

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

MICRC

20240222-1000 Meeting

Captioned by Q&A Reporting, Inc., www.qacaptions.com

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission will begin shortly.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: All right, Commissioners. We have a quorum. I'll be starting a live stream. Madam chair, I'll give you a thumbs up whenever we're ready to begin.

I call this Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission to order at 10:10 a.m.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: This Zoom webinar is being live streamed on YouTube on The Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission YouTube channel.

For anyone in the public watching who would prefer to watch via a different platform than they are currently using, please visit our social media at Redistricting MI. Can you hear this? Okay.

Thank you.

Our live stream today includes closed captioning. Closed captioning, ASL interpretation, and Spanish and Arabic and Bengali translation services will be provided for effective participation in this meeting. Please E mail us at Redistricting@michigan.gov for additional viewing options or for additional details for accessing Language translation services for this meeting.

People with disabilities or needing other specific accommodations should also contact Redistricting at Michigan.gov. This meeting is also being recorded and will be available at www.Michigan.gov/MICRC for viewing at a later date.

This meeting also is being transcribed and those closed-captioned transcriptions will be made available and posted on the Michigan.gov/MICRC website and written public comment submissions. There is also a public comment portal accessed. Michigan.gov/MICRC.

Members of the media who may have questions before, during or after the meeting should direct those questions to Edward Woods III, Executive Director For the Commission at WoodsE3@Michigan.gov or 517 331 6309.

For the public watching and the public record I will turn to the department of state staff take note of the commissioners present.

>> SARAH REINHARDT: Good morning, Commissioners. Please say present when I call your name. Please let us know where you're attending remotely from. I'll call on Commissioners in alphabetical order starting with Elaine Andrade.

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Present from Imlay Township Michigan.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: I apologize. Can you repeat that?

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Present from Imlay township, Michigan.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: It seems we've having audio issues.

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Present from Imlay township Michigan.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Donna Callan.

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: Present from Mexico.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Juanita Curry. Anthony Eid.

>> ANTHONY EID: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Brittany Kellom.

>> BRITTINI KELLOM: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Rhonda Lange. Steve Lett.

>> STEVE LETT: Present. Lee county, Florida.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Marcus Muldoon.

>> MARCUS MULDOON: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Janice Vallette.

>> VICE CHAIR, JANICE VALLETTE: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Erin Wagner. Richard Weiss.

>> RICHARD WEISS: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: 10 Commissioners are present and there's a quorum.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you, Ms. Reinhardt. As a reminder to the public watching, you can view the agenda at www.michigan.gov/MICRC. I would entertain a motion to approve today's meeting agenda.

>> STEVE LETT: So moved.

>> CHAIR ORTON: So moved and seconded. Is there any discussion on the topic? Seeing none. All in favor of approving today's meeting agenda, raise your hand and say aye. Aye. Any opposed, raise your hand and say nay. The meeting agenda is approved. Without objection, I will ask MICRC Executive Director Edward woods III to present the purpose of the public hearing today. Please proceed, Mr. Woods.

>> EDWARD WOODS, III: Thank you, Madam Chairperson. I'll share my screen. Good morning, everyone. You can say back "good morning!" Can we hear you a little bit louder? Good morning, everyone! There we go! We're happy to have you here live and present at the Second Ebenezer Church. We're excited about hearing the feedback as the commission deliberates and comes to a decision as relates to the final map for this Michigan House of Representatives in light of the court order for the seven reconfigured Districts. We would like to give a shout out, and I'm not sure yet if he's present, to the church and Bishop Edgar Vann II. I know he's coming, and we want to give him an opportunity to greet the audience, if he's not here yet. We'll interrupt the meeting and give him the personal privilege. I would like to thank Tabitha Goodner and the entire team here for ensuring we're not only welcome but well taken care of during this public hearing experience. Also, I would like to thank the Southeast Michigan

Council of Governments who provided a presentation to the Commission along with the City of Detroit Neighborhood Department, the community organizations that continue to allow Commissioners to come and present, whether it's virtual or in person, to educate folk on the redistricting process, our civic leaders, pastors, community neighborhood leaders. I want to give a special shout out and thanks to council President Mary Sheffield, house member allowed us to come and present and other council members who are calling and lining up presentations for the Commission to share about the redistricting process. I also want to thank our volunteers who are out in the hallway who are registering people to speak and making sure we have a pleasant experience. Can we give everyone a round of applause?

Thank you. In 2018, voters passed a Proposal 2, a ballot initiative, for voters not legislators, to take responsibility for nonpartisan redistricting and created the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission. The Commission is comprised of 13 randomly selected Michigan residents that includes four affiliated with the Democrats, five who don't affiliate either with the democrats or Republicans. We usually call them independents, and four who affiliate with the republicans. The Michigan Independence Citizens Redistricting Commission is responsible for redistricting the U.S. congressional, Michigan House, and Michigan Senate Districts. It has no jurisdiction, I repeat, no jurisdiction for county redistricting or the city of Detroit redistricting.

The seven-ranked redistricting criteria in the old standards, the old way, we had APOL standards. Named after the gentleman who created them. It's not an acronym. And that really focused on keeping county, city, and Township boundaries. In this new process, I repeat, this new process, the Commission is required to follow based on the constitutional amendment the seven steps listed on the screen in order! In ranked order. They can't flip it. They can't change it. They can't vote and try to rearrange it. They have to follow it in order.

Number one, equal population in the Voting Rights Act. Number two, geographically contiguous. Number three, reflects State's diversity and communities of interest. Number four, no disproportionate advantage to any political party. Number five, no favor or disfavor to an incumbent elected official or candidate. Number six, reflect consideration of county, city, and township boundaries. And number seven, be reasonably compact.

These are the seven mandated ranked redistricting criteria that the Commission is required to follow.

The Western Michigan District court southern division, this is a U.S. court, found the Commission drew maps focused on race in violation of the 14th Amendment, the Equal Protection Clause, and disenfranchised Black voters. There was no finding, I repeat, no finding or guidance given regarding the Voting Rights Act from this panel. This court ordered the Commission to reconfigure the state how's Districts, that's why we are here today. The state house Districts 1, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12, and 14 and not focus on race. Even

though we have the Voting Rights Act is the first ranked redistricting criteria, the court directed the Commission to not focus on race and to draw the maps race blind. The Commission did do a voting rights analysis at the end of the process, but not at the beginning. So just want to share with you what we were told to do by the three-judge panel.

Why should you care about redistricting? Redistricting is your chance to make sure your voice and your community's voice is heard and represented. If you remembered earlier, we shared the seven ranked redistricting criteria. The third criteria is reflect the state's diversity and communities of interest. What is a community of interest? A community of interest is a historical characteristic, a cultural characteristic, or an economic interest. For example, the Commission, when looking at historical characteristics, they looked at neighborhoods. They looked at neighborhoods. That's why we asked the Southeast Michigan Council of government, why we asked the City of Detroit Neighborhood Department to provide a presentation so we could understand the neighborhoods, I repeat, the neighborhoods in the city of Detroit. Culture characteristics, as you know, the middle eastern and north Africa population is not represented in the census, and they are grouped in with Caucasian people. Nevertheless, they're a community of interest. We want to know all the cultural characteristics as it relates to community of interest. Whether it's LGBTQ, whether it's the Bengali population or any other population, we're interested in knowing about those communities of interest because in this new redistricting criteria, the communities of interest, in some cases, cross county, municipal, and township boundaries. We're required by the seven ranked redistricting criteria to place a higher priority in keeping the communities of interest together versus county, municipal, and township boundaries. The other one is economic interests such as river front property or communities that are bordered by river front. It could be art District, entertainment District, whatever the economic interests may be. We're interested in knowing about that community so we can keep it whole. Redistricting keeps your community together, as we shared, so you can #showupandspeak up on behalf of your community. Whether you do it in-person here, whether you do it remotely, or I repeat, if you go online and enter your comments through the public comment portal or the mapping comment portal.

Redistricting will help make sure your elected officials reflect your values or important issues, such as health care, education, public safety, and justice.

Why we're here? We're here to hear directly from you regarding the nine draft proposed maps and one individual map. We want to understand what map best represents you and your community of interest as is or with minor tweaks. We want to learn from your feedback to select the best map in compliance with the Court order and the seven-ranked redistricting criteria.

Yes, yes, yes, we want public comments! We expect a dynamic experience just like we had yesterday at Greater Grace. We share the guidelines, so people know up front what we're expecting. One, you have up to three minutes to speak. I know you heard 90 seconds, well, the Commission changed it, and you have three minutes to speak. And guess what. You can speak twice! You can speak twice. So you can have a total of up to six minutes, if you sign up twice. You address the Commission as a whole, and not an individual member. Once again, the Commission speaks as one voice. You address them as a whole and not an individual member. Number three, any person making personal, impertinent, or slanderous remarks, or should become boisterous or disruptive while addressing the Commission may be requested to leave the microphone. We want to keep it professional, ladies and gentlemen, keep it 100 right here. So we can follow some courtesy. Respect is given both ways. I believe we can have a very orderly process.

If any person disrupts the orderly process of the meeting, or refuses to comply with applicable MICRC guidelines and rules, the Chairperson may rule that person out of order and/or order their removal from the meeting. This is the last-ditch effort. We don't expect to use this effort. We haven't used it so far. So we ask we continue to make sure we have a meaningful dialogue and knowing in advance you'll comply. We just thank you for complying with these guidelines.

Once again, I want to invite people to show up and speak up. You can like or follow us on Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, or Tiktok. You can submit public or mapping comments at www.michigan.gov/MICRC or you can call us at 1-866-MAP-FAIR, that's 1-866-627-3247 for questions or information. Once again, we're happy to have you here on the Eastside of Detroit. And we welcome your comments! Thank you so much. And, Madam Chairperson, we'll turn it back to you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you very much, Mr. Woods. Individuals who have signed up and indicated they would like to provide in-person public comment to the Commission will now be allowed. We will start with in-person public comment and then we'll move to remote public comment in chronological order. You'll have three minutes to address the Commission. Please conclude your remarks when you hear the timer. First in line to provide public comment is number one. And since we don't know your names, we'll just call your number. You can introduce yourself, if you would like. We would like that!

>> SPEAKER: Hi. My name is Mona. I'm a pharmacist and community organizer. I'm here today to give you a little bit of background about my lovely community. Our community is under the umbrella of the Arab community. But there are a lot of differences between the Yemeni community and the remaining Arab community. There are a lot of disparities because of, you know, disparities in socioeconomic opportunities back home, in education, in the schools are a new phenomenon. They're only 60 years old. To the rest of the Arab world, they've had schools forever. There's a lot of

disparities. And here in Dearborn and Wayne county, this community is such a hard-working community. A very committed community. Despite the disparities that they suffer from, uniquely suffer from, they've been making strides in education and different professions, and they now want to be politically engaged and want to have representation. One thing I want you to understand about this community is that it's the fastest-growing minority community in Wayne county. In the city of Dearborn alone, this city makes over one-third of the population, yet they still don't have any representation on city council or on charter Commission. Because we have at-large elections. This community came together and wanted to advocate for Districted municipal city elections, and we were shut down. I'm going to be very frank; this effort was shut down by the Arab establishment themselves. So the two only Arab Commissioners on the charter Commission voted "no" against Districted elections, which is mind boggling because we all know Districted elections is the only way for adequate representation of our different communities and our unique communities. So recently six of the seven council members live in the affluent West side of Dearborn, and eight of the charter Commissions live in the affluent West side of Dearborn. We have no Yemeni representation on it. The reason I say this, it's the same with the House State District. And there's an alarming, alarming pattern with how the certain organizations, Arab organizations, are advocating for certain Districts.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: I'm sorry. Your time is up. You're welcome to sign up for a second.

>> Speaker: Okay.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number two.

>> Speaker: Good morning. My name is Christine. I'm an academic librarian. In my so-called spare time, I'm an activist of political and nonpartisan issues. I grew up in southwest Detroit and currently live in -- I've been there for over 23 years. And I urge the adoption of the map. It's constitutionally fair, impartial, and transparent in this application. It also has Districts that cross 8 Mile between Oakland county and Wayne county, which adds to the idea of regionalization versus the "my county is better than your county" sentiments. Among the maps, it is the best balanced of the criteria for redrawn maps, including partisan fairness, equality, Voting Rights Act standards, common sense, contiguous borders, and, for the most part, keeps community of interests together. Maybe some tweaking could be done there. Obviously the office of the map collaborated well and listened to the Detroit voices. It has almost the most Districts for minority voters to have representation. If you are split county pieces. It's very important that a Commission map, and not a map drawn by a special master, be chosen by the Court. That is the Commission's promise to the people of Michigan to design a map that serves all the voters. In my opinion, the Motown Sound is most likely to pass that test. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: For addressing the Commission. Number three.

>> Speaker: Good morning. My name is JaCarter --

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: I'm sorry. We can't hear you.

>> Speaker: Good morning. My name is JaCarter. I'm from zone eight. I lived in the Dexter area, and I've lived there for the last 58 years. It's a great area! My granddad was married to Barry Gordy's auntie, and I saw the area go up and still going up. And I just appreciate being here today. And I'm just here to help the area get better. I thank you for letting me speak today. I appreciate it. Have a good day!

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Before we go to the next one, just a note that Commissioner Wagner is here. She joined at 10:18. And number four.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Apologies for the interruption. Commissioner Wagner, where are you joining from.

>> ERIN WAGNER: Remotely attending from Maiden township.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Go ahead.

>> Speaker: I'm looking at this situation, this map, almost like a Biden/Trump situation. Why should we be remapping? Okay. One of my coworkers is saying we can't go across the borderline and try to make decisions over there. Why is another city or township coming in our area and make decisions where it's predominantly Blacks. It seems like the red line, like you're putting us back in time again but doing it in a secret way. We can't make decisions in 1. And everything is gathered around Detroit. As the lady said, majority of the Blacks in Detroit. And it seems like you're red lining us. This quorum and you come across to tell us what we need to do and the decisions we need to make. That's my bottom line. You're making difficult laws after laws. It's like -- us more. That's my opinion. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number five.

>> Speaker: Hello. My name is Kathleen. I basically have a question. It has been for years about the insurances and how much Detroit pays and I wanted to know with the redistricting will our insurances go down? Will we get more benefits? Because the District has changed, or will it be the same where Detroit pays higher bills or higher insurances than other townships or communities here in the area?

>> ANTHONY EID: So we don't decide that. The politicians in Lansing decide that. You know, they passed an insurance reform bill a couple of years ago, is my recollection. What this does affect is the people who you will vote for who will then go to Lansing. So it kind of affects it in a downstream way, but we do not directly affect that issue. What we're affecting is the people who will be on your ballot, the community that will be in your District, and then it's up to you later in November and August to then vote for your reps who will then make those decisions in Lansing.

>> Speaker: Okay. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you very much. Number six.

>> Speaker: Hello everyone. My name is Naza and I'm a community member of Dearborn, Michigan. An Arab American Muslim woman who was raised here all my life. I think it's really important to know that I come from a disadvantaged community, a vulnerable community. A community that is -- has one of the highest levels of air pollution in the country. Who has, you know, endured flooding, and most recently, you know, a hike in anti-Arab and Islamophobic rhetoric that is affecting safety of our community, which is why I urge you today to keep our communities together. We not only need representation who look like us, but actually share our values and know, you know, our deepest worries. So I urge you today to adopt Motown and include Melvindale. I'm aware it's exceeding population. We are going to have another group that was working on a map from the community of interest that will present to you today. Thank you so much for your time.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you very much. I think I lost count already. Was that were you number seven? Six. Okay. Seven.

>> Speaker: Good morning. I'm Nalda. I grew up in southwest Detroit. I'm here to support the maps. Our community in southwest -- I've been here for going on 52 years living here. And I would not change my community for anything. We're a tight community. Which we look out for each other, try to support each other, and try to make our community much bigger and better. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number eight. Number eight. No one is claiming it. Number nine. 10.

[Laughter]

11. I don't know who has these numbers but -- 12.

>> Speaker: Good morning, everyone. My name is Hera Cahn. I work heavily in the areas particularly within the Muslim community. And I want to say before I begin that the Muslim community is extremely diverse. The Muslim community encompasses parts of the Arab American community and the African American community, south Asian community, and Latinx communities. These are communities that have been disenfranchised and marginalized and deserve to be completely represented in our democracy. And the best map in our assessment that represents those communities is the Motown Sound map with the inclusion of Melvindale. Again, to my colleagues' point, we realize that may exceed the population map, and there will be maps shared later today. Please be on the lookout. These are communities impacted by similar issues, systemic health disparities like asthma and cardiopulmonary disease, cancer, and other socioeconomic and infrastructural issues. So that's our recommendation today. Thank you so much.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 13.

>> Speaker: Good morning to the honorable Commission body. My name is Christopher Johnson. I'm the President of the Community Council. The map that I think would be best to represent my community would be the Motown Sound. With this change that we just had, firsthand knowledge that we did not get the representation that we were supposed to get. There's some things I could say, but I won't say at this meeting. I used to work in Lansing, so I know firsthand about the representation. We got partial representation while part of the representation was excellent from our community, another part wasn't. The problem that I see is that with these changes, we need to see the representatives for this area be in the area. The lines were drawn when they go across 8 Mile. Then if you have to go across 8 Mile, go across 8 Mile. We need representation. We have a diverse community. And like the person who spoke before me, my community is very diverse, but we do need representation. So I hope this body would take the recommendation of the Motown Sound.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 14.

>> SPEAKER: I'm here to say we strongly agree with the Motown map. It is ready verse. It's collectively, socially, and economically sound in our eyes. But my constituents strongly disagree with the Tulip Map. It's such a disparity in economics, definitely a disparity in social issues, and Wayne County have nothing in common. Not economically, not ethically. We don't -- well, we have Peter Wang -- as said. We have a problem with environmental. We have a problem with the health issues, particularly the air quality which also has possible health issues that Macomb doesn't have. There's things we're fighting for legislatively, collectively and Macomb doesn't have them. You better make sure that the communities are not getting addressed. They don't have the economic mediums. We're talking \$20,000 to \$30,000 difference in economic median. So I want you to reconsider the Tulip Map and adopt the Motown map.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 15. 15. 16.

>> SPEAKER: Good morning. I just want to make a statement that I live at borderline Wayne and Macomb. As they have spoken on, we can't combine the two. There's nothing that we have in common. I can't go to Macomb and get services. And Macomb probably can't come to Detroit and get services. So I strongly support the Motown Sound redistricting. I think I'm saying it right. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 17.

>> SPEAKER: Hello. My name is Antwon Herman. Born in Detroit. So I definitely support the Motown Sound. I currently live in Taylor, and I just want to say please keep Taylor as a whole. The area's Black population is split up between different Districts, and there's really no need for that. One for all and all for one. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 18.

>> SPEAKER: I just -- my comments that I support the Motown District. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thanks. Number 18. Number 19.

>> SPEAKER: My name is Amanda Costello. I'm a resident of metro Detroit, and I'm an organizer for Southeast Michigan, including the city of Detroit. I'm here to reiterate those supporting the Motown Sound map. It is the best for partisan fairness and -- yeah. Just here to amplify those voices.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you. Number 20.

>> SPEAKER: Hi. My name is Gabriella Richly. I wanted to amplify the other voices in the room and share my agreement on the Motown Sound redistricting and my support of it. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you. 21.

>> SPEAKER: Good morning. Reverend Ryan Reece House District 14, at present. I want to thank the Commission for your efforts. It's nice to actually speak to you in person this time. And, also, I'm here along with many others to support Motown Sound redistricting map. I've looked over the VRA, VRA is solid. There are 11 Districts of opportunity. It's making an effort to make sure that 1 that is listed is still being followed through. It is avoiding the strange attempt at merging the communities that seems to be present in several of the other maps that is both nonideal and does not match any sort of COIs in the area. Personally, I find it to be a good map that does not disenfranchise the voters inside of our region. It is one that is ideal. I live in what would be one of the Districts that is set up in that, and I work just south in one of the others. And I can speak to both communities from the last 17 years, that I feel that the Motown Sound is very reflective of the two sets of communities that are right there in the south, north Detroit area. It crosses 8 Mile in appropriate ways. I think the effort that was made as far as the redistricting map was very solid overall. I definitely do not like the Bergamot maps at all. The constant effort to have so much focus around 8 Mile is a firm boundary the way it works doesn't seem to be appropriate in any way, shape, or form. I would stress that the efforts made in the Motown Sound to protect partisan fairness should be appreciated and I fully support that. Thank you very much for your time. I'll speak to you again in a few minutes.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for your comments. Number 22. 23.

>> SPEAKER: Hello. My name is Karla. I'm a Detroiter for life. My only thing is, I need you to go back to the original map because evidently, we had good representation as far as being a Black community. We don't need to be bothered with Macomb or Oakland. Anything crossing 8 Mile stays across 8 Mile. Anything below 8 Mile should stay below 8 Mile and we should be together because, first and foremost, it wasn't like that before. Why are we trying to do it now? You were just doing some gerrymandering and I don't believe you should change from what works so well to where we, as a Black

race and a community, we had voice, we had direction, and we still do. And my name is Karla with a "K" and first and foremost, if it's not broke, don't try and fix it! Go back to the original of what we had. Let Grosse Pointe stay with Grosse Pointe, Warren with Warren, Ferndale with Ferndale, East Point with East Point, East Point changed its name from east Detroit, so since they changed their name, they didn't want to be bothered with us. They can stay over there on the other side of 8 Mile. Just like Alexander Young senior stated. You don't like what's going on in Detroit, head to the 8 Mile and as far as I'm concerned, go back to where we started. If it ain't broke, don't fix it.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Kara, I have a question. Karla? My question is, when you say "go back to the original" you're talking about the 2010 redistricting?

>> SPEAKER: No. Whatever changed it to negate the Black community, that -- you need to go back to where it was when it kept the Black community's vote together. See, you trying to do this on the sly. But some of us are not dumb. We may not all be Ph.D. educated, I'm a Masters educated. Even if I didn't have a Masters, I remember from 1973 on up what you all did. Ya left, now you want to come back, and take everything back. You changed the laws to where the taxes take everything back from us. No. Take this mess and go sit on it. So now I'm going to do my pimp walk like Obama did when he got Hussein. See ya.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Okay. Number 24.

>> BRITTINI KELLUM: I know Karla you're leaving, but I wanted to say not just to her but the rest of the folks sitting here. So we're a body of 13 folks that were randomly selected. I'm a native Detroiter. Some of us are from other places. We're not politicians. Prior to this process, people went in the back room and voted and drew maps however they wanted maps to be drawn. I understand the frustration of the Detroiters and other Brown and Black communities I understand the frustration of my people where they feel it's a process they can't trust. But I urge us, right, to not push down our pain. That's what keeps the fuel going. When we remember from when we came and how we were oppressed. However, if we're focused on that and don't look at the opportunity we have, you've never seen maps that reflected your areas and actually had a time to talk about it. So now this Commission, whether folks are white, Black, Arab, whoever is up here, you look past that, and this is a time to draw in the places that you live. We are in Detroit because we have to redraw and get Detroit right. So we can't go past the frustration of how things used to be knowing it's still up to politicians, knowing that people still want to vote for their friends and have whoever in office. That's up to the representatives to do the job. I said this yesterday and I'll say it again today, this is the alley-oop for the people. This gives you all a chance to talk where representatives were not listening to you. So if you go to sleep, if you're too angry, and if you say "no I can't do this" then you're going to miss out on these maps. You're going to miss out on people desperately wanting to get it right.

