuses to comply with applicable MICRC guidelines and rules, the Chairperson may rule that person out of order and/or order their removal from the meeting. We want to thank you in advance for complying with these guidelines because we know it's more important to make sure voices are heard and then to have a chaotic and a disorderly process which we do not expect at all.

Show up speak up we want to encourage you to show up and speak up. You can like and/or follow us on Facebook, Instagram, Twitter or TikTok and subscribe to MICRC YouTube channel and those who may not be able to come to make public comment either virtually or in person submit comments at [www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC). If you have any questions or need additional information you can call 1-866-map fair. That is 1-866-627-3247 for questions or more information. Once again we thank each and every one of you for coming whether you are in person or virtual and look forward to your public comment. Thank you. Chairperson, turn it back over to you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you Director Woods.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Excuse me we would like to acknowledge the entrance of Commissioner Eid.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: And Commissioner Kellom is on as well I believe, Ms. Young.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Kellom, good morning if you could share where you are attending from remotely.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Attending remotely from Wayne County. I will be there momentarily, just as a doctor's appointment so good morning everyone.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay, so individuals who signed up and indicated they would like to provide live or remote public commentary to the Commission will now be allowed to do so. We will start with live public comment first followed by remote public comment in chronological order. You will have 90 seconds to address the Commission. Please conclude your remarks when you hear the timer. First to provide public comment is number one.

>> Good morning to the Commission. My name is Reverend Dr. Steve Bland, junior pastor of the Liberty Baptist church here in Detroit, Michigan and past president of Baptist pastors here in Detroit. Welcome this opportunity to share remarks with you. On today as you have come into the community I spoke when you first were formed, and I do still appreciate the fact that we as citizens voted this Commission so that you become the voice for our people in regards to how redistricting ought to be done. The voice is done through voting. In our democracy is counted through our census but done in equitable lines. I challenge you then some four years ago about making sure that that is done equitably in our community. And I just want to say in the brief time that I have here today that as this process has been opened again I'm not sure exactly how the differentiation is being made between community of interest and race and things of that nature, but I do know this: I know in our community we've gone from 12 Black representatives in the House to 6. I know we have gone from two senators to none from two Congressional representatives to none. From 17 persons representative being decreased is a concern for too many of our citizens. We've had people in this African/American history month we celebrate who had great history and representation to die for our citizen community. Do the right thing and make sure we have equitably represented this community the 7 Districts that have been challenged. I am Reverend Steve Bland and I thank you for this time.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number two.

>> Good morning.

I'm Dr. Jabilani. I live in Brightmore here Detroit, eastern Brightmore and I'm leaning towards the Motown sound configuration would be my first choice. The second choice would be Spirit of Detroit. I'm looking, I did consider-race somewhat with the history involved, long discussion. In looking at those choices. Thank you. Better? Or can you hear me? How so those come to mind first. Also on the computer looking at the screen I had difficulty figuring out where I lived and where I fit on the configuration. I'm not sure if I'm in District 4 or District 16. Because the streets and things are not clearly shown. And if you live near a freeway or something there is a division line may be unclear as to what the proposed District one could live in. So it's kind of vague. So is there any kind of way which if I gave my address I would be for certain whether or not I'm in District 4 or District 16?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Yes, if you go back and see the gentleman. Ryan will you wave? If you go see him he can help you put in your address and see exactly what District you are in.

>> Thank you, that's all I have thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: And that goes for anyone here. If you go back and see Ryan back there, he can help you with that. Thank you for addressing the Commission.

Number three.

>> Good morning Commissioners. My name is Sarah Ismal and live and work in the City of Dearborn and on behalf of access. I will ask that the Commission keep our community of interest together, so our community is St. Arab American community with more broadly Middle Eastern north African communities and these communities are and not in Dearborn or Dearborn Heights but Melvindale and pockets of Detroit. So this community of interest has a lot of shared similarities in terms of ancestry, heritage, culture, language. Even all facets of daily lives and share that we are invisible like one of the Commissioners was stating. With that invisibility we are able to enter the community of interest is not only a community of interest, correct? So the inequities our communities face and we don't have a Mena category we appear white with the U.S. census and it's hard to have equal representation when it comes to redrawing the maps. We are asking the Motown sound maps keep just enough of our community of interest together and not diluting it and asking Melvindale be added to District 3. It's one of the communities that has a lot of similarities across Dearborn, Dearborn Heights and part of our community of interest. So I was hoping to show the map that we were able to do that. So we were asking that Motown sound map be there. But along with Melvindale attached to it and I hope the Commission takes that into consideration when looking at the map again. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number four.

>> Hi my name is Kara Love, live in Oakland County and here with access and here to talk about the Mena and as you have heard this community of interest lives in Dearborn, Dearborn Heights, West Detroit and Melvindale and other parts of the state and Arab access serves and Metro Detroit is the largest concentrations and is unique in diversity successes and challenges. It's one of the oldest Arab American communities with roots back to the 1890s and we as access receive more Arabic immigrants than almost any area in the country. This is the largest community in the country as you heard because we are not captured in the census it's left out of the redistricting and we like the Motown sound map and community of interest and would like to request Melvindale go to District 3 and it shares cultural and linguistic characteristics so thank you for your consideration today.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Numb five.

>> Good morning.

My name is Mariam and live in Dearborn I'm here today to advocate that my community of interest be kept together. Arab Americans and more broadly the Mena communities are under counted in the U.S. census making the process much more difficult for our community to demonstrate the size and needs of the community. My community of interest primarily lives in Dearborn, Dearborn Heights, West Detroit, and Melvindale, as well as other parts of Michigan such as Hamtramck, Livonia, Canton and Ferndale. Leaving our community of interest together ensures we are able to quantify needs. And it would further ensure that they develop programs that meets the needs of the

communities can stay intact and use the Motown sound map for community of interest in the draft House map. We would also like to advocate for Melvindale to be added back to District 3 and remain a part of our community of interest. Thank you for your time.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 6.

>> Good morning.

At this point you guys probably know all the statistics and fun facts about Arab Americans in the U.S., but I'll say it again just in case you missed it the first 200 times. Hello, my name is Ahmed and work in Dearborn and here to advocate my community of interest is kept together. I'm asking that the access communities of interest are kept together which are Arab Americans, Middle Eastern and north African communities. Metro Detroit is home to the largest and most diverse Arab American and Middle Eastern and north African communities in the United States. It is. Our community of interest primarily lives in Dearborn, Dearborn Heights, West Detroit, Melvindale and other parts of Michigan including Hamtramck, Livonia, Canton and Ferndale. And again without a fair count of our community and the U.S. census we are constantly invisible and not factored in the process of redistricting. I urge you to please consider the Motown sound map which provides enough consideration to our community of interest, and can you guess it, we would also like for Melvindale to be added back as a part of our community of interest. The Commission will determine the representation that COI will have for the next ten years. And the generational impacts it will have for our future. Please take the time to redraw the House maps, thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I got a quick question for you, sir. Hey there. And this could go to any of the last speakers, but so Melvindale has about like 12000-ish people. So if we were to add Melvindale back to District 3 we need to take out about that same amount of people for population. And this is in the last few speakers where would you recommend taking that population from? Like what part of Dearborn?

>> That sounds like a great question. When I have an answer I'll get back to you.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: That could be something y'all put on our website.

>> Absolutely. We will get you that answer.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Number 7.

>> Hello, Commission, my name is Delany and work in Dearborn and Arab American myself. The diverse Arab American community and broadly more Mena populations trace their ancestry to different countries and dialects and religions and socioeconomics. As Edward says there is much diversity in this community it's still a community of interest within the Mena population through shared ancestors. Using the best available data from the U.S. census American community survey we demonstrated a picture of the unique community as a result of dis-aggregating the Arab and Mena community from the white racial category. Findings indicate 43% of Arab/Mena ages



25-64 live in poverty with 8.4% that are unemployed. Arab Americans and Mena individuals have distinct experiences. Data on Mena obscures such as disadvantaged communities in the Metro Detroit area. I support the Motown Sound map which provides enough consideration in keeping our community of interest intact but would also like again as people have said for Melvindale to be added back in and remain a part of our community of interest. Please take the time to draw the House maps and it will affect our representation for community of interest. I will also get back to you about the question that was asked right before this.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you. Number eight.

>> Hello, my name is Shams and work in Dearborn, and I did have something prepared but because of Commissioner Eid's question so as you all know I personally have been to this Commission several times even beforehand. And advocating for our community of interest. A community interest map we had submitted unfortunately that community of interest was not represented in the maps that we now are here to speak about. So what I'm advocating for the Motown map it's not the best map for community of interest it's also a map that will break our community but in addition to that that is why we are here to also encourage you all to go back to the map and if you are able to look at our community of interest map we had submitted initially, ensuring that Melvindale was part of that. As others have alluded to because Mena individuals are not counted in the census you are not able to see the data. We are actively working and engaging the census and hoping we can see that data in 2030. But we do we currently are also working with the office of management and budget to also see the numbers of Mena individuals in the State of Michigan so that being said out of these maps we are -- I personally support the Motown one in the sense if we are able to add Melvindale in. Our greatest push would be keeping District 3 and 15 together but I know if that is not feasible we would encourage you to look back at the maps and see how we can include the community of interest that we have been advocating for. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number nine.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Is there a number nine?

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: They may have stepped out for a moment so we might come back to them.

>> CHAIR ORTON: All right, so and we will move on to our remote public comment and we will come back to the in-person if they come back in. I will call on your name and our staff will unmute you. If you are on a computer, you will be prompted by the Zoom app -- to unmute your microphone and speak. If you are on the phone a voice will say that the host wants you to speak and prompt you to press star six to unmute. I will, okay, also please note that if you experience technical or audio issues or if we do not hear from you to 3-5 seconds we may move on to the next person and return to you after they are done speaking. If your audio still does not work, you can e-mail [redistricting@Michigan.gov](mailto:redistricting@Michigan.gov) and we will help you trouble shoot so you can participate

during the next public comment period or a later meeting. You will have 90 seconds to address the Commission. Please conclude your remarks when you hear the timer. First to provide remote public comment is James Gallant.

>> Hello, can you hear me?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Yes, we can.

>> All right. Thank you very much. This is James Gallant, Marquette Suicide Prevention coalition. These are my opinions. And to the Commission as a whole, of course, I'd like to personally apologize to you folks in Detroit, you know, the Plaintiffs, you Black folks in Detroit. You were done wrong. And shenanigans. This is the shenanigans I'm talking about. Some people just don't want to follow the rules. And that is the biggest problem here. You are all in my community of interest as self-identified as the complete border all the way around Michigan, everybody. And the only way to protect everybody all at the same time is for the Commission to follow the rules, the Robert's Rules of Order, based on our U.S. Constitution and House of Representatives. And in Michigan, our common law, parliamentary common law in America. Now, Madam Chair, I appreciate that you have started the discussion about this Robert's Rules and everything at the last couple meetings here. And I would ask you to continue that with me so we can flush this out a little bit because when you were first convened, Mike Brady, director of legal services, instructed you that you, the Department of State, that you must follow Robert's Rules of Order. So not only you but the people of the State of Michigan. Our due process is that you have to follow Robert's Rules of Order. Motion second, discussion, vote. Every time and make sure of that. Even your facilitation rule says you can facilitate it while it's before the Commission, while there is a motion with properly supported for a specific action. You don't even have...

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Next in line is Chris Andrews. Please wait a moment for our staff to unmute you.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: That participant is not currently present.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay, then next in line is Anthony Scannell.

>> Thank you, Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission so much for the opportunity public hearing today. My opinion being in District 1 currently, I would say, no, to the Tulip map. I would say yes to many of the maps, but I would say no to Tulip because of it splits southwest Detroit in District 1, not very good. On a different note I would say make Taylor whole again, the City of Taylor. That can be done on any map that you choose. It's a good idea. And you've gotten so much public comment about it you don't want to disregard all the public comment you have gotten about Taylor. Third point I would say please drop the costly Supreme Court litigation. It's going nowhere. You and I both know. And point four, you still have the same political affiliation as when you filled out the application to be on this Commission four years ago. I think we have about three Commissioners who have waded in since I put it in

Spanish inquisition are you still a democrat, a republican or independent because that depends if you are qualified to sit on the Commission, thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Do we have number nine in person? In the room? Is there anyone else that signed up for in-person public comment that hasn't spoken yet? I don't see any. So perhaps we will wait and see who else enters.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I would encourage everyone in this room and see a few people who have not spoken yet and now is the time. I mean, this is it. It's the time to have your voice heard. We have those maps in the back. I really recommend every single person in this room go check them out. Go look at where you live on those maps. And then once you take a look at them, you know, I would love to hear about what you think. But this is the opportunity. Let's make it happen.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Why don't we take a ten-minute break and perhaps by then we will have more public comments. So we will turn at 10:50.

[ Recess until 10:50 ]

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioners attending remotely while we are on break you are more than welcome to remain on mute and to turn off your video. Thank you.

[ Recess until 10:50 ]

>> CHAIR ORTON: It's time for us to be back from break but we have quite a few folks in the room looking at the big print outs of the maps so I want them to be able to continue doing that and we will come back up and take public comments. But feel free to keep looking at the maps and discussing. For those that are here in person if you had a chance to look at the maps in the back or perhaps talk to Mr. Taylor in the back and you wish to make public comment now you can go out to the sign up table, sign up for public comment and then we will call on you. And please do. We would love to hear from everyone in this room. Okay so we do have some more in-person public comments so is number ten in the room? I don't see them. Number 11. Oh, are you number ten? Are you number ten?

>> Yes.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you.

>> Hello, everyone, my name is Zana and I live in Dearborn, and I want to keep my community of interest together. The Arab American and Mena communities in Michigan are the largest and diverse they have ever been concentrated in Dearborn and heights however our community of interest primarily lives in Dearborn, heights West Detroit and Melvindale and Hamtramck Livonia Canton and Ferndale. We have been in Southeast Michigan for the last 50 years. I urge you to continue to do your work adding time to your schedule to redraft the House maps. Please consider the access community of interest map which provides enough consideration to our community of interest. If Motown would move forward we would like Melvindale to be added back and part of the

community of interest. Commissioners you have the ability to draw District lines and maps that influence Michigan State. And the national landscape for the next ten years. We urge you to consider the representation of these communities that will shape their future. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 11.

>> Good morning.

My name is Charles Thomas and I'm the founder and director of the voter turnout organization. When you vote I win. The organization is built on the story of two of my aunts who are 14 and 16 years old trained by John Lewis and his members of Snick in '64 and '65. Participated in the process in marches in Selma that resulted in the signing of the Voting Rights Act. So as an individual as an organization we are fully vested in the Voting Rights Act. But along with the Voting Rights Act, we lean into the language of the 14, 15 and 19th amendments that we are to afford all citizens of age the right to vote and are the support for, and not just the VRA, but the Supreme Court, one person, one vote theory. So with that in mind this Commission cannot walk away from this process having believed they have done their jobs, if they accept any map that strips away the power of the individual vote. You cannot walk away believing that you have done your job if you return Michigan to its decades long recent history of any party that receives the least amount of votes walking away with the most seats. The maps to be considered Motown Sound is the best performing and both VRA compliant because does worse on partisan fairness.

it can be improved addressing the east side of the map in a few districts. Lastly I will say for the record the most evident proof of what is desired in the democratic process is casting your ballot for it. 30 to 40% and topping out at and celebrating 50% is not Selma worthy stuff. Prove what you want by going out and voting for it.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 12.

>> Good morning. I am Valorie Kendall I'm the mayor of the City of Harper Woods.

And I want to ask that the Motown Sound or the Spirit of Detroit will be the best consideration for our community because we share school districts, water, infrastructure with those communities that we are connected with. So those would be the best maps on changes for our community to continue to be the thriving community that we are. Because we not only share those school districts and water infrastructure, we also share mutual aids with those cities. So to separate us and put us in a whole different light would make it ever be -- it would be cumbersome on our community to be divided and are thinking the Motown Sound and the Spirit of Detroit will be the best for my community. Harper Woods and the Grosse Pointes, thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 13.

>>Hello, my name is Stan Hobbs. And I would just like to voice my vote for the Water Lily map because just like the people from Dearborn were saying they share a culture;

people of Detroit also share a culture. And the Water Lily map seems to keep that intact. So I would go for the Water Lily map. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Is there a number 14 in the room? Okay it looks like we don't have any more in-person right now. So I would invite anyone in the room who hasn't spoken to go out and sign up and speak to us. We would -- we see a few people we have not heard from. We would love to hear your thoughts. And otherwise we will just wait and see if we have anyone else. We have about a half an hour until Noon. Feel free to go back and look at the maps some more or talk to Mr. Taylor that's in the back with the computer. He can help you look up where you live and your community. So we have some people who have asked for a second public comment. And I believe that our rules say don't allow for that right now. Because we allowed for that just during the town hall. But this is a public hearing. So I would like to make a motion that we allow for public comment to be three minutes long and there can be a second public comment, after all the first public comments have been shared.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: I will second.