It's not a mistake that we're at Second Church today. It's not a mistake we're at Greater Grace yesterday. We know, I know, where people congregate, where people like to get thought leadership and that's church. That's a beauty shop, that's at the living room tables. So, you know, we are here earnestly listening. We're not a part of how things went wrong. Because we pay taxes, we're citizens, I have a whole day job. My buddy Marcus has a job. Cynthia is a grandmother. We're regular people that were chosen to listen to our own people. So I hope you all receive that.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you, Commissioner Kellom. Number 24. We have lots of people that have left the room. 25.

>> SPEAKER: Hello. Hi. My name is Mary Rhymer. I live in Ypsilanti at the moment. My family is originally from Roseville, Michigan. I also think that the Motown Sound map is the best one. I think District 13 and 12 are both well done. And it represents the communities in Roseville and East Point well. I think using Kelly Road as the dividing line effectively partitions the different business Districts in the area. I think that's sensible. And I also think this map Motown Sound is the one that complies with the Voting Rights Act and gives representation while also keeping with -- and that's it. And thank you for the work you're doing.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you very much for addressing the Commission. Number 26.

>> SPEAKER: Good morning. Pamela Dewberry. District 1, the Motown. I just want to say the purpose, what is the purpose of all this redistricting. If things had been left, this would not have happened. Just piggybacking off Karla. She gave very, very good information to a lot of us -- for those that are here. And if we -- you all could look at what we do, how we do it, and why we do it in our community, you would get a better understanding of the redistricting. Leave it alone.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 27.

>> SPEAKER: Hi, again. It's Mona. So I'm in support of the Motown Sound map. With the addition of Melvindale. I would suggest taking out West Dearborn and putting it with District 15. Melvindale, southwest Detroit have more in common as a community of interest than they do with the affluent west Dearborn. And historically, in our District, federal, state funds everything has been inequitably allocated to the more affluent side. And our communities have been neglected. Also, these communities share similar struggle, like it was mentioned, similar, you know, for those cities that I mentioned, similar ethnic and cultural and religious backgrounds, socioeconomic status, newcomer immigrants with language barriers, environmental racism corporate polluters, and broken infrastructure, and they have similar home values unlike west Dearborn, the multimillion homes. And I just want to reiterate one thing. I want to ensure the committee that as a community, we're not seeking to restore my community's voting power on the expense of minority's voting power. I want our communities uplifted all

together. I would love to see Melvindale in Motown Sound and take out west Dearborn and get it into District 15. The current lines for District 3 and 15 look fine to us. It gives the Arab community a chance to have two Arab representations. But by changing the lines and including west Dearborn with District 3, it decreases -- it reduces that amount of Arab population in District 15. So it's going to be difficult for them to have representation. So I just want you guys to keep that in mind. I thank you so much for all the hard work you're doing. I know it's a lot. And that's about it.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission.

>> SPEAKER: Can I say one more thing?

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Time.

>> SPEAKER: I have 30 seconds. Let me say this quickly. There's an attempt to gerrymander District 3 to make it easier to certain ethnicities to get re-elected. And that's why you see in most of the maps, and I'm sure ABC advocated for this, it's either Melvindale community being pushed -- of the Yemeni community. That makes it for the current rep easier to get re-elected. It makes it impossible for a Yemeni to ever have representation and run in one.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you. Number 28.

>> SPEAKER: Good morning, everyone. It's good to see everyone. Glad I was invited out. My name is Walker. Lifelong resident. Going on 49 years. I am here in support of the Motown Sound. But however, I just want to echo my sentiments with our sister in the red. My mother and my dad came here from the South. And over the years, I've seen the economic disparities due to the redistricting and the red lining. In my observation, for God allowing me to wake up every day. And my observation with the redistricting, I see housing resources being stripped from residents. I also see watershed offs. I've also seen children taken away from their mothers because of water shutoffs. And all this redistricting talks since 2011. I've been serving since 2011, and I've seen people stripped of their dignity and respect. During this entire process. School closing. All this conversation, to me, not blaming y'all, but I just want to be here as a witness in real time to let this honorable -- Black and Brown people were stripped of basic needs and necessities. And all this conversation and talk about how we're going to cut up the cookie, it is all about the other people, the have and have mores taking our resources. Detroit is a title I city. It's billions and trillions of dollars that are here. For some reason, with these conversations of redistricting and all the cookie cutter it's about taking resources from Black and Brown people. I'm telling you to see it in real time, I thank God he allows me to wake up and keep on fighting the good fight, but it's hard to see Black and Brown people being stripped of housing and schools and high water runoffs, food insecurities because one side of the block want to take 90% and leave us with 10 and get up and go to work in Mercedes-Benz and whatever. That's a conversation for another day. I want to thank the elders in the room for allowing me to speak. Because if it wasn't for you, I wouldn't be here. Thank you for

allowing me to rest on your shoulders. But our lawmakers and our honorable body up there, I want you to think of the voiceless, the downtrodden and forgotten. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing us. Number 29.

>> SPEAKER: We meet again one last time. House District 14. I'm a little bit more of a number cruncher, in some ways, I'll admit. I stand with everyone, as I've said before, in favor of the Motown Sound. Looking at the numbers, the compactness, in particular, is generally handled very well in Motown Sound. There's an effort to avoid packing, particularly in the East Detroit area, which I noticed in a lot of other maps, there was a considerable tendency towards packing voting blocks that was resulting in very problematic results from VRA standpoint. The very -- well, misrepresentation that has been so loudly and passionately spoken about today, I can see where many of the other maps actually have that problem very real. Motown Sound makes a clear effort to avoid this. While at the same time trying to pay attention to the Dearborn communities, to the Arabic minorities that we have in the portions of west Detroit, Dearborn, Melvindale and other areas. I think it's important we not forget the COIs along that portion of town. I'm not from that area, but I know there have been a lot of concerns those people have. Really, it's the only map that I can see that has made an effort in this regard. It's one of the only maps that does not have this strange redistricting along the Grosse Pointe areas that I to this day do not understand the notion of. I cannot find the COIs. I've been to that area many times; I live not far from that area. I cannot see the COIs that make justification for some of the other maps. So, by all accounts, I stand firmly in favor of the Motown Sound. I want to thank you very much for the opportunity in talking to you guys now for a little over a month. It's been a pleasure! Thank you very much for taking the time to hear us out. And I will be praying for you guys to make wise decisions in the days to come.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you. Number 30.

>> SPEAKER: My name is Kassandra Ford. I grew up in Detroit. So what I'm about to say, I guess, is the sister who spoke in the red, that's any sentiment. I do not understand what's going on with all the maps. I have to admit I'm really not educated on this issue. I do remember when they started coming up with the independent District and started putting out feelers to try to get people in those jobs to figure out what to do. I see you guys have a committee that are trying to do that. What I don't understand is how we got here. How did the city of Detroit get divided up into so many different Districts? How did that happen? And why. I know that you all have a job. And I respect that. Y'all trying to do what needs to be done that you've been appointed to do by this Commission. But I guess I'm -- because I'm, like, I don't -- it's so mind boggling. I looked at all those maps, and I'm confused as I don't know what. I'm, "like, I don't get it!" You know, when I grew up Mayor Young was the mayor of Detroit. He said it, I didn't understand it, once I moved to East Point. I got it. I got it. There is a difference in the way people are treated. My grandchildren would walk down the streets, the lady down

the street would call the police and say they walking -- that was untrue. They were children. But the police would come out because they felt they had to respond. We had meetings with them and talked about this. They would even admit that, yes, we got people in our community who are racist. We got people who do this all the time. But we have to respond. And so it's a difference where you live and who you get to represent you. I've lived in East Point 25 years. I'm telling you I've seen a lot. The mayor who was there actually got some changes done in the city. When I come into the city hall, I can see people that look like me. That never happened before she got elected. Now she's out, and we still going through the same thing over and over. So I'm saying to you all, if there's any way y'all can put Detroit all together so that the people have an opportunity to vote for themselves, it's only when you're able to represent yourself and know what's really going on are you -- do you feel you're a part of the system. Without that, with we are outside of it. I'm just -- I know that what I'm saying you're probably "oh -- maybe I don't. This is what I feel, and I've got friends of mine who are not here, who feel the same way! They live in Detroit. They feel the same way. So I really beg you to take a look at putting it all together. And not splitting it up like it is right now. Thank you.

>> ANTHONY EID: I might be able to clear up some of those. And then I got a question for you. So come back up! Thanks. So Detroit has a population of around little less than 650,000. These Districts that we're making are about 92,000. So we got to split it up somewhere. And that's why we're here today. We're trying to figure out how to split up that 630,000 into these 92,000 blocks. And that's why we're here. Now we also are here to do the Senate District in a couple of weeks. Those are bigger Districts. That has about 270,000. In that configuration you know, you can have it be a little more Detroit centric. But given that we do have to split it up somehow, I really would like you to take some time to look at the maps that we have back there and let us know which version you like best.

>> SPEAKER: I did look at them. They're all confusing to me. Why is it, it has to be 92,000 people?

>> ANTHONY EID: Well Michigan -- this is for the whole State of Michigan. We're the redistricting Commission for the whole state. Not just the city. And Michigan has about 10 million people, that's what the last census showed, and we have 110 house seats in Lansing that represent, you know, the State of Michigan. So if you divide the numbers up, about 10 million divided by 110, that gives you about 92,000. So that's where the 92,000 number comes from, we didn't create that number. It was created in the Michigan Constitution whenever they did that. Because there's 110 house seats.

>> SPEAKER: So it's always been that way?

>> ANTHONY EID: There's always been 110,000.

>> SPEAKER: It's always been 92,000 people to be represented by one person?

>> ANTHONY EID: Well no. Because there used to be more people in Michigan.

>> SPEAKER: Okay.

>> ANTHONY EID: You have to divide the whole population. When Michigan had, like, 14 million people, back in the day, they would then divide that by 110 and all of the Districts would be bigger. See what I'm saying?

>> SPEAKER: Yeah. I guess I do.

>> ANTHONY EID: If you stick around, too, during the break, I can come around and, you know, help you with the maps. Maybe we can figure out which one you like best.

>> SPEAKER: I will stick around until about 1:00.

>> BRITTINI KELLUM: I wanted to add, I think sometimes, not sometimes, but in this conversation two things are coming together at once. Right. The historical trauma and legacy of racism and how it trickled into the Detroit area. My mother would kill me, and she watches these meetings, because I'm her only child. My mom is 67 years old, sorry, mom. She's always been a native Detroiter. She tells me stories about being bussed to the schools. The first Black kid, the Detroit riots. So when I sit here, I'm not just sitting here in glasses going -- I have a deep understanding of the legacy of my city. Red lining is what has been done to Black people from Jim Crow era who dictates who gets what money. Some of the issues being brought up today are very true and valid, but they come from the legacy of racism and discrimination in the government that has influenced how reps make decisions and how they choose. This is an opportunity that we know that still happens and it's horrible, this is an opportunity for citizens to get mad, get informed, like you all are doing, ask questions, slowly understand and say "oh!" Now that we have 13 people that don't represent politics in a traditional sense, but are living and engaging in the State of Michigan, some of that can be canceled out by choosing a map where representatives actually have to work hard and don't get to decide off the legacy of injustice and disempowering Black and Brown people and Arab folks in the metro Detroit area and Detroit. Does that make sense to you? So it's not, like, these lines are enforcing or, you know, massaging red lining's miserable spot. But it gives citizens an excellent opportunity and interesting one to engage so they can fight back slowly. You know, they have the thing called incremental change. I don't like that incremental change means somebody is still being hurt. This is a way to have big change, if we properly engage. If that makes sense.

>> SPEAKER: Yeah, and I understand in an ideal world what you're attempting to do. We still live in that world you just talked about.

>> BRITTINI KELLUM: Absolutely.

>> SPEAKER: That's the problem.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you. Number 31.

>> SPEAKER: Good morning. My name is Faith Harris. I don't represent anybody. I'm just a voter. The only reason why I came, I saw the commercial about this meeting on TV. And I decided I was tired of people making decisions that affect me and I don't know what is going on. So I brought my mom. I'm confused, too, a bit. I thank you, the

gentleman that was explaining it to the lady before me. It's a little bit helpful. I just want my voice to be heard! That's it. I want my vote to count. And I don't get why what has to be fixed that wasn't broken kind of thing. It's kind of crazy, but if you have to change it, please go by the Motown Sound. It seems to be a little bit more fair. If you're going to change it. I pray to God that you listen to the voters! I know you said why change it? If you're going to change it, if it has to be changed, then be fair to everybody! Be fair -- do what's right. I know you're not politicians, but I'm just tired of my vote going and then somebody doing something different than what I want. I want my vote to be heard! I want you to do what's right. What is fair. Now you shouldn't change what doesn't -- what's not broken, if you have to do it, do it fairly. That's all I have to say.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you. I will say, before I move on it. We have to do it every 10 years following the census. It has to be Districted because people move. People change locations. That's why we are doing this. Number 32.

>> SPEAKER: Hi. My name is Laurie. I live in Hunting Woods. I'm back again. I was --

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Sorry. We can't hear you very well. Can you pull that down a little bit?

>> SPEAKER: Hi, Chris! My name is Laurie Leasey. I was at the church yesterday, and I came to advocate for the Motown Sound. And Commissioner Kellom, I appreciate you asking me a question afterwards. I talked about tweaking it to increase the partisan -- to make the partisan fairness better. And you asked me how I would do that. So I went back, and I talked to Ryan, and I went home, and I studied all the statistics and the maps. I'm still not smart enough to tell you how to do that. But I did look at the data for partisan fairness and I compared it to the hickory map, which is the one I think we have right now. And in some respects, it's actually more partisan fair than the Hickory was. And so I'm kind of just here to tell you guys good job! I'm scared if we do too much tweaking, we lose some other benefit of the Motown Sound. I also want to say, I really appreciate the voices of the Detroiters who are most affected. My District will change as a result of this, but I really think this is democracy in action! It's kind of almost made me tear up. I mean, you guys have been great at explaining and asking questions and listening to people. So kudos to you! I'm still in favor of the Motown Sound, and I just felt compelled to drive over here today and tell you keep up the good work!

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for driving across town! We're glad that you came again today. We're so grateful for all of you for coming out today. Number 33.

>> SPEAKER: Good morning. My name is Crystal Bailey. I didn't know I was going to be speaking but the lovely ladies up front suggested it. Actually kind of, like, made me. I took a number. So I'm actually excited to be here. This is very informative. I am in favor of a map, and I like the Motown Sound. But the reason why is because I'm a

former oak Park school board member, former Vice President, and I thought keeping Oak Park together just made sense. I think bringing it into Detroit helps with the whole reason of redistricting. And I liked being a part of this. Again, I'm Crystal Bailey. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for taking a number and speaking up. We appreciate it! Number 34.

>> SPEAKER: Good morning. My name is Virgil Smith. And part of this process. I was a part of the -- I was a member of the committee that drew the lines over a decade ago. I was a member of the Michigan Senate at the time. The Tulip maps and the Bergamot maps are bad, as far as I'm concerned. I don't understand why this Commission keeps breaking up Royal Oak township. It's two voter precincts. Majority African American cities and you're splitting it. I don't understand it. I understand that Eastside with the population loss on the Eastside makes it difficult to draw. If I have to pick my favorite map out of this is Waterloo. That keeps -- it doesn't break 8 Mile as much as the other maps. Look, the demographics, the politics, the social economics of 8 Mile are completely different. You put us -- I'm in District 14 right now. You put us in with Warren, East Point, the suburban cities and the Detroiters are not necessarily getting represented. We're losing races based upon the Hickory map. The compactness -- I understand you guys are trying to keep partisan fairness, but the compactness of that map is terrible. That's why we're here today. And I hope you hear what these people are saying. You know, breaking 8 Mile causes real problems. And it's not working. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. 35.

>> SPEAKER: Hello again to this Commission. There were a few things that I wanted to say, but I didn't have my notes with me. I have notes. But, first of all, what I should have said, too, is thank you Commissioner Kellom for helping to redraw these maps and the Motown Sound map. That map is actually, I think, one of the best deals for all interests. Voters of Color made clear in 2018 that we wanted maps that reflected communities of interest and did not favor one party over another. But with this redistricting that we just previously had, that's what it did. It made a divide. The gentleman that spoke before me spoke of Royal Oak township. The township has been suffering. And even with the redrawing of the maps they did, what happened to the representation? They're still having issues, but I think if you keep together as well as Oak Park, I think those interests will be better served. Where you have one person that can put their effort into that and, also, to some of the other people that spoke, the Motown Sound is Commissioned best map for partisan fairness with Arab American communities and some of the other larger communities in District 3. So thank you again. I do appreciate this Commission on what you're doing. I think actually this has been a great effort. And I hope when it comes to the senate redistricting, as well, that you will take these things into consideration, as well. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you. Number 36.

>> SPEAKER: I wanted to make a comment, as long as it took to get here to make a vote -- people die for us to make a vote. Okay. To have a say so in our life. You know what I'm saying?

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: I apologize for the interruption. Please speak into the microphone.

>> SPEAKER: We need to come together and make a decision together. You know, no one is here. I don't understand it. As long as it took us to get here. I think about Rosa Parks. You know what she went through. We need to get together and we need to come in majority to do issues with like this. That's what I'm saying. And if it doesn't -- if it's not broken, don't try to fix it, people. In the name of Jesus Christ, I pray to you, please, please. And thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you, sir. Number 36.

>> SPEAKER: Good morning to this Commission. My name is La Tonya Garrett. If I had to pick a map today it would be the water lily map. Just for the sake of keeping us on the south side of 8 Mile. If I had to think about Royal Oak, the spirit of Detroit and Motown. Currently I'm in house District 7 and move to 4. It would be a whole new District, which I don't like, but I know with the process we have to do something. So, again, the water lily map would be my first choice for today. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you. I think that is all of the people that we have in person right now. Is there a 37? I don't believe so. I'll go back through the numbers that weren't here at the time they were called, and if you're one of these numbers, please come to the microphone. 8, 9, 10, 11, 15, 22, 24. Don't see them. Okay. So then, at this time, we will move to remote public comment. Without objection --

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Madam chair. I apologize. Do you have a 37 and 38?

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Okay. 37. 38. I don't see them right now.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: I believe they're still looking at the maps right now, so we might come back to them. 37 or 38, you want to say something? No. Okay. Then without objection, vice chair will facilitate the remote public comment portion of today's agenda.

>> VICE CHAIR, JANICE VALLETTE: Thank you. I'll call your name and our staff will unmute you. If you're on a computer, you'll be prompted by the Zoom app to unmute your microphone and speak. If you are on the phone, a voice will say that the host wants you to speak and prompt you to press "star 6" to unmute. I will call on you by name or the last four digits of your phone number. Also, please note that if we have -- if you have experienced technical or audio issues, we do not hear from you for three to five seconds, we'll move on to the next person in line and then return to you after they are done speaking. If your audio still does not work, you can e-mail redistricting@michigan.gov and we'll help you troubleshoot so you can participate

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

during the next public comment at a later meeting. You'll have three minutes to address the Commission. Please conclude your remarks when you hear the timer. First in line to provide public comment is Claudia Aboud. Please allow our staff a moment to unmute you.

>> SPEAKER: Hello. Can you hear me?

>> VICE CHAIR, JANICE VALLETTE: Yes. We can.

>> SPEAKER: My name is Claudia Aboud. I live in Plymouth, Michigan. I'm reporting from Wayne county. We support the Motown Sound map when you as a starting point. We ask that you also look at Districts like d4, 88%, and d588% that neighbor rock. It could be unpacked to address concerns. Arab Americans and more broadly people from the middle east and north Africa region are not protected under the section 203 because language minorities are determined as certain language minority groups who are unable to speak or understand English adequately enough to participate in the electoral process. However, we have shown through our COI map that Arab Americans are a sizable population and language minority. Under section 2 of the federal Voting Rights Act, Arab Americans are not protected as a language minority. When it was created, we were not a sizable community. However, as we have shown through our access COI map, we're a language minority and now a more significant population with shared interests and similar needs. Moreover, we have no protection from being packed or cracked as a community. The federal VRA was meant to be the minimum standards, and nothing precludes you from extending those rights to Arab American communities. We have shown through the access community of interest map, that this community has particular needs. With that in mind, for the state house maps, we are requesting that this community have fair representation across two minority/majority Districts. To do the population limitations for each house District we ask you take our COI into consideration as you begin mapping changes for the senate maps. Thank you.

>> VICE CHAIR, JANICE VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Next in line is Adam. Please allow our staff a moment to unmute you.

>> SPEAKER: Can everybody hear me?

>> VICE CHAIR, JANICE VALLETTE: Yes, we can.

>> SPEAKER: All right. I'm Addam Beddawi. I live in Washington, D.C I work for Access, however. I'm here asking for this Commission to keep the access communities of interest together. Those are the Arab American and middle eastern and north African communities. I want to echo a lot of the same comments made by Claudia previously. Including support for the Motown Sound map. As a starting point. I wanted to just mention that we think about the minority and majority Districts for our communities of interest, we see those Districts, they could be unpacked would help address concerns, authorized or included in the federal VRA. I want to mention that a lot of work that we do on behalf of Arab Americans and service of Arab Americans is due in large part to the fact they're not protected under federal law, including under the

federal VRA on including as language minority groups. You know, as language minority group, even if -- Arab Americans are many of whom are unable to speak or understand English adequately enough to effectively and actively participate in the electoral process, are in need of protection. And so we've shown through our map how Arab Americans operate as a sizable population in the language minority group. When the federal VRA was created you know, Arab Americans were not a sizable community, but we had representation and organization. Now we've only gotten more organized, more significant as a community. And it's half past time that reflects in the way that this -- these maps are drawn. And so, you know, we've shown through this map our community of interest map C15310 have the particular needs and due to the population limitations from each house District, we ask you take our community of interest into consideration as you begin mapping the changes for the senate maps. Thanks to the Commission for this work. You know, hearing the comments in the previous section and in-person. I think it's a lively discussion. It's an important discussion. And I urge the Commission to take our community of interest, the Arab American and broader population into consideration. So thank you.

>> VICE CHAIR, JANICE VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission. I guess we have one more in-person we're going to take now.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Number 39. Maybe they didn't stay in the room. Okay. We'll continue with remote.

>> VICE CHAIR, JANICE VALLETTE: Next in line for remote comment is James Gallant. Please allow our staff a moment to unmute you.

>> JAMES GALLANT: Can you hear me?

>> VICE CHAIR, JANICE VALLETTE: Yes, we can.