>> CHAIR ORTON: So a motion and a second. Is there any discussion on that motion? Commissioner Callaghan, it looks like you have a thought? Okay no discussion or thoughts on that? Okay then can we have a roll call vote?

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Absolutely Madam Chair. Commissioners, you have the motion before you to allow for second public comment after the first public commenters have had the opportunity to speak and to move the commenter's time to three minutes. Do I have that correct Madam Chair?

>> CHAIR ORTON: And this just applies to public hearings.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: This just applies to public hearings thank you. If you are in agreement with the motion, Commissioners, affiliate that by saying yes and if you are not in agreement please share a no. I'll call Commissioners in order starting with Elaine Andrade?

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Donna Callaghan?

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Juanita Curry? Anthony Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Brittini Kellom? Rhonda Lange? Steve Lett?

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Marcus Muldoon?

>> MARCUS MULDOON: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Cynthia Orton?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Rebecca Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Janice Vallette?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Richard Weiss?

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: We have nine yes votes, the motion carries.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Commissioner Wagner, yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: I'm sorry, Wagner? Commissioner Wagner?

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Thank you. That makes ten.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much. Okay so I'm not sure of the process. I'm not sure if you get a new number or not. If you need to go back out and sign up can the Secretary of State's office help us know the procedure?

>> YVONNE YOUNG: We are going to ask you please go back out if you would like to speak again and grab another number, that helps us to keep up with the accommodations and help us to learn how many more we have as second commenters, thank you so much.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you. I see people going out to sign up again. I would just like to say if you spoke the first time and didn't quite have time to get all your thoughts out or looked at the maps and have something else to say please go out and sign up. Speak to us again. Is number 14 in the room? Is there a number 15 in the room? Again Reverend brand pastor of liberty church and I have first again in another round so thank you for the second bite of the Apple I had to leave the first time because I had a member of my church that passed away and needed to be with his wife so I talked and spoke about everything other than the map I was in favor of. So thank you for allowing me another opportunity to come back to finish my statements in that regard. Again, I do commend the Commission for hoping with the opportunity, I share the first time around about my concerns about the diminution of representation particularly in the Detroit community and looking at the maps on the Motown Sound map appears to me to be the map that I believe has the best opportunity for configuration that might help to reserve the integrity of what might help to restore and preserve the things that I think might be helpful for people who are particularly in the Detroit area to be adequately represented. I do know that the shape files and everything that goes along with that has to be looked at. I do wish that we had the opportunity to offer other map opportunities. Again, I'm not sure what community of interest versus race really means. I believe Section Two of the Voting Rights Act suggest we have protections we would like to see activated so we might have accurate representation in the state, House and Senate and our Congressional work. So again if you would accept the Motown Sound map as my recommendation as a map to work with I appreciate the work you all put into it. I know it's tedious work and appreciate the work and please understand in the meantime those

of us who are represented in the Detroit area with pride and distinction would like to make sure we maintain the integrity of the representation we had and give our children in the future to be adequately represented.

I would like to see my granddaughter to run for a seat that represents the interest of the community she lives in. Thank you for the second opportunity to speak, thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing us again. Next 16.

>> 16, 16.

>> I can't hear too well, and I thank you very much for having this opportunity to speak once again as I stated before I'm the mayor of the City of Harper Woods. And the configurations of the map of Motown is the best one for our community because as I've stated before we share mutual aid. We share school District and we share and the culture of what we do in the Harper Woods and Grosse Pointe area we all work together and I think that this configuration for the Motown map is the best map for our community to have representation and to also continue to improve the quality of life for all of us in that area. So I hope that you would take this in consideration because it's very important to all of us to have to stay together. And I appreciate you. Thank you so much for your service. I know it's been a tough job for you guys. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much for addressing the Commission. 17.

>> Good morning my name is Karen green I'm a Detroit resident and a precinct delegate a Black club president and all that fun stuff I appreciate and echo what others have said, all of your diligence in the maps, I like the maps back there better because I can actually see much better than I was trying to see on my computer. I like Motown Sound map. And from the District on the map of 16 it looks like most of what we have currently, just asking if possibly it could refer and pick up some of the other area going and I forgot the number you have back there but going back towards the Detroit area and also looking at District 10 that includes Harper Woods suggesting if maybe that could be moved in District 12. And I think that is all of my suggestions. Hopefully Motown Sound will be the selected map. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 18. Oh, Commissioner Kellom?

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: I was trying to raise my hand really tall since I'm so tall. Joke, I'm not, I'm 5'3". I had a question for you, you asked, and I know you said you didn't remember the number that was listed for Motown Sound. But you were talking about the Redford area, can you just repeat?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Could you come to the microphone so people online can hear?

>> Looking back there on the Motown Sound map, it looks like the number 16 that you have it looks like it caps in Livonia. And just asking if possibly it could cap in Redford and pick up, I don't have my little notes, and pick up some of the other area above, going towards Detroit. I actually have to see it to tell you again.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Okay, no, that is fine.

>> Some people sound like they really studied it, but I didn't.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: District 10 adjusting Harper Woods.

>> Yes Harper Woods to all right where is my wonderful little note? Adjusting Harper Woods.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Could we show that map? Mr. Morgan?

>> Is it going to look like the one on the wall back there?

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: It will go to this screen.

>> I know but I really I wish my computer had picked up all of that.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Yeah.

>> So cap Livonia and ending at Redford in 16 and then the, okay, so the Harper Woods suggesting that Harper Woods can be moved into District 12 along with where the Moss, Yorkshire Woods and Morning Star, East English Village.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Okay, thank you for that clarification.

>> That would help me. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you Mr. Morgan. Is there a 18? Okay then I think that's all of our second in person that are in the room right now. So then we will move back to the virtual public commenters, second time. And I will ask Sarah Reinhardt to call those names because I'm not sure who has signed up.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Thank you Madam Chair we have one participant who requested to speak for a second time virtually and that is Mr. James Gallant. Please allow us a moment to unmute you.

>> Hello, can you hear me?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Yes, we can hear you.

>> All right. Thank you. James Gallant. These are my opinions. And you know to the Commission as a whole, of course, first I'd like-to-echo the past commenter wanting to verify your political affiliations. We asked this dozens and dozens of times and you simply will not answer. And I have to force this to Court so your lawyers will like that. But taxpayer money is at stake here. I don't think that you folks get to actually identify as affiliating with a voting membership organization like a political party. You are either a voting member or you are not. You are affiliated with a vague to determine who affiliates with them. And it's interesting that even a political party has come out to speak about this at all. And comment about this, has been dozens and dozens of times and still identifying, I think the secretary of state slipped in identifying as affiliating. Kid of like, you know, I don't know. You know, the other thing about that, and the part about the Secretary of State, she is not here today. And I saw in the transcripts and Mike Brady suggested that as the Secretary of State we, I said we will provide you with support. Well, the Secretary of State is not a we, unless, of course, she self identifies and her pronouns are they, them. And then the past tenths of that would be we. And I don't think that is it though. The Secretary of State without a vote is not Sarah Reinhardt, office of the Secretary of State, and not anybody else. And we need to get



with Dr. Nancy Wang because she is the one who wrote. I think this is disingenuous for the Voters Not Politicians to say that, you know, following the people made the amendment. They didn't. But ten people who voted signed this language, and that is the board of directors of Voters Not Politicians as a nonprofit corporation. And this is Dr. Nancy Wang. And she did this on purpose. And must have forgot the part about if you don't put a designee in, you can't have a designee. So this is completely wrong. So can we just, Madam Chair, keep with the part about when you said as the Chair you said that Robert's Rules of Order is not in the constitutional amendment, it's not. But Mike Brady, the director of legal services, specifically instructed you and the Secretary of State that you must follow Robert's Rules of Order. And that was agreed to by the University of Michigan, Michigan State University, Gecko, Grossman, Dr. Wang at Princeton, all of them have agreed in the orientation materials and that is why it was presented to you that way, you must follow Robert's Rules of Order under our Constitution. Now, I think that you are pushing me to get another yet petition, amendment to the Constitution just saying we have to follow Robert's Rules as common law in America and Michigan. And I think I'm going to be starting that as, you know, as a project of the suicide prevention coalition because this is the problem. It's the abuse. It's in real time abuse of people's rights to vote. You say hearing no objections puts the onerous on member to object. The one always is objecting. I see Commissioner Lett. The look in his eyes right now, oh, yeah, objection again as you ignore the community what is being brought to you as a community and choosing...

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Our second public comment participant for the second round of public comment is Anthony Scannell, Anthony allow us just a moment to unmute you.

>> Thank you so much. I see I hear the Melvindale issue come up and you know I've said you know what I've said, I'm in Melvindale everyday but I really don't -- wouldn't mind which way it goes. But I think you made good decisions with it either way. And you've heard from both sides. I'll just be in the middle there on that question. But I was looking at the portal and Michigan-mapping.org the public comment portal submission C1510, I think it was a visual representation of that access community that was providing comment earlier. I really appreciate Mr. James Gallant's public comments. I think his citations of what has happened and maybe what should happen I think there is right on, the very detailed citations. So I appreciate that always Mr. Gallant and I would like to draw attention back to the question of what does it mean to be affiliated with a political party under this constitutional amendment because you can't be like an elected party officer, say, I don't know county vice president, county Chair, county treasurer of your party, would that even go so far as to include you can't be a precinct delegate? So then by what measure are you affiliated? I guess you could -- that could be checked in the public record if you have donated to candidates. Well you can donate to candidates of both parties, major parties so I think it's a flawed thing. But that's all I have.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: That concludes our current requests for a second round of public comment.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you. I'm up to number 18 for in-person. Is there anyone in the room who -- you're 18? Oh, and you spoke your second time, so we are up to 19 then in the room. Is there anyone that I haven't called on that did sign up for first or second.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Ma'am, were you number 18 for signing up for a second public comment? Okay, and so you would like to speak again? I understand. Okay.

Okay, so it's her second public comment and she's number 18, so she hasn't.

>> CHAIR ORTON: You have not spoken twice already?

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: No she has not unless I'm mistaken.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Twice. As far as I know everyone who wishes to speak has been able to speak twice. Anyone else is welcome if they have not already spoke twice just go sign up out at the table and you will be able to speak to us. Until we get more that wish to speak, feel free to look at the maps. Ask questions of Mr. Taylor out there. With his hand raised. And we will be here, waiting.

So it looks like we have 15 minutes before our lunch break and there is no one else in the room that wants to make a comment. We do have a little bit of business that we can take care of. So I will turn some time over to Executive Director Woods.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Thank you Chairperson we are here as a part of the director's report, if there is something that comes up business wise we will take care of the time we have. We are grateful for Sarah Reinhardt if you remember starting the mapping process and putting it together Sarah is the one that took the lead and did a Yoman's effort of initiating the first round of mapping we did in 2021 for the 2022 election cycle and she has continued to assist us with regards to the mapping process and procedures regarding the reconfiguration of the 7 districts for the House. And so at this time Sarah will lead out in the discussion with regards to that and we just want to thank her and continue to recognize the extraordinary contributions she provided with the mapping process policies and procedures so Sarah Reinhardt thank you on behalf of the Commission and at this time we will turn it over to you.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Thank you Executive Director Woods.

So Commissioners, today we will be reviewing this document that I'm screen sharing right now, which is the 2024 procedure for this election of House maps. This document is based on the 2021 mapping process document. This Section, the last Section of that document, the adoption of maps so we kind of have taken part of that process and modified it just a little bit to fit what you are you are doing now to select a House map to submit to the District Court pursuant to the District Court's order in this case listed here.

And so just to kind of kick us off as you all know the final remedial State House map will be submitted to the District Court no later than March 1st, 2024, so that is the timeline that we are working on. So I'm going to go through and if you all have any questions feel free to raise your hand or comment and I can take questions as we go.

And just as a reminder I know that Executive Director Woods communicated this in the e-mail we are, or you all are not voting on this today. I'm just presenting it for your awareness, and I believe it will be on the agenda for a vote tomorrow. Great.

Okay so these are the dates next week which you all selected or voted and approved for this process to take place. And the maps that you will be considering during that time are the ten maps, the draft proposed maps which are along the back of the wall here. So these are the maps that you will be choosing from, for which one to submit to the Court. And this is an important piece here during this election process you all have the ability to modify these maps based on what your attorneys classified as logical outgrowth of public comments received. Definitely sounds like an attorney wrote it there. But what it's saying is what you all hear during the public comments here if you want to make adjustments based on that, you are able to do that.

So this is really where we get into the process of what the days next week are going to look like for you all. So this is really just a recommendation for you all prior to the meetings to take a look at the beautiful maps that you all have here, familiarize yourself with them, if you are taking notes during the public comment period or the public hearings today and tomorrow, then we view those notes, just make sure you are ready to go next week. And then here is the procedure for the actual like review and vote for the maps.

So the Commission Chair or Vice Chair will facilitate an overview and discussion about all of the collaborative maps, so those will go first. And kind of like you all did during the deliberations, during the mapping sessions, you will just go through each of them, talk about each of them. And during this overview and discussion the Commission, by majority vote of members present may vote to amend one or more proposed draft maps so that is the process you would make any edits you want to make based on public comment you received. And after reviewing and/or making any minor adjustments to each map the Commission Chair or Vice Chair will also facilitate a discussion offering the opportunity for each Commissioner to talk about which maps you prefer. So which maps are your favorites? And why? So you can have that discussion.

This is a little bit different, this part here, just a conversation about which maps you prefer and why. It's a little bit different than what you did the last go around. The last go around it was more of a formal process where someone made a motion for each Commissioner to state their top two preferred maps. And so you would go around and just state the name of your top two preferred maps for the record. So I really wanted to kind of pose the question here today if you would prefer to do it that way we can do it

that way or if you would rather have it be an informal discussion that is on the record we can go that route. Does any Commissioner have a preference or a thought on that?

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: This is Steve Lett. I think we should -- I like this informal for a couple reasons. It's kind of what we do anyway according to Mr. Gallant so I would not want to disappoint him.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Thank you, Commissioner Lett. Does anyone else have a thought on that?

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: This is Commissioner Kellom. I too agree with the informal discussion format because I think it speaks to the importance of the process and in a genuine way we have very thorough discussion, and it does not create this type of like bottleneck of forced voting in any sort of weirdness that could take place by trying to nail down your top two maps. I think it will be more decisive if we are able to discuss and we can have shared thought leadership in the maps that we are choosing.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: All right thank you Commissioner Kellom. Okay, so the next step after discussing the maps and reviewing them for the public benefits and talking about your preferred maps will be the actual vote itself. So once we move from the discussion the vote will occur in this format. The Commission Chair or Vice Chair will call for a motion for the secretary to conduct a roll call vote and the motion would be for the Commissioners to vote for a final remedial State House plan to submit to the District Court and Commissioners will vote stating the name of their preferred plan to submit. So when we go around each Commissioner would just state the name of the map that they would want to adopt. Does that make sense?

Great. And then the secretary will record the votes and will confirm if any plan received a constitutional majority. So what is a constitutional majority? Just as a review, the Constitution provides for the criteria, the threshold really for any approved map to meet during a vote for it to be considered adopted. And what that looks like is at least two Commissioners who affiliate with each major party voting in favor of a map and at least two Commissioners who do not affiliate with a major party or we can refer to it as the two two two vote. So that is two Commissioners who affiliate with the republican party would need to vote in favor of a map. Two Commissioners affiliated with the democrat party would have to vote in favor of a map and the independent. If there is no initial vote we will repeat that discussion and voting process twice more so there will be three initial round of voting. If no map constitutes a third constitutional major the third time that is when we move on to the ranked choice vote which is described in the Constitution. So I'm going to pause there. Does anyone have any questions? Not seeing any so I will move on.

So if no map achieved a constitutional majority for the first three rounds of voting, the Constitution describes that you would move on to a ranked choice vote. I want to be clear here that the Constitution doesn't say you need to vote three times and then move on. It just says, I'm paraphrasing here, if it fails to meet that threshold you would need

to do a ranked choice vote so doing it three times is something we would recommend as the Commission like doing it a substantial amount of times to before moving on. Does that make sense?

Okay, seeing nodding.

So the ranked voting, how would that work? As the secretary we will call on each Commissioner in rotating alphabetical order for each Commissioner to audibly indicate the draft proposed map they would like to submit for the ranked choice vote. So we would call on each one of you and you would let us know which map would you like to vote on for the ranked choice. Each Commissioner may submit one draft proposed map for consideration. And more than one Commissioner may submit the same draft proposed map. So if you like the same map as the Commissioner sitting next to you and you both want to submit the same map you are welcome to do that. The secretary will record which Commissioner has submitted which draft proposed map. And the Commissioner's corresponding party affiliation. This ties into a constitutional requirement which I will go into just a moment so if you are wondering why we have to do it, I will explain it in just a second.