>> JAMES GALLANT: James Gallant. Marquette Suicide Prevention Coalition. These are my opinions. It seems like a common thread is going on through most of these testimonies. And I've watched you in Detroit today. And I agree with Commission Kellom. We need a process we can trust here. I'm going to ask you again to hire a real parliamentary to get reported recommendations, and please request the hon rather general finish the procedural audit he was supposed to do. Edwards woods stated on the record while the motion on the pending -- and that analyze whether you had followed those procedures you had approved. That never happened. He just went through the financials on that. So please do that. A couple of things about the fairness part. You know, doing the wrong thing for the right reasons is still wrong. And you have to follow the rules to change the rules. And where there is no law, there is the least amount of real liberty. And that is doing on here. It says if you folks are -- it's like -- it's like improvising at the comedy club. You folks are suspending the rules by consensus as you go. And then slipping in and out of the following the rules for this facilitation rule without a motion pending. And about the affiliation of the political parties. I thought was rule number 405 of the securities act of 1933, identifies common

control of a corporation as a definition of affiliate. So the voting numbers of the democratic party of Michigan together collectively control that corporation in Michigan. So you have to be a voting member of the democratic party to affiliate and republican party to affiliate with those corporations in Michigan, I believe. And, also, with Sarah Reinhart. Call the role and determine a quorum. In the constitution it says the secretary of state should do that. I think it's identity theft of the title of secretary of state. That's an elected official. That's a mistake of Dr. Nancy to put that in there. They should shuffle it off to the staff, I like to say it says in the constitution that this Commission is housed in the legislature. We've never talked to anybody in the legislature about the administration of this Commission. And the Secretary of State was supposed to transfer the approved constitutional amendment language to the director of budget. Where is the oversight going? They said they don't have that. So the Secretary of State hijacked this Commission. And then she's instilling her own employees to run it. See, I think it's a conflict of interest. Sarah directly informed by the Secretary of State. That's her boss. She better do what the Secretary of State wants, or she'll lose her job.

>> VICE CHAIR, JANICE VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Next in line is Norah. Please allow our staff a moment to unmute you.

>> That participant is not present.

>> VICE CHAIR, JANICE VALLETTE: Next in line is Kyle Stefanski. Please allow our staff a moment to unmute you.

>> SPEAKER: Good morning. Can you hear me?

>> VICE CHAIR, JANICE VALLETTE: Good morning. We can.

>> SPEAKER: Great. My name is Kyle Stefanski. I'm a proud resident of the city much Warren. I want to thank the Commission for the hard work you all are doing. I know it's not easy work but it's very important work. So the Commission has heard from many of us calling for a District that would cross the 8 Mile line. This must be done in order to have a Voting Rights Act compliant map. Warren should have a say in and be represented across multiple Districts, being the third largest city in the state. You guys heard Warren with the Motown Sound map. The new District 11 would give south Warren and north Detroit the joint representation we have been calling for since before this Commission was a twinkle in the eye. We reject maps like water lily and Bergamot that reinstate racial gerrymandering in our community. I implore you to pass the Motown Sound map. Thank you for your time.

>> VICE CHAIR, JANICE VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Next in line is Anthony Scannell. Please allow our staff a moment to unmute you.

>> SPEAKER: Thank you Michigan redistricting Commission, independent redistricting Commission. I'll start to say, I think it was really good that you guys printed out maps on a poster-sized board. That's a great call. I'm not there to see it, but I can sense the engagement from those physical maps to look at. Not everyone likes technology. Okay. Next opinion I have on the maps. Is a no on Tulip because it splits

southwest Detroit and District 1. I think those comments were echoed yesterday by a decent number of people. I would also say please make the city of Taylor whole again. If it ain't broke, don't fix it. If it is broke, you probably should fix it and Taylor is broken. Many people have said that over the course of this month, or so. Next point, I would say please drop the Supreme Court litigation. It's not well advised. Do you really want the outcome? I think based off public comment, and the election results, we don't really want the outcome in Supreme Court anyway. If you want to continue all the litigation, I would say hopefully to the Agee plaintiffs, please just challenge the congressional maps. Have the MICRC come back and redraw the congressional maps, too. I would hope the plaintiffs would do that. In 2024 Michigan at the center of the political universe with the presidential election. Probably one of the most important swing states. That's an exciting time. And the people who we vote for in the state house and the state senate, I always like to take note of who I see them, you know, getting together with the higher candidates. They like to ride the coat tails, let's say. You'll see them campaigning with or making social media posts that refer to, let's say the governor, a higher office holder, or even the President. It's an interesting factor that plays into your process here. Who we chose is who will be the wing man of our higher office leaders. Thank you. That's all I have for the time.

>> VICE CHAIR, JANICE VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Next in line is James Gallant. Please allow our staff a moment to unmute you.

>> SPEAKER: Can you hear me now?

>> VICE CHAIR, JANICE VALLETTE: Yes, we can.

>> SPEAKER: Thank you very much. These are my opinions. James Gallant here. You kind of -- I hope that the community here and the people of Detroit kind of, you know, you're not getting with your churches and your groups. And it's like the people of your city, your county, your charter Commissions. What are they doing? They're cheating. They're not following the rules. Republican members of this Commission, you have the back door deals that you're not going to follow the rules. And you're getting run over and all of a sudden Commissioner -- uses the rules against you. Let me show you how this works. This is one of my examples is in Wayne county canvassing board, in the 2020 presidential election for Joe Biden, they voted twice on certifying the election. Well, how do you vote twice on the certification? The first time failed. Failed to certify. And Michigan could not have failed. Could not have certified the election in Wayne county had not certified. And the whole country could not have certified Joe Biden if Wayne county had not certified that election. And yet the democrat, the member of the democratic party then made a motion after a couple of hours of rewriting it said, hey, how about we make a motion to approve the certification, but we'll get you that audit, the procedural audit you're talking about. They said yeah how about they do that. They did that. The paper said they reconsidered their decision. They didn't reconsider their decision because they did a motion to reconsider. All they

did is make another motion to just stomp out the other one that failed. And then what was interesting was the democrat immediately after the vote then motion to waive reconsideration. Oh, yeah. Really? Wait a minute. It means that the democrat and the other members' rights were violated because they had the right to reconsider that first motion. The motion had been exactly like that motion. The democrat knew that. I believe he's an elected official now. And we're good to go. So you go to your county Commissions, you go to the city, you go to the church basement groups and guess what. People are not following the rules. So this Commission should actually do a training on how to do a motion, second, first. That's how you need to know the question first. And please give us the transcripts for April 8th, 2021, when you did the pledge of allegiance thing. You did vote. It says you voted. It says you deliberated first. You said the deliberation was first. Then you, yeah, and, oh, you didn't want to lose your relationship with Commissioner Kellom and the vice chair. That should be a, you know, code of conduct thing. We needed to figure out the rules here and follow them. I'm saying what they are and determining why you're not following the rules because it's not in the amendment. Who told you that? Did Mike tell you that behind closed doors? Just do it.

>> VICE CHAIR, JANICE VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission. So we have more people who have signed up in person. I see people are actively looking at the maps. If I call your number and you don't want to leave the map yet, we'll call on you again later. Number 39. Okay. Number 40. If you're -- if I call your number and you aren't wanting to come up, -- or wanting to come up, raise your hand so I know. There's people walking. I can't tell if they're walking up here. It's a little hard to see. Number 41. 42. 43. Okay.

>> SPEAKER: Hi. I've looked at the maps. I want to go with -- I like both Motown Sound and Spirit of Detroit. But I if have to offer one, I'll do Spirit of Detroit. I like both of them.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for taking time to look at the maps and tell us specifically.

>> SPEAKER: This is my second proceeding. I've been watching. Thanks.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you. Number 44.

>> SPEAKER: Hello. I like the Spirit of Detroit map. It keeps us all together. So I think that would be the best for our District and our community. Thank you. And I've been watching, too. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you. We appreciate it. Okay. So we have some time left, and -- go ahead, Sarah Rinehart.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: I received a request for a second virtual public comment. For, like, another one from someone. Do you want to switch to that real quick?

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Sure. That's from Mr. Anthony Scannell, if you can allow us a moment to unmute you.

>> SPEAKER: Thank you so much, Commission. I'll be very brief and say to the Commissioners that affiliate -- they identify as affiliating as one of the two major parties, I will just ask why you would want to affiliate with -- to me, I don't see how you can describe either of these groups organizations as anything but organized crime. I don't know why you'd want to affiliate with those. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission again. So I -- unless one of the numbers that I called that hasn't come up yet wants to come up, I think we'll take the opportunity to have a couple of Commissioners go back to the maps and maybe describe some of the reasons that we made the choices we did in the various maps. So if anyone who is interested can go back to the maps and look at them with us. And then we'll return to public comment when people are ready for that.

>> Let's gather around about why these maps look the way they do. We can start over here. We're kind of going to take it in a progression from what we did and then how we improved upon it, until we get all the way down and hopefully go through all of the options here. Now how I keep these organized in my head is by how many Districts they changed. So let's start with daisy 2 here. This map only changes the Districts that the Court order said that we have to change. And it kept everything else the same. That's why you see some of the old Districts in the hickory map carry over. Such as Districts 5, 6, 13, and 9. Again, this map only changed what the Court told us we have to change. We then move on to Tulip down here. So thank you. Tulip is this one is Tulip. It changes what the Court we have to change plus three more. Districts 4, 9, and 13. But, again, it still keeps some of the Districts from the original hickory map in the area such as Districts 5 and 6. And we did it this way because the Court said that we have to change the Districts that are reasonably necessary to change. So we have to do some experimenting on what does it mean? What does it mean to be reasonably necessary. And that's going to be up for the Commission to decide and what we need to hear from you folks. Now after this map, we get into some of the other ones like Bergamot, Spirit of Detroit, Water Lily, Motown Sound. Those make further changes, but they'll have the same. So this one changes three more. All of the other ones change eight more.

[Question]

>> In this one. Five and six in Tulip and the one we were looking at. Daisy two are the same as the hickory map. Exactly. That's why we have the other options. If we go to this option, Water Lily, -- okay. If this map is -- so, again, only on the Tulip map we have the 10 options here. Right. If you live in District 9, if Tulip is adopted, this would be your District. So your District would go kind of this District 9 kind of encompasses

downtown up through the educational centers, up through the North End and then up the river. So that would be the District you voted in.

>> SPEAKER: What would they give me? What is my --

>> So when the people who run for office, they have to run in a District. Right. Exactly. Huh huh. So when you get ready to vote in August and in November, the people on your ballot are going to be determined by, in part, by these District lines. Then those people that live in the District are going to decide, hey, should I run in the District? If they run in the District, you get to decide -- we all can vote --

>> SPEAKER: They come in here. I don't get anything.

>> That's up to you to vote.

>> SPEAKER: If they come in here and I vote for them, then whatever they do is I have to suffer. That's what I'm --

>> Yeah, but that's anyone. And that's the beauty of democracy, right? So let's move on real quick. I know there are questions but let me describe some of the maps first and then we can answer some questions. But like I said, we then progressed to the different configurations that are in Bergamot, Water Lily, and Spirit of Detroit, and in Motown Sound. And that's when you get into some of these differences we've heard today. We've heard a lot of support for Water Lily. The biggest difference in Water Lily from Spirit of Detroit and Motown Sound, in my view, is that Water Lily, as you can see, does not cross 8 Mile very much. The division between Wayne and Oakland and Wayne and Macomb counties. And that is the big kind of thing with this map. It doesn't cross that 8 Mile boundary very much. Now if we go to Spirit of Detroit and Motown Sound, and I'll let Commissioner Kellom talk more about these. They're essentially the same configuration, except for this Eastside of Detroit. The only difference pretty much the only difference is between Spirit of Detroit and Motown Sound are here in Districts 10, 12, and 13. Right in this area. And I'll pass it on to my fellow Commissioner to talk about these two maps.

>> BRITTINI KELLOM: So the Spirit of Detroit, thank you Commissioner, he does an excellent job in explaining the maps because he loves to map! So Spirit of Detroit and, as he said before, Motown Sound are different iterations, like different additions of kind of the same map with major changes. So we started off with Water Lily and then we ended up with Spirit of Detroit. Spirit of Detroit was one of the first -- one of the big first attempts for the Commission to really draw from the standpoint of neighborhoods and street names. If you go back to Youtube, and I was taking my turn to draw this map, I drew purposefully saying familiar streets and areas. Because, in my view, even though, you know, we have a lot of Detroiters in the room, we experience Detroit differently, people's neighborhoods is meaningful. I was talking to a gentleman from the community that said I grew up in the Fitzgerald community, but people don't necessarily know I'm from District number. Especially if it changes and our street names mean things. We have an idea of what it is. We know where 7-mile is. We know some

people say McNichols. Other people say 6-mile. That's the Spirit of Detroit. So this map when we were drawing this, so I guess it's obvious. It crosses 8 Mile in some points. We also know that there are communities of interest, you know, there are Black people that live across 8 Mile. We know they -- there are migrations of Black populations that live in western Wayne, as well. So this map, to me, is the first time where the Commission intentionally started to cross 8 Mile in a way that gathers communities together. Even if you're a Detroiter, you know Oak Park, Ferndale, and Detroit have a symbiotic relationship. You're crossing 8 Mile but there are things, most people have some sort of business or enjoy something in Ferndale. There are school Districts where Detroit children attend from Detroit and go over to those areas. There are schoolteachers that were native DPS teachers that are now helping children in Ferndale and Oak Park Districts. It made sense. It didn't feel like a leap. We're not merging areas of, you know, northwest Detroit with, like, Birmingham. Okay. When you really look at the map. And the same thing with the Lakeshore District. We have the Lakeshore District is talking about themselves as a community of interest, and that is true from their standpoint, right. They have Grosse Pointe Academy. They have their country clubs and parks that are important to their community. There are also some things like Harper Woods wanted to be in with the Lakeshore Grosse Pointe community. We have warning side, Cornerstone, and east English village came out strong. You said "leave us out of the points" this is a map where we intentionally did this. We said, okay, as Detroiter, I think they can be in with East Point. Uh-huh. So then what I personally gnaw I'll speak for myself what I enjoy most about the Spirit of Detroit in this first attempt, we didn't lock out the other Districts. So the Court said these are the Districts you have to change. Right. These are the Detroit Districts you had to change. When we started to do that in daisy two and Tulip, I'm like we can't change what we want to change. And when I was getting at this one, I came up with an analogy. If someone gave you a cutout of the star and told you to draw a sun in the middle of it. You could draw the sun, but the sun might not look the same. So that's what I found happening as we were collaborating as Commissioners. We had the cut out and we had to, like, stamp Detroit, southwest, Dearborn. That didn't make sense to me. We ended up with Districts that, like, if we look at District 8, as an example, in some maps because we locked out all the Districts, we ended up with, like, downtown and midtown being pushed all the way to Ferndale and, like, the Palmer Park area. Yes. In some of the maps you'll see that. I'll take the opportunity to say that these maps represent choice. It's not every Commissioner or the Commission as a whole saying "oh, we love these maps so much." There are some that we like more than others. A lot of the Commission or some Commissioners like Spirit of Detroit. A lot of Commissioners like Motown. A lot of Commissioners like some of the other because of the efforts that were behind it. So don't look at any map and take it personally. If that makes sense. We didn't want to give the community two maps. Because that doesn't feel like

democracy. That -- yeah. That feels like we took -- yeah. This is more choice. Right. So in some of the maps, you'll see us trying certain things. Okay. And then when you look at Motown Sound, that is, like, Spirit of Detroit on steroids a little bit. So I'm kind of just -- full-time yeah. So I was saying Motown Sound changes the Lakeshore District. That's the biggest change. It puts -- you want to say something? Okay. It puts some of the deeper parts of Eastside into District 10. I see some heads shaking. It's okay. It curves -- go ahead. So District 10 is Morning side, east English village, Grosse Pointe, Harper Woods, and Morris -- and I'll also say this, right, so I think Commissioner Eid, you've heard us talking about this before. When you look at a map and you say, okay, this makes me uncomfortable for a community. And you probably have heard this discussion in Melvindale. The discussion of the Yemeni community and giving representation there. When you don't like something, give a suggestion it keeps in mind the population we were talking about of the 91,600 folks because if we were to take just taking an analogy a lot. Detroit stay below 8 Mile. I have two feelings about this. The concept of red lining and all other things that we're talking about then we're packing Detroit in ways that also are unconstitutional. So it goes back to representation. Your reps getting out there and doing the work for you that are beyond the lines. Like, they have to do the work. The people that we fill in the bubble for have to do the work. But, also, what it means is other communities are disempowered and disenfranchised. It also includes Black people. These are the folks we're hearing a lot about and Detroit has the make of. When you look at a map like Motown Sound, think about where the population will go if Detroit stays below 8 Mile. Detroit is already a compact city. It has a lot of population. So some is a math gain. Some of it is demographics. Some of it is geographical. I think it provides a unique opportunity for people to find community in folks that don't look like them. It forces you as a citizens to be accountable to somebody who might have a completely different story line, which is, you know, what the folks that have come out speaking about Melvindale have recognized. Right. Okay. We want Melvindale to be here. But then where do the 12,000 people go? What does it mean for District 1, 4, 8, all the Districts around it. Does that make a little bit more sense?

>> Where does it go --

>> ANTHONY EID: That's a good question. And this change when you look at 10, 12, and 13. That change was made specifically to better comply with the Voting Rights Act. That's why District 10 and 12, especially, look that way. The two Voting Rights Acts Districts instead of one in Spirit of Detroit. Yeah. 10 and 12.

>> I guess when it comes to numbers, I don't know the populations of all of these things. It's impossible for me to figure out, you know, where 92,000 people are.

>> ANTHONY EID: Yeah. It's hard. And there are a lot of factors to consider. The Voting Rights Act is more so about minorities having the opportunity to elect somebody

of their choice. The 92,000 number, because of the population of the whole State of Michigan.

>> Okay. The 92,000 and say this is how you -- this is -- to allow minority populations to be represented.

>> ANTHONY EID: No the Districts have to be about equal population. That's the number one criteria. The Districts have to have about the same population in each District. About 91,600. Around the same number of people in every District. Right. Because think about it, like, one person, one vote. Right. If one District had 10,000 more people, those voices wouldn't be heard as much versus a different District. Then we got two more down here. We got two more down here. We got Bergamot and Bergamot 2. The big difference is in these two maps, is, again, these don't cross 8 Mile very much. But, really, the biggest difference between Bergamot 1 and Bergamot 2 is the -- how the Lakeshore is configured. So you can look at Districts -- yeah. Mainly District 10 Grosse Pointe and St. Clair Shores are configured. That's the big difference between the two. You have District 10 here. That's 10 in purple. It stops at Grosse Pointe. It doesn't go into Detroit except the small part of Cornerstone Village, but 11 is a Detroit District. Right. As you can see, on this one, 10 includes Harper Woods in 10. Along with the Grosse Pointes and St. Clair Shores. Whereas in this one, here, Harper Woods is with District 12 along with East Point and the Outer Drive area. So the big difference between those two, again, is Harper Woods and if it should be with the Lakeshore or if it should be with Detroit and East Point. Yeah. If you look at Spirit of Detroit or Motown Sound, as an example, these Districts are together. These cities are together.

>> The biggest city here --

>> Yeah.

>> And it contains two other cities. But it has to be broken down.

>> ANTHONY EID: Yes. And all of the Districts, also, have to be contiguous. They have to touch each other. You can't just split off because they're located within the city of Detroit. See what I'm saying.

>> Right. --

>> ANTHONY EID: I don't think so. There are Centerline. Centerline is kind of like a different city inside -- I don't know of a city inside of another city like Park is. Previously Detroit had, like, 10 -- people in District 5 and 8 and 9 will get to decide who they vote for. Right. And then hopefully, right, that person -- let me give her the mic back. One moment.

>> ANTHONY EID: I hope that little exercise helped everybody get to know our maps a little bit. Do we have any more public speakers?

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Since members of the public are enjoying looking at the maps, I think we'll take a 10-minute break. And then we'll come back. We have a

few more public comments. And before our lunch break. So we will come back from break at 12:30.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Okay. People had time to look at the maps and they had the explanation, which I appreciate the Commissioners that gave those explanations. So if we can finish our public comments before the lunch hour, that would be good! 39, are you ready to give public comment? I'm going to list a few numbers, and if you're in those numbers and ready to give public comment, come on up! So 39, 40, 41. 42. So 39 clears up to 47, actually.

>> ANTHONY EID: If you have a "4" in your number, please come to the microphone!

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: We got 20 minutes until lunch. We have a few numbers to get through. Three minutes each.

>> ANTHONY EID: 48.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Go ahead. Tell me what number you are.

>> SPEAKER: I'm number 48 --

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: I can't hear you. Can you scoot closer to the --

>> SPEAKER: Can she hear me now?

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Yes.

>> SPEAKER: My number is 48.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you.

>> SPEAKER: My name is Tina. How you doing? Hello. How are y'all? Y'all okay? What I'm trying to find out, really, basically is the representation of my community. Who from Detroit helped in designing the map did y'all find anyone that represented, you know, the community? The redistricting council seems as though it doesn't represent me and, you know, I'm not just a voter, I'm a citizens of this, you know, this city. I'm trying to figure out why. I know for a fact that a person like me applied to be on that council since -- in office. And it was always rejected that I wasn't a strong voter. And wasn't a registered voter. When I actually was registered since 18 years old and voted. Jim Carter, my first President. I don't know. It lets you know I'm older now. I haven't seen anyone that I know who was represented in our community. Is there someone that's represented in our community? Where are they? Do they speak to us? From Detroit?

>> ANTHONY EID: Well, we got three Commissioners that currently live in Detroit.

>> SPEAKER: Who are they?

>> ANTHONY EID: I'm one. Commissioner Kellom is one of them. And one more on Zoom. Juanita Curry. And we have a few from Metro Detroit and the rest of us are spread out from around the state.

>> SPEAKER: What were y'all decisions in drawing the maps?

>> BRITTINI KELLOM: I can speak for myself as a Detroiter. Not representing all Detroit and definitely not all Black people. When I took my turn to draw the maps, I drew from familiarity. From neighborhoods and keeping neighborhoods together.

Because I consider those areas communities of interest in Detroit. I'm originally from six-mile area, the Fitzgerald community.

>> SPEAKER: I live in Fitzgerald.

>> BRITTINI KELLUM: My mother went to Fitzgerald. So I went to Baits and Barton, at one time was on Teterboro, I drew maps based upon where I know Detroiters and Metro Detroiters live, play, work, and stay and wanting to stay together. We know Grandmont is a large community. We know the Fitzgerald community is a strong community. I'm just naming communities.

>> SPEAKER: I'm in the --

>> BRITTINI KELLUM: Exactly. So I drew from that standpoint. And many of the other Commissioners to my left also contributed. And weighed in on neighborhoods in Detroit. We also had to consider population. For the house maps, we need about 91,600 folks.

if you're not understanding the process, it looks like "why can't we just --"

>> SPEAKER: I can understand.

>> BRITTINI KELLUM: I don't mean you personally. But you in a community. If someone is not understanding that piece of population, then they might not understand how we came to draw some of the things that we are drawing. But I'll speak for myself, it was important for me to keep neighborhoods together in Detroit because that is very sacred to Detroit. Block clubs, community centers, whether they exist or don't exist, they're still staples of the community. I know there's a lot of revitalization that people don't know about that is happening because of the citizens that live in the community. For instance, the Warren strip, six-mile, those things can't be changed or should not be changed because those neighbors need to be there to make some of those Black businesses and things that are coming into that area stay the way they are. As well as getting, you know, more resources. So that's how I draw when it's my turn and my Commissioners support me and help me draw in that same spirit. With having them to understand Detroit, as well.