So next I will pull up a Microsoft form, which is a kind of survey software. And I will live share my screen while I'm creating it to input the names of the plans that each of you submitted. And then I will send you all the link to the plan via e-mail and you will be able to rank them in your order of preference with number one being your most preferred and then the final plan submitted being your least preferred and you will submit that. And then if any Commissioner is unable to access the form for any reason, maybe you are joining by phone because you have Internet issues or something like that you would audibly relay to me over the Zoom, which what your preference is in ranked order. So each Commissioner will have ten minutes to complete the form and submit it. Obviously if you need more time we can definitely accommodate that. But we will start with ten minutes. And after ten minutes has passed, and we have the results of the ranked choice vote, I'll read the results of each Commissioner's vote for you to audibly confirm publicly what your preferences are. So I'll go through everyone's votes and then we will read the result of the vote.

So this italicized text is directly from the Constitution. So it states that each plan shall be assigned a point value inverse to its ranking among the numb of choices giving the lowest ranked plan one point and the highest plan point value equal to number of plans submitted so if there is 14 plans submitted your first-choice map will get 14 points.

The Commission shall adopt the plan receiving the highest total points so I'll add everything up on an excel spreadsheet then I will share that excel spreadsheet so you can all see it and so members of the public can see it. And we will be able to see which plan received the most votes. And it also prescribes like a threshold kind of here for the ranked choice vote as well. So it has to be ranked among the top half of plans by at least two Commissioners not affiliated with the party of the Commissioner submitting the

plan or in the case of a plan submitted by nonaffiliated Commissioners is ranked among the top half of plans. By at least two Commissioners affiliated with a major party. So this piece here from the Constitution is why we have to do that initial part with Commissioners submitting a plan that they want to be voted on. Because it has to meet this certain threshold based on the Commissioner that submitted it.

So finally I will announce the results of the ranked choice vote. And share that spreadsheet so everyone can see. And we will know which plan has won. Now there is a slim possibility that there might be two plans tied for the highest point total. And the Constitution states what should happen if that occurs. So it does say that if that is the case, then we would move on to a random selection of the final submitted plans. And we would schedule that with an independent accounting firm. And that is something that would be handled by the state no later than February 29, 2024. And then finally in this document I just included all the constitutional language on the adoption of a map so you can see it for yourself if you want. And, yeah, that's the whole document. I know that was a lot. Does anyone have any questions?

>> CHAIR ORTON: I don't see any questions. Nate Fink?

>> Nate Fink: Hi everyone. I don't have a question, I just wanted to make a clarifying point just on that last point that Sarah made there and first of all thank you Sarah for presenting this. And I think it's unlikely we get to this point but if there are two maps in the ranked choice voting process that are highest ranked then I believe the Constitution says that the secretary will do a random selection between those two. If none of the maps meet the constitutional criteria under the ranked choice voting process, and none of them are selected through that process, then the secretary would do a random selection of the maps that were submitted for the ranked choice voting process. So I think there are two different things. And that is I think provided for in the document that Sarah was presenting but I just wanted to clarify that point. I think it's unlikely we get to that, but just wanted to clarify that point.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Thank you, Mr. Fink.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay is there any other questions or comments? I don't see any. It is now 1:00. That is our scheduled lunch break. And so we will come back at 2:00 for more public comment.

[ Recess until 2:00 p.m. ]

I think we had public comment come in person, if you raise your hand if you signed up for a public comment? No, I'm just seeing we have a scheduled lunch break that we publicized from 1-2 so I'm just seeing if we have time to take these public comments before we leave for lunch. So looks like there is four of you so I think we are on number 19. Is one of you number 19? Okay go ahead and speak. We will take these four and then we will go to lunch.

>> Good afternoon. My name is Racy precinct delegate for precinct 248 and I had an opportunity to view some of the maps in the back and the best map that I see fit, that would work would be the Motown Sound.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Madam Chair I apologize but our scheduled break from 1-2 and looks like our interpreters have taken a break right now so I'm not sure if it's recommended for us to proceed with public comment without our accommodations.

>> CHAIR ORTON: I see, thank you. So I'm sorry, we did hear your comment but, yeah, we are not able to continue during this break time. So you will be first in line when we come back. At 2:00.

[ Lunch recess until 2:00 p.m. ]

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay we are back from break. It was a break, not a recess. Do we need to call roll, Sarah Reinhardt? Okay will you please call the roll?

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT:

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Good afternoon Commissioners if I call your name if you would be kind to say present so we can continue with roll call. If your present location has changed as you are attending virtually.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Pardon the interruption can we get quiet in the room while we are calling roll for just a minute. Sorry about that. Folks in the back of the room. I apologize for the interruption we are taking roll call, and we need to hear the Commissioners if we can quiet in the room for just a moment, thank you so much.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: I will start again good afternoon Commissioners when I call your name please say present. If your physical location has changed if you are not here in the room with us please share that information so that our roll call may be accurate. I will start with Commissioner Andrade?

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Callaghan?

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Curry?

Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Kellom?

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Lange?

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Lett?

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Muldoon?

>> MARCUS MULDOON: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Orton?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Vallette?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Wagner?

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Weiss?

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Madam Chair there are 12 Commissioners present. You have a quo um thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much we will resume with our in-person public comment and I believe we are at, well, number 19 shared with us but I believe that the interpreters were not present is number 19 still here?

>> Good afternoon. Are you number 19? All right I'm sorry, and before we start that we do have a press take for those that weren't here this morning so we will have a short presentation then we will move on number 20.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Good afternoon and welcome to the Michigan independent redistricting citizens public hearing we are so happy to have each and every one of you today and we want to go over a brief purpose with regards to why we are here and we are doing this at every break so we provide an orientation to the meeting knowing that people are coming from different backgrounds and may not share the same common knowledge, we want to kind of bring people up to speed.

I'd like to express our appreciation to Greater Grace Temple and Charles H Ellis the third today with regards to this wonderful facility. We appreciate the entire team what has gotten together to ensure your comfort and ability to provide public comments in a safe and secure environment. I'd like to thank Veronica Phillips, who is the event coordinator for Greater Grace Temple for all the work she has done and her team in setting up this public hearing. We would like to appreciate the southeast Council of Government to provide a presentation to the Commission. The City of Detroit neighborhood department. The various community organizations over the last month where they have allowed the Commissioners, our team to come either in person or in virtual to speak. I'd like to thank our civic leader, Council President Mary Sheffield, Council Member Duhall and others across the City. Fannie Lou Hammer and others who allowed us to come in and present whether there was a formal presentation or during the coffee hour. We greatly appreciate that. And we would like to thank the volunteers who are helping outside with regards to processing public comments in terms of registering people to speak and asking questions for people that come in. This is really a total team effort as relates from the Commission standpoint we would like to express our appreciation to each and every one of them.



The history, in 2018 Michigan passed proposal two, a ballot initiative for voters and not legislatures to take responsibility for nonpartisan redistricting and created the Michigan independent citizens redistricting committee. The Commission is comprised of 13 randomly selected Michigan residents which includes four democrats, five independents, and four republicans. The MICRC is responsible for redistricting the U.S. Congressional districts which are 13, the Michigan House Districts which are 110, and the Michigan Senate districts which are 38. We are not responsible, I repeat we are not responsible for the redistricting that is taking place within the City of Detroit or any county redistricting efforts.

The redistricting has seven ranked criteria under the old standards, the Apoll standards, they really focused on county, City and Township boundaries but in this new legislation there are seven ranked redistricting criteria that the Commission is required to follow. It is not optional where they can make number seven important or number four important or number two. They have to follow it in this ranked order. The first is equal population and the Voting Rights Act. The second is geographically contiguous. The third reflects states diversity and communities of interest. Four, no disproportionate advantage to any political party. Five, no favor or disfavor to an incumbent elected official or a candidate. Six, reflect consideration of county, City and Township boundaries. And number seven be reasonably compact.

Recently the western Michigan District Court of southern division found that the Commission drew maps focused on race in violation of the 14th amendment the equal protection clause and disenfranchised Black voters. I need to repeat there was no finding regarding the Voting Rights Act at all. The Court ordered the Commission to reconfigure State House districts 1, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12 and 14 and not focus on race. In other words, the Commission was given the directive to draw race blind maps. To draw maps that didn't focus on race even though the first ranked redistricting criteria was equal population and the Voting Rights Act.

Why should you care? Redistricting is your chance to make sure your voice and your community's voice is heard and represented. When we talk about communities of interest, in terms of your community's voice we are talking about three things in particular. Historical characteristics, cultural characteristics, and economic interests. When we speak about historical characteristics we are really speaking about neighborhoods. In the old method they were so concerned about keeping county, City and Township boundaries together that they split up neighborhoods. And neighborhoods is really what represents you. And identifies your needs and concerns in choosing your representation. In this new method the third ranked criteria reflects state's diversity and communities of interest. The historical aspect relates to neighborhoods. There's also cultural characteristics. In particular the Mena population the Middle Eastern north African population we have mere here in the Dearborn area than any other place outside of the middle east. They are not considered in the census

because they are deemed white and so they want their own community of interest, and they can do that in this new redistricting process.

So culture characteristics would be Mena or LGBTQ or anything along those lines with regards to the culture characteristics. The next thing is called Commissioner interesting. Commissioner interests refers to waterfront property, it could be an art District, it could be a business District. But we are trying to keep those communities at whole in this redistricting process. So when we say redistricting keep your community together, that's what we are talking about. And that's why it's so important and with are glad each and every one of you are here to hash tag show up, speak up. Last but not least when you are taking a look at this information as redistricting it will help make sure your elected officials reflect your values or important issues such as healthcare, education, public safety and justice. And we believe by keeping communities together you will be able to elect representation that has the same common interest as you do so therefore we are very happy you are here to show up and speak up.

Why we are here. We are here to hear directly from you regarding the nine draft proposed maps and the one individual map. We want to understand what map best represents you and your community of interest as is or with minor tweaks. We want to learn from your feedback to select the best map in compliance with the Court order and the seven-ranked redistricting criteria.

Public comment guidelines. I want to share with you that you have up to 90 seconds to speak. You have up to three minutes to speak. Only once or? Okay, it's your lucky day you can speak up to three minutes, one time and then you can come back again and speak for another three minutes on the same day. So if you want to come and speak three minutes now, three minutes later, sign up and come to Second Ebenezer and do three minutes there and three minutes you can have 12 minutes to ensure your voice is heard. You have to address the Commission as a whole and not an individual member. Now we are here professionals and want to hear from you. We need this back-and-forth dialog so please address the Commission as a whole because the Commission is the one that makes the decision as a body, not as an individual member. Anybody making impersonal natural or slander remarks or boisterous or disruptive addressing the Commission, you may be requested to leave the mic, the phone. Once again this is a professional meeting and want good conversation and interaction and the Commission may ask you and that does not count with your three minutes, it won't count at all but they may ask you some follow-up questions so let's make sure we have good dialog as we help them with regards to the map.

Number four if any person disrupts the orderly process of a meeting or refuses to comply with applicable MICRC guidelines and rules, the Chairperson may rule that person out of order and/or order their removal from the meeting. This is like a last-ditch effort. This is not something we want to do but we want to put it out as part of our rules and procedures, so people are aware of what the consequences are. Nevertheless we

believe we will have a healthy meeting and have an engaging meeting and we are eager to hear from you, so we just thank you in advance for complying with these guidelines.

I want you to show up and speak up. "Like" us or follow us on Facebook, Instagram Twitter or TikTok at redistricting morning subscribe to the MICRC YouTube channel submit public mapping comments to the [www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC) or you can call it 1-866-map fair, 1-866-627-3247 for questions or more information. If you have or need any assistance with regards to seeing a map or identifying what District you're in, I would like Ryan in the back to wave his hand, Ryan is here to answer the questions for you and show you right on the map where you are there are nine maps behind you of the collaborative maps and one individual map. We want to thank you for taking time out of your schedule to show up and speak up to ensure your voice is heard as the Commission deliberates at what best map could be great for the 7 reconfigured Districts that the Court is ordering us to remediate. Thank you so much for being here and without further ado we will turn it back to the Chairperson, Cynthia Orton.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you, Director Woods. So individuals who have signed up and indicated they would like to provide live public comment to the Commission will now be allowed. We will start with the live public comment first, the in-person. And then that will be followed by the remote public comment so you will have three minutes to address the Commission. And please conclude your remarks when you hear the timer go off. And we are going to start with number 19 because I think they are back.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: No.

>> CHAIR ORTON: No?

Okay, we thought they were back. Okay number 20.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: What was your or what.

>> CHAIR ORTON: What is your number in red, 21 if there is no 19 or 20 we are going to 21.

>> Thank you. Good afternoon to all. My name is Michelle Thomas. I'm a proud UAW member as well as a proud Detroit. I stand here in support of the Motown Sound map. I believe it is a good map that shows great representation for the voters in Detroit, and we do depend on maps for fair and balanced representation. As we know in 2018, the voters we all made it clear that we wanted maps to reflect our communities. And I once again stand in support of the Motown Sound map. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 22.

>> 22? No? 23? Good afternoon, right? Good afternoon Commission. I'm Nicholas barns, 29 year resident of Detroit. I'm a special Olympics basketball coach. Soccer coach. With the Detroit public recreational department and advocate in my community. I'm very passionate about the Districts in Detroit to make sure we get Black representation we need and partisan fairness if you look there is not a lot done on the partisan fairness, let's get the best Black districts in Detroit. Looking at the maps

honestly believe the Motown Sound is one of the better maps that has been drawn. But I do believe there are some edits that can be made to make those districts a little more VRA compliant at least the population on there. One of the biggest things I seen about the map that should be changed but was good on the Detroit is to keep the lakeshore together Harper Woods and Grosse Pointe should be drawn together because they share school systems that are vital to the communities and if they express having those two together I think that is something you should take into consideration.

Also in District 1 I believe we can beef up the numbers in District 1 and make that over 40% as long as you move around certain pieces inside of the Motown Sound map. I plan on drawing a new map tonight combining the Motown Sound and Spirit of Detroit maps and submitting for you all to see. So besides that one of the issues that I had just from a more technical side is that when I go to your beautiful website and try to download shape files I have an issue with the Motown Sound shape file. I'm not allowed to put that spot into the program that I'm using. I wanted to see is there a way to get that file that I can use or a better version because the other nine files work but that one doesn't work I don't know if it's something on my side.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Why don't you go talk to Ryan Taylor that is in the back and he should be able to help with that.

>> Another thing that concerned me is what happens to the data you are collecting on the new map form me I think it was a lot of sensitive data I had to get out just to share my voice about my community. I feel I should not have to give my address and my phone number and I'm really concerned where the data goes and who has the data because we live in a day and age where data is the new gold and I would not say it's a violation of people data or privacy rights but I just feel that is a lot of sensitive information to collect from people just to come and just tell you hey you drew my neighborhood wrong. So I don't know if this can be changed in the further process, but I like the way you did it on the comment portal where a person put a name and an e-mail and call it a day. I feel the new common system is kind of intrusive for people and may turn people off from engaging in the process. Thank you for your time and good luck.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for that comment. I believe Secretary of State can talk to that.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Thank you Madam Chair. Sir, I would note that for signing up for live public comment in person we don't collect any information. So if someone was asking you for personal information, oh, you mean the online sign up. Some of the additional sign up like an e-mail address is required so you can -- we can send a link for you to join the Zoom meeting to your e-mail address. But that information is only used for that purpose. And it's retained by the Secretary of State's office who is the secretary for the Commission. Yeah so the additional information that's requested on there is something that you can provide if it's like an optional thing to

provide. Oh, I see what you're talking about. We can connect offline and talk about it but thank you, I appreciate it.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission and bringing up those questions. Number 23. 24.

>> Good afternoon distinguished Commissioners. We are very, very honored to have you in the City of Detroit. I know you're going on the east side tomorrow as well. I think this is a great opportunity for citizens to voice their opinion on things that concern us. Commissioner Woods that was a great introduction. Culturally I'm here to represent culturally the City of Detroit. A 62-year-old Black man 48235 District I live and I'm about four minutes from my House and my business, my business is American rack we make storage systems to keep guns away from children. Big issue and I'll be working on that with you, the state that is. At the end of the day the maps is the key. They used to be done in closed rooms with none of us in there, that had any type of representation to explain what could and could not happen. Now we have an opportunity to make a difference, I charge each one of you to think about not only yourself but the children of other people, not like yourself, who have to live with the decisions that you make. When you draw Districting lines, you determine who is going to represent us in Lansing and Federal representation. That is very important. We left British or Britain because of that, you know. You cannot have representation and not be representing all the people so I hope that you know this meeting today touches each one of your hearts and lets you do things that you might not want to do but, you know, a spirit came across you and said, hey, I should do the right thing. We can't control everything. But the things we can control we try to do. We are about change. You know, ten years ago you didn't think that Uber was important or masks or Lysol then it became very important. Things change in one day but when you draw these new lines could you please consider that little children who can't say anything about anything are counting on you to do the right thing so they can grow up healthy just like the children you are around, and you grow up around. We cannot always have a us and them mentality. In 2024 and beyond tribalism has become horrible and we cannot get caught up into that to the extent that right is not right and wrong isn't wrong. In closing I'm just going to say that my goal is to protect children from firearms. That's what my lifelong mission is. You will find out about me by looking at my shirt. However, I will not state my name. I came in person, so I didn't have to give all my information online. I drove four minutes to get here. And I hope that my message resonates with you. At the end of the day, God looks at what your motives are. Remember that. And I'm really grateful to talk to each and every one of you. You seem like a great group of people, and I hope you draw the lines properly. I looked at the maps just today and it looks like I like the river walk and the Motown map the most. So thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission, sir. Number 25.

>> Hello, my name is Loretta Hill. I live in 48235 and lived there since 1973. I'm a retired nursing supervisor. And the first time I saw the maps a couple years ago I was totally outraged because it was divided like a pizza with the widest portion of the pizza slices all located in the suburbs around Detroit. Which rendered Detroit completely impotent. Now, I sent a letter in, and somebody invited me here. But Detroit is the largest City in Michigan. Whether you like it or not. I'm sorry. Okay, and we need representation and as far as I'm concerned you need to put your felt pen down on 8 Mile and telegraph and you need to draw a Black line all the way to the river. Everything south of that 8 Mile is Detroit. And everything north of it can take care of their own business. And I don't care how you divide up Detroit. I'm in far northwest corner. I will share my opinion with people down on west Chicago and Tireman or wherever in Detroit, but I want to maintain the integrity of Detroit and I don't want it diluted by red lining, period. And I feel a lot of people in Detroit feel that way. We didn't make 8 Mile. We didn't create it. 8 Mile was created in the 1920s and 1930s because of red lining. It's there, it exists, you have to live with it, and we want to maintain our integrity in Detroit. My issues are Detroit. I don't want a representative from Mount Pleasant or Royal Oak or Ferndale. However, I like Ferndale, I spend a lot of time in Ferndale but I want somebody from Detroit to represent me with my problems. And my problems are the same as somebody down touchdown in DeQuindre and West Chicago Boulevard and somebody on the west side on Plymouth road, but not somebody in Ferndale as much as I like Ferndale, thank you.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Ms. Hill, I don't know what your time looks like, if you have already done this then just throw it back in the Lake that I'm getting it from but if you have some time can you share, and this is Commissioner Kellom, I'm the one talking to you right up front.

>> Okay, right here.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: It's me talking.

>> Looking over here.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: No, it's okay if you could look at the maps that we have.

>> There are to maps that almost maintain the integrity of 8 Mile.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: I want to know.

>> One is willow.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: You like willow.

>> It only crosses over I think Ferndale I think a little bit it crosses over in Ferndale and maybe they just crosses over a little bit but you got to maintain that 8 Mile.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Go back and look again and speak again if you have a chance. Thank you, Ms. Hill.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you, okay number 26.

>> Good afternoon. My name is Lucinda Kyles. I'm a concerned involved and committed voter in citizen of House District 5. And I did work on the Voters Not Politicians campaign and circulated petitions because it matters to me that there is a voice of the people dividing things and not the public coparties going back and forth. So I wanted to say today after looking at the maps first of all, secondly I guess I'll say thank you all for all the work you're doing. And I can only imagine how hard and time consuming it is. But I really do appreciate each and every one of you being willing to do this hard work. And I would ask that you would adopt the Motown Sound map because I think this map best addresses the concerns of fair and accurate representation of all and it would also be in compliance with the Voting Rights Act I think. So that we wouldn't have to go through this yet again. I think it's properly compact. I think it doesn't go very far above 8 Mile as I looked at it, across the lines. And I just want to wish you all well and hope that you can draw, redraw if the courts have something that remains or becomes even more fair and representative than you were able to do before. And holds to the principles that were outlined in that lovely presentation that you did for us at the beginning. So thank you again.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 27 or were you 27? I get confused with the numbers. 27.

>> Number 27 here. I'm really glad you gave us an extra minute because I just want to tell you how much we appreciate what you're doing. And how much work it is. It's just amazing. And I know when we started on the redistricting project four years ago no one could envision we got to this point. So just please know that I'm giving each and every one of you a hug. And glad that you're here and thank you very much.

I'm Nina-Abrams from Huntington Woods and I've been paying attention to redistricting now since you guys started. I am urging the adoption of Motown Sound map. It's constitutionally fair, impartial, transparent in application. It has good -- it has good lines around cities and counties, but it also crosses the border in some senses. I was critical of your crossing the border before. And I apologize, I was wrong. I thought the experience of the last two years in crossing the border gave us a sense of regeneration and introduced us to new neighborhoods and new friends. So I'm glad that there is some pureness around 8 Mile but I'm also glad in about three or four situations you cross 8 Mile and mixed it up a little bit. I think that's good.

For me, personally and Huntington Woods you have kept in Motown Berkeley school District together where Huntington Woods and Berkeley we have the same safety thing. We have the same school District. And we share the same downtown. Among the maps, I think that Motown Sound is the best balance of your 7 criteria, partisan fairness, equality, VRA standards, common sense contiguous borders. Good job. And you keep communities of interest together. I've heard other people talk about that. And I think that's a very positive thing.

And I want to say that the authors of this map who worked together collaboratively, thank you. You did a great job in listening to the Detroit voices. We have the most districts for minority voters to have a representation and fewer split county pizzas. And I'm really hoping that we use a Commission map and not a special master map. And I think that Motown Sound is the map that is most likely to pass in the courts.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for your comments. Number 28.

>> Good afternoon. It's a pleasure and an honor to stand before you. A couple years ago I stood before you and I was really disappointed. But today I am proud of the work you have done. You may or may not remember but I asked the Commission to do the right thing. I was talking about a took a line from spike Lee's movie and you have done the right thing. Now this order that we draw these districts is done on December 21st by three Federal judges. I'm not saying you guys didn't want to do it, but you were mandated to do it and again I want everyone to understand the power of the people. The power of your vote. Because we have not said anything, and Chary and her team would not have said anything we would have the maps. So understand the power of voting. I want to take another movie Claudine and in the move they said mama I feel invisible, that is how we thought invisible and overlooked and ignored and taken advantage of our good nature and our culture. You diluted, not you personally but the people that drew those maps diluted our political power that is why I point day-to-day we honor a great man who was assassinated Malcolm X that we do the work because right now historically and today maps in Michigan and around the country are flawed. Fatally flawed. But we as a people, as Detroiters, will never stop fighting. We don't have to prove our worth. We just want what belongs to us an unalienable right to vote the Constitution does not have anything in there guarantying the right to vote, that came from the Supreme Court with the 18th amendment 1868 after the civil war and people are enslaved to get them equal protection under the law. But the trickery continues counting pennies or beans in a glass jar or crafty maps drawn by a sword it continues. Gerrymandering or bad decisions however you want to define it the people have suffered. Because of that struggle to not accept us to respect us we are not invisible. We rise. We rise in honor of our ancestors and provide for our children and celebrate them. So on behalf of the CBTU and the president Michael Joseph of the Detroit capacitor of the coalition of Black trade unions we support the Motown map because it's clear and transparent and it's honest and gives people an opportunity. Folks your vote is important. A year ago you asked for the amendment to become law, you can vote early please vote. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 29.

>> Hello teams of Commissioners. Good afternoon the team of the Commissioners of Michigan. Thank you for this opportunity to stand before you and to have the opportunity to voice my opinion on, not my opinion but to speak up. And my name is Nora Simmons and I'm a retiree and a homeowner. And I'm addressing the sanitation,



you know. That part. Today as I was coming down here, I saw a truck, you know, the garbage truck, this is our pickup day. And a truck was filled up and as it was going the trash was just blowing all over. What was the point of picking up the trash when you still are the trash going all over the place. Not only that when they are coming to caught, you know, vacant lots and so forth, they cut with over the trash and the trash is just torn up in pieces and still scattered all over the lot. What's the point? If you're going to cut the grass, you are supposed to make it look decent and trash is all over the place. And so I just wanted to bring this to your attention that when you are re -- you know redistricting, you know, the place, you know, the areas that you do not just think of just the affluent neighborhoods, just trying to put all of them together and leaving out the weaker, you know, areas of the Detroit. We have, you know, a billboard or used to to say keep Detroit beautiful. But yet, you know, you're not, you know, doing the job that should be done. It would be done in Grosse Pointe. You know, I'm not blaming the employees, the truck drivers or whatever because I don't know what their issues are or what they have to go through. But, you know, maybe they don't have enough trucks to, you know, just go and, you know, they are filling them all the way up and they just you know it's out of their control. So we should have enough trucks, you know, so that they can do their job without, you know, just having a mess going about. So any way when you are redistricting, I think you should consider taking the, again, the you know, the affluent neighborhoods with the weaker neighborhoods, put them together so that there will be some respect when they come to do their job that they will say oh, you know, they will, you know, when they say that the trash is going everywhere that they will, you know, not do that or go back and reload or whatever they need to do. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON:

>> Oh, and by the way, my choice is Motown map. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission.

Number 30.

>> Good afternoon. My name is Cheryl Thompson Marsh I'm a homeowner in the City of Detroit. And I also worship in the City, and I have concerns that we continue this process in a fairway that you will operate in integrity. The voters spoke and we asked for you. And now we are coming before you today to remind you that we have some needs and some of those needs are to keep neighborhoods together. To make sure that people who live and work together in their communities are also able to have representation that represents them. And so I do want to support the map Motown Sound. I see that it offers some of the things I'm most concerned with and I would just remind you as you deliberate that you consider the comments that have been made here today because representation does matter. And we all know and have heard that taxation without representation is just not fair. And so we are just asking for you to have a fair process as you deliberate and the selection of the maps and also adhere to what the courts have mandated. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 31.

>> Hi good afternoon, hello Commissioners. My name is Lori Leesy. I'm not a Detroiter, I live in Huntington Woods and I'm in a District that it will be affected in many of the maps that you have drawn because we are right next door to some of the districts you need to redraw. I also wanted to echo that I really appreciated the presentation you guys did before. I thought that was very well done and brought everybody up to the same level of knowledge.

I want to thank you for your very hard work. And I'm here also to speak in favor of the Motown Sound map. And I'm glad to hear a number of Detroiters also being in favor of this map. It is the best of all the maps for being compliant with the Voting Rights Act for providing the most opportunity districts for minority voters. And of the greatest importance to me, the most partisanly fair of all the maps currently under consideration. I was a petition circulator for the ballot initiative that led to the formation of this Commission. And to a person, the people that signed my petitions were signing because they wanted Michigan District maps to be fair. While I strongly support the Motown Sound over all the maps currently under consideration, I would love to see some tweaks to that map to make partisan fairness even better.

I would hope that this could be done without sacrificing VRA compliance and without decreasing the number of opportunity districts. If that's not possible then I guess I would just ask you to leave it as is it but ask you to look at tweaking partisan fairness. I know you guys have a very difficult balancing act to do when considering the Court order. And the criteria for drawing maps. However, I ask the Commission to pick the Motown Sound map, hopefully with some partisan fairness tweaks because I also believe it is the map that is most likely to be approved by the special master and will not result in the drawing of maps by the second special master. The initiative that led to the creation of this Commission was passed, my hands are shaking, because citizens did not want their districts to be drawn in back rooms by a few individuals. Adoption of the Motown Sound should, fingers crossed, avoid this outcome. Thank you very much.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Sorry Commissioner Orton, sorry, go ahead I had a question.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Go ahead.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: I don't know if you can answer this though so don't feel any more pressure than you might. It's really for anybody that's giving comment as I'm taking notes and maybe other Commissioners are taking notes as well. If there are certain things like you offer a tweak for partisan fairness, right.

>> Right.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: If you have an idea that you can share in public comment or submit it online, that would be very helpful.

>> Okay, I would -- I don't know that I'm smart enough to do that.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Don't say that. None of us are either. We are regular tegular people.

>> But maybe I will talk with somebody smarter and submit a comment online.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Okay.

>> Okay I appreciate you guys listening to us.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Thank you, thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Ryan Taylor, did you have something? Okay, sorry, I didn't catch the cues there. If you want to speak to Ryan Taylor in the back, he is raising his hand in the corner there by the door, he can -- he is the smart one that can help.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: This is the last thing I will say because I don't want to change any one's public comment to come if there is a particular map that you like or dislike and you're talking about the map, you can say that you don't like it. You can also say that you do like it but if you could include what the map does for your area, the area without giving all your personal business, like if you like Motown Sound, if you like Water Lily whatever the map does if you can speak to what that does for your neighborhood that will be great for the Commission. Or like I said if it completely disenfranchises or disempowers an area that you specifically live in or work in or whatever is that speak to that as well. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you, okay number 32.

>> Good afternoon. My name is Miranda Hawkins and I'm a resident of St. Clair Shores and reside there with my husband Wayne and two young daughters. I carefully reviewed the available proposed maps and I believe that Motown Sound is the best available option. Thank you for your time, consideration and your service on this important Commission.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 33.

>> Good afternoon. My name is Michael Dunn, my wife Debbie and I resided in Lathrup village for 32 years. Looking at our own block going down up and down each side of the street you will find Black families, white families and immigrant families, straight, gay and lesbian couples. Retirees, empty nesters, families with young children and even a single mother with not one but two sets of school-aged twins. I don't know how she does it.

Various families practice their Christian, Jewish and Muslim faiths or don't practice any religion at all. This is all within one block. 30 homes up and down the street. So I wish all Michigan communities were as open and welcoming as ours. I've reviewed the proposed maps and Motown Sound is the best map available. Motown Sound is the one map that best threads the needing and meets all the key ranked criteria including compliance with the Voting Rights Act and other Federal laws. Two promotion of communities of interest and three maintaining partisan fairness. I want to echo the earlier speaker that that is especially important. You guys made great strides in the earlier maps providing partisan fairness across the state and we really don't want to see

any reversion back to the old partisan maps. I want to thank all of you for your time and hard work while you serve on this important Commission. And in closing I just want to strongly urge you to select the Motown Sound map and present it to the Court on March 1st. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 34.

>> Good afternoon my name is brook Harris a resident of Boston Edison neighborhood in Detroit. I would like to thank you the Commissioners and staff for your work for redrawing the maps and having the hearings in an accessible location to avoid downtown whenever possible. I also find the Motown Sound map to be the best out of the options listed. I appreciate the intentional care in that map to keep my neighborhood intact. It dips far enough east to go to Woodward instead of cutting us off at the lodge which has happened in the past. I would encourage you all to tweak that map to take this type of care with all neighborhoods so it can remain intact and more communities of interest as possible and not split them and make small tweaks for partisan fairness and I'm not smart enough to do it off hand but I can see what I can do on line. And with the most block districts and I and other representation that looks like us and represents our interest. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 35.

>> Hi everyone thanks a lot my name is Mary Ann Parnis and live in Huntington Woods and first of all like so many said thank you for what you're doing but I can't imagine it must have been pretty discouraging when you were told that you had to redraw these maps because in practice from what I saw, at least with regards to the House Districts I thought they worked out to be pretty good. But I get it and I'm glad that you were able to go back, and I think that what you drew is even better. And one of the things that I will comment on because no one else has mentioned Royal Oak Township, I don't live in the Township but close to the Township and work with a lot of people in the Township and in the last map they were split in half so I'm so happy you are keeping them together and in one community. I think that is going to be really important to help that particular community.

And there's other things like I said I live in Huntington Woods so keeping with Berkeley we share the same school District that is like another important feature some people have mentioned maybe doing some tweaking. You know, I really trust what you guys have been working on and I think that you've got you know you have delved into this far more deeply than I have. Thanks for the hard work. And you know, I think that looking at all of the maps, the whole idea is that we do not want a problem at the end of the month that this map is going to be rejected and that is why I think the Motown Sound map gives us the best possibility that the Court will not reject that and we have to take a map that's not drawn by the people, which is totally opposed to what we worked so hard to get at the beginning. So thanks again.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 36.

>> No 36? 37. 38? Are you 38?

>> Yes.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay.