>> SPEAKER: Well, I feel there should have been some economic sensibility in it, too. Because we do have to qualify for certain dollars. You know through, you know, how we're, you know, grouped in.

>> BRITTINI KELLUM: Yeah.

>> SPEAKER: You know what I mean? For resources, parks, infrastructure, things of that nature.

>> BRITTINI KELLUM: I'm sorry. Go ahead.

>> SPEAKER: I want to know, were those things also considered?

>> BRITTINI KELLUM: I think they were considered in terms of impact. Right. The things you're thinking about, funding, dollars, food deserts or food apartheid, as I call them, that's up to representatives. Once the lines are drawn, it's up to us as voters to vote the right people in office that care about the areas they say they care about.

Because we are random folks of day job, retirees, mothers, grandparents, folks that work in the auto industry. We're not politicians. We're not city council. We were randomly selected, and we represent different parts of Michigan as a whole. So those are things that are out of our immediate control, but are up to the representatives that we, as voters, elect to represent us in Lansing and beyond.

>> SPEAKER: Yeah, but we also if you draw the lines, we have to make sure we have that type of representation.

>> BRITTINI KELLOM: Exactly. That's why we're here with the 10 maps behind you trying to get it right. If you like a map, tell us why. If you hate a map, also tell us why. Because it's the opportunity. Then we're going to go back and tweak those maps and vote on the best map that represents the community and everyone that has spoken out in the hearings and online and in person. We're going to put it all together and have a very spirited debate about the maps that make the most sense.

>> SPEAKER: Okay.

>> BRITTINI KELLOM: Thank you so much for being here.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Let me know what your number is.

>> SPEAKER: My number is 30. I've got a better understanding of the maps now and what is going on. And because I am from East Point, almost every map will work but the one with East Point with the St. Clair Shores. It's butted up with St. Clair Shores. St. Clair shores is a huge community. We cannot go into their parks or any of the things they have in their neighborhood. They make it clear unless you're a resident of that city you're not allowed in those areas. So please do not put us in St. Clair shores.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing us. Go ahead. Let me know what number you are.

>> SPEAKER: I'm number 42. I'm a precinct delegate in Detroit, 248. For over 40 something years! As I look at the map, I would appreciate it if, and I think it's called Bergamot, either Bergamot or Bergamot 2. Either one of those. It looks like it keeps Detroiters in blocks. And the reason why I would advocate for that is because currently as they stretched up the map, the other communities don't really play well in the sand box with Detroiters. So our District now goes all the way up to West Bloomfield and they're not so welcoming. They're not so open to Detroiters and the representative also doesn't really come down to the rest of the part of her District. So it would be better if the maps in the Bergamot -- something like that, if you kept Detroiters in block. As a first person told you before me, some of those communities are not welcoming. They don't even try to be welcoming. They're very emphatic about you not being in their community.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you very much for addressing the Commission. Is there anyone else that has a number -- that has a number. That wishes to talk. We'll take any number!

>> SPEAKER: Hi. I'm in the 12th District Morning Side. I was looking at Motown Sound. As I look at it more, I like Spirit better for my community, rather than Motown. Unless it's changed back to, like, what it was. Because I'm looking at all these places that I'm surrounded around, and somebody just mentioned about the parks. Grosse Pointe is not going to let us in their parks. St. Clair Shores is not going to let us in their parks. Woods I'm good with them. But Village is not going to let us in there either. So I prefer us to be like what we was. So Spirit. That's all I have to say.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you. We appreciate everyone who has come out to be with us today, to voice their opinion, or just to ask questions and look at the maps. Is there anyone else who wishes to make public comment? Not seeing any. I think we'll just break a little bit early for lunch. So without objection, we will recess for just over an hour for lunch. Hearing no objections, we'll recess until 2:00.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: I call this meeting back to order at 2:10:00 p.m. Will the secretary please call the roll.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Sorry about that. Absolutely, madam chair. Commissioners, please say "present" when I call your name, and if you are attending remotely and have changed your location since you disclosed it this morning, please let us know where you're attending remotely from. I'll start with Elaine.

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Juanita Curry. Anthony Eid.

>> ANTHONY EID: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Brittany Kellom

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Ronda Lange. Steve Lett.

>> STEVE LETT: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Marcus Muldoon.

>> MARCUS MULDOON: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Rebecca Szetela. Janice Vallette.

>> VICE CHAIR, JANICE VALLETTE: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Erin Wagner.

>> ERIN WAGNER: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Richard Weiss.

>> RICHARD WEISS: Present.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: 10 Commissioners are present and there is a quorum.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you very much. I will ask MICRC Edward woods to present the purpose of public hearing today. Please proceed, Mr. Woods.

>> EDWARD WOODS, III: Thank you, Madam Chair. Good afternoon, Detroit! How are you? I'm doing well. Thank you so much for coming out. We're very happy to have you here with us, and we're going to do a brief presentation with regards to our public hearing at Second Ebenezer. We're excited to be here. We want to express our

appreciation to the second Ebenezer church and bishop Edgar Vann III so we can hear from Metro Detroiters with regards to the reconfiguration of the maps, per the Court order. I would like to give a shout out to Tabitha Goodner and her team making sure everything was set up and working with our partners to enable this public hearing. The Commission heard from two organizations with regards to communities of interest. The Southeast Began Council of Governments and City of Detroit Neighborhood Department. We want to thank both organizations for being available to the Commission and making that information clear to us. Also, I would like to thank the community organizations and the civic leaders who have hosted us to meetings, invited us to meetings to educate with regards to this redistricting process. So definitely want to give a shout out and thanks to council President Mary Sheffield, council member Fred Dewhall and others who made sure that the residents have the information about the redistricting process. Last, but not least, we would like to thank our volunteers who are helping out with registration from the different organizations across the state to ensure that people can sign up and answer any questions they may have. So if we don't mind taking moment to thank those. We want to appreciate through a round of applause. Thank you so much.

History of the MICRC. In 2008, Michigan voters passed by more than 61%, Proposal 2, a ballot initiative, for voters, and not legislators, to take responsibility for nonpartisan redistricting and created by the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission. We're comprised of 13 randomly selected Michigan residents that includes four who affiliate with the democrats, five who affiliate with neither the democrats nor republicans, called independents, and four who affiliate with the republican party. The Michigan independence redistricting Commission is responsible only for the 13 U.S. congressional Districts, the 110 Michigan House Districts, and the 38 Michigan Senate Districts. We do not have responsibility for redistricting in Wayne or any county in Michigan or any city, including the city of Detroit.

There are seven ranked redistricting criteria. Seven ranked redistricting criteria. Unlike the eight post standards which was done by the person who came up with the Apol standards that focuses on keeping county, city, and township boundaries whole. The seven reranked redistricting criteria that happened the last redistricting cycle that the Commission fulfilled include: one, equal population of the Voting Rights Act, two geographically contiguous, three, with reflect the state's diversity and communities of interest. Four, no disproportionate advantage to any political party. Five, no favor or disfavor to an incumbent elected official or candidate. Six, reflect consideration of county, city, and township boundaries. And seven, reasonably compact. These are the seven ranked redistricting criteria that the Commission is required to follow, according to Michigan's constitution.

The Western Michigan District court southern division found the Commission drew maps focused on race in violation of the 14th amendment, the equal protection clause,

and disenfranchised Black voters. There was no finding, I repeat, there was no finding regarding the Voting Rights Act. They ordered the Commission to reconfigure the state house Districts 1, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12, and 14 and not focus on race. Even though equal population and the Voting Rights Act is the number one ranked criteria in the Michigan's constitution.

So just want you to know why the maps did not focus on race, was not because we didn't follow the constitution, but because of how the federal court ruled.

Why should you care? Redistricting is your chance to make sure your voice and your community's voice is heard and represented. Once again, when we speak as a community, we're talking about communities of interest. Communities of interest can be historical characteristics, cultural characteristics, or economic interests. We're looking at historical characteristics, we're looking at neighborhoods. That's why it was so important for the Commission to have the Southeast Michigan Council of governments and the City of Detroit Neighborhood Department to provide a presentation so we could understand the neighborhoods, not just in the city of Detroit but also those that border the city of Detroit. When we think of cultural characteristics, we're talking about, for example, the Yemeni population. It's known as the middle east north African population and heavily concentrated in the Dearborn area. Those can be considered communities of interest. Those that same the share culture. It could be LGBTQ, Bengali and others. We're interested in keeping those Districts, those communities of interests whole regardless of the county, municipal, and township boundaries. This is the new standard. The new standard for redistricting has seven ranked redistricting criteria, and most importantly, it invites you, as citizens, to come and tell us how we can ensure your community is represented by raising your voice, #showupspeakup, but also your community's voice, as well. In this new redistricting process, we're able to keep your community together. Redistricting will help make sure your elected officials reflect your values or important issues in your community, such as health care, education, public safety, and justice.

At this time, we are going -- do you want me to finish this one? We want to let you know why we're here. It's based on three reasons. We want to hear directly from you regarding the nine draft proposed maps and one individual map. We want to understand what map best represents you and your community of interest as is or with minor tweaks.

Number three, we want to learn from your feedback to select the best map in compliance with the Court order and the seven-ranked redistricting criteria. At this time, I'm going to turn it back over to our chairperson, and I will be back with public comment guidelines. Thank you so much.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you, Director Woods. At this time, we are going to try something a little different than we have done at the other sessions of public hearing. We're going to have some Commissioners come down and talk specifically

about each map and about maybe why they look like they do. If you have a quick question, you can ask the question. At that time. We can answer that. Then after that, we will do the public comment. So then you'll have your three minutes, if you sign up, to speak to us. And then maybe that'll help everyone be on the same page about which map you're talking about and what it looks like and things like that. So you're welcome to come closer to the map, if you want, or you can stay seated. There will also be shown up above on the screens.

>> ANTHONY EID: All right, folks. Test. Hello. Can you guys hear me? Hello? Hello. Hello. There we go. It's not close enough to my face.

So we're here today to hear from you. Which of these 10 map configurations you like best. To help you determine that. We thought it might be a good idea to go over why some look the way they do. I would like to note that redistricting is done all over the country every 10, according to the United States census. That's why it's important for all of us to fill out the census every 10 years so there's an accurate count on who lives where, and then we can get this right.

Now the data we have to use is according to the 2020 census. That census said there were about 10 million people in Michigan. Now right now, we're working on the Michigan House of Representatives maps. There are 110 seats in the House of Representatives, and there are about 10 million people in Michigan. That means that each one of these Districts has about -- just under 92,000 folks in each one. We know that Detroit has about 650,000 people. So this is about how do we create Districts for Detroit that are comprised of that population?

Now the first map we're going to look at here is called Daisy 2. This map keeps the former Districts that are in the Hickory map that this Commission passed previously, except for the ones that the Court said we have to redraw. So that's Districts 1, 7, 8, 10, 11, and 12. All around here. All around here. Yeah. So we got 1, 7, -- everything in the Metro Detroit area except for 9, 13, and 4. The other Districts that are around those, for this map, the Commission decided to keep the same. Just for this version. And it's kind of important because the Court said that we have to make changes that are reasonably necessary. So in order to determine what is reasonably necessary, we had to do some experimentation. And that's what this map represents.

Let's put up Tulip. So Tulip is a little different. It changes a few more Districts. In addition to the seven Districts the Court said we have to redraw. It also changes District 4, District 9, and District 13. But, as you can see, it keeps some of the other Districts that were in the Hickory map, such as Districts 5 and District 6. From this the Commission then moved on to a different configuration. So pretty much all of the following seven maps change what we just talked about plus eight more. That is what is an all of the collaborative maps. So we started here with berg month. It was a collaborative map that every Commissioner got a turn to draw. There's some important things on here such as the Districts not crossing 8 Mile very much. You have a District

8 that goes from the 8 Mile boundary down to midtown. You have a downtown District that goes up the river through Belle Isle/English River. You have a down river District that is comprised of Southwest Detroit, and then you have just other Districts that are configured to be wholly in Detroit and not crossing 8 Mile. And then when you cross 8 Mile and go into the suburbs, you have a District 6 comprised of oak Park up to Birmingham, and then 7 that is comprised of fern dale, Madison Heights, and Hazel Park. Now we have a different version of berg month 2 or Lakeshore. The only difference between these two maps is where Harper Woods is. In 2, Harper Woods is located within the Grosse Pointe and St. Clair shores communities. In the former map, Bergamot 1 map, it is a part of District 12 being with East Point, Morningside, East English village, and its neighbors. From there, we then created Spirit of Detroit. And you can kind of see, this happened organically. We made one map. We saw it, looked at it, tried to see how many Commissioners liked it, and what we thought we could improve. So Spirit of Detroit then took that map and tried to make really community centric changes in it. And I'll turn it over to Commissioner Kellom.

>> BRITTINI KELLOM: This is going to be a joint effort. You can still join in, Commissioner Eid. The Spirit of Detroit was our, I feel like, first intentional take to take into consideration that Detroit is built upon historic neighborhoods, and to residents that might not know about District whatever number they. They know street names, they know Fitzgerald, Cornerstone, East English Village, those areas. Right. So Spirit of Detroit does exactly just that. We kept whole communities and neighborhoods, particularly on the historical context of Detroit and Black communities within this map. Spirit of Detroit has Harper Woods in with the Lakeshore District. It has East point, East English Village, morning side, and Cornerstone village in District 12. These communities have been coming out strong and commenting on the map in terms of wanting to be together. It does great things for the southwest community. I'm not saying it's really great as, you know, Brittany Kellom, but the residents and citizens of southwest talked about Spring Wells, talked about these areas that are important to them and why the Latino and Hispanic community need to stick together. I'll also use this opportunity to say that sometimes, or during this process, we've been getting a lot of comments of why are these maps crossing 8 Mile. And for a lot of reasons. One, we have to go by demographics and geographics. We also have to account for populations. When you're thinking about a District crossing 8 Mile or whether it stays below 8 Mile, we take into account that we need the people to make the District. And I know that 8 Mile, the bridge, the structure has a lot of tension. Especially for a lot of Black people in Detroit. And I think I'll also use this opportunity to say that the redistricting process sets up an opportunity for the people that we are responsible as voters to elect, and then the same conversations in which you're engaging in this room, this is like the fire, the catalyst that should also start conversations that you have with your own representatives to talk about funding, to talk about food deserts, to talk about

school Districts. We're not the city council. We are regular citizens that have full-time jobs, grandchildren, whatever it is. We're not picked, you know, from -- from some special pile of people. But we're here because this is -- we're citizens engaging with other citizens to actually hear your voice in the way that politicians in the past were not. We know politicians went in the back room, they did whatever they wanted to do for the citizens of Detroit and elsewhere. So this has -- it gives the opportunity to have an open and transparent process to talk about the maps. So Spirit of Detroit is, again, the first time that we really slowed everything down and took the comments from almost three years about what Detroiters were saying about the neighborhoods. I think the next one is The River Walk. Here you can do it.

So the River Walk takes into account there are communities of interest, aka Black people that don't just live in Detroit proper. That there's migration within the population for a certain African Americans and this map creates a Western Wayne District to depict a community of interest that has asked for more representation. It was our attempt to see if we could create more Districts of choice for metro Detroit and Detroiters. From my memory, we weren't a huge fan of the metrics of the map. But, again, the maps that exist are so we're providing choice instead of just giving you two maps. It allows the citizens something to look at, and so folks can weigh in. Go ahead. He was just pointing -- thank you.

>> ANTHONY EID: So we have the lively debate going on. Do we cross 8 Mile or not cross 8 Mile. Some people think we should cross it to try to get rid of the historic red lining and systemic barriers of racism that happened in the Detroit area. Some people think we shouldn't in order to keep more wholly Detroit-centered Districts. That's a debate I'm sure we're going to continue to have and have every time this process takes place. But we've heard you folks. So we have this configuration, Water Lily that originated from the Bergamot maps we looked at earlier. This doesn't cross 8 Mile much at all. The only Districts cross 8 Mile in District 12 taking up a little bit of East Point. And District 10 that combines the points with St. Clair Shores, but that's not in Detroit anyway.

So, as you can see here, this configuration doesn't cross 8 Mile. It has similar configurations to some of the other maps we've seen. District 1 is similar, District 4 is similar. But then when you get to Districts 5 and 8, you see instead of going up, like, District 5 going into Oak Park it stays south of 8 Mile. Fern dale is not connected to Palmer Park and the University District areas. This is an option that doesn't cross 8 Mile.

That's a good point. This version also has Royal Oak township split between District 6 and 7.

So from Water Lily, we then made Willow. That's why they both start with "w." We wanted to show some progression. And Willow took Water Lily and tried to make a few more VRA compliant Districts. In order to do that, we found in keeping with the spirit of

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

Water Lily, the only way to do that was to, in fact, cross 8 Mile. So this map does cross 8 Mile, like some of the other ones. You can see, it does in ways that are similar to some of the other maps. Like District 5 only goes up into Oak Park. District 7 takes in Ferndale and Hazel Park. You don't have some of the Districts that we saw in the beginning in Daisy 2 and Tulip that go from Detroit all the way to Birmingham. I think this is the last one. So that brings us to Motown Sound. This is very similar to Spirit of Detroit. Really, in my eyes, the biggest difference between the Spirit of Detroit and Motown Sound is right here in the Lakeshore area. We wanted to try to create one more VRA compliant District. To do that, we reconfigured Districts 10, 12, and 13 to add in one more of those VRA compliant Districts.

>> BRITTINI KELLUM: In our previous session, we had a lot of feedback when we were engaging in this way with the participants, you all. And there was some comments about Cornerstone, East English Village, and morning side being in with Grosse Pointe. Because that is, in some ways, the opposite of what they had asked. And I think it would be fruitful in this moment to talk about how when you have mixed ideas or perspectives between two communities, it could allow, it's not promised, it could allow an opportunity for those folks that previously did not have a voice to weigh in on people that have had a voice for years and years and years. If you all understand what I'm saying. So while it may look, on the outside, it's not favorable for that community to be in with 10, I think it gives a unique opportunity to shake up some things that have been a certain way for a very, very long time. So just to get a little bit more specific, and then I think we're going to turn it over to the folks that have signed up for public comment. We have this map not splitting wild mere park. It improves compactness and adds to the Jefferson avenue. It keeps the community together for garden view and part of the Warren community. The weather bee neighborhood from 16 it puts in District 4 and added far west Detroit. So Rosedale isn't as chopped up. We realize there could be work, a little bit more work, possibly, that could be done to the Grandmont/Rosedale area. And it shifts some population south of McNichols into District 17. And I have some other notes, but it really aimed at improving on Spirit of Detroit by fixing the neighborhoods and improving or increasing the VRA for choice Districts. VRA is an acronym for Voting Rights Act. So I think that is all that I want to say about this map. The other thing I'll kind of throw in here that is maybe just more my opinion base, is we tried to keep neighborhoods that made sense together. Like in some of the maps, District 8, while in that map, things are below 8-mile, it does things like put this northwest side of Detroit with the downtown area. So on the outside, that could be, oh, we're working in Detroit together. Then you have to think about a representative or rep has to navigate all that space. It's quite different. Midtown is different than Highland Park, Green Acres, Palmer Woods. Think about these things. You can still tell us "don't cross 8 Mile, you horrible Commission, do something else" think about what it means in terms of population and the other criteria that we have listed that it went through. Ask

good questions. Give us the comments about the maps. You're more than welcome to look at the map, make a comment, and then change your comment and comment again. Because we cannot draw the maps if nobody is silent. Even if you're frustrated, still figure out the words to express yourself so we can do the best job possible. Because we don't want to do it over again! But we will if we get it wrong, I guess. Okay? Thank you all for being here.

>> ANTHONY EID: So these that went over are the Commission's collaborative maps. We have one individual map.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: That will be explained at 4:00 p.m. By the end --

>> ANTHONY EID: Okay. Yes, Commissioner Szetela submitted it. It's back there. So please go take a look! Take a look at all of these. Let us know which map you prefer, any tweaks you'd make, and now you know the spirit behind these maps and why we're doing what we're doing, we hope y'all provide us with some good debate. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: So I think this would be a good time to just I don't know if we call it a break, but we'll take 10 or 15 minutes so you can each go look at the maps before we have the public comment. So you'll be able to look at specifics. So we will plan -- we'll plan 10 minutes. At 2:50, we'll do public comment. 1-

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Okay. Question can take some public comment now. I see people are still looking at the maps, but if there's anyone that has a number that is below 50, feel free to come to the microphone and give your public comment. I know that some people weren't in the room when I called their number before, so anyone below 50 or number 50. Number -- are you number 50?

>> SPEAKER: Good afternoon. She's 49.

>> SPEAKER: Good afternoon. I'm Terry Jeffrey. Lifelong resident of Detroit.

>> ANTHONY EID: Could you stand a little closer to the mic.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: You can pull it down, I think.

>> SPEAKER: This Motown Sound map may be fair and perhaps it will give better representation to the citizens in Detroit. Now as far as Detroit is concerned, we haven't had an honest election. Only time we have an honest election is when it's a landslide. They have more of a selection process than an election process. But perhaps this will work for us. And I'm hopeful.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing us.

>> SPEAKER: Good afternoon. My name is Shelly Esther. I'm a lifelong resident of Detroit. Specifically in Green Acres. And I've looked at all the maps, gone through everything, and my pefaces would be Motown Sound and the Spirit of Detroit. My concern coming here today was that specifically the city of Detroit's votes would be watered down. And I believe that with those Motown Sound and Spirit of Detroit that we have the best chance of representation. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 51.

>> SPEAKER: Hello. My name is Kendra Davis. I'm a lifelong resident of the city of Detroit. I've been voting since I was 18, I'll soon be 70. Now I have worked for the city of Detroit, retired from the city of Detroit, worked for Detroit public schools, retired from Detroit public schools. I feel when I look at those maps, I have my concerns. And I have a question. I would like to know how many Districts was Detroit broken down into before the 2020 election? Do you know?

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: We will look it up real quick.

>> SPEAKER: Okay. The reason I'm asking is when they had the 2020 election, you had all this outside interference coming down to Detroit, going down to Huntington Place, trying to steal our votes. And it seems like after that is when this board was created, and they want to cut Detroit up into pieces and water down our votes. And I think that people ought to kick Donald Trump and his crew to the curb because they're nothing but a bunch of racists and leave Detroit alone. That would be my comment.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Okay. We're still looking for your answer. We'll look for that number. We'll get it to you when someone is able to find it. Number 52.

>> SPEAKER: Hello. My name is Marian and I live in Dearborn. I want to keep my community of interest together. I'm asking to keep the access communities of interest together which are Arab Americans and the middle eastern and north African communities. We support the Motown Sound map as a starting point. But when you think through minority/majority Districts for our community of interest, we ask that you also look at packed Districts like d4, 88%, and d581% that neighbor our community of interest. Those Districts could be unpacked to help address the federal VRA concerns. Arab Americans and more broadly people from the middle east and north Africa region are not protected under the federal VRA under section 203 because language minorities are determined as certain language minority groups who are unable to speak or understand English adequately enough to participate in the electoral process. However, we have shown through our access community of interest map that Arab Americans are a sizable population and language minority. Under section 2 of the federal Voting Rights Act, Arab Americans are not protected as language minority. When the federal VRA was created, we were not a sizable community. However, as we have shown through our access community of interest map, we are a language minority and now more significant population with shared interests and similar needs. Moreover, we have no protection from being packed or cracked as a community. The federal VRA was meant to be the minimum standard and nothing precludes you from extending those rights to Arab American communities. We have shown through the access community of interest map C1510 this community has particular needs. With that in mind, for the state house maps, we're requesting this community have fair representation across two minority/majority Districts. Due to the population limitations for each house District, we

ask you take our community of interest into consideration as you begin mapping changes for the senate maps. I urge the Commission to take this into consideration. Thank you for your time.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 53.