>> Good afternoon Commissioners I appreciate all the work that you all have been doing for our City. I'm a Detroit. My name is Toya. And the reason I'm here I'm for the Motown Sound map as well. Also, I would like to know that as far as activities that we once had in the Detroit, oh, thank you, as far as the activities that we once had in Detroit, that has been taken away from us, I sort of became discouraged because I remember once there was the winter blast we used to have every winter during the month of January and February that has been taken out of Detroit. I remember we used to have the State Fair that was once in Detroit for years where my daughter who is now an adult we can no longer go to the Detroit. We no longer have a State Fair in this large City that we have. I have been to the one in Novi and I'm telling you it's nowhere near in comparison to the way it once was in the City of Detroit. So my concern is why are we one of the largest cities in the world, but we don't have a State Fair. We don't have, they have taken away the winter blast. And beats and eat is in Royal Oak and I like that but when you have a major City and that has been taken away from the City of Detroit but at the same time you want people to represent Detroit and live the in Detroit what do they have to look forward to as far as the seasons go for their children, for their grandchildren, even for themselves as far as retirees to have somewhere to go to. And somewhere besides being at home or just going to work and coming home and trying to figure out what they should be doing. That's my concern.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: This Commission so I'm Commissioner Kellom and I miss my elephant ears too but this body of 13 is we are regular citizens from all over the State of Michigan, right? So we are not politicians. Never run for anything. So we are representing our different neighborhoods and coming together to listen to you all give feedback on the maps that we have in the back, which you did, with is Motown Sound but we are not responsible unfortunately for the things that you have said. So what we hope, you know, and I think I can speak for the rest of the Commissioners. We hope you are drawing maps that inspires the folks that go to Lansing and other places to represent the Detroit area. We hope that this process in our maps inspire them to work hard to bring equitable activities and communities back together. That's what I can say to what you just shared with us.

>> I appreciate it.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Yeah.

>> All right thank you so much.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: You're welcome.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you. Okay, number 39.

>> Good afternoon. My name is Byron white and I'm a proud homeowner in the City of Detroit. And I can appreciate the task that you were given in a short amount of time,

that you were given to complete it. But I was also very upset while we had to come back here and do this again. And I was also kind of disappointed with someone on the Commission that wanted to go to Court to try to maintain the maps that you have drawn. I was upset about that. Especially about how the Commission came to refer to not refer but to retain someone that gave you the information about how to draw these maps and how to go about it. Not considering, not knowing about Detroit or having any affiliation with the City of Detroit. And that bothered me. Hopefully we won't come back to this again. And the Detroit sound map seems to be an efficient map. I have a lot of concerns about how the Commission was comprised. I didn't like that as well. But that's what we were dealt with. So that being said, I hope you will consider that because we in the City of Detroit always have to fight. We are continuing to fight. We are not the only ones fighting. People around the country are fighting. Because when these maps are drawn, guess who gets marked out of those maps? Who is disproportionately affected by these maps. As far as resources, as far as diluting our vote, as far as our political representation. That's all we have. That's all we have is our vote. That's the most important thing that we have in this country today as African/Americans is voting. My daughter Jess completed her thesis, her doctorate and what her doctorate was the ramifications, the psychological, financial, economical ramifications of African/Americans due to regentrification. When it's regentrified and when we pay tax in the City, supported the City when everyone else has left the City. And then when the City is revitalized where are we? We don't get an equal share. And the worst thing that we can be affected by is not getting an equal share in our voice being heard through our voting. Because that's the only way we get resources is through legislation. That's me? You voting me off. Okay thank you for hearing me.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 40.

>> Hello. How you doing? Let me know when you are ready. Okay so hi my name is Norman Clement I represent myself and Detroit change initiative. I have been at the process since the beginning and again thank you for your service to redraw these maps again. I'll be brief. I know that folks are looking at the Motown Sound as one of the popular maps. I also recommend Daisy two map the reason is Motown Sound does bring up two turns number one the cracking of Dearborn also the maps how they are drawn in the Grosse Pointe Farms area with that map we might be back in Court again and you might follow the same situation going back with the maps. Daisy two is a map that has been drawn but also it does offer the same opportunity of representation but also the other surrounding areas that they were deemed qualified were not touched and that is my concern on the other maps. So also following this process here just want to make sure that folks understand that number one, once the Commission is up everybody has a chance to apply for the Commission, so I say everybody in the room and broadcast if you want to apply there is an application process, everyone is welcome to sign up. This is not a secret. No hidden math you are welcome to sign up so

hopefully you guys will take advantage of that people around the City of Detroit premium are in the process there you can sign up and be part of the Commission and get through a selection process. The second thing is that also encourages folks to make comments on the map. Realize what happens and once we get a map please be satisfied with it. If you don't like your representation you vote them out. Understand that process. So the thing is that we definitely want a map that's fair, that is, you know, bias and we don't want to be in the same situation because some people think they are not represented when the maps are redrawn and have a higher percentage of representation by Black African/Americans who are leadership in office now.

That is my time and thank you for doing your job and have a great day.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission and thank you for that plug. Yes, we would say to everyone you can be on the next Commission, or you can apply to be on the next Commission. So number 41.

>> 41.

>> I got the pop right here. I probably won't use all my time. My name is Richard Clement I'm a precinct delegate in precinct 92. First of all the Commission was drawn you know we never ever want to go back to what it was before, okay? That is why the people spoke up in the first place, you know. We wanted fair maps, we don't want the people, you know, to be gerrymandered. We want to get away from that. I further recommend we take the program to states like Texas that really got a messed-up map because what's wrong is what is the nice part about this Commission is that everybody has access to the same software, okay? And you can put it to a vote of the people like we did. So since Texas sued us to try to steal our votes, I think we ought to return the favor to Texas and sue them on the redistricting, okay? With that being said, everybody is kind of pushing the Motown map and it's okay.

You know, and let's start with the premise that the whole census was sabotaged in the first place. Like I say I was the numerator with the census, and they were telling the people and if you answered the census especially in southwest Detroit you going to get deported, okay? And that's the kind of factors we had to envision and now with all these supercomputing and everything else I remember in the census report they were using drones to count people, you know. And since the clown is bussing these immigrants from Texas and throwing them in sanctuary cities we can probably do a quick recount with all the technology and everything and get some new numbers, okay? But overall the only thing I'm really worried about is that if you -- when you do these maps and everything you don't split up and go back to the way it was before, to a different type of gerrymandering because you know I like my rep, he is a good dude. Other than that, I want to see the State Senate map. Have you done the Senate ones? Not yet. Okay you're not going to touch the House maps, right? The U.S. House, no, you are not going to touch that. That is good. So basically just keep up the good work and we will

-- we must never, ever, ever go back to the way it was before and a little tweaks we are going to get it together up here, okay? Job done, peace.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 42.

>> Is there a 42?

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: I think 41 is the most current number for signups.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay then we will go to our remote public comment. So for remote public comment I will call your name and our staff will unmute you. If you are on a computer you will be prompted by the Zoom app to unmute and speak. If you're on the phone a voice will say the host wants you to speak and prompt you to press star six to unmute. Also please note that if you experience technical or audio issues or we do not hear from you from 3-5 seconds we will move on to the next person in line and return to you after they are done speaking. If your audio still does not work you can e-mail [redistricting@Michigan.gov](mailto:redistricting@Michigan.gov) and we will help you trouble shoot so you can participate during the next public comment period or at a later meeting. You will have three minutes to address the Commission.

The first to provide remote public comment is Bronwyn-Prater.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: You are unmuted and free to address the Commission.

>> Good afternoon and thank you for hearing from us today. My name is Bronwyn and I work for access. I'm here to give my support to the Motown Sound map a map that gives consideration in keeping the Arab American as well as the Middle Eastern and north African communities together. And would also like for you to consider adding Melvindale back into District 3 and remaining a part of our community of interest. This community of interest originates from a culturally geographically and religiously diverse set of countries but countries that share many experiences and challenges. Leaving this community of interest together will ensure that we are able to quantify its needs and would also mean that programs can be developed to meet the needs of these specific communities and that funding can be acquired to do so. Because Mena and Arab American communities are already going unrecognized by the Federal Government they are under counted and they are not able to accurately demonstrate the size and needs of their communities. The Motown Sound map would best recognize the significant presence of this community in the region as well as display the Commission's dedication of equity through the redistricting process and I will extend my thanks for you for the work you all are doing on this thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Next in line is Chris Andrews.

>> Hello.

>> CHAIR ORTON: We can hear you.

>> Thank you. Yes, this is Chris Andrews from Haslett. It appears to me that you are going to do one of two things either pass Motown Sound or make adjustments to



Motown Sound to improve fairness. And I think that I commend you on finding a solution to the racial under representation problem and in coming on here to keep your final solution doing that. But for those of you who were in the process at the beginning, a couple of years ago there were hundreds of people who told you that the Hickory map was very unfair and asked you to start over. Understandably you didn't have the time to do that. But I think it's really important for you to try to reduce the unfairness. And Lisa Handley had said at the beginning of this process the second time what is fairness? She said it would be reducing or at least maintaining the level of unfairness that you have. And it's my belief that you can do that. People are asking the good question of how do you do it. And I'll be the first to say I don't know and I'm not familiar with the districts. But I think that you have certainly among your members have people who are familiar with the communities and you've got experts who should be able to help provide some options. I would think if you ask your experts, your consultants to say give us a few options that absolutely protect Black voters in the Detroit area, but reduce the unfairness of the maps that they ought to be able to give you some options. And in the last election when democrats won landslide victories for Governor and Attorney General and Secretary of State and there was abortion that was greatly driving turnout, it took all of that to have the tiniest of majorities for democrats. And if you replace that and add a layer of more unfairness and go into more normal elections, I'm convinced we will have one party winning a greatly disproportionate number of elections. And as somebody before me said, the reason that people were out electing petitions and signing petitions and voting for the constitutional amendment was because they wanted fair elections that where the will of the people is respected. So I encourage you to see if you can find the better solution that reduces the unfairness. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Next we have Percy Johnson.

>> On mute can you hear me?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Yes, we can hear you.

>> Oh, wow, perfect timing. Yeah, so I came down and I looked at the maps that you have on the board. And I really liked the Motown. I liked the Motown map the way it's shaped and the title you gave me too. So, yeah, I'm in for supporting the Motown map. It looks like we are giving. My concern has always been giving individuals who live south of 8 Mile some strength to where when they vote they can get representation that lives in their neighborhood and also that lives in that dynamic or the challenges that they live with in that neighborhood or just living in that particular area. Because individuals I feel live north of 8 Mile don't deal with the same situations people have south of 8 Mile. So I'm in strong support for the Motown Sound. And I like the name of it, and it takes me back to the song that came from that is people power. That used to be the Motown Sound give people the power and we are doing that. Letting people instead of politicians and not people. I mean people instead of politicians making the lines. That

is what we want, we want the people to have their power to get the representation that they need, the job. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. I think we have one more in-person. Number 42.

>> Thank you my name is Steve Walker and live in southwest Detroit which of course is part of District one. First I want to thank Commissioner Szetela who expressed an interest in having a Latino District, those of us in southwest Detroit certainly do appreciate that. Fortunately thanks to the Court decision, that's not feasible to cradle the Latino district you would have to take away a Black District. Secondly, I hear a lot of people who like the Motown Sound map. And I can see some of the advantages in that map. But I do notice that it looks to me like it takes an east side Detroit district and draws it up into St. Clair Shores. Now if somebody can explain to me what the community of interest is between St. Clair Shores and Detroit I would really like to know that. That would be some news to me.

I actually the map I think I like the best is Daisy two. I saw somebody earlier spoke to it also. The big advantage of Daisy two is it puts Melvindale back in with Dearborn and you heard all those Arab Americans this morning saying they wanted Melvindale to be in with the rest of their community which makes perfect sense to me. I do think it would take some changes to make that map satisfactory to me. For example Commissioner Curry pointed out at a previous meeting that River Rouge and Ecorse like to stay together, which I believe she's correct. And Daisy 2, Ecorse is cutoff from the rest of the District one. I think it should be included. So I think the map needs to move a little bit south and include Ecorse. Obviously when you do that, then you have to take the adjoining District and move that a little bit west which I have no problem with and when you do that then you got to take the lakeshore District and make an adjustment. I would think you would add Harper Woods in. The mayor of Harper Woods was here this morning and explain how they feel like they are all part of the Grosse Pointes. The people I know who moved out to Harper Woods knew they were leaving Detroit. I don't think they would appreciate you putting them back in the Detroit House District. So I do think that also could be done and then I think you would have the kind of District that would satisfy the Court. And the chief community of interest.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much for addressing the Commission.

Is there anyone else in the room who wishes to provide public comment, that has signed up that we haven't called on yet? I don't see any, so we don't have any more public comments right now. Director Woods, do we have any other business we can conduct at this time?

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: No, I think we can take a break.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay, all right, we will just take a 15-minute break, come back at 3:35.

[ Recess until 3:35 p.m. ]

>> CHAIR ORTON: So we do have a few more public comments in person. So we are ready here to hear from number 43.

>>Yeah, he is going to do it.

>> Good afternoon. First of all, I was on a call I think a week or so ago. I wasn't really made clear to me the purpose of this meeting as far as how it benefits the City of Detroit because someone mentioned every ten years you have to I guess renege crate the lines of basically to determine I guess what I don't know how you determine the districts. So my question is what's the purpose of the red lining? Why is it necessary and if we as citizens are not in favor of our areas being spread out to I guess combined with sur bur ban areas do we have a vote in that say? If we don't have a vote in that say you are doing what you want to do any way. How do we prevent or find out how it benefits us? Why are we doing this? Why is it necessary?

>> CHAIR ORTON: So I'll answer that just a little bit. Redistricting is necessary every ten years with the census because the population shifts. So that's why we are doing this. And to the point of these public hearings is to listen to the public. So you speaking to us is how you can have your voice heard. If you go back and look at the maps that we have published for the public to view, you can see the districts like the District that you live in, your community of interest, then you can comment specifically, you do like something or you don't like something or you think it should be a different way, the more specific you are the more helpful it is for us when we are trying to draw these lines.

>> Because I live in Detroit, but you all placed me in Brightmore, which is the same thing. I don't understand how you determine how all of a sudden Detroit has been broken up in so many different pieces and parts. I mean on one side of the street I'm Detroit, across the street from me is Brightmore stupid but okay. So why is Detroit being broken up so much and when you say the population has shifted, exactly what population are you talking about? The Black population, the white population, what population are we talking about? A lot of us Black people are still here but we seem to be getting so our communities are getting so minimized where we are being pushed out. So what population exactly shifted?

>> CHAIR ORTON: We are just talking about population in general. The census shows where the population is. And the population, you know, people move. So one area might have fewer people than it had last time. One area might have more. So we just have to have a certain number of people in each District. So that they are balanced.

>> So is it based on when things are closing down in our community because when you close things down you shut schools down and things like that, then of course our children have nowhere to go to be educated then we have to move or take them somewhere else and of course we don't all have the financial means or the vehicular means to go. So we move closer to where we have our needs met so when schools are being closed of course we are moving further out to educate our children which amazes

me how this shift of so many different other people are moving into the community, now all of a sudden we have to be the line has to be renegotiated again?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Each ten years is when we redistrict. If you have questions about specific maps, you can look at them back there and then Ryan Taylor is at that desk back there. And he can.

>> I'm on oxygen so I won't be walking back and forth to a map that is why I'm talking to you because I don't have the physical ability to do those things which is what I said when I was on the Zoom call with you the other day. Because I'm living with health issues. And living with oxygen and a lung disease from COVID. Does not allow me the ability and the flexibility to be able to go back and forth. So standing there looking at a map that I don't understand, and you all don't seem to be able to make it simple and plain for me was also living with COVID brain, which means my comprehension is declining doesn't help me either that is why I'm here asking you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Commissioner Eid, do you have something?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: First I want to say thanks for coming. I'm happy you are here. I remember you from last Thursday or Wednesday whenever it was speaking to us so thank you for making it out. We need your opinion and I appreciate you making it out here. So redistricting is done all across the country every ten years. It's not just Michigan it's not just Detroit, it's the whole United States does redistricting, and it's based on the census. That is why it's important to fill out everyone in this room, I hope you are listening fill out the census next time, please. Because I know a lot of people say so we need to fill out the census so that we can have accurate representation of where people are. And the census is what we have to work with. You know, that's what is used. And that's the, you know, that's what we use in order to make sure that these districts accurately represent where people are.

How can we help you? Like how do you think we can best help you? Do you want somebody to come. I can bring a computer next to you and we can look at it together. How can we best help you?