>> SPEAKER: Hello, Commissioners. My name is Sarah and I live in the city of Dearborn and work in the city of Dearborn. I'm here to ask to my community of interest together. Aaron Americans and the middle eastern north African communities. We support the Motown Sound map as a starting point, but when Districts for our interests, we ask that you also look at packed Districts like D4 and D5 that neighbor our community of interest. Those Districts could be unpacked to help address federal VRA concerns. Additionally Aaron Americans and more broadly people of middle eastern north Africa District are not protected under section 203 because language minorities are deemed as certain groups unable to speak or understand English adequately enough to participate in the electoral process. We have shown through our community act that we're a sizable population and language minority. To add under section 203 you have to meet one of two criteria. A population of 10,000 or that you meet the threshold of being 5% of a geographical area. Additional under section 2 of the VRA, Arab Americans are not protected as a language minority when the VRA was created, we were not considered sizable community. However, as we have on how through our acts of interest map, we're a language minority and more significant population with shared interests and similar needs. Moreover we have no protection from being packed or cracked as a community and the VRA was meant to be the minimum standards, and nothing precludes the standard from extending those rights. Me we have shown through the map that this community has particular needs. With that in mind, for the state house maps, we're asking this community have fair representation across two minority majority Districts. Due to the population limitations for each house District, we ask you take our community of interest into consideration. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. 54.

>> SPEAKER: Good afternoon. My name is John Maison. I live in the North End. I live in the North End for over 30 years now. I look at your maps and I see that it's nothing but a form of gerrymandering, which is quite popular in this country now. Your maps are diluting the votes of the city of the people of Detroit. In Wayne county. Your maps reach out to Oakland and Macomb county, which has nothing to do with the people of the city of Detroit. This country right now has been gerrymandered in all states, just about, especially republican-controlled state houses. And people's rights are being taken and people are sleeping on those rights because they're not speaking up. You need to do a better job on your maps. The young gentleman told me I should go home, and I told him I would get on the computer and look at the maps. From what I'm seeing right now, none of your maps represent a person like myself. I think your

maps are just another way to put up lesser evidence, the jobs they will not do. People should understand that in 55 years between the Voting Rights Act and the Civil Rights Act, you're taking away abortion rights, you're taking away civil rights, you're taking away voting rights. This is done in the states. So I ask you to go back and get together and do a better job of your redistrict. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you. Number 55. Number 56.

>> SPEAKER: Good afternoon. My name is Michael Griffe I'm a resident of the University District. And I appreciate the opportunity to make a public comment today. I am in support of the Motown Sound map because I think it adequately preserves representation in my community and the communities of interest in the neighboring neighborhoods. I hope that you take that into consideration as you make forward your final decision. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 57.

>> SPEAKER: Good afternoon. My name is Christine Holmes. I'm a resident of the Wood Bridge neighborhood.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Could you be a little closer to the mic.

>> SPEAKER: Is that better?

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: That's better. Thank you.

>> SPEAKER: Oh, yeah. I'm Christine Holmes. I live in the Wood Bridge neighborhood in Detroit. I'm the director and policy director for neighborhood corporation. It's a close-knit neighborhood of about 4400 people on the west side of Detroit. Our eastern boundary is a lodge. Western boundary is Grand River. North boundary is I94, and the south boundary is Martin Luther king Boulevard. It has four election precincts. However, the Daisy 2 map proposed wants to divide the Wood Bridge neighborhood into three separate house Districts. Number 1, 8, and 9. We are already split District in terms of our city council representation. Part is in District 5, part in District 6 with the new city council maps. More of our neighborhood will be in District 5. We would prefer to have single representation. This is particularly important at the state level for us, particularly my organization, that does affordable housing and home repairs for our residents. We would like to be able to advocate to a single represent instead of having to chase down three separate House representatives to try to advocate for our singular neighborhood. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Mr. Morgan.

>> SPEAKER: Yeah. If you like, I can show a screen of the previous House Districts from 2012.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Great. Thank you.

>> SPEAKER: Okay. These are the Districts that were in effect from 2012 to 2020. So District 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, and this District 10 has a little bit of Detroit. So there

were proximately 10 Districts. So two things happened. The population changed, so the population isn't quite there to have the same number of Districts. And in most of your maps, you are going outside of Detroit. You'll see, for example, here in this former District 6, river Rouge and Ecorse in Detroit. Some were in 1 and some in 2. There was no crossing of 8 Mile in the former map. Hopefully that helps to answer the question.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you very much for finding that. Number 58.

>> SPEAKER: Good afternoon. My name is Frank Woods. I'm the chairperson of the Wayne county democratic caucus. And I am in support of the Motown Sound maps. Because I believe it gives us the best representation of the people of the city of Detroit and Wayne county to exercise our votes and make sure that we elect people that represent us and our communities. Thank you.

>> CHAIR, CYNTHIA ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. I believe that's the last number, 58. If you have any other number and you haven't spoken yet, can you let me know. I see some folks in here that haven't spoken to us yet, so be sure and sign up, if you have something to say. I think, at this time, we'll just take a break and give people more time to look at maps and decide if they want to make public comment. Maybe more people will come in.

>> CHAIR ORTON: People are looking at the maps, but we have another in-person comment, number 59, if you want to make your way to the microphone.

I can't tell if someone is coming up.

Number 59 or anyone before that?

>> Thank you so much. I just walked in so I will try to be brief.

>> CHAIR ORTON: You have three minutes, so you don't have to be quick.

>> Okay, a few weeks ago Detroit was redistrict, can you tell me why? And it ties into redistricting I guess now across the state. I'm not sure what District I'm in. So can you tell me? I will tell you what streets I'm bordered by. I live 8 Mile and Schaffer can you tell me? I could not ascertain from the map on what District I'm in because I have a specific question. Once you tell me that.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: So thank you for that question.

It's a great question because there is a lot going on in this area currently. You are right, the City of Detroit did its redistricting, I believe they decided on a plan a couple weeks ago. That is completely separate from what we are doing. So the City of Detroit, they had a Council that does the City redistricting. We are doing the whole state.

>> Correct.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: We did the whole state but right now we are working specifically in this Metro Detroit area. So they are separate, they are totally separate processes. And as far as your address, we have a vendor back there somewhere, the gentleman in the blue raising his hand if you turn around. He can help you put in your address on the website and let you know where you are in these maps.

>> Okay, well, as I make my way to him my question really relates to if I read the map correctly, I'm kind of in the Oak Park area but I don't live in Oak Park. And so my question is: Can I benefit from services in Oak Park? Even though I live in Detroit? And I'm so close to Oak Park I really could spit across the street and be there. That is how close I am. If I read that map correctly. So do you all mind if I take the mic with me and walk back here so this gentleman, I can't do that, okay.

Anyway. If he can tell me what District I'm in.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: We will help you figure that out.

>> Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: These Districts they determine who your Michigan House rep is so they are the person you are going to vote for who will go in Lansing on your behalf.

>> Okay, okay.

So prior to or when you all are done, I will know who that is and I can make an informed decision if I want to vote for them, is that what you're saying?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Exactly.

>> Thank you so much for your time.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Is there anyone else that has signed up to speak that hasn't spoken yet? Please come up. Can you tell me what number you have?

>> My name is 60.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you.

>> Okay, I'm a resident of the City of Detroit. I'm not up on all of this, but I wish you had had the original map so that we could just see if there is progress in going to these -- going to these other maps. And I hope, if there are future meetings, that you will put that map out there so we can see the difference. There is a big difference. There is a big difference. Yes, ma'am.

>> CHAIR ORTON: When you say the original map what map are you referring to?

>> The current map.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Right now the current map is the Hickory map that we drew in 2021. Is that the map you're referring to or the one before that?

>> I think the one before that. The one before you all really were a Commission.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay I understand.

>> Because that map is still active, correct?

>> CHAIR ORTON: No, the one from 2021 that we called Hickory, that is the one that is active right now.

>> Okay, it would be my suggestion is to put both of those maps out there. To give us a little better history. Not everybody is current on all of this. My choice right now would be the Lily map. The Motown map. And Bergamot 1. I would like for you to just review those three maps again. For a better representation. Of people in Lansing from this

area. You know, there are laws that have been changed that have hurt us more and more. And what you're doing now is not going to solve all the problems, but we hope it looks like progress. And looking at those other maps in 2021 and before that, will help us to see if there is real progress. So I think you can be a more up front and visible with what we are comparing things to. So that's my recommendation.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay, thank you very much. Is there anyone else that has a number that has not spoken? .

>> Hi, I spoke earlier, and I came back. I went home and I really looked at these maps because it was more like a rush thing at first. So I was confused. But I got to looking at it. I think more Motown and I think it's spirit, is it a spirit?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Spirit of Detroit?

>> Yes, and got to talking to a couple of them up there. Really made me think, them would be good for us. For my area. Especially Motown. I got to looking at that one. That will help us I really think. And that's all I have to say.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much.

>> Okay thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Is there anyone else that has a number that has not spoken to us? .

Okay then we will go to the remote public comment. Without objection Vice Chair Janice Vallette will facilitate this portion.

>> Good afternoon. These are we going to remote comments. I will call your name and our staff will unmute you. If you are on a computer, you will be prompted by the Zoom app to unmute your Mike phone and speak. If you are on the phone, a voice will say that the host wants to speak and prompt you to press star six to unmute. I will call you by your name or the last four digits of your phone number. Also, please note that if you experience technical or audio issues or we do not hear from you in three to five seconds we will move on to the next person in line and return to you after they are done speaking. If your audio still does not work, you can e-mail redistricting@Michigan.gov and we will help you trouble shoot so you can participate during the public -- next public comment period at a later meeting.

You have three minutes to address the Commission. Please conclude your remarks when you hear the timer.

First in line for comment is Delaney-McDermott.

>> Hi all can you hear me?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Yes, we can.

>> Okay, great, hello my name is Delaney and I work in Dearborn, and I want to keep my community of interest together and I am an Arab American. I'm asking to keep the access communities of interest together which are Arab Americans and more generally the Middle Eastern and north African communities. We support the Motown Sound map as a starting point. But when we think through the minority-majority Districts for our

community of interest we ask that you also look at the pact Districts like District 4 and District 5. That neighbor our community of interest. Those Districts could be unpacked and help address the Federal VRA concerns. Arab Americans are from the northeast and African region and not protected under the Federal VRA under Section 203 because language minorities are determined as certain language minority groups who cannot speak or understand English enough to participate in the electoral process. However we have shown through our access community of interest map that Arab Americans are a sizable population and a language minority. Under Section Two of the Federal Voting Rights Act. Arab Americans are not protected as language minority. But when the Federal VRA was created we were not a sizable community. However as we have shown now, we are a more significant population, which means that we should be protected as it currently stands. We have shown that through our community of interest map which is C1510 that this community has particular needs and with that in mind for the State House maps we are requesting that this community have fair representation across two minority majority Districts. Due to the population limitations for each House District we ask that you take our community of interest into consideration as we begin the mapping changes for the Senate maps. And we urge you to take all of this into consideration, thank you for your time.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE:

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. We have one more in-person before we continue with remote so number 63.

>> Good afternoon. With this my question is with the Districting does the residence have access so you combined them so say if I stay in east Detroit and a part of St. Clair Shores can I send my child to St. Clair Shores schools? I can go to the parks.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: So that would be up to your legislation like you all the let's say there is more than one person that is asking that question from where you are from East English Village or Eastside of Detroit that is up to how you push the representatives once you vote to rally against those types of privileges because if you are part of the Districts you will have more of an impact than if you are not, right? Because if you are now a part of a District where Grosse Pointe and Grosse Pointe Woods et cetera, if you are a part of the District you can weigh heavily having some things like going to the parks or attending those schools but that is not something that this body as a Commission is in charge of. We are drawing the lines and then it's up to the voters to determine who represents them if that makes sense to you.

>> Okay and are these lines currently in place?

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: No, that is why there are ten different versions of the map to the rear or to the back of this little Section. This process is for you all to engage with us and to engage with the maps and say I really like this idea and this is why I don't like where this District is and tell us in detail why and then we go back to the drawing board and discuss everything that has been shared in person, online in the remote

space when you hear people calling in. We get all that data together and we have a healthy and spirited debate about what decisions should be made and why.

>> How do we get access to the previous lines that are drawn.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Previous lines is it the Hickory map we drew?

>> I just came in so I'm just trying to get some information. This is not in place so what is in place?

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: The Hickory map.

>> Called the Hickory map.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Yes, we were charged with redrawing this map, so this is the process.

>> We can't see the map.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Go to Michigan.gov/MICRC, that is where you can find the Hickory map and unless one of the Commissioners has another place where the Hickory map can.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Perhaps Mr. Morgan can pull the Hickory map up right now.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: So the map just so we are clear the map you are about to see is being currently contested, that map has to be changed and that is why we have those ten draft maps towards the rear of the room.

>> Okay, and one more last question. That map previous to this Hickory map.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: John can also pull that map up as well if he would be so kind. He has a shape file that will show you what it looked like from 2012 until 2020 if you want anything further back then you might have to do that. Unfortunately on your own time but we can at least show you Hickory and perhaps if it's readily available John can then show you the previous map to that.

>> I would appreciate that.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Just some history real quick, I'm talking over here and saw you looking around. So the previous map that was the map drawn by the legislature in private in 2010 based on the 20 ten census. But Michigan there was a constitutional amendment in 2018 that changed the law to make it so that instead of the legislature drawing the map, it's an independent Commission and that is who we are. Now we drew the maps in 2021 and used in the 2022 election. That map is what which colleague referred to as the Hickory map. That map was the last map used in the 2022 election. So do you want the original map passed by the legislature in 2010 or do you want the map that was just used in the 2020 election?

>> Both.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: That we can do.

>> Thank you.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay I will share the screen here.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Wait just a second and he will explain what we are looking at. He is just getting it set up.

>> MR. MORGAN: Yeah, it just takes a second for me to make this quick change hopefully. So I currently have both the 2012 plan adopted by the legislature and I also have the Hickory plan. So I will show them in succession. So the first one will be what was enacted by the legislature in 2012. So these are the Districts in the Detroit area that were enacted in 2012. So we have District 1 was Grosse Pointe shores, Grosse Pointe Woods, Harper Woods and part of Detroit. And then you had District 2 was Grosse Pointe Farms, Grosse Pointe park, part of Detroit. 3 up here in the north part of Detroit, Central Detroit was 4. West Detroit is 5. 6 was downtown down to River Rouge and Ecorse. Seven is here. 8, 9 and then this District 10 had Redford and this part of what is it the Losser Section of Detroit. And then I'll switch to the Hickory map.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Before you switch maybe you could go a little further out and show the Dearborn area, just the areas that we were working in on our new maps.

>> MR. MORGAN: So District 15 has almost all of Dearborn minus about 3 precincts here in the north. So if you imagine it in the old population, it would have been the City of Dearborn would have been a little too much for one House District. So a small amount was taken and put in District nine and then this boundary is Dearborn Heights, the municipal boundary which was combined with Allen Park and South Gate then I will put the overlay of the Hickory plan. Sorry then I will turn off the previous boundaries. So we can just focus on Hickory. So this is the Hickory plan as drawn and enacted. .

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much, Mr. Morgan.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay.

>> Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Number 64. Number 64. I don't see anyone going to the microphone so we will go back to remote. You are coming. Okay, sorry, can't see very well with the lights.

>> Sorry for the delay. Good afternoon. How are you? Good to see you all. My name is Michael Joseph. I wear a variety of hats, Black unionist, the board family of men and serve on the board for bridging communities. I'm a retired UAW worker. I'm a precinct delegate. I'm a father. And all of that together helps me become a better educated voter.

As I spoke to some people, the reason why we are here today is because of the power of the vote. So some voters got together and would not accept the maps that were presented to us in the last venture. Me and my colleagues here from the league we went down to the Huntington center and spoke against those maps and the process. So we are happy that those citizens who are voters would not accept what was given to them and they made a lawsuit come into this action with three Federal Judges said you have to do it over and do it right. And I ask you again do the right thing. And that's not to you but to everybody out there, get out and vote. Do the right thing. I stand in favor

of the Motown map. I think it's the most transparent, whoever put it together did an excellent job and that is what it's about. You talk about the community of interest. That is what has to be happening. That you look out for the people and not for the politicians, not for the corporations, not for the folks with money. But the people that are supposed to serve. I remember I asked you to do the right thing and I talked yesterday about from the movie Claudine when the son said I'm invisible. Many times our community in the City of Detroit we feel that we are invisible because no one looks at us. No one listens to us. But we matter. We are important. And so is the power of our vote. So as a matter of fact I just finished voting. Because of the people's vote that took an amendment and made it a law so we can have early voting in Michigan and I encourage all of our citizens to take advantage of that and I say to you the Commission please look at the Motown, that is the best one and that is who I support. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much. Okay now we will go to remote public comment.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you next person in line to speak is Haneen-Eldiri. Please allow our staff a moment to unmute you.

>> Hello, can you hear me?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Yes, we can.

>> Hello, my name is Haneen and live in Livonia and I want to keep my community of interest together. I am asking to keep the access communities of interest together which are Arab Americans and the Middle Eastern and north African communities. We support the Motown Sound map as a starting point. But when you think through the minority-majority Districts for our community of interest we ask that you also look at packed Districts like D4 and D5 that neighbor our community of interest. Those Districts could be unpacked to help address Federal VRA concerns. Arab Americans and more broadly people from the middle east and north African region are not protected under the Federal VRA under Section 203 they are groups who cannot speak or understand English adequately enough to participate in the electoral process. We have shown through the access map Arab Americans are a sizable population and minority. Under Section 2 of the Federal Voting Rights Act Arab Americans are not protected as a language minority. When the Federal VRA was created we were not a sizable community. However, as we have shown through our access community of interest map, we are a language minority. And now a more significant population with shared interests and similar needs. Moreover we have no protection from being packed or cracked as a community. The Federal VRA was meant to be the minimum standard and nothing precludes you from extending those rights to Arab American communities. We have shown through the access community of interest map C1510 that this community has particular needs. With that in mind, for the State House maps we are requesting that this community have fair representation across two minority majority Districts. Due to population limitations for each House District we ask to take our

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

community of interest into consideration as you begin mapping changes for the Senate maps. I urge the Commission to take this in consideration. Thank you.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Next in line is Lama-Ahamad. Please allow our staff a moment to unmute you.

>>Hello, can you hear me?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Yes, we can hear you.

>> Hi my name is Lama and live in the City of Dearborn Heights and wants to keep my community of interest together and asking to keep access communities of interest together which are Arab Americans and Middle Eastern and north African communities we support the Motown Sound map as a starting point but when you think majority and minority Districts for our community of interest we ask you look at Districts like D488% and D5, 81% that neighborhood the community of interest they can be unpacked to address VRA concerns. Arab Americans and more broadly people from the middle east and north Africa region are not protected under Federal VRA un-December Section 203 because language minorities are determined as certain language minority groups who are unable to speak or understand English adequately. Enough to participate in the electoral process. However we have shown through our access community of interest map that Arab Americans are a sizable population and language minority. Under Section Two of Federal VRA Arab Americans are not protected as the language minority. When the Federal VRA was created we were not a sizable community. However, as we have shown through our access community of interest map our language minority and now a more significant population with shared interests and similar needs more over we have no protection of being packed and stacked as a community Federal VRA was meant to be the minimum standard and nothing precludes you from extending those rights to Arab American communities. Thank you.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Next in line is Zaynah-J, give the Commission a moment to unmute you. Hello can everybody hear me?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Yes, we can hear you.

>> My name is Zana and live in Dearborn and want to keep my community of interest together. I am asking to keep the access communities of interesting to which are the Arab Americans and Middle Eastern and north African communities and support the Motown Sound map as a starting point but when you think through the minority majority Districts for our COI we ask that you look at packed Districts like D488% and D581% and neighbor our COI and Districts could be unpacked to address Federal VRA concerns. Arab Americans and from Middle Eastern and north African region are not perfected under Section 203 because language minorities are determined as certain language minority groups who are unable to speak or understand English adequately enough to participate in the election process. However we have shown through access COI map that Arab mentions are sizable population and language minority two of the

Voting Rights Act Arab Americans are not protected as a language minority when the VRA was created we are not a seasonable community however as we have shown through access COI map we a language minority and now more significant population with shared interests and similar needs. Moreover we have no protection from the impact or cracked as a community the Federal VRA was meant to be the minimum standard and nothing precludes from extending the rights to Arab American communities we have shown C1510 this community has particular needs with that in mind for the State House maps we are requesting that this community have fair representation across two minority majority Districts due to population limitation for each House District. We ask that we will take the COI into consideration as you begin mapping changing for the Senate maps. I urge the Commission to take this into consideration. Thank you.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE:

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Next the line is Christian grant.

>> Hello.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Hi.

>> Can you hear me.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Yes, we can.

>> Thank you. My name is Christian and I'm here to speak in support of the Arab American and specifically Mena communities the current lines for the State House direct 3 and 15 give Arab the best chance of representation. The anti-Arab Commission is pushing for currently concentrate Arabs in District 3 only and dilute the Arab vote in District 15 reducing their chances of having two Arab reps into only one. There is a pattern for some of the proposed maps for State House District three. They either take out Melvindale or east Dearborn which are areas of predominately Yemeni residence. That is an alarming pattern because of that I ask that you keep the lines for District three and 15 an intact and add Melvindale to District 3 and Motown in the Motown Sound District and remove the affluent west Dearborn from District 3 and put it with District 15. If possible, add in the remainder of the Aviation subdivision in southwest Detroit near Lonyo, Michigan, thank you.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Next in line is Alex King. Please allow our staff a moment to unmute you.

>> Hi, I'm Alex King. Thank you for giving me a chance to talk. I'm feeling a little under the weather today so thank you for having a virtual component, but I wanted to speak about Motown Sound map and as a resident of Livonia it's the best map for representations of communities of color. I think it's the most collaboratively drawn map by the Commission and really an improvement of Spirit of Detroit and I believe it's the best map for partisan fairness like the 12 Black opportunity Districts and really appreciate you for giving me the opportunity to address the Commission. I wanted to

keep it brief, but I just wanted to address my support of Motown Sound. And wish you all the best.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Next in line is Nouredin-Almahameed.

>> Can you guys hear me?

>> CHAIR ORTON: We can hear you.