>> That would be one way to help me. Another way would be to bring things instead of spreading and breaking un-Detroit in so many small pieces bring our community back together to bring the resources back into it so that we can have the same fighting chances that the areas around us do. There are schools closing down. I never understand why so many schools are closing down but I'm seeing so many children being born. But you all say, you know, it's based on, you know, the number of people and things of that nature and we, yeah, we can fill it out and give it to you all. But how can we be guaranteed that you all are taking our count and making it matter? All we do is hand it to you. After our hand it goes into whomever's hand, and you do with it what you will. Which means our communities are getting smaller. Resources are leaving. So we can put in, we can do our end on our end, but it doesn't seem to behooving us.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Thank you for that. I hear what you're saying. Trust me when I say we are trying over here. And we can get some assistance for you as well to be able to see these maps and get a greater understanding of it. But thank you for that comment.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay number 44.

>> Good afternoon. My name is Booker T Walker I'm with Michigan liberation, a nonprofit criminal and social injustice organization. I'm one of the leaders there. And what I'd like to speak about is that I was a product of the mass incarceration of the 1980s. And the 1990s I was sent up north to a location called Barraga. And while I was there it's a rural area. And they came with the census. And so we got counted in, but we got counted out at the same time. So when we came in because it took resources from the community and representation. So in other words I was included and excluded at the same time. Well, that community flourished and it was just like ciphering things out of Wayne County and the community. Wayne County is the one that sends the most people to prison, and we have the biggest issue with reentry and everything and the services and mental health and all of those issues.

It takes away the resources such as aid to reentry, mental health in general, services for healthcare, affordable housing, substantial and sustainable employment. General healthcare and education. So what I'd like to see in the chance in the fact how they are able to utilize the gerrymandering. The resources and representation is fairly and just like the lady spoke previously to me in how they you know divide up so much of the community but, you know, when we are impacted all the same, with the same system, so I would just like to see it changed there. This room actually should be field but because of the ignorance of the community in which we definitely need to get educated, we are failing in everything. And so Marcus Garby made it clear and says intelligence rules the rule and ignorance bears its burden so I would like to see something done as far as the gerrymandered part so we can get the resources being deciphered out of the community. And I would like to know how you all feel about what steps need to be taken or what do you propose that we start so that we can see about making that change? Thank you very much.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. We have number 45.

>> Hello, my name is Richard Clement I'm a precinct delegate of precinct 92 in Detroit Michigan. The reason I'm here is basically to encourage people to get involved in civics, okay? This whole thing is about civics. Policies come from our representatives, okay? And in order to pick those representatives you got to have an area to represent, that's why the census was there and that is why they draw these lines in the first place.

Now, we could look at what happened over the last ten years when the politicians drew the lines, we lost Schools. I mean, we got screwed in housing, Detroit and all of a sudden more, you know, you got the policies that you have now that are destroying and have destroyed your water in Highland Park. So if we look at it as a math aspect the

census has an error rate, okay? And the error rate is like 8% of the number in whatever is there, okay? I guess the people are confused because of a lack of civics in the first place. This census, this whole process is I mean it's like a law of America. I mean the whole this plays every ten years. It's been done for 400 years from the invention of the Constitution. So with the census and the drawing of the maps you really don't want to go back to the stacking and packing of votes in one area and diluting your vote in another method. So it's all about the math, okay? When you look at it, it's all about mathematics and numbers. Okay? And the coefficient of race and other factors with the common thing of interest. And more people need to pay attention to what the heck is going on so they wouldn't have all the problems they have now.

That means you all got to vote, and you better answer the census instead of siccing the dog every time, go to the people I'm not answering the census we know you are here, but this is how things are made. So with that being said, you come up with a map, nobody is going to be happy in the end. That is what is going to happen but it's got to be fair, we don't want to go back to what you had before, I know everybody is hopping on the Motown map, Motown and you know, the Arabs you probably say hey wait a minute, but still it's not going to be fair to anybody really. It's just like a Referee. You got to make a decision. And y'all pay attention, wake up, and it's policies that is why you're doing the thing in the first place and wouldn't have this problem. I guess my time is running out and I want to see this Commission rock. Okay? Peace.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you, sir. Next we have number 46.

>> Thank you for having me speak again. I definitely want to speak as far as the legacy of mapping in the City of Detroit and why we are doing this process. We are doing this process because back then the maps were done in a closed room where no one could look at and all the time those who are elected or Elites were able to draw their maps out and so what ended up happening in the past before 2000 Detroiters were really locked in a certain area. They had representation but unfortunately from the Senate and the state reps we were gerrymandered all over the process that means at the time Detroiters had representation but not power. There is an illusion of representation so we can't go back to that. And so that is why we have a Commission of people who are putting an application in. Get randomly selected that is why we are encouraging folks to sign up for the Commission for the next around. Anybody can sign up for it. And so going back to those days of red lining going back to where Michigan had the highest insurance rate in the world particularly in Detroit that insurance cost more than your car literally. Your car payment was 500 your insurance payment was 1400 that happened in redistricting because of the communities that had represented the District got together and red lined all the benefits to them and also had Detroit pay for it. So we had to remember that when folks were talking about going back to those times before. So right now the movement that people have happen again unfortunately school districts have closed because of population loss but also we also know that communities are

coming together from other areas of town, other areas of the City so we know kids who live in Grosse Pointes go to Cass tech downtown. Kids who live downtown area go to school in River Rouge. So we know that there is a movement of people who live all over the District. And so sometimes what happens is you may have a representative that lives in Detroit that also represents parts of Oakland County. Parts of Royal Oak, that representative has to do the work for that whole District. That means I have to do the work for Detroit and Oakland County. So what happens and for me to do my job and win that is what I have to do. A lot of folks who are against the process want to go back to the old way where I get elected in August and do nothing for my job because I can walk through easily go through in general and I have a job for 2.5 years and not represent anybody because I got it through a gerrymander process and also it's name recognition. We can't go back to that. So this is a simple education about what happened in the past. What we need to do down in the future. And so also with the Commission tomorrow I ask if you guys can produce a paper for my sister over here so she can see the forms because some forms have a hard time looking at the screen and walking around. So that is my time. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much. In the room is there a number 47? I think that is all the in person public comments we have at this time so we can just take this time to look at the maps, maybe talk to people, take a maybe Anthony if you are willing to take a computer over and show the map and we will just do that for a little while. Oh, and Secretary of State has an announcement about primary voting.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Hello, ladies and gentlemen. Thank you so much for being here today. Just wanted to make sure everyone is aware that the February 27th primary voting is now open. It's the first time that early voting is occurring for a statewide election in the history of Michigan. So if you visit [Michigan.gov/vote](http://Michigan.gov/vote) you can look up the location of your in-person early voting site. You can go, fill out a ballot and have it tabulated and vote. You can do it today. You can do it tomorrow. And that is open until it ends this Sunday. So look up the hours and locations of early voting sites near you today. And then if you would rather wait until election day, election day is on Tuesday, February 27th, and you can look up additional details at that same website [Michigan.gov/vote](http://Michigan.gov/vote). Thanks, everyone.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you.

>> When are the Senate maps coming out?

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Yes, sir we have to go back to Court in April and then we will announce the process once we hear the dates back from the Court. But there will be a similar process to this one public hearings, the opportunity to address the Commission and have the maps at the back, same type of process.

>> All this has to be done before the primary election in August?

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: No, remember the Senate is every four years.

>> Oh, yeah.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: So we have some time. It has to be done by March 1st.

>> Okay.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay we are back we have one more in person public comment and that is number 47.

>>Hello, my name is Brad Scott Devonshire and also the mayor of Pleasant Ridge I wanted to comment on the maps thanks for everyone that worked on producing the map my favorite is the Motown Sound and think it gives us good representation between 8 Mile borders. It's very important I think for cities north of 8 Mile and south of 8 Mile to be represented by the same people so that we see a more diverse and good representation along the wood war corridor. There are some versions of maps that might benefit the similarly to the Motown Sound map, but it seems that one provides the best solution to give good representation. Thank you again for your help and your work.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much. I believe that is our last in-person public comment but in case I'm wrong is there a number 48? I don't see one. Okay so we will take a dinner recess. So our scheduled time is from 5:00 p.m. to 6:00 p.m. So we will be back at 6:00 p.m.

[ Recess until 6:00 p.m. ]

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Test one two, now we are good, okay, start from the top.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay again as Chair of the Commission I call this meeting of the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission back to order at 6:05 will the secretary please call the roll?

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Certainly Madam Chair. Please Commissioners please say present when I call your name. If you are attending the meeting remotely and your remote location has changed from this morning please share that information when I call your name. You will need to share you are present when I call your name. We will begin alphabetically with-Elaine Andrade? Callaghan?

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Anthony Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Brittini any Kellom?

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Rhonda Lange? Steven Lett?  
Marcus Muldoon?

>> MARCUS MULDOON: Present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Cynthia Orton?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Present.



>> YVONNE YOUNG: Rebecca Szetela?  
>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Present.  
>> YVONNE YOUNG: Janice Vallette?  
>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Present.  
>> YVONNE YOUNG: Erin Wagner?  
>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Present.  
>> YVONNE YOUNG: Richard Weiss?  
>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Present.  
>> YVONNE YOUNG: Madam Chair you have nine Commissioners present. You have a quorum.  
>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much. So without objection I will.  
>> YVONNE YOUNG: I'm sorry Madam Chair I see Elaine Andrade on, Commissioner Elaine Andrade online would you please share where you are remote from?  
>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Present from Imlay Township, Michigan.  
>> YVONNE YOUNG: Thank you Commissioner. Madam Chair, you now have ten Commissioners present.  
>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much. Okay without objection, I will ask MICRC Executive Director Edward Woods III to present the purpose of the public hearing today. Please proceed, Mr. Woods.  
>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Thank you Chairperson. Let me start to share my screen. Great. Good evening everyone. All right, all right, all right, we may be few in numbers, but we can definitely raise our voice as we show up and speak up at the public hearing today at Greater Grace Temple. This is our last session of the day from 6:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m. For those who may be at home or close by it's still not too late. I repeat it's not too late to sign up for in-person comments this evening only, in-person comments this evening only it's not too late to sign up and invite you to come to Greater Grace Temple to make sure your voice is raised and heard. We would like to thank Greater Grace Temple and Ellis III for opening up and hosting us and appreciate the warm hospitality and thank Veronica Phillips the event coordinator for all she has done to make this possible here at the City of David. The Commission heard as we reconfigured the 7 maps from presentations from the Southeast Michigan Council of Governments as well as the City of Detroit neighborhood department and we want to thank them as well. We want to thank the community organizations and the civic leaders that provided opportunities for us to address them and educate folk regarding the redistricting process and the Court order. I definitely like to thank the Honorable Mary Sheffield who is the City Council Pettifurd and Fred a City Council member we were able to go to different organizations and at the Alfa-fraternity alumni in Detroit and organizations that opened their doors for us to present and encourage people to come

out. Also like to thank our volunteers assisting with registration outside for coming here and being here with us this evening to facilitate the public speaking process.

The history of the MICRC. In 2018, Michigan voters passed proposal two a ballot proposal initiative for voters and not legislatures to take responsibility for nonpartisan redistricting and created the MICRC known as the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission. The Commission is comprised of 13 randomly selected Michigan residents for 8 with the democrats five who affiliate neither with the democrat or the republican party. And four who affiliate with the republicans. The MICRC is responsible for redistricting the U.S. Congressional, which is 13 districts across Michigan, the Michigan State House, which is 110 districts across Michigan and the Michigan Senate districts which are 38.

The seven ranked first redistricting criteria that this Commission was responsible for following to draw the maps is different from the old standards name which were known as the apoll standards. The apoll standards focused on keeping City, county and Township boundaries together. In this new process the Commission has to follow these seven ranked redistricting criteria in order. We are not able to switch the order around, flip the order, change the order we have to follow it in order. Number one equal population in the Voting Rights Act. Number two geographically contiguous. Number three reflect the state's diversity and communities of interest. Number four, no disproportionate advantage to any political party. Number five no favor or disfavor to an incumbent elected official or a candidate. Number six reflect consideration, reflect consideration of county, City and Township boundaries. This is not a mandate but to reflect consideration. And then number 7 be reasonably compact. These are the 7 ranked redistricting criteria this Commission was responsible for following in drawing the maps. The reason why it's so important to hear from each and every one of you is when we talk about communities of interest no one knows their community better than the people that live there and that's why we are so happy you are here tonight.

There was some a filing regarding Detroit that took place not in the eastern Michigan District Court but took place in the western Michigan District Court southern division in Kalamazoo where they filed and the Court found the Commission draw maps focused on race in violation of the 14th amendment, the equal protection clause. And disenfranchised Black voters. There was no finding I repeat there was no finding regarding the Voting Rights Act. In order to the Commission to reconfigure House Districts 1, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12 and 14 and not focus on race. So when the Commission started the process to reconfigure these maps, they did not focus on race at all. Because that's what the Court directed them not to do. So in other words people say what about the Voting Rights Act? We could not focus on the number one ranked criteria because the Court order clearly stated do not focus on race. That was the direction from the Court. Do not focus on race. So why should you care about redistricting? Redistricting is your chance to make sure your voice and your

community's voice is heard and represented. Heard and represented. One of the things that we shared earlier with regards to communities of interest reflect state's diversity and communities of interest. When we talk about communities of interest we are focusing on three areas. When we speak to historical characteristics we are speaking about neighborhoods. So if you take a look at the ten maps in the back, that the Commission is considering, you will notice that you can see the neighborhoods on those maps. Instead of trying to keep county, City and Township boundaries together, we are more concerned about keeping neighborhoods together. Historical characteristics, economic characteristics and economic interests. When we talk about cultural characteristics we are talking about for example the Mena middle east north Africa population around Dearborn and it's not counted in the census and that population is basically declared white. So a way to identify them as a community of interest is for people to submit maps or boundaries of those maps so we can understand the culture, characteristics in determines of where the Mena population lives or where the LBGT population or Bengali population and others in the Metro Detroit area that are impacted by this Court order.

Then last but not least is economic interests. When we talk about economic interests we are talking about the river front. We are talking about art districts or business or entertainment districts. Where we are trying to keep communities whole. So the reason why we say redistricting is important it's not just your voice but also ensuring your community's voice is heard. By making sure your voice and community voice is heard you can keep your communities together and that's why it's so important that you show up and speak up to these public hearings and we are happy to have you this evening.

The other thing about redistricting it will make sure your elected official represents your values on important issues such as healthcare, education, public safety, and justice.

So this is why you should care.

Why we are here today. We are here to hear directly from you regarding the nine draft proposed maps and the one individual map. We want to understand what map best represents you and your community of interest as is or with minor tweaks. We want to learn from your feedback to select the best map in compliance with the Court order and the 7 ranked redistricting criteria. The Commission is required to submit a map to the Court by Friday, March 1st.

Public comment guidelines you have up to three minutes, three minutes to speak. You can address the Commission as a whole and not an individual member. Once again you address the Commission as a whole and not an individual member. Any person making personal, impertinent or slanderous remarks or disruptive addressing the Commission may be requested to leave the microphone. If any person disrupts the orderly process of a meeting or refuses to comply with MICRC guidelines and rules the Chairperson may rule that person out of order and/or order their removal from the

meeting. That is not a desire that we have. We have not had that happen so far. And we do not believe that will happen this evening, but we do want to state what our rules are so that you are aware because we believe this is going to be a meaningful discussion with regards to what are the communities of interest and the best maps that you feel represent you and your community. So therefore we thank you in advance for complying with these guidelines.

Once again I'm going to invite you to show up and speak up, like and/or follow us on Facebook, Instagram, Twitter or TikTok subscribe to the MICRC YouTube channel, submit public or mapping comments if you are not able to be in person or sign up to speak virtually you can submit your public or mapping comments at Michigan.gov/MICRC. Michigan.gov/MICRC. If you have questions or you want to make a call you can call us at 1-866-map fair. And that is 866-627-3247. 866-627-3247. For questions or more information. Once again, thank you so much for taking time out of your schedules to ensure that your voice is heard following our hash tag show up speak up. Thank you again and we will turn it back over to our Chairperson, Commissioner Cynthia Orton?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you Director Woods. So individuals who have signed up and indicated they would like to provide in person public comment to the Commission will now be allowed to do so. We will start well we don't have any remote public comments signed up for this evening so it will all be in person, and it will be in chronological order. So I will call your number because I don't know your name so please introduce us, you know, introduce yourself by your name so we know who you are if you are comfortable with that. And you will have up to three minutes to address the Commission. And please conclude your remarks when you hear the timer go off. So our first person to provide public comment this evening is number 48.

>>Good evening, hello everyone. Do I come right here, right? My name is Jaja Hubbard and as a family and youth advocate I'm here to make a few comments and I also have a question that I'd like to ask. Because one of the things that's unfortunate as a family and youth advocate is that once we educate our youth and our families about the importance of being civically engaged and knowing what's going on and building up that momentum to actually be encouraged knowing the political history for our people, the people that look like you, the people that look like me and the effects that it's had on people like myself, it's really unfortunate and disturbing because all of the efforts that we place to educate our youth to really have that desire to want to know who's being elected, who is representing them, who makes the decisions and the powers that be. Only to turn around and have to reeducate them time and time again. Because these type of things are happening within our community. And it's only happening in communities that look like me. Unfortunately I had two siblings that went off to prison. And when you have siblings that go off to prison and all the things that impact their lives and then for them to come back home and not know what's going on because the way

that they left is not the same way that it is when they return home, and it's really extremely up setting because our youth really desire to want to be involved. But if you're constantly taking that ability away from them to learn what they are learning how can we really help the next generation? And I'm asking not only that you consider the people that are currently voting but to also consider our upcoming voters. The people that really, really desire to be involved and know what is going on.

The education process of being civically engaged is not the same when I was growing up. When I was growing up we knew who our mayor was, what they did, City Council, even having this board is new. That did not even exist when I was in school. That wasn't too far ago just so you all know I'm still a young tenderoni but in between time what I do know is that things were a lot simpler. And I think right now with redistricting it's making our community education for civic engagement hard. And it's making it daunting and even more boring and frustrating than it's been this times past. Not only that, but our community has so many more emergency and priority issues than this one. We need people to register to vote. And if we are having issues and challenges with increasing that portion, only to turn around and tell them, hey, yeah we got you registered to vote but you don't vote there any more or this person doesn't represent you anymore all that does is it creates the decline and encouragement to be a part. So I'm just asking that you think about our youth as they're coming up, to want to truly be engaged. How are we really helping them? We are saying that our youth are the future and tomorrow but are we really preparing them today? Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 49.

>> So now we got a swing of it my name is Loretta Hill. I'm a retired nursing supervisor and I live in Detroit and say the 8 Mile line has to be maintained all the way across because only people that live in Detroit can understand what it is to live in Detroit. In other words why is my Wi-Fi 25% more? Why is my car insurance two to three times as much and I have not had a claim in 30 years? And why I when I was working, I'm not working any more, I called to get a car for them to deliver me a new car, they send the paperwork through, and I see the quote for the interest on the loan and I hit the ceiling. And I go to the dealership out in the suburbs and he sees my white face and he apologizes all over the place and offers me a free undercoating and two years of free oil changes. Okay? I have a credit score of 845 you're supposed to deliver me a car when I call you, okay? But because I live in Detroit, my interest rate was on the ceiling, okay? I'm an old white lady I can wander around the state, and nobody pays attention to me at all, yet they chatter constantly in front of me in a road House on M25. On 75 in a saloon. An art gallery in Traverse City, nursing seminars in Muskegon and Grand Rapids. So now I know exactly what you think of Detroit. I know exactly. And that line on 8 Mile has to be maintained so that we can be represented. Because nobody on the other side of 8 Mile knows what it's like to live in Detroit and what we have to deal with. I wouldn't have to deal with that if I lived in Oak Park. A man would

say thank you and deliver me a car. Okay, I wouldn't be paying twice as much for car insurance or 25% more for Wi-Fi and I can stand here until tomorrow to tell you everything else that goes along with living in Detroit. So we need representation. And we're not going to have it if I'm represented by somebody in Harper Woods or Royal Oak or Ferndale. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 50.

>>Hello. I'm actually here to observe and listen, but since I'm here I would like to know more about the City ordinances and how often or are you regulating those things that are really concerning for our community. Because even though it is at large in terms of the City structure, in each individual community they may span so many blocks of a school, particular school District. Then what we need to know in order to make sure that our community has actually been able to receive the different or ordinances to keep our community strong and well. The other concern that I have is that in terms of hospitalization, if there is an emergency, and you are more familiar with a particular care and need that's been received from, you know, your particular hospital that might be near or just the jump distance from you. I understand that you're taken to the immediate hospital, which, in your regard, maybe perhaps you might feel that that's not the one that's actually giving the care and the services that's needed. So those are my concerns and hopefully they can be addressed. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON:

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: I'll just say hi everyone my name is Commissioner Kellom I'm a native Detroiter and we haven't in this round introduced where we are from. And I welcome any Commissioner if they are comfortable to share but we are 13 random selected citizens and picked out of a hat, but it was way more formal and not picking us out of a hat, but I say this process has gone really fast for a lot of people particularly Detroit. Particularly for Black folks that aren't used to trusting bodies especially with faces that don't look like them and don't come from places where they are from, right? So I say that because I think even though our Executive Director did the presentation, that needs to be repeated so that folks are really understanding what we are and what we represent. We are not the City Council. Even though we might have individual endeavors of shifting things in community we as a body don't have the power to do that. I'm a trauma specialist that works all day with kids and adults and an entrepreneur, I work with young people, so, Jaja, I know what it's like to tell young people to change the world and sometimes you are a part of a system that does not do that and can be frustrating but I'm saying that for everyone in the room to contextualize a discussion. The maps back there we spent the last three or four weeks, I don't know how long friends we spent redrawing those maps to give Detroiters something to look at. There is somebody staring and understanding the maps right now and that is the process we are begging people to engage in, to understand where they are on that map, to look at the map and say this is what I don't like. This is what I do like. This

area speaks about community and why. And then it's up to once these maps are drawn collectively, not just by us but you all to say, yes, we love this. Not everybody is going to love it, but this represents, this gives Black Detroiters a chance, this gives my community a chance. Once that process takes place and it's up to the representatives, it's up to the people, to the circles that you fill in on the ballot, then you hold space and do the same thing to them. You tell them what you want. You talk about sanitation. You talk about school districts. You talk about the issues that you're raising to us because those are the folks that are going to go to Lansing and do that. They are the ones that are supposed to rally and advocate. We are giving them an alley oop and listening to you and giving them an alley oop to finish the rest and you do what you are supposed to do which is vote and make these things happen as a wonderfully empowered community. Okay? Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you, Commissioner Kellom, for explaining that. And just as another just point of clarification I know that the City of Detroit is currently or has been redistricting and that is not us. We are not City of Detroit redistricting. We are redistricting the State House maps right now. So next is number 51.

>>Hello, my name is Betty Daniels and I have to say I'm going to dovetail on all the speakers that have spoken. I think what is happening right now is there is confusion. Okay not clear of who is on first and who is on second. And as the other person I will say in my age group, it won't hurt your feelings but we are not at the point where we have a lot of history that we can contribute as far as political and you know whatever and I think what is happening right now is we just don't have the understanding of who is on first and who is on second so when we go to the polls to vote we are not sure what we are -- are we going for you or our District, that kind of a thing. And so and I would be willing to work with someone as a semi-retired person, I have all this time. But we need to, because I was aware of this when it first organized but I got somewhat sidetrack and did not keep up with what things were going on. But as the one who is now on a semi fixed income I want to know where, who do I talk to, how can your organization address or not address that? And does that include us because we have a lot of people who our property values are going up, but our income is not going up. So, you know, I can get a certain amount for my home but where can I go that, you know, I can get the same thing? I pay more on my taxes on insurance than anything else and Social Security is not guaranteed any more. This is a tangent but more or less voicing some of the things when someone like me hears about your redistricting, how does that impact my day-to-day? Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 52.

>> Hello, everyone, my name is Carl Doren and lived in or Detroit all my life. I studied for this to talk 90 seconds and I think I may have mis studied. We will find out. Correct me where I'm off, okay? Well, I can make mistakes then.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: You can sing, you can just entertain us for the rest of your time.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: I apologize for this; can you pause the time? Can you make sure when you are speaking you are speaking directly into the microphone because we have interpreters on virtually who need to be able to hear? Thank you.

>> My name is Carl Dorin. I lived and born this Detroit and lived near here all my life or in Detroit. For redistricting in Detroit I believe Motown Sound is the best map so far. I hope that is applicable to what we are talking about. Improves partisan fairness and I believe can do even more. I ask what improvements and alterations will help keep partisan balance fair? Like the willow run map, the willow map District 13 for example. And represent communities of interest well, not to split neighbors, neighborhoods. I live in District 6. And the shape of it basically follows Woodward. Following thorough fairs the roads people get to work on seems like a great idea. Guaranteed to have an outcome that keeps communities together. There needs to be flow within neighborhoods that work for the community. The question I ask is how do we create the most opportunity for Blacks and all people of color like District 10 and 12 that really seem to be lagging behind. I thank you for the work you're doing. You're making a huge difference for Detroit. Michigan and our country. As we strive to have fair elections for all people and make up for lost ground. Detroit has been known as the most segregated City in the world. Not just the country. So this is a heavy lift. And I thank everyone for participating. I couldn't not participate because I'm born here. I don't say this much but I even went to reform school here when I was a kid. Straightened me out, went on to be president of the board of directors. There is a lot here. And a lot when we have been given a lot to contribute back. So thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Carl, if you have some -- some of the comments you have for particular areas that you like or dislike we have a public comment portal, I would love to see that there if that is accessible to you. If not we have Ryan in the back working with folks to understand the map, but you can talk to him about how to upload those comments. Ryan, yeah, he is pointing to the map. He has glasses. Relatively tall. The white guy in the back. Just touching the map.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Ryan Taylor, can you just raise your hand, so people know who you are? He's the go-to guy everybody. Were you number 52? Okay 53.

>> Hello, my name is mark Harriston. I apologize I got here a little late, so I know you were going through some of the criteria on the board here when I got here but I'm a little confused. You mentioned population as being one of the criteria but what you wanted to keep the population pretty equal between the districts but what is that actual number? Was that.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: 91,600 people for House District, State House.



>> Okay, looking at these maps behind me, are these all being considered or is that an evolution to some point?

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: All ten maps are being considered by the Commission, nine were done collaboratively and one was submitted as an individual map by a Commissioner.

>> Okay, so I would go back to the comment of one of the previous speakers where I see some of those maps go gerrymandering out into the suburbs and I agree with her that it really should -- districts really should be contained within the City. Because we need representation from the City that understands our concerns from the City. And I see one of the maps shows the District that I would be in would be gerrymandered all the way up into Birmingham. And I'm telling you nobody in Birmingham understands me or my community in Detroit. Period.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Is there any particular map, sir, that did, that you found that was acceptable?

>> Yeah, I think it was the Water Lily was one. And another one in there too that contained.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: If you want to go back and tell us because the Commission wants to hear what you feel would be the best.

>> CHAIR ORTON: So my suggestion would be to go look at them and you can sign up for a second public comment so then you can go sign up again then you can tell us specifics because that is really helpful to us.

>> Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLUM: I will also say this really quickly because we have heard this before and it might not change your mind and we also have all the meetings we have had when we were mapping are available on YouTube and I think they are available on our site, if I'm incorrect then don't quote me on that piece. Some of the logic just like you said for our criteria and accounting for population when we are crossing 8 Mile and some of the maps you can go back and listen to our explanations as to why that was done because there are communities let's take for instance Sherwood forest, Palmer Park, Ferndale and Royal Oak Township. Some of those communities share people, community like landmarks that have things in common so just think about that as you're looking at some of the maps that for instance in that example that I just gave there is a large LBGTQ IA community that shares relations between Ferndale, Palmer Park, so then that would mean that we have to cross and we are also charged with not packing communities Detroiters in a way that is also not permissible. So just keep that in mind as you're looking. Our effort is never to gerrymander or to cause any harm. Because I live in Detroit. And these folks behind me live in their own communities they would not want harmed as well.

>> Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLUM: Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you again Commissioner Kellom for your explanation. So that is our -- well, let me ask is anyone number 54? I don't believe we have 54 yet. So that is all of our people that have signed up for public comment at this time. So please take time to look at the maps. If you haven't provided public comment yet or if you have only provided it once and you see something that you would like to tell us, please sign up again out at the table and then we will just take a short break to, you know, give you a chance to look at the maps, come up with your comments and then we will come back again and listen. So we will just take a break. Until 6:55.

[ Recess until 6:55 ]

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay, so we went longer than we were expecting but it's great to see folks back looking at the maps and asking questions and learning things but any way now we have a few more people who have signed up for in-person public comment so we will listen to those. So number 54.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Excuse me folks in the back of the room looking at maps excuse me could we get quiet in the back of the room? Thank you so much for looking at the maps and you can continue to look at them and discuss them, but we will continue with public comment, so we need to be able to hear it.

>> I'm Mark Hariston again. So I took a look at the maps and looking at the Tulip map and talking with one of the Commission members, it looks like my House would fall into District 6 currently as the districts are laid out. Before the Court case. And I looked at the other maps and I like the Water Lily and the two Bergamot better because they put me in District 5 and they include neighboring communities, neighboring neighborhoods to mine which I think are more homogenous I guess you would say.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Community of interest is the word you're looking for.

>> Community of interest. I did like the Tulip and some of the others like Daisy 2 because they put me in districts that go north, up into Oakland County, for example, and the Tulip District, Tulip map, District 6 goes from northwest Detroit all the way up to Royal Oak and it includes more affluent communities of Royal Oak and Huntington Woods which I don't think reflects my area of Detroit. So and that's a big reason why I don't like going across county lines to include community, other communities. Now, I'm okay with some of the maps that include Oak Park and Royal Oak Township. Because those are just a couple of blocks north of me. And so I know those areas and I think we have some similar interests and similar concerns. But for the most part I would prefer that my District encompass neighborhoods in Detroit.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much for taking a look at those maps and providing public comment again. That's very helpful. Next we have number 55. Is number 55 in the room? Okay number 56?

>> I want to thank you, thank you, thank you for having this meeting and also appreciate the Commissioner interactive with us to give us a better understanding of what was going on. The thing I got out of this is I have been able to exchange my contact information from two other people in the expanded District which I think is really good because then we can get together and share information, share strategies and then we can send a combined report because I'm good at sending out reports. And doing the outline. Okay I'm good at that. And all three of us who were there, we are from southwest which is now known as something different but around Lincoln Park, outer drive, that part. And then the two of us, we are in the same kind of thing. And like the gentleman just said and the point I was trying to get out earlier there is a history that we understand how things evolved so it came out first about you trying to tell the youth we can give them some kind of sense of look you are talking about that but this is what is going to happen, this is how it works. Same thing we had the persons coming from the other part of the community. So I want to thank you for having this meeting, so we have this kind of interaction. I can become more informed what it is I'm vying for and more knowledgeable of the things what I'm trying to do so thank you again.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you. I'll go back to number 55. Are you in the room? Yet?

>> And I wanted Water Lily.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for slipping that in. Okay, 57.

>> Good evening Commission my name is Victor from Michigan LCV, and my community of interest would be southwest Detroit, Mexicantown, that greater area, more so like District 1 here. And I had some opinions about I really liked the maps that include Corktown with District 1. And southwest Detroit. Corktown is historically one of the oldest neighbors in Detroit and one of the oldest neighborhoods of southwest Detroit. I think it makes sense for it to be in there. If you needed to like I can move some things around for population. I think the Midwestern portion that you have may be able to go somewhere and like and/or River Rouge and Ecorse, I think those two should stay together. But I mean if you needed to make some moves there are places you could do it from. And also I'm wondering if that little portion from like the Dearborn area did not cut through like dicks like it does in District 1 after it leaves Spring Wells and goes southwest in that direction.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: What map are you looking at? I'm sorry.

>> Motown Sound I should have started with that and it seems like that is favored by some folks and may get some version that is close to that and I would appreciate if we kind of cutoff the Dearborn on victims or made sure the till of Spring Wells and cemeteries stay apart of distribute District 1, those are specific in my neighborhood and where I grew up that really stand up to me. Other than that I agree with everyone else and some benefits from the Motown Sound map and I hope you guys do come to pass some version of that. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. And I think it would be really helpful since you were talking about specific areas and roads if you could add that to our public comment portal so that we.

>> Okay.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Because I couldn't write it all down.

>> Sure, I will definitely go ahead and submit that. Thank you very much.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you. Number 58.

>>Hello, my name is Chris Turner. I had an opportunity to review all the maps. And it was three of them that stuck out to me that I thought were pretty good. And representative of the Metro Detroit area as a whole. Those three maps include river walk, Spirit of Detroit and Motown Sound. I think those maps are really representative as far as the population in these individual neighborhoods and communities, type of people that live there, work there and everything like that. Some of those maps in which the areas go up into Oakland County, there was one map in particular in which Birmingham represented a neighborhood in northwest Detroit. And the issue that I could foresee with that being you know, being as such if somebody that lives in Birmingham is representing a portion in northwest Detroit not too far from here, they are not really going to be pressed on the issues that take place in this area because they have no idea what it's like to live in this neighborhood, in this area. So issues down here are not the same up there. Their focal point is not going to be the same and people that live in that neighborhood are not they are just not going to get the same treatment. I live in Grandmont part of the Grandmont Rosedale neighborhoods. And even though I like these three maps that I shared with you guys, it's a couple of them in which my particular neighborhood Grandmont is split off from Rosedale Park and north Rosedale Park. And I think that it should be changed because the Grandmont Rosedale neighborhood association that represents that whole pocket. And if we are left out of that, then we could be representing a District in which our neighborhood could be potentially serving as like an anchor. And I think that should change. We are all one community and we have been that way since this neighborhood association has been in existence. So I do think that needs to change across the board on all the maps. But these three are like I said the best representation of Detroit in all these neighborhood as a whole. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. And thank you for those specific areas that you talked about.