>> Perfect I want to start by thanking the Commission for all the hard work they have been doing. My name is Naureen and a resident of Madison Heights. You know the Arab American community have been fighting for fair representation in the legislature for years now. And I just want to thank you guys for listening to us and the proposal of the Motown Sound map. It makes it clear you have been listening to us with how well you drew District 3 in Motown Sound map. In my opinion it's a way better map than the Tulip map which carves it up like a butcher. And in summary Motown Sound to me personally sounds like a very good map over Tulip. And that is it. Thank you, guys, for your hard work.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission. We have another in-person.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Number 65.

>> Hello members of the Redistricting Commission my name is Joe hunt from the City of Warren. Currently in the District 14, which is being redrawn. One of the reasons I'm here today is that I would like to echo my support for the Motown Sound map. I've placed comments on the website, watched all of your three hearings of yesterday. And a portion of today's hearing before the Internet went out. And the reason I'm here in person is that I would like to lobby for the Motown Sound map is that is what I've heard from everybody else. It does take into consideration all of the various elements of communities of interest as well as provides for what the voice of the people is trying to express too. Personally I think the Water Lily map is better for me as a person. I have run for elected office like eight times in the last 14 years, so I know how to actually see what people want. And as far as people echoing their sentiment of the ten maps that are available, Motown Sound does actually satisfy that criteria. I personally like Water Lily as the best one because what it does is it keeps Detroit in Detroit. And for any of you that may have communicated with any of your legislatures in the past to get something done, you will find that basically the closer you live to them the more that's accomplished. Personally at this point I don't have a representative in the House due to political Chess so to speak. But like I say Water Lily would serve my purposes well. When I ran for State Senate in direct ten a map that is being redrawn for obvious reasons, what I did encounter was problems in working with the Wayne County election Commission and the City of Detroit as a whole. Just to get a simple qualified voter file. And that was really like a downer.

But then again, you know, your criteria is based upon compactness and the amount of people. And contiguousness. So as I say, personally I would like Water Lily. I feel that the Spirit of Detroit is the template map, really says it all. It's a shining star as far as what I would consider to be a contiguousness. But as far as communities of interest I don't see it at all. So I'm here just basically to say that if everybody that's come up to the podium is expressing their interest to the citizen body to approve the Motown Sound, I will go with that, although my preference is Water Lily. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission.

>> Ex cue me I missed my number.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Go ahead.

>> I was back looking at the maps, I'm 62.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay thank you.

>> When Farancee ran against Blanchard for Governor I know at the time he wrote an Article and in Metro times you might be able to find it about proportional representation. And he proposed one House instead of two, instead of House and Senate. And then if you got more than his -- he suggested six or seven percent vote, you would go and represent that six or seven percent of the electorate that voted for you. And if you didn't or got less of course you're not going to get a representative for that viewpoint. So I looked at all these maps. And I would just like to make a suggestion that we look at proportional representation. And so we don't have to have so many boundary changes. Technically if you could set up some boundaries that would make more sense so you didn't have to keep changing the boundaries all the time, and that you could change the proportion of votes that go to the District and we would have to make sure all our citizens got good at math in school. Which we could do. So that they could understand the voting and trust it. But I don't like all these different you got maps for the county, maps for the state reps, maps for the Senate, maps for the City Council, maps for the Congress, maps for the Senate, you know, well not for the Senate, you got the statewide. But I'm just saying it's confusing to people and it keeps people from getting involved I think when they don't even know what District they are in. Probably don't know their own representatives. But I'd like to suggest that. I would like to see approval voting. So that people could vote for more than one person. If they like them, they can't vote for the same person twice. But they could vote for more than we get more people running and we would find out what people really wanted. If you combine that with proportional representation, and Lani-G was an African/American woman that got nominated by Clinton I think for the civil rights Commission. And they wouldn't approve her way back then. But she has written a book on proportional representation, I have not read it but going to try to find it at the library.

And the other thing is that you need to get the dark money out of the elections. And frankly if we, according to percentage we are the ones who are supposed to have control over our media. And if they have the right to have media rights, they should

have to put up campaign, fair campaign stuff so that everybody has a chance to run. We attract people who are willing to run and gather a lot of money so they can afford it. So we don't know who is paying for it.

>> CHAIR ORTON: So I'm suggesting.

>> We would like to know.

>> CHAIR ORTON: I'm sorry your time has elapsed. So your time has elapsed. I'm sorry.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Chairperson just for the record the Commission has nothing to do with dark money. That is not under the Commission's purview at all, whatsoever, thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for clarifying that. We can finish the remote public comment now.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Next person for remote count is Courtenay-Hall. Please allow the staff a moment to unmute you.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Madam Vice Chair can you repeat that name? Can you repeat the name of the public comment participate you said.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Courtenay-Hall.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Thank you.

>> Hi, can you hear me okay?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Yes, we can.

>> Okay, good afternoon, as many have stated, there are many commonalities amongst the voters in these communities. They share the burden of being marginalized as evidenced by their bombardment of environmental racism. Failing infrastructure. Health disparities, red lining, home value issues and the list goes on. Black voters are asking for District lines that restore their voting power. Latinos need more representation. And Arab American and specifically speaking Yemeni are asking for more representation. The Court has asked you or challenged you to go back to the drawing board and redraw your initial maps. I have friends in Districts in District three and I'm asking you to leave District 3 and 15 as they are but to add Melvindale into District 3 with the hope of amplifying Yemeni representation. And I support the Motown Sound map. Thank you.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Next in line is Rima-Meroueh. Please allow staff a moment to unmute you.

>>Hi, can you hear me?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Yes, we can hear you.

>> Hi, my name is Rima I'm here to ask you to keep our community of interest together. I'm asking to keep access community of interest together which are Arab American and Middle East or north African. We support the Motown Sound map as a starting point and would like to keep Melvindale and Warrendale District in District 3. When you think through minority majority District for COI, we ask you look at packed Districts like

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

District 4 and District 5 that neighbor our community of interest. Those Districts could be unpacked to help address Federal VRA concerns. Arab mentions are not protected under the Federal VRA because language minorities are determined a certain language group who are unable to understand English adequately to participate in the electoral process however, we have shown through the community of interest map that Arab Americans are a sizable population and language minority. Under Section 2 of Federal Voting Rights Act Arab Americans are not protected when Federal VRA was created we were not a sizable community however as we have shown through access community of interest map, we have and are a language minority and now a more significant population and with shared interests and similar needs. Moreover I have no protection of being packed or cracked and meant to be a minimum standard and nothing precludes you from extending the rights to Arab American communities we have shown through the access community C1510 this community has particular needs. With that in mind for the State House maps we are requesting that this community have a fair representation across the two minority majority Districts due to the population limitations for each House District we ask you take our COI as you begin changes for the Senate map and I urge the Commission to take this into consideration thank you.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission. I believe that's it.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay so I think that is all the people that wish to provide public comment for right now. Director Woods, is there anything else we can take care of right now?

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Sure. Miss Reinhardt can we proceed with the mapping policy? She says yes. Why don't we consider that so we can take, oh.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Mr. Morgan you have something.

>> MR. MORGAN: Was there going to be another map presentation?

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Ms. Szetela is not available.

>> MR. MORGAN: Sorry I was under the previous information.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you go ahead.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Ms. Reinhardt we will turn it over to you.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Hello Commissioners I believe the agenda item or the item that we wanted to review with you today was that mapping process or the selection of House map process that I reviewed yesterday. And today we were going to put it to you to whether or not to adopt that process as it was written.

So are there any comments from Commissioners or thoughts or edits on that document before we proceed?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I like the document. Thank you, Sarah and everyone who worked on it. It's like our previous one that we used, but makes some improvements

and think it keeps the spirit of what we did last time alive, but you know edits it slightly to be okay with the Court order and help move us along.

>> CHAIR ORTON: I don't see any other comments so thank you.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Mr. Fink, do you have any comments? .

>> CHAIR ORTON: I do see Commissioner Lett then we will go to Mr. Fink.

>> CHAIR ORTON: We can't hear you, Steve.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: I move we adopt the procedure.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay we have a motion and a second. So now discussion will start with Mr. Fink.

>> Nate Fink: I don't think I had anything to add beyond the clarification I made yesterday and happy the answer questions or discuss anything in here, but I think, you know, like I said if there is any questions happy to answer them. I don't think I had anything to add.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay does anyone have questions for Mr. Fink or other discussion? Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Could we just review the I don't anticipate it will come to this but in case it does can we review the random drawing process part of it?

>> Nate Fink: Commissioner Eid was that directed to me? Or just to the world?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Anyone, if you can answer or I'll look for someone.

>> Nate Fink: I don't know if someone is able to pull it up on the screen, the current version, that would be helpful. We could look at the language. I think I have it too if someone has it at their fingertips.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Sarah Reinhardt are you able to pull that up? Just a moment, she is.

>> Nate Fink: Okay, thank you. Okay thank you. It looks like.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Sorry what I'm displaying this is the constitutional language that kind of outlines it, so I don't know if you wanted to review this Mr. Fink.

>> Nate Fink: That is helpful thank you Ms. Reinhardt. So the Constitution actually has this fairly detailed language about the voting process. If you get to the ranked choice voting procedure. And again this only happens if you don't, if the Commission doesn't have a majority, a constitutional majority of one of the maps. Next week you only get to the ranked choice voting if you don't have majority and if you get to the ranked choice voting process as you can see here, we took the language and spelled it on the procedure. But the Commission has shall adopt the plan receiving the highest total points but it has to be ranked among the top half of plans by at least two Commissioners not affiliated with the party of the Commission submitting the plan or in the case of a plan that was submitted by a nonaffiliated Commissioner or Commissioners is ranked among by two Commissioners affiliated with a major party. Here the language at the end that I think Sarah was just highlighted if plans are tied for the highest point total, then the secretary does a random selection from those plans.

And then if you scroll down if no plan meets the requirements of that of the subparagraph there, the secretary then randomly selects the final plan from all the submitted plans. And to be clear, a submitted plan my understanding of it is it's not all of the draft proposed plans. It's -- it has to be one of the plans that was submitted pursuant to Section C1 or, yeah, C little i, there. During the ranked choice voting procedure. So that won't necessarily include all ten maps that are under consideration currently by the Commission.

But it would be any of the maps that were submitted through this process, the ranked choice voting process. If none of them garner or qualify and are selected as the plan through this ranked choice voting procedure, and you get one with the highest total points, if you don't achieve that, then the secretary would do a random draw from the maps that were submitted through that process.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Mr. Woods?

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Yes, and Mr. Fink, just for clarification this is the constitutional language. It cannot be amended by our mapping policies and procedures.

>> Nate Fink: Absolutely, that's correct. This is a requirement of the Constitution. And so.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Thank you.

>> Nate Fink: Have to follow that. Yep.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I just want to make sure similar to our process last time when we did this in 2021. It says each Commissioner may submit a plan to be included in that random drawing if it gets that far; is that correct?

>> Nate Fink: That's correct.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Sarah Reinhardt did you want to say?

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: So the submission of the plans as Mr. Fink was just referring to, that's actually what would take place if you get to the ranked vote. So that's when the submission occurs. So you can think of it as there is kind of three phases of voting with moving on to the next phase if the first one fails. So your first phase is you just vote like you normally do. You state the name of your plan that you refer or that you prefer. If one of them receives a constitutional majority which is the two, two, two then it would be selected. If that fails three times and no plan achieves that constitutional authority, then we move on to the ranked voting and that would be when each Commissioner has the opportunity to submit a map for the ranked choice vote. Each Commissioner may submit one draft proposed map for consideration and more than one Commissioner may submit the same draft proposed map. And the secretary will be responsible for recording which the Commissioner has submitted which draft proposed map. And the reason why you have to submit maps at this phase is because the Constitution states that for determining which map is selected through the ranked choice vote, that threshold is reliant on the affiliation of the Commissioner who

submitted it. So if you look at this language here, which Mr. Fink just read, if you get to the ranked choice vote the Commission shall adopt the plan receiving the highest total points that is also ranked by two Commissioners not affiliated with the party of the Commissioner submitting the plan. So this is the step the plans would be submitted. And then if the ranked choice vote fails, then we would move on to the random selection. So of those plans submitted for the ranked choice, all of those plans would go into the random drawing.

>> Thank you.

>> Nate Fink: If I may just clarify something that Ms. Reinhardt said. Miss Reinhardt mentioned the two, two, two and that is correct. In order to adopt a plan through the majority vote procedure, not ranked voting but just through the initial voting procedure, you need to have at least two from each group, right? Republican and democrat unaffiliated. But you also have to have a majority. So two, two, two would be six. And right, that is not necessarily a majority of I don't know how many that will necessarily be present, that that wouldn't be a majority of the 13 for example. So you obviously in that circumstance need to have at least one more member of the Commission voting in favor of whatever that map might be. But you need to have at least two from each group.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Good catch, thank you, Mr. Fink.

>> Nate Fink: Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay is there any other discussion about the motion? Seeing none, can we have a roll call vote?

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: The motion before the Commission is to adopt the plan as presented or the procedure as presented. I will call on Commissioners in alphabetical order and please state with a "Yes" or "No." I will begin with Donna Callaghan?

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: Yes.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Anthony Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Yes.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Brittini Kellom?

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Yes.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Steve Lett?

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Yes.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Marcus Muldoon?

>> MARCUS MULDOON: Yes.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Cynthia Orton?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Yes.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Janice Vallette?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Yes.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Richard Weiss?

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Yes.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Elaine R and D?

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Yes.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: With nine yes votes the motion carries.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much.

At this time I did see a couple people walk in the door. I'm not sure if you have signed up for public comment but you signed up for public comment and have a number please come to the microphone and let me know what number you have. .

>> I have number 66.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Go ahead.

>> I'm Lamar lemons and according to your legal counsel the Plaintiffs attempted to have an expert placed in under the guise of a witness. I was a witness in this case. So when you go over the transcripts you will see my name. Throughout the process. And you did this your attorneys did this several times. So to the degree that you considered me an expert or at least your attorneys did, I shall go ahead and give my commentary. First of all, let me say this: I don't support any of the plans as presented. I think and let me say this I have the unique perspective as being the only candidate, a former candidate in a recent election to run on these existing maps. On the existing maps and my experience was the following: One, the people in Macomb County and Warren were more concerned that I, as a Detroiter, and I was the only Detroiter in that race as well, as well as the only African/American that I as a Detroiter and African/American would only be concerned about Detroiters. So African/Americans said you are just going to take care of Detroit and Wayne county. Aren't you? I had to constantly defend that is something I would not do. And the second thing is that are you only going to be concerned with African/American issues? Those two things led to a conjunction with some other political realities led to my defeat in that candidacy in District 13. It was clear to me abundantly clear to me that there was no need to cross the Macomb County line. That you could have easily drawn an African/American predominately African/American District to the north, going across, between 8 Mile and 11 mile, going from Ryan to however far you needed to go eastward. Keeping East Point whole. And going from there.

Let me say this: The maps of the 2010 the population notwithstanding were fair. And the only reality is that more Detroiters, in particular in this case particularly African/Americans, had moved across 8 Mile and they form add parameter south of 11 mile, north of 8 Mile to create one contiguous District. As a matter of fact both East Point and Warren share some of the same school Districts. Some of the sale polling places et cetera. Macomb County wanted to be united even above that community of interest was more important even above race in that case. Because they were concerned that I as a Detroiter would only be concerned with Detroit and African/American issues and not the Macomb County and particularly Warren in this issue. And it repeatedly came up and it shows in the election results where I won

Detroit despite tremendous odds of having being a democratic establishment supporting my opposition. But I still prevailed in Detroit. But in Warren they were able to convey who people who really didn't know me were getting to know me. We're able to say, listening we like you, but you are going to take care of Detroit and you're not going to take care of Warren. Which nothing could have been further from the truth. I have an agenda good for all peoples. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Do we have a 67? . It doesn't look like we have any more public comment at this time.

Director Woods, is there anything else we can take care of at this time?

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Actually I don't think I have anything at this time. Just a friendly reminder that we are meeting Tuesday at from 8-11 virtual. And then we will meet again on Wednesday, I believe, from, let me get the right time, so pull that up, from 9:00 to 6:00. So just wanted to know that. And Tuesday we will do preliminary reviews and things and looking to deliberate and vote on Wednesday because we are only meeting for three hours on Tuesday. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much. Okay, then without objection, we will now recess for dinner. And so hearing no objection we will return for the evening session at 6:00 p.m.

[Dinner recess until 6:00 p.m.]

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay, hello everybody. Glad you can join us. We will have a presentation by Edward Woods III and present the purpose of the public hearing today, Mr. Woods?

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Before I begin, I want to welcome to the microphone in the center pastor Cummings of the Second Ebenezer Church and he is going to provide some welcoming remarks on behalf of Bishop Edward II let's give a warm round of applause for Doctor Cummings.

>> I am humble to be the executive administrator pastor here and with the Bishop in his absence we welcome each and every one of you doing the work in the hour and contacting redistricting in the season there is a lot of good work ahead of us and grateful today we have Commissioners and community here and we welcome the voice and welcome a fresh wind and welcome order and life. So again on behalf of our esteemed Pastor, Bishop Harold Vann, and the countless members of this great church. We welcome you to Second Ebenezer. We hope that today the work that we put in will not only bring us great joy but also hope for our glorious future. Again, welcome to Second Ebenezer Church.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Thank you so much, Dr. Cummings, greatly appreciate you. Good evening, Detroit. Good evening, Detroit. We are happy to have you here to participate in the public comment period for these ten maps that are being proposed to you. I want to remind you; you can still provide your public comments either in the public comment portal or the mapping comment portal that is located off our website.

We do have Ryan who is in the back. He is right there but the maps but if you turn around, he is waving his hand he is going to be over there to the right by the audio-visual equipment. And if you have questions or want to put any comments on the mapping comment portal, he will be able to assist you. Or if you need a better explanation, he will help you as well. So once again we want you to know the resources are here to assist. We've heard you loud and clear about redistricting being a tough topic and we want you to leave here today with a better understanding so that your voice can be heard show up speak up as relates to these draft proposed maps.

Once again, we like to thank Second Ebenezer Church and Bishop Edgar Vance the second and appreciate this wonderful facility and being able to use it to host our public hearings. We want to thank Tabatha Goodner for the outstanding job in logistics and coordinating. We greatly appreciate her as well and her team.

The Commission would also like to thank the Southeast Michigan Council of Governments and the City of Detroit neighborhood department who both provided presentations so that we could understand the neighborhoods inside of the City of Detroit as well as those that border the City of Detroit. We want to thank the community organizations and civic leaders that allowed us to do presentations including but not excluding but including City Council president the Honorable Mary Sheffield and City councilman Fred Duhall and greatly appreciate them and Fannie Lou hammer, Eastside alfa fraternity incorporated and other organizations to participate in sharing this information about redistricting. We would like to thank our volunteers as well and we have volunteers that are outside that help with registration and so if you could give everyone a round of applause as we identify those we are appreciating this evening.

Thank you again. History of the MICRC. In 2018 Michigan voters passed by more than 61%, I repeat 61% a ballot initiative for voters not legislatures to take responsibility for nonpartisan redistricting and created the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission known as MICRC it's comprised of 13 randomly selected Michigan residents includes four who affiliate with democrat, five who do not affiliate with democrats or republicans and four who affiliate with republican party.

The MICRC is responsible for redistricting the U.S. Congressional, 13 Districts and the Congressional, Michigan House, 110 Districts there. And Michigan Senate District, 38. They do not, I repeat they do not have any jurisdiction whatsoever for any county redistricting or any City redistricting including the City of Detroit.

The MICRC for the first time in history has followed what was passed in the ballot proposal these seven ranked redistricting criteria. Once again, once again in this new process this is the new redistricting criteria. The old standards followed the apoll standards and the apoll standards sought to keep City, county and Township boundaries whole as much as possible. But in this redistricting process, these are the seven ranked redistricting criteria. One, equal population and the Voting Rights Act. Two, geographically contiguous. Three, reflect states diversity and communities of

interest. Four, no disproportionate advantage to any political party. Five, no favor or disfavor to an incumbent elected official or a candidate. Six, reflect consideration of county, City and Township boundaries. And, seven, be reasonably compact. Once again, the Commission is required to follow these seven ranked redistricting criteria in the Michigan Constitution.

Western Michigan District Court southern division. They found the Commission drew maps focused on race in violation of the 14th amendment the equal protection clause and disenfranchised Black voters. There was no finding repeat no finding regarding the voting rights act. Or guidance provided to the Commission regarding the Voting Rights Act.

They ordered the Commission, I repeat they ordered the Commission, the Court did to reconfigure State House Districts number 1, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12 and 14 and not focus on race. In other words, they wanted them to draw the maps race blind even though the Michigan Constitution clearly states equal population and following the Voting Rights Act.

Why should you care? Redistricting is your chance to make sure your voice and your community's voice is heard. When we talk about community, we are talking about community of interest which is the third ranked redistricting criteria which states reflect the state's diversity and communities of interest. When we refer to community of interest we are talking about historical characteristics. This is why the neighborhood presentation by both the City of Detroit neighborhood department and the Southeast Michigan Council of Government was so important in that the Commission is viewing neighborhoods as historical characteristics.

When it comes to culture characteristics, we are looking at the Mena population middle east north Africa LBGTQ or the Bengali community or other groups who have come before the Commission as relates to cultural characteristics. When it comes to economic interests, we're referring to the river front property. It could be an arts District. A business District and entertainment District. These are the communities when it comes to economic interests that the Commission is considering.

Redistricting can keep your community together and that's why it's so important that you hash tag show up and speak up, so we understand who represents or who is in your community.

When you have a community of interest, it's always easier, it's always easier to make sure your elected officials reflect your values or an important issues such as healthcare, education, public safety, and justice.

Why we are here. We are here to hear directly from you regarding the nine draft proposed maps and one individual map. We want to understand what map best represents you and your community of interest as is or with minor tweaks. So we want to hear if you like a map, tell us you like it. But if there are some minor tweaks for the Commission to consider please share them for their consideration. They will be voting

on these maps next week. The maps are due -- the map that is selected is due to the Court on Friday, March 1st. We want to learn from your feedback to select the best map in compliance with the court order and the 7 ranked redistricting criteria. At this point the Commission is going to transition to highlight five of the nine five of the nine collaborative maps that have received the most feedback from the public. And I will turn it over to our Chairperson, Cynthia Orton as we transition and then I will come back and share with you the public comment guidelines, thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much, Mr. Woods. Okay, so at this time some Commissioners are going to come down, we are going to be explaining some maps up here at the front. If you care to move closer, in the seats that are closer you can. It will also be seen on the screen up above. So just give us a couple minutes.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Welcome everybody and thank you for being here. I love being here today. It's always great to be in a church during the season of lent. My name is Commissioner Eid. I'm one of the 13 Commissioners on this Commission. And we just thought to help increase engagement and increase knowledge of what we are doing and why we are here today we would explain why some of the maps look the way they do. And I kind of want to take this in a step wise approach how we started drafting and where we have come since then. As you can see, we have ten different options and what we need to hear from you folks today is what option you like best, which options you don't like and if there are any tweaks, we can make to the options to make y'all happy. So we are going to start here with the Daisy 2 map. Now in the Court order it said that this Commission has to redraw 7 House Districts and it said we can change other Districts as they are reasonably necessary. So we as a Commission have to figure out what exactly does that mean? So kind of as an exercise, as an experiment we drew this map Daisy 2 that only changes those House Districts that the Court said we need to change. That includes District 1, District 7, District 8, Districts 10, 11, and 13. 12 and 14. Yeah, 13 was not changed which is why it's still here in the original configuration as it was in the Hickory map. Now this was a good place to start because you know it showed us if we didn't change anything else what was possible. We then made a few other maps. There is a map called Tulip in the back. That map changes the 7 Districts I just spoke about plus three more and you can take a look at the configuration, it's back there. After that we decided we should look into changing a few more on top of the extra three so all of these other maps around the room, they change, the original 7 plus the three I just spoke about plus about eight other Districts.

But there are significant differences between some of those maps. So now we will talk about Water Lily. Like I said this map changes those eight additional Districts, which is why you no longer see this District five and 6, 5 going from Detroit to Birmingham and from Detroit up into Royal Oak. Water Lily and all the other versions get rid of that. But Water Lily in particular does not cross 8 Mile. Now we had this rousing discussion we have heard from the public over past few weeks do you cross 8

Mile and try to get some of the historic racism that road has caused in the form of red lining and just systemic issues? Or do we not cross it and have more Detroit centered Districts and that is a debate that I'm sure will rage on and you are here because we need to hear from you what you think about it. But we want to give you all a choice, so this is one choice where the Districts do not cross 8 Mile and very Detroit Districts. District 1 we have a southwest Down River Area, and this type of configuration is pretty similar across all the maps. You have a District 9 that encompasses the downtown, midtown areas. Up the river, through bell aisle you have a District 8 that includes Highland park with northern Detroit, you have a District 5 that is just northwestern Detroit and a District 4 that's pretty much just western Detroit. And then you have the lakeshore areas. This version in Water Lily has the Grosse Pointes along with St. Clair Shores and a District 12 that includes eastern Detroit, you know, Harper Woods, morning side, East English Village and a little of East Point. That is called Water Lily. Remember the W because from that map evolved willow. We want to show a progression here and wanted to keep with the same letter so we went Water Lily then willow. Now the point of willow was try to do what we did with Water Lily but try to create a few more VRA centered Districts. For this configuration we found the only way to do that would be to cross 8 Mile. So that's why on this map you see a few Districts that do cross 8 Mile. You see the District 5 configuration, it includes Oak Park, the District 7 configuration includes Ferndale and Hazel Park. But the rest of it down below is pretty much the same. You got the District 1 that I just spoke about. The District 9 I just spoke about and this lakeshore District that goes up the Lake and the same District 12 that has Harper Woods, the Eastside of Detroit along with a little bit of East Point. And then concurrently as a Commission we also worked on Spirit of Detroit which was kind of our first real attempt at slowing things down and taking into account some different community of interest concerns that we have heard throughout this process. And I'll turn it over to Brittini.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Good evening, everyone. I am Commissioner Brittini Kellom. I am from the City of Detroit. And like Anthony said Commissioner Eid said, Spirit of Detroit was our attempt to aggregate, gather all of the data meaning the conversations that we've had with Detroit residents, people that have come out and supported Detroit that were not even from Detroit and wanted to see the citizens of Detroit namely Black folks, right, get the representation that they deserve.

So we concentrated a lot on neighborhood streets, historic markers that are important to the citizens of Detroit. We focused on the northwest Detroit area. We used District 8 as kind of a pivot point because if we -- we knew that if we didn't take northwest Detroit all the way down to in some of the maps it goes almost to midtown, if we didn't do that we could create other areas for the Metro Detroit, southwest Detroit, it gave us more options. So you will see in District 8 there is Ferndale green acres Sherwood forest Palmer Woods and Pleasant Ridge and down to Boston Edison narrow dinner park and

Russell Woods again we tried to intentionally cross 8 Mile. I think there is this Fehr and we understand what happens to representation and what happens to folks that have different interests, if these lines are crossed or if we go across 8 Mile and I think that there are communities of interest in areas that have a lot of commonalities and could stand to share resources when crossing 8 Mile. So it was not arbitrarily done. The same thing for the neighboring District, District five, we have Bagley, Schultz, Winship, College Park, and then it bleeds up to Oak Park and it also reunifies Royal Oak Township. If you're familiar with that area, and if you are going west down 8 Mile, I want to make sure I'm getting it right on either side you have a gas station a Kroger, I think it's a liquor store. So right across 8 Mile you have Royal Oak Township on the map that was split apart. So this was joined again in the Spirit of Detroit map.

I'm also going to draw your attention to District 10. District 10 keeps the shores and Grosse Pointe together. We know that they like to be together. But it also incorporates Harper Woods which is a community that has asked to be with the shores because there are commonalities. So I point that out because now we come to Motown Sound. And the biggest difference is this lakeshore area in the Eastside of Detroit. So Cornerstone village East English Village, morning side they have vehemently said they do not want to be with Grosse Pointe. However, in an attempt to mix up representation and in an attempt to create more choice Districts, we had to figure out where that happens. And if we know which we have done before that crossing 8 Mile not only creates community uproar but doesn't make a lot of sense when we look at all the other numbers, then we are forced in this name of playing a puzzle game to work with other areas. So then we have the hard job and you all will help us do that, where do we sacrifice? Where do we take from because we have to also draw with population. For these House maps we need about 91,600 folks per District. So I don't want to change anyone's comments, but I hope this informs what you already want to say. When you're calling for change, saying don't cross 8 Mile and say we don't understand population has a lot to do with it. Because if we drop below 8 Mile then we are squishing and keeping in mind what Commissioner Eid said in Daisy 2 what that looks like went you lock all the other Districts and you're only working with the Detroit area. The example that I gave is if someone gave you like a cut out like how you make sugar cookies and give you the cookie cut out and so the cut out would be a star. And they told you to draw a sun in the middle of the star. You could draw a sun, but it might be a squished-up sun. So Motown Sound and Spirit of Detroit gave us more options to draw for Detroit. Are all ten of these maps perfect maps? Absolutely not. But it does a better job at representation. It does an awesome job particularly I would say, and I think the Commissioners would agree with me, we have talked about that these two maps really, really, really hone in on community. Commissioner Szetela is not here for a presentation on her map so we can't speak as a Commission to what her particular map does, but we do want you to look at all of the maps wholistically and pay attention more

than just what crosses 8 Mile. Something crosses 8 Mile really look at the map to see why or ask us what the logic behind that was.

But like I said, in these two maps it was neighborhood Central. We heard from southwest Detroit and spring well Mexican town Chadsey, Condon and hearing from the Yemeni and Arab and north American community that is suggesting that Melvindale goes back to District 3 and what we said about that is, and we have seen some suggestions. One person said okay take Melvindale, put it into three, take this piece of Warren avenue and put that into four. That kind of still leaves two empty for population. So we have to be careful as good neighbors because during this process all of you no matter where you live or if someone is Black, white, Chaldean, Asian right now we are all good neighbors. So if you are asking and calling for change for your community to be represented, think about what that does to the whole. Think about a great idea to make that happen. Because we know folks are frustrated but right now it's trying to move and cultivate action and use your voice and your critical thinking skills. Detroit is behind the eight ball, I will tell you that. And the Black people are the last people to know things, but we have to move past that and a lot of other communities of color are because this is the opportunity to make things different. The 13 of us are not politicians. We have regular day jobs. Some of us had no idea how to map and through these past three years we finished or figured out the software, figured out how to map. We are listening and being patient and understanding that we don't know everything. So you know when somebody gives you an olive Branch and walk to us because we are listening. So everybody is not here but tell a neighbor to engage in the process, we have this much time left. March 1st we have to have our discussions and pick a map based upon what you all are saying then we got to do it all over again for the Senate maps. So hopefully these rooms will be full of people, full of voices no matter how you all talk to us, we are ready for it, okay? All right? So the question was can we point out the entertainment District on Motown? So are you saying the downtown area? So this is District 9. District 9. So this keeps the Jefferson area, the gold coast bell ail keeps it more Central and tight-knit and keeps it Central to the areas than the Central downtown area, okay?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much Commissioners. Now we had some explanation and if you will notice we -- do you want to say something else? Okay, if you will notice we only explained half of the maps. The other half are still in the back. Now they are all going to be in the back. I think Commissioner Eid has something else. Then we are going to take like 15 minutes. You can go back and look at the maps, ask questions, look at them closer and then we will have our public comment time.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM:

>> COMMISSIONER EID: So right now the best way to use your time and to interact with this Commission take a look at these maps. We will set them up back there, there

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

is ten of them. Figure out which one you like best and what changes you would like to see and sign up and let us know. We want to hear from you. .

>> CHAIR ORTON: Feel free to go back to the actual maps back there and look. Ask questions. .

Okay everyone has had some time to go back and look at the maps, so we are ready for the in-person public comment. We have our Executive Director Edward Woods III is going to give us some guidelines.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLUM: If you're looking at the maps keep looking but we are going to start the public comment guidelines and immediately start the public comment.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Thank you Chairperson public comment guidelines are something we just want the public to be made aware of. We have full confidence in your ability to comply and look forward to this engagement with you. I want to remind you that you have up to three minutes to speak. I repeat three minutes to speak. You address the Commission as a whole. And not an individual member. You address the Commission as a whole and not an individual member. Any person making personal impertinent or slanderous rashes or who shall be boisterous may be requested to leave the microphone. Four if a person disrupts the orderly progress of a meeting or refuses to apply with applicable MICRC guidelines and rules, the Chairperson may rule that person out of order and/or order their removal from the meeting.

We know this is the last ditch effort with regards to that. We want everyone to be here, be engaged and be positive. But like I said this is the last-ditch effort and we want to thank you in advance because we do believe that you willfully comply with these guidelines so that the Commission can select the best map for Metro Detroit. .

Last but not least we want to encourage you to show up and speak up. "Like" or follow us on Facebook integrate Twitter TikTok, subscribe to MICRC YouTube channel and submit comments at www.Michigan.gov/MICRC. And you can call 1-866-map fair. That's 1-866-627-3247 for questions or more information. Once again thank you so much for coming. And to show up and speak up. Commissioner Orton, I return it back to you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much Director Woods. So our first public comment this evening is number 67.

>> Good evening. So I'm a born and raised native Detroiter, I'm also a teacher now, been a teacher for 25 years.

And one thing that I specifically demand in my class is fairness and respect. And I know you all stated that we have to move past what happened. And I get it. But I have a right to express how I felt how the map was drawn previously. And I believe that it was drawn after I wonder from past president didn't make enough votes to become the new president. And people were harassed downtown. While they were doing the poll. Working the poll. And a group of people came down and practically harassed Detroiters and then the new map was drawn. So I am asking that you continue to hear the public

comments, continue to put out when you will meet, more than just the news, maybe make pamphlets or what have you. Because I don't think a lot of people knew about this. And last of all I would like to say I'm in agreement with the Motown map as well as the Water Lily map. I like how you all included cultures to be together and neighborhoods to be together. That have historically voted together. And I think it represents our wishes, our livelihood, and we will be able to better be represented than we are now. And I thank you all for having all these meetings to hear us and please continue to do so. And that's it, thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 68.

>> Is there a number 68 in the room?69?hello, my name is angel I'm a fellow Detroit. I am also pretty much both sides. I agree with the map personally because it helps the community, you know, team, you know, minority or minority, it feels better to know at least your people care about you, you know. Team work makes a dream work and it can make everybody you know feel more wholesome and better personally. That's all.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you. Were you number 69? Okay, 70.

>> My name is Robert Taylor I'm a Detroit and live in Detroit all my like and I like to go with the Motown Sound. I think that is the best map y'all got up there. Thank you, that's all.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much for addressing us. 71.

>> No 71? Oh, you are coming, okay.

>> Hello good evening.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Good evening.

>> You probably heard me through the Detroit City Council.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Can you come closer to the microphone so we can hear you?

>> I didn't want to be too loud I'm Nina and some of you probably heard me from Detroit Council 2009-2012 and I feel Detroit Motown City map is best for me and my community because it does not will one has advantage or another. We work around another, and we are all in this community. That's it.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing us. 72.

>> Hello. So I was born and raised in Detroit and actually two decades lived in 48221Livernois area. For our City and our people I think the Motown Sound map is the best map that represents Detroit, so I hope you guys go with that map. That's it.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. 73.

>> Good evening, Council. My name is Delton Peoples. Lifelong Detroit. I'm in District 7. As I look through all of the maps and I was listening to her explain it, the Motown Sound maps looks like it's the best because it keeps culture, and it keeps the area intact. And we can also cross over so we won't miss out on some of those funds that the other Districts normally get a chance to use. So maybe they could spread that money around. So Motown Sound.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. 74.

>> 75.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: While 75 is making their way to the mic I want to thank our public commenters here today and as you approach the mic; I would ask you to speak directly into the microphone. As you see on the screens up here, we have really wonderful interpreters online today and for them to hear you and interpret for folks out that who require the interpretation they will need to hear you through the mic. Make sure when you are talking you are speaking directly into the microphone and thanks again for being here.

>> Good evening, Commission, thank you for your time. My name is Jalong and live in District 3 in Dearborn. Keep access community interest together which are comprised predominately of people of Middle Eastern and north African ancestry we support the Motown Sound map as well as a starting point. But we ask the Commission that when they analyze minority majority Districts, for communities of interest we ask you look at Districts like D4 and D5. And also Melvindale and Warrendale areas. These Districts could be unpacked to help address Federal voting rights concerns. Just to give a little historical narrative because I think these laws and these decisions need some historical context. Arab Americans and broadly people from the middle east and north Africa are not protected as a language minority under Section 2 and Section 203 of the Federal Voting Rights Act. I was a history major in college so I can speak to that context. With a lot of passion. The Federal Voting Rights Act was passed in 1965 signed by President Johnson to remedy racial discrimination in the voting process. Arab Americans at that time were not even a blip on the radar. We missed the party. So to speak. However, as we have demonstrated in our access map our community of interest excuse me is both a statutory requisite language community for the purpose of Section 203 of the Federal Voting Rights Act. We have shown that through the access apps that our community of interest has particular needs. And we believe that our presentation lays out those particular needs effectively. We are asking with the utmost urgency of this Commission to recognize our community of interest. As you begin mapping changes for the Senate. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 76.

>> Good evening. I'm Ms. Hall and a resident of District 2 Detroit. And I would like to ask the Commission to support Motown Sound map. I think that it will, well, I guess it will address some of the issues that we have in terms of racial boundaries. And turn it into a more of an economical match for Detroit as we move forward. Also, I think that it slips down a lot of our votes being diluted in terms of northern Oakland County. And so Detroit has its own set of issues. Birmingham has its own set of issues, Royal Oak has its own set of issues but if we can somehow just dilute it just, I mean I guess dilute the line north of base line just a little bit we can all kind of bend the counties together and the municipalities together for one Michigan. So that's my opinion.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 77.

>>Number 78?

>>Good evening and for a second time today. My name is Lamar lemons. I was a witness for the Plaintiffs in the case, which is why we are here. I was one of two witnesses. And as a witness your attorneys on several occasions, on three occasions throughout this process decided that I was an expert. So to the degree that I am an expert, I'd like to testify here on the maps.

You're missing the mark on -- because of you being new to this process, and most of you are missing the mark on several key things, which has not come up but will come up. And one of the things was always natural boundaries, natural boundaries are always supposed to be considered. In the City of Detroit we don't have mountains dividing the committees, but we do have freeways. One of the natural boundaries? The area is I94 so historically let me put this in a little context as a college student I worked with David Holmes on the 1970 redistricting and reapportionment. And in 1980 and 1990 which is why you try to say I was an expert. However, I'm a witness. I'm also, put it in context I'm also a former state legislature so I worked in the process even as a state legislature when before this law was passed to give a little background.

And I would agree that the Motown Sound is probably moving closest to but there is no reason to cross 8 Mile on the Eastside. None. You can go, you can clearly take East Point south. As I pointed out in the Court the new 8 Mile was 696. And between 8 Mile and 696 in Macomb County they made it clear that they wanted to stay together. And how do I know we have the best poll ever, an election. There was a special election on January 30th, to which I participated in as the only African/American and the only Detroiter and as the only former legislature. And the people made it clear that they wanted to stay together. Also their school District. So you can divide and then move west. Also on the west side of the Motown you need to tweak it with 16 and 17 have greater parity. So 16 and 17 both have 51%. The goal here from our perspective and as you know you will have to at some point sit back and negotiate it with the Plaintiffs and I can tell you our goal is to get to 51% and in as many Districts as possible. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 79.

>>Number 80.

>>Good evening once again. Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission. My name is Joe hunt, born in Detroit, currently a resident of the City of Warren over 12 and Van Dyke in the how District 14. And that House District seat is currently vacant due to the current law. There will be an election coming up. The reason that you are here is to revisit the 7 House Districts. And you will be revisiting the Senate Districts shortly.

As a vocal resident I run for elect Tiffany office 8 times in the last 12 years and what I've seen is a variety of different things associated with both parties. The one thing I can

say from this process is I appreciate the technology that's gone into your presentation. The Zoom meetings. The online comments. Everything is very visual, laid out for everybody that wants to comment to see. If I say Motown Sound enough times you will agree to the Motown Sound map. I like the Motown Sound map. I went inside last night to find the Motown Sound map was based on the Spirit of Detroit. So for my selfish purposes in running again this year for elective office for a House seat in District 14 Water Lily serves my purposes well. And what will happen there is that that allows me to basically deal with one City and one county and know all the precincts based upon the voters I had for years. The moment that we work on other maps, the willow map is the worst map because my District 14 would have to deal with Wayne County and Oakland County as well as Macomb County. So I would be reinvented the wheel. And trying to figure out where a community of interest exists. However, I'm going to say Motown Sound because what I've seen in all the comments, what I've seen from all the people, what I've seen in passionate pleas for this body to vote on is Motown Sound. How can you tweak it a little bit more? Move everything a little bit more south. Because what I've seen especially when I ran for Senate District 10 is whoever lives north wins. And this is the idea. It really comes down to the voters. What is contiguous? What are communities of interest? And from what I've seen in the Water Lily map the Water Lily map serves everybody's purposes well as far as representation, as far as the neighborhoods of interest. It's contiguous. But for the purposes of voting and going with the group that everybody is basically saying Motown Sound and I don't really see how you can refuse the Motown Sound map when anybody who has come out on this day and idea is saying the same thing over Motown Sound Motown Sound Motown Sound although I the vote for Water Lily. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 81.

>>Good evening members of the Commission my name is Chewy-K, I have a great privilege of serving as the general Council for the Detroit Branch NAACP. And I'm here first of all this evening to urge, to help you understand that we support the idea that the Commission, the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission should draw the maps for this state. That's what the people of Michigan wanted. That is what we voted for. That is what we should have. We don't want to see either special masters or courts drawing the District for this state. That's what we may see if the maps are not drawn properly. The Commission put out one set of maps that the courts have determined failed us. So now we are asking let's make sure that we get it right this time. You know, we think that all of the ten maps that you are considering now don't meet the test that the Court is going to apply. But that the closest that come to meeting that test are the Motown Sound and the Spirit of Detroit. So what we are asking, we are happy that you have more time to put into the consideration of these maps. Because even though you have two that come close, they aren't good enough and they got to be tweaked. The thing, the factor that I think will trigger either a special master or

intervention, is the packing of Black voting age population and to Districts in Detroit. That has been a problem and is going to be a problem and if any of the maps that exist now are sent forward, we fear that they will all be rejected. And, in fact, will get some form of judicial intervention that displaces this Commission. That's not the outcome that we want to see. So we would urge you to look at the Motown map, to look at the Spirit of Detroit map. To put in additional work so that we can have our Commission be the deciding voice on what our Districts look like. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON:

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Excuse me. Sorry, I did not want to break your applause. Do you have any concrete ideas or suggestions for the Motown Sound map?

>> Be happy to work with you on that.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Yes, please submit it. This is the process and the time for us to get all the input that we possibly can.

>> We will have input for you before your decision is due next week.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Okay just make sure it takes into account the map that we already have.

>> I got you.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: That is my finger wave.

>> Wag mine back at you.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: You said the Districts were too packed and how would you fix that without creating what we had before that the Court already struck down. That is the whole reason why we created what we created before. The Court struck it down so I wonder how you would do that.

>> The issue I saw with the Court striking it down before is there was a deliberate focus on race. And as the primary and almost only consideration. I think it can be done by looking at issues like proximity of communities to one another, traditional alliances, things of that nature. We can work on that. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you. Next 82.

>> Good evening I'm Lawanda of St. Clair Shores I'm in favor of the Spirit of Detroit map although I would like to see some tweaks and I don't know if anyone can explain the whole process as it pertains to offering feedback online, when that will actually shut down. I know I kind of have the same sentiments as the last gentleman that spoke. Race is definitely a big factor.

In fact, that is one of the reasons why we are having this meeting in the first place is of what happened during the last election cycle and how much representation was actually lost by in particularly Black individuals that comprised a great deal of Detroit. But I also feel as though with the things that we have gone through historically as far as integration having the option or the opportunity to represent a different community where you may not be a predominant race is also important. So I do want to make sure that we do have ideas and diversity and inclusion at the table. But I also want to make

sure that people really understand this process to the fullest. I know that there was a lot of great information shared last night at the event that you had, and a lot of information went forth tonight and earlier this afternoon about how this whole process works. But I believe that the biggest way to make sure things are fair and equitable is to make sure residents that are affected by the new maps have a clear understanding as to how this Commission works. I know I went on YouTube and in efforts to see if there was some kind of educational piece available. And unfortunately, I couldn't find anything so I would ask for that if you have the opportunity in the future. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Go ahead, Mr. Woods.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Excuse me, ma'am, could you share with us which portal was closed? That you tried to enter comments in?

>> It wasn't closed. I'm asking when it's actually scheduled to close. Like I know I can go online right now and make a comment or a suggestion or offer feedback but when do you stop collecting that feedback? I believe that tonight may be the last public hearing. And so for anyone who may be interested in going online, offering suggestions or even just educating themselves I think that is something that we should have a better understanding about as to when that process will be closed out.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: The Commission will be considering maps on Tuesday and Wednesday of next week. So I would encourage everyone for quality assurance to put in their comments no later than tomorrow.

>> Do you have a time?

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Any time tomorrow.

>> Okay so up until midnight.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Sure www.Michigan.gov/MICRC. But the comments will be open Tuesday if you want to make comments, they will be open Wednesday if you want to make comments but there is a lot comments the Commission will have to be considering and aggregate together so give us that time to put all that information together for the Commission. I'm just saying that would be the best. I'm not saying it might not count but there is no guaranty.

>> Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you. Number 83.

>> Good evening, Commissioners. Greetings my fellow citizens my name is Donald Hudson and I'm a pretty much a lifelong resident of the City of Detroit. I attended schools in Detroit. Graduated from McKenzie Wayne state University and I'm retired after serving 40 years on the Detroit police department. Where I was part of an independent workgroup that wrote the use of force policy that is currently in use by the Detroit police department.