Okay I'll go back to 55. Do we have 55 back in the room? No one is claiming 55. And is there a 59?

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: It seems like number 55 might still be looking at the maps. Sir, were you 55?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay, come on down. Hello, good evening, thank you for having us here. I was looking at three of the areas that I felt that were good for the City and our

community. Water Lily, Bergamot and Bergamot 2 and that gives better representation, and everybody knows there is a definition line between 8 Mile and the other communities. So I'm thinking that basically we should keep our interests on this side because this is where Detroit is and on the other side of 8 Mile that's where our communities are. And we are altogether, and we all need, looking for the same things. But we all have slightly different detailed things and problems that we need to have solved. So I think that was my pick from these things.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you.

>> Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for taking time to look at the maps and give us that feedback. So I don't believe we have any more signed up right now. We still have some time. So if you haven't addressed us, you still have time to go sign up or if you only addressed us once and you think of something else you want to say you can sign up for a second time. So we will just take a break for a few minutes, and you can feel free to look at the maps again. And talk amongst yourselves. Okay so we have one more in-person public comment, that would be number 59. Number 59. Come on up. And while she is coming up, I'm let you say stick around after this public comment, we are going to have some Commissioners explain some of the reasons that the districts were drawn the way they were in the maps that were here for public comment. Go ahead, number 59. You can introduce us to your name.

>> Good evening my name is Beverly Troy and thank you for having me and I just want to really piggyback on one of the gentlemen that was up here from Rosedale Park I'm also from the Rosedale Park area and I agree that particular community should not be broken up as I see they are on the maps there because we are one voice and one community and we've been together a long time historically. Also I like Szetela basically because I see for out for District 16 that we are not spread across the other side of Detroit, on the other side of 8 Mile nor on the other side of Livonia. We are all one voice. So basically for all of Detroit we really need to be one voice. And all of our districts need to be put together and not so much broken up because so we can stay focused and be able to.

>> Your conference is already in progress for ten hours, 11 minutes, press pound or star to continue the conference otherwise your conference will end in one hour, 15 minutes.

>> CHAIR ORTON: I think you can go now.

>> I like the interruption and how I would be with the maps totally chaos so thank you and take into consideration things we have said, we are speaking from our heart and really love Detroit and want to stay one community so thank you and have a wonderful evening.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Okay so now if you want to go back to where the maps are, we have some Commissioners that would like

to share some of the reasons why some of the districts are drawn the way they are and if you have questions we are going to take a microphone back and we need to speak into the microphone so the people online can also hear. Okay you all my friends that are still here. Commissioner Eid and I and the rest of the Commissioners are going to explain, yeah, some of the reasons why we drew things. So I'm going to start with Motown Sound because that has been in a lot of conversation.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: John can you screen share the maps she is talking about so folks online can also see them.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Hi everybody I'm Commissioner Brittini Kellom we started off with, so Motown Sound evolved from Spirit of Detroit. One of the things this map changes is the lakeshore District because we were trying to find the middle ground of comments and different communities of interest and the lakeshore community that has offered you know a lot of public comment just like you all are offering. One of the communities that has continuously since we started this process asked to be together is Cornerstone, East English Village, morning side is kind of deep east community Harper Woods asked to be included the Grosse Pointe. So again we cannot draw with saying we want Black to be here, but we can draw with neighborhoods and communities of interest. So the main goal with Motown Sound was keeping some of Detroit sacred and neighborhoods together. This is why we have green acres Sherwood forest, University District Palmer Park, Dale farms Penrose, State Fair and we included it with neighborhoods that would not interfere but integrate without going so deeply south into like the downtown area. However, when we drew District 8 as it is in Spirit of Detroit, we got a lot of comments that said hey wait, what about Palmer Park and Ferndale, what the LBGTQ IA community what about Pleasant Ridge and the resources we share. So we extended 8 just across 8 Mile because remember we need 91,000 folks. We can't just draw what we want to draw. So it's the biggest game of Tetris Chess that you ever played in your life. If you don't like puzzles this would not be enjoyable for you at all. And then we looked at District 5 the Schultz baggily community, college park community and we kind of looked and said okay what do we do with District 5. If we have to cross 8 Mile what does that look like, the Oak Park community and Royal Oak Township community Royal Oak Township was split and they asked to be put back together which makes sense you are a Detroitter and drive down 8 Mile and have Wyoming right there I think is Kroger, liquor stores, mobile gas station so Royal Oak Township is right there. Why would they be split up. You can also drive through Royal Oak and where do you end up Ferndale. So these are some of the reasons why we drew these communities. This map took the approach of not locking the outside districts so that we can more freely draw Detroit in a way that is not constricted. Daisy 2 Commissioner Eid and Tulip locked all of this out. So when you all are talking about how districts bleed and strip across 8 Mile it's because logistically there is nowhere to go if you lock those districts. So it forced Commissioners to draw up, not drawing

because we are trying to gerrymander but literally drawing according to population. I will also pause and say these maps don't represent like oh, we think these are like ten great ideas. These are ideas that follow the criteria that some of them took into account the Court's request for us to only change what was drawn. If you look back at YouTube you will see us saying that makes no sense because we going to do the best job for Detroiters and do the best job for Black people how can we dare lock-out districts when we need populations in places to change that kind of stuff. Then we listened closely to the southwest community. I want to flip through.

>> When you say lock-out populations, what do you mean by that? When you say lock-out populations, what exactly do you mean by that? She said a few times state map locked out populations. And I was wondering what exactly she means by locking out populations.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: I will quickly we locked certain of Daisy 2; Water Lily took out the districts that were challenged in the courts only. And everything else when I say locked like the software literally it's like turning a key into a lock that means on the computer they can't be changed. For an exercise we only drew what could or what was exposed or left out. Does that make sense? Okay that makes sense. Go ahead, somebody had a question, yeah. Sorry I keep for getting.

>> So those districts that were challenged in the Court there was something that should have happened such as this meeting so we would know why those particular rationales why they were merged, not just because they're near each other or right at the line. You follow what I'm saying? In terms of population, what was the precursor that Court, that actually calls this to be a question? And why?

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: So it's still we are still in ongoing litigation but what I will say is the Court said, hey, you know, in their Court language but I'm breaking up the legalese which think you could have done a better job for Detroit so Detroiters can choose who they want to represent their City and they challenged our Hickory map. So that is what happened. I think also I will say that Detroiters like this or like you all are really engaging. You don't see the looks on your faces, but the Commissioners do, and you are nodding your heads and being this close and touching the maps now you get it. Now you get the progression. So I think some of that was missing not because it was intentional by the 13 of us like I said we were randomly selected and started doing the job and got on YouTube the meetings are live but not everybody has a computer, not everybody can come to Huntington TCF, Cobo hall whatever you want to call it so we had to keep coming out, had to keep activating and for us, the people of color that are in here we can't be at every church, barber shop, beauty salon engaging in this type of discussion so I think that went into a lot of the decision making too. But, yeah, we had a lot of comments from the Mena community, Middle Eastern north African, spring well village Mexican town Chadsey, Condon, the logic behind District 1. So using Motown Sound you are looking at Spirit of Detroit that was kind of the first iteration of us

intentionally crossing 8 Mile but focusing really, really heavily on neighborhoods and communities of interest.

And then this was a bump up of that with some edits to neighborhoods. And changing the lakeshore District a little bit, okay? So I'm going to pass the microphone to Commissioner Eid. Keep thinking and asking questions.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: So if you look at Spirit of Detroit and compare it to Motown Sound Spirit of Detroit is there. They are essentially the same the only difference is the lakeshore area on the east side of Detroit northeastern Detroit, the Grosse Pointes, East Point, St. Clair Shores. So when you are comparing those two that is really the biggest difference, is the configuration in districts 10, 12 and 13. And the Commission did that to generate one additional VRA compliant District in Motown Sound when compared to spirit of Detroit. Let's move on to this other map the Daisy 2 we heard a few people talk about it today. This map was really more of an experiment than anything else. We had Commissioners who wanted to see if it was possible to only change what the Court told us to change. So we talked about locking districts earlier. That's what this map did. It only changed the districts, the 7 House Districts that the Court said we had to change. And it left all the other ones the same. So for example District 4 is the same as in the original Hickory map because that one did not get shut down. And the same thing with like District 13 for example. So that's why these districts look a little bit more funny in shape because since those were locked we had a geographical burden to overcome. But like I said it was more of an experiment than anything else.

There is a similar configuration in Tulip over here, let's move down. Kind of similar to Daisy but a little different. This one, again, keeps the districts locked exempt September there are changes in three more. So the Court said the districts that the Court told us we had to change plus three additional districts, but it keeps the other ones outside of Metro Detroit the same. That is why you see five and six in this map that are the same as in the original.

Now let's move on to Water Lily. We've seen some people here today talk about Water Lily. Water Lily is right here. Now both Spirit of Detroit and Motown Sound and Water Lily and willow they all came out of like a collaborative process that originated with the Bergamot map down there. One could say these all-evolved kind of in, you know, sequential fashion. The biggest difference between Water Lily and the ones we were speaking about earlier, Spirit of Detroit and no found sound is Water Lily adheres to the 8 Mile boundary. Some people think we should, some people think we shouldn't cross 8 Mile that is why you are here so we can hear what you have to say. This is an example of a map that really doesn't cross 8 Mile much. You can see District 5 ends at 8 mile and District 8 ends at 8 Mile. From that map we went and created Willow which is a derivative of Water Lily but ends up crossing 8 Mile in a way to try to become VRA



compliant. Listen, I'm just trying to hold it let's bring it down. Let's bring it down, folks, let's bring it down. Water Lily? This is Water Lily right here.

>> Supposed to change this.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: What are you speaking of?

This is district 9 in Water Lily with Midtown, Corktown, Downtown, going up through the river going up through Bell Aisle. It's similar to what is in the other maps but a little different. You got to pull up the map and look at the actual differences. But again the biggest difference is that this one does not cross 8 Mile.

>> I'm trying to get a clear understanding and possibly some others might have the same question. I see where when the maps change they are covering more affluent to affluent and the other ones and look down and I'm not sure if that is Spirit of Detroit or whichever, Spirit of Detroit, where you are looking at 8 and above it has the choice to connect either at Oak Park or if I'm looking at it correctly Ferndale or Hazel Park, whichever one. Okay we now that the other would possibly I don't know for sure what Hazel Park has but it would be in the sense of affluent. And when you look at each one of these maps at the proposal if you look at the connection above 8 Mile, and the connection, if it's affluent one we all know the different affluent areas in Detroit they make sure it's either bridged over right connecting with that District which is the most populated affluent District as well as the most populated and opportunity voting opportunities. Because what's missing on here is the population, approximate approximation number on each one of those maps that would actually be in the sense of voting that it could actually impact the voting District, the persons that would elect from there, okay? So you see one that is over here. Say it's very affluent and very different in terms of political difference. This might be democrat. This might be republican. Possibly. And so with that happening, you're saying that now if you choose someone from up here that might have a difference of opinion, we are not saying complexion but would have a difference of opinion that could very much sway because you have a more of a term of being able to publicize both television radio, walking and talking than up there. I don't want to continue on but.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: No, I think that is a very astute point that is why we have ten maps here, ten different choices to hear what people say for it. One moment, Brittini do you want to say something? No, good?

>> Okay this is the only map I'm interested in right here. This is the map okay. Now I live in Schultz right here. I live there since 1973. Okay, this is the highest density population for Detroit right here. This has been the breadbasket of Detroit since 1967. We have supported the City. We pay our taxes; we clean our alleys and you guys are screwing us on every other map because you put population across 8 Mile, and we won't have a voice at all. The ladies will be pissed off when I go back and tell them. They will be after you I mean I swear. When these block clubs see this map, see those

maps and you put one of those up and tell them we are going to representation from Oak Park whoo-hoo.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: That is why we are here today to hear those kinds of comments.

>> And I'm going to go back.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLUM: Ms. Hill I will repeat what I told you and my other good friend looking at the maps. I understand what you are saying both in sentiments and literally I understand the words you're saying but just like when we had Oscar who is from District 1, it is a game of Chess. So if you're suggesting we come below 8 Mile, think about what happens with the other communities if they are squishing where do the numbers go. The same question earlier when someone said put Melvindale back in what was it 3? 3 so what do we do with those 12000 people? So it's about meeting of the maps and learning about people from your communities. This is not a concept a lot of people are comfortable with particularly with Black people because when you have been starved and fighting and fighting the last thing you are thinking about having a conversation across the table but bringing this below 8 Mile by beloved community where I ran down the street barefoot they are now below 8 Mile but what about everybody else? If we were to draw for those considerations for every community, this map would look a mess. We still have to keep the districts. Hold on.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Excuse me, I love the interaction here. But we have to be out of here at 8:00 and so we do have a couple other public comments. So we need to wrap that up and come back up here.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLUM: Okay we are going back to sit down because there is more public comment, and the mic has to go back on the stand is what our Chair just said.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much to everyone for being engaged and to the Commissioners for explaining that. We have a couple more public comments so number 59.

>> 59 spoke already thank you for keeping my numbers straight. Is 55 back in the room yet? I think we never found 55. Just don't want to miss them. Did we? Okay see it's late. Okay number 60. Number 60 do you want to give your public comment? 60.

>> Good evening Commissioners and thank you for having this event here at Greater Grace Temple which is my church. And thank you to Bishop Ellis for hosting this event. In honor of Black history month I want to spotlight the late Senator John Lewis who helped to modernize and revitalize the Voting Rights Act of 1965. He said when you see something that is not right, not fair, not just you have to speak up. So I'm here to speak up. Black leadership matters. Black representation matters. The way the maps are currently being drawn continues to dilute the Black vote. Making it impossible for any Black person running for office to win elections. And Section Two of the Voting Rights Act requires drawing new and preserving existing majority-minority districts. I'm

urging the Commission to continue to tweak the maps for VRA compliance and partisan fairness. Detroit is the largest City in Michigan. It has 80% Black population. The entire City of Detroit should be considered a community of interest. I'm advocating for the following maps: The river walk map. The Spirit of Detroit map. The Motown Sound map. The Szetela map. I cannot support vehemently the Daisy map. Let me say heck no to the Daisy map. No to Bergamot one or two and no to Water Lily. I urge the Commissioners to draw maps going east and west instead of moving the maps more north, past 8 Mile which stretch going into three or more counties. Giving Black people not a fighting chance to win. So what I'm urging at this point is give us a fighting chance to win elections in the next decade. Thank you for listening. And thank you for being here.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Is there a 61? Come on up.

>> Thank you again. I just wanted to after reviewing the maps and talking to some other colleagues and reviewing some other maps specifically Tiger Lily I believe that is the one that is cut through and kind of butchered southwest Detroit in half right? Water Lily. Water Lily, no Tulip is the one. It's Tulip. That's the one that cuts through southwest Detroit. We will definitely end up being here again next year if that was the map so definitely let's keep those folks together and not like cut that community totally in half. That is definitely a big community of interest for me as you can tell. So please anything but that one and specifically that is what I have the issue with.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Which community are you referring to?

>> Southwest Detroit which it kind of slices through and does this weird, it's bad, so let's keep that altogether out. Thank you very much.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Understood, thank you for addressing the Commission. And is there a 62? I don't see a 62. I think that is all the public comment that we have. Okay, well, we would like to tell everyone that we really appreciate everyone who came out to speak to us. And also who spoke to us remotely. Or added things to the public comment portal or comments on the maps. We really appreciate all of the input. We are grateful for the opportunity that we had to meet in this beautiful building. And for the hospitality that was granted us. We are also really grateful form the volunteers that were working out on the sign-up tables and the staff behind the scenes to make this public hearing possible. And we look forward to seeing many of you again tomorrow maybe. And that will be at Second Ebenezer and the address is 14601-Dequinder Street in Detroit. And it's going to be the same hours so 10:00 a.m. to 1 p.m., 2 p.m. to 5 p.m. and 6:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m. So we hope to see lots of people there. And thank you very much again.

[ Hearing concludes ]

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

I suppose I should officially say this meeting this public hearing is adjourned at 7:53 p.m.