And I was disturbed and dismayed when I heard the comments of the three Judge panel about the last group of maps. But I can't say I was not surprised because of the makeup of the Commission. And I saw that they had Commissioners who was

supposed to be independent yet they came from out state Michigan where their interests are certainly not going to be aligned with mind or most of the people in this room. I was sitting home today with no intention of coming to this meeting when I heard one of the Commissioners on the news state that he thought they had done a pretty good job on these maps because he based his -- he based that decision on the constitutionality of their makeup. He stated that the Constitution precluded having Districts where certain groups or races were bunched together so they made sure that didn't happen. And as I looked at these maps you did a pretty good job of it. But what you also did a pretty good job doing was assuring that the people of the City of Detroit will probably never elect a public official based on the way these maps are drawn. It's what they call gerrymandering. And even though it may not be intentional. We all heard Nikki Haley say she thought America had never been a racist country. And I'm sure she believed that. And it comes from her perspective. Your perspectives most of you are going to be different than mine. I'm a 72-year-old man who was born in the Jim crow south, had to sit in the back of the bus, had to enter a movie theatre through the alley entrance my perspective is different than yours. You don't want to bunch any one particular group together you assured that the majority group is going to do all the electing. We can vote all we want to but we're not going to have enough constituted voting power to make decisions and to exert a power or authority. So I just want you to give what I said some thought. I'm sure that most of you are well intentioned. I say God bless you. God bless Michigan.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing us. Number 84.

>>Good evening, Commission my name is Viva foster. I'm a lifelong resident of the City of Detroit. Before I give you my thoughts on which map I think would be good for us, I'd like for you to consider that I know that there has been a lot of work that you've had to put into this process for whatever reasons you had to do it, Court ordered, so on, but I get the feeling, and maybe it's just me, but I've heard it from other people as well, today is February 22. And a lot of the input that you're asking for the community to provide is due next week. And I feel there are a lot of people that feel that they have been excluded from this process. I'm sure there's been some communication out there, but I don't think it was enough. I don't know what you could do better at this point. But I don't think people had enough time to address this. I feel like we are crunched to make a decision. And the tweaks that people have recommended, are well taken and well stated. So I hope you take that into consideration and put forth the best effort to the input the people have taken time out tonight to give you input on and throughout the day. I don't know what the turnout was earlier. But what I see tonight, this is not a sufficient outcome for this important issue. So my vote is for the Motown Sound. And but I hope you guys do the best you can and make sure that you understand that we are vested in this, and we want this to be done right and we don't want to have to do this again. Because it's confusing. Folks do not understand this. And I think when they get

so confused, they turn it off. And they disengage. And we need to be invested in this. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Go ahead.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Hi I'm Commissioner Kellom I wanted to quickly address what you raised because I do agree that there is disengagement when folks are confused or unaware or they are excluded from the conversation. And just having been on the Commission since the beginning I know that things move fast. I know that a part of participation has a lot to do with disengagement and mistrust. And I think that was my plea earlier when we were going over the maps. If, and especially outside of this as a trauma specialist, the last thing I want to tell somebody is to get over something that has been extremely painful. Which is centered around miss trust. But I will say at some point there has to be a pivot from disengagement to curiosity to filling seats and to making change. And when we first started this process, and we came out to Detroit there were hundreds of people that came out and we would be here until 9:00 or 10:00 at night. One eye open, whatever we had to give. And what I will say though the comments were of frustration and anger. So we have been asking for a year and a half for Detroit to come out through Instagram through TikTok and the news and can receive the criticism and are big girls and boys but what has not happened is direct engagement. It's still the miss trust and we are asking hands open for communication and for suggestions we have done and again it's not perfect we have done what we could to engage the City. I for one have called District managers and have not received phone calls, a call back. I called deputy managers for each District. I have not received phone calls back. So I'm saying this to you all so that you can understand the depth of our efforts. And us trying to do the best to draw for the City of Detroit. So none of it is on purpose but we are literally begging at this point for decisions to be made. So that you all aren't saying that you're left out. Absolutely.

>> CHAIR ORTON:

>> So when you don't get a response from District managers what have you done beyond that?

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Being here and Edward Woods III have tried to engage and taken community suggestions where to go. Considering for the Senate process high schools, wherever we can to help to have this process be better navigated by the citizens as well as all of our meetings are online since 2021. Every single meeting that we've had is live, including this one.

>> Okay, then I would suggest too if you are not getting the response that you need from your District managers then maybe you can find some resource in some of the community organizations and go to them.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Absolutely.

>> Those folks, those District managers know who those people are but if you're not getting it from them there is a lot of information out there. But that's what I would do. Go directly to the community.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Thank you, I like that suggestion, there was someone from the back baggily community that came out today ran we will likely be reaching out to them. I will also say this what I'm kind of pointing at gently is there are people that are behind some of the things that you all are asking for that don't like the Commission. That don't want us or don't want to see us get involved with citizens. So this is why you all don't know. I not that we are -- we are voters just like you. We have day jobs and whatever live regular lives to whatever extent just like you all and don't have anything to hide or gain by not having you all fill these seats and be engaged with the maps at all. So that is what the thing is. Voters are still voting for people that have protected interests and it's been like that, and it causes corruption, and it causes disruption and ignorance and destain and why we are sitting here, and folks are disengaged.

>> Point taken. But again if you are not getting it because just for the reason that you just said you are running into a roadblock there, so you got to find a way to go around it and go directly to the community.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: I like that okay thank you.

>> Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON:

>> When is the meeting deadline.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Speak into the mic.

>> I'm sorry I've been told I had pretty much an outside voice.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: It's for accessibility and our interpreters, thank you.

>> I was just curious the meetings that you guys are going to have next week where in you are going to determine which one of the proposals you are going to accept. You say those are all going to be online.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: All of them are online and live yes and we take public comment at the beginning of each and every meeting.

>> Okay and is that on Zoom or YouTube or?

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: We have our own Zoom meeting but it's live on YouTube and how do they sign up for that?

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: On the Commission's website which is Michigan.gov/MICRC.

>> Thank you very much.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: On that Page you can select meeting notices and materials and all the information on accessing the Zoom meeting and the YouTube is in the meeting notice for the meeting for the day.

>> I found that website tonight because I told you I was watching the news and I jumped up to come down here and got on my computer and located this meeting. Again sorry to speak twice but I want to wish you guys good luck.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: No thank you everyone hereby matters to us and so happy it's not a full auditorium we would love to see that, but I believe the right people are always where they need to be. So all the groups that we have I know they are charged up enough to pass the word. And there is going to be a good up rising and engagement with this map and when the Senate maps that process starts, I know that Detroit will show up and show out with unlike you know different from what is happening right now which is still totally fine. So thank you.

>> Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you. Number 85.

>> Good evening, I'm Oliver Wilson and I'm highly invested in my area where I live. Northeast Detroit. That would be District 14, I do believe. And so what is the process after this hearing is over? I believe this is the last hearing, so what would be the next step that you will take to let us know which map is going to be applied?

>> CHAIR ORTON: So next week on Tuesday and Wednesday we will have remote meetings that you can watch live on YouTube. And we will be taking, discussing all the information we heard in the public hearings and all the information we have heard in the past and we will be discussing each of the maps and kind of seeing if there is any tweaks that we need to make and whittling it down to the one map we are going to present. So that will happen hopefully on next Wednesday. Our meeting is between 10:00 a.m. and 6:00 p.m. And after that we present that to the Court. And then it's in their hands from there.

>> Now the Court will decide which map?

>> CHAIR ORTON: No. We will decide which map we are going to present to the Court. And we will analyze it and make sure it fits all the criteria.

>> So you guys are going to do the same thing that you did when you redistricted Detroit, which pretty much, no?

>> CHAIR ORTON: We didn't redistrict Detroit. That is a different body. Different people redistricted Detroit. We do the whole state. We just happen to be doing the Districts in the Detroit area.

>> That is what I meant.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Yeah, so yes, then the Court will take it from there and decide to go with our map or not. Then we start this process again with the Senate map that we have to redraw a few Districts in that map in the Detroit area.

>> Okay, so when you did that, you disenfranchised Detroit or you basically penalized Detroit because you took a lot of Black representation out of Detroit and like my District there is a white gentleman who I just recently met who is my District representative, right? And not that I have anything against him. But to kind of paraphrase Martin

Luther King and, you know, unjust law in any form is an unjust law. And I think that what you guys did with the redistricting map was just for the simple fact it was unjust that in my opinion, I don't know if everybody feels this way but I was disenfranchised because you sent me a representative that in a City that is 80% Black didn't look like me. Right? And so to me that was a front. And basically disrespectful. And I don't know who selected the Commission. I know it was probably some kind of pool that was pulled out of a hat so I'm thinking that maybe some of you were African/American you would have been more sensitive to Detroit. I don't know. But I think that there should have been more African/American representation on this Commission. Right? That's just my opinion. And so I know that the Motown map, the Motown Sound map, it would sort of put Detroit back where it was prior to what we have now. And I think that's what should happen. That we should get it back to where it previous was, as close as we possibly can. Any comment?

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay, thank you very much.

>> Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Were you number 85 or 86? Okay thank you. I lost track.

Number 86.

>> Good evening, all of you good everything my name is Karen Washington and represent groups on the northeast side of the City of Detroit. Not a long time resident but over 40 years. So I think that is a long time. And concerned about the community. That's my passion. That's what I do, interact with residents and empower them into leadership capacity and what I saw for the District that I'm in from Woodward to Kelley road there were three different representatives covering that area, which then took them to Macomb County, Oakland County and Wayne County. What a split. And what I'm looking at now is similar in District 14. The maps change so much. But I think for the residents' sake they were totally confused. And if it had not been for our representative, and I'm under Donovan McKinney's leadership for the state where he is, had he not been brave enough to go, and I want you to think about the representatives who run for the state offices, and what they have to go through in new treaded territory to go from Detroit to go to Macomb County, culturally speaking and Wayne and Macomb, Macomb and Wayne and then Oakland. What a tragedy it was for Mr. McKinney to be harassed by the police department. What is he there for? Knocking on doors. Those things concern us as leaders. Because you're putting our people in harm's way. And no one wants, and I heard a lot of talk about that, but I saw it happen. And we encouraged him to keep the faith, keep going out there and knocking on those doors and putting himself in harm's way. That is the other part of this process. When you're among your own people you feel a little more comfortable, I think. But I think for the citizens, that is who has got to vote. That is what it's all about and if they don't feel comfortable going to the polls and there is no encouragement for them to go to a meeting and you live in Wayne County, south of 8 Mile, but a meeting is called that's with the District then you got to go

on the other side of to Oakland or Macomb, they are not going. So if we want participation and we truly want people to vote and feel comfortable voting and feel that their voice matters and this is our big State of Michigan, and we have a spot here. And comfortable, I live in Detroit. I love Detroit. But I go to Macomb. I go to Oakland County too. But there are many people who will not go on the other side of 8 Mile. So as we are redistricting and the map that everybody is saying about Detroit and that's because they feel comfortable in that space where they can go and hopefully it will encourage them to get out and vote. That's the whole purpose for this process I do believe. And that's what we have to keep in mind. We want people to come out and participate in the process. So I thank you for this opportunity today and when you say you went to the neighborhood organization groups, the City of Detroit neighborhood department of neighborhoods, that's a sad scenario because those people are getting paid to interact and speak on behalf of these neighborhoods, same thing with our City Council. So we got leadership issues all around. But I am happy to hear that you reported that. And I will certainly speak to my representative because that's what they are getting paid to do. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 87.

>>Good evening, Commission. I'm listening to the room and had some talking points and kind of I would say don't really know where to go from listening to the people and just seeing the maps and the data. One thing I will attest to just being young and being in this I will call it a post-bankruptcy kid of Detroit, going through public schools during that terrible time. I think it comes down to a lot of people my age don't understand Government and I think that is where this come down to. Government was one semester in high school, you learned about all three branches of Government and didn't really have adequate teachers and stuff like that and then we get older and this political process discounts us and beats us down because a lot of us feels like to attest to what Commissioner Kellom was saying there is corruption, what is really going to change? I think the rumor in here is not that we don't believe it. I think we don't know and the reality that we face, you feel like there is no change in it. But that's why I'm here. I'm here to be the voice of the young people and hopefully give you guys insights to what we think and what we would look for in these maps. From what I've been seeing, the Motown Sound map is what the people want on the website. It seems like it gives them what they feel is fair Districts in Detroit and maybe the easiest option for you to decide on as a Commission. But I'm here to bring the option to the Motown Sound that's not necessarily different as we saw earlier is the Spirit of Detroit map. I think that map is just as good because it's the same map, but it takes care of the shore front COI people were talking about Harper Woods wanting to be drawn in with the points. But I think over all just to echo what the Honorable Representative Lemon said. He made good points about, you know, 696 being with 10-Mile and all that good stuff. But I think over all I think of the people want the Motown Sound map I think that's a pretty

straightforward decision as far as I'm concerned because I feel like this is a public process and the people come out and talk. And if you have outstanding support for one thing it's safe to say that is what the people are satisfied with so I would put my vote behind Motown Sound just from a group standpoint, but I think the Spirit of Detroit is a better map. I appreciate what you all doing and be up there and have people come and be rate you and everything you do is not going unnoticed and appreciate you and it takes resilience to sit at the stage and take in all of that information, have the capacity to analyze all of that and try to give people fair Districts. So I see what you are doing and wish you the best, I hope every cup of coffee you drink is the perfect temperature you want it to be. And you guys make the best decision because I want to see you all succeed because I'm a firm believer in testimony democracy and citizen mobilization and people expressing their voice, so I hope you make the best decision and I wish you the best of luck thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you very much. Number 88.

>> Good evening, Commission, good evening all individuals who are present who are here to speak out and speak up and in reference to the Redistricting Commission.

I want to thank the Commission and Second Ebenezer church for hosting this redistricting meeting today. I think I forgot to say my name is Natalie Bienamee and 88 is lucky and graduated from Redford right here in the City of Detroit. It's no longer Redford high school. It's now Meijer's. So again just a little bit of history. But in honor of Black history month I want to spotlight the Honorable late Senator John Lewis who helped modernize and revitalize the Voting Rights Act of 1965. He said, when you see something that is not right, not fair, not just, you have to speak up. I'm here to speak up. Black leadership matters. Black representation matters. The way new maps are currently being drawn continues to dilute the Black vote. Making it impossible for Black people running for office to win an election. The City of Detroit needs our Michigan legislature to have Black elected officials who look like us. And from Detroit who understand our unique community needs like red lining. Of cars and homeowners insurance and Michigan no fault. For example, most men Black people in the City of Detroit are paying more money for car insurance than their car note itself. I need my representative to understand the education to prison pipeline in Detroit. I need them to understand police brutality. Educational disparities and inequality. Health and housing and redistricting and voter suppression highlighting another Black history truth which helps to bring home my point, Commissioners, did you know that it took 247 years for the first Black lawmaker to lead a party in Congress. Let me reiterate it has taken 247 years for a Black representative to be recognized. That individual is Hikeen Jefferies and serves as the House minority leader and leader of the House democratic caucus since 2023. Let me be very clear that each Commissioner is responsible for doing what is fair and just when creating Districts that create opportunities for Black leadership in the Michigan legislature. History is in the making. Will you be on the right side of

history? Or not? Section 2 of the Voting Rights Act requires drawing new maps and preserving existing majority-minority Districts. I'm urging the Commission to continue to tweak the maps for VRA compliance and partisan fairness. Detroit is the largest City in Michigan. And has 80% Black population. The entire City of Detroit should be considered a community of interest. I'm advocating for the following four maps: The river walk map. The Spirit of Detroit map. Motown Sound. And the Szetela map. I cannot support a resounding no to the Daisy map.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Excuse me your time is over a minute up so I'm sorry. Come.

>> Bergamot or two. No to the Water Lily map and I urge the Commission to draw maps going east and west instead of moving the maps more north past 8 Mile and stretch into three or more counties.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Okay your time is more than a minute and a half out so you're going to have to stop. Thank you for addressing the Commission. Number 89.

>>Hello, my name is Chavet Mcillroy Anderson and would like to thank the Commission for your hard work and everything you have done to try to do this charge that you were charged with and the oath you have taken to be here and become Commissioners without having a lot of a roadmap to how it needs to be done. So we thank you for that. I do want to say that I'm really concerned about the special master. And having the special master make a decision. So I'm urging that the Commission would take into consideration the Motown Sound map with some modifications to 16 and District 16 and 17. I do believe that the Motown Sound provides the opportunity for lakeshores and Harper Woods to be together. And utilize the communities of interest, school Districts and municipalities that they have. I'm grateful for the opportunity to speak to you today. I do hope that you are listening and are going to provide, put forth the maps that are going to result in being accepted and not having the special master's decision prevail. Thank you.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Is there a number 90? Okay, we are going to move to the remote public comment. And without objection Vice Chair Janice Vallette will facilitate the remote public comment portion.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you. I will call your name and our staff will unmute you. If you are on a computer, you will be prompted by the Zoom app to unmute your microphone and speak. If you are on the phone a voice will say the host wants you to speak and prompt you to press star six to unmute. I will call on you by name or by the last four digits of your phone number. Also please note that if you experience technical or audio issues or we do not hear from you in three to five seconds we will move on to the next person in line and then return to you after they are done speaking. If your audio still does not work, you can e-mail redistricting@Michigan.gov and we will help you trouble shoot so you can participate during the next public comment period at a later meeting. You will have three minutes to address the

Commission and please conclude your remarks when you hear the timer. First in line to provide public comment is Adel-Mozip. Please allow us to unmute you.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: That participant is not currently present.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you next in line is Adel-Mozip please allow the staff a moment to unmute you.

>> My name is Adel-Mozip on the Dearborn school board and represent more than 110,000 in Dearborn, Dearborn Heights and I want to bring your attention to the current mapping and how it affects my school District as well as my City. I'm also in favor of the Motown Sound map and with some modifications so that you would add Melvindale to the District, I believe Melvindale and south and east Dearborn serve together as a community of interest. Mainly represented by Arab Americans of Yemeni decent. Those two communities have always been disenfranchised by so many issues such as environmental injustice and also no representation on any elected offices, combining Melvindale with District 3 would add some representation to this District and also as I've been hearing for the last hour or so that Motown Sound is favorable for Detroit residents as well. I thank you for your valuable work. And I hope it works out for you. When you submit these maps to the Court, thank you.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Next in line is Alex King. Please allow the staff a moment to unmute you.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: That participant is not present.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Next in line is Moe-Hussein. Please allow our staff a moment to unmute you.

>> Hello.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Hi.

>> My name is Hussein and live in Dearborn and want community of interest together and keep access communities of interest together which are Arab American and Middle Eastern and north African communities. We support the Motown Sound map. As a starting point but when you think through majority minority majority Districts of our COI we ask you look at packed Districts like D-4, 88% and D-5, 81%. That neighbor or COI. Those Districts could be unpacked to help address Federal VAR concerns. Arab Americans and more are more broadly and more broadly people from the middle east and north Africa region are not protected under the Federal VRA under Section 203 because language minorities are determined as certain language minority groups who are unable to speak or understand English adequately, enough to participate in electoral process. However, we have shown through our access COI map that Arab Americans are sizable in population and language minority. Under Section 2 of the Federal Voting Rights Act Arab Americans are not protected as in language minority when the FVRA was created, we were not a sizable community. However, as we have shown through our access COI map, we are a language minority and now more significant in population with being or with shared interests and similar needs. Moreover we have no protection

from being packed or cracked as a community. The Federal VRA was meant to be the minimum standard of, and nothing precludes you from excluding those rights to Arab American communities. We have shown through access community of interest map C1510 that this community has particular needs. With that in mind for the State House maps we are requesting that the community have fair representation across two minority majority Districts due to the population limitation for each House District, we ask that you take our COI into consideration as you begin mapping changes for the Senate maps. I urge the Commission to take this in consideration. Thank you.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Next in line is Sali.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: That participant is not present.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you next in line is Nagi please allow the staff a moment to unmute you.

>> Unmute good evening are you able to hear me.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Yes, we can.

>> All right perfect. So good evening, Commissioners, I hope you are well. And I'd like to say God bless you for the work that you're doing. My name is Nagi. And I'm a Dearborn resident for 40 years now actually. I emigrated from a country called Yemen as a child more than 40 years ago. And I'm not a part of any organization or group. I'm just an ordinary citizen who goes to work every day and pays my taxes. So please bear with me for a few minutes. I know it's been quite a long day for you. I do appreciate your patience. I want to take a step back actually, way, way, back. And that is every single one of us on this call regardless of where we are in life's station we are made up of protons, electrons, neutrons, yet miraculously it came together to make you and I and intuitively we know that didn't happen by accident. It was the design of the divine creator. And according to our declaration of independence our rights come from that divine creator. And one of the many reasons why I love America is the fact that we have the Bill of Rights and the basic idea of fairness, and that justice is blind. In fact, God all mighty commands us to be just and kind. Now, when I look at some of the proposals to redraw District 3 and 15, I see some things that are disturbing in my opinion. I recognize the pattern for some of the proposed maps for District 3 in particular. They either take out Melvindale or east Dearborn, which both of them are primarily comprised of Yemeni Americans. And when you look at the situation of Yemeni Americans in Dearborn, we have no representation neither in City Council or the charter Commission. Even though we makeup one-third of Dearborn's population. We are probably the most politically marginalized community in all of Michigan. So, in closing, I urge you to do the just thing. Do the fair thing. And keep Districts 3 and 15 intact. Thank you and God bless you.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Next in line is Mir-Razvee. Please allow a moment for the staff to unmute you.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: That participant is not present.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you the next person is Samra-Luqman, please allow the staff a moment to unmute you.

>> Tell me if you can hear me.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Yes, we can.

>> Okay thank you my name is Samra a 30 plus resident of Dearborn Michigan specifically southeastern side known as south end of Dearborn and would like to thank you for listening and taking comments into consideration. On behalf of the keep Districts 3 and 15 as originally drafted in 2022 and without changing them both Districts provide adequate of community of interest and a chance of equitable representation in the state. What is being proposed for the District is extremely similar to the way the Districts were drawn prior to redistricting which means basically having each City have its own District. Why on earth would you use the Court ruling using Districts completely detached to change the boundaries to revert these back to the way they used to be drawn before we had even voted to change the boundaries as a mandate? We asked you to make those changes and this Court ruling has been hijacked to undue the will of the voters in my view. First, changing it concentrates and consolidates areas of west Dearborn to have limited socioeconomic environmental or health similarities with the current population in some areas of District 3. Melvindale is Dearborn in the south end of Dearborn are faced with the following one high and extremely more dense immigration. Two higher poverty levels and lower property values. I have more in common living in 100,000 than the mansions of west Dearborn. Three de facto segregation with red lining and continued segregation.

In fact, the mutual struggles that I as a colored Arab woman have gone through gave me more similarities and life experiences with former candidate Roslyn that ran in our District than Aaron Burns who is currently the House rep for the area you wish to replace. Number four increased environment M health impacts from proliferation of industry through urban renewal and the east and south ends of Dearborn and Melvindale and Detroit. West Dearborn with million dollar homes thriving business and higher income brackets has extremely limited similarity with District 3 except in making it easier for nonminority candidates with wealthy donors to essentially wipe out any chances of us obtaining a representative that would prioritize any aforementioned issues as an Arab woman coming out of the south end of Dearborn I have more in common from a sister from another mister out of Down River and Detroit than the white folks in west Dearborn. I fought with this woman on environmental issues that impact the south end of Dearborn, Detroit and specifically Melvindale. Not with anybody from or any issues in west Dearborn. I have to live next to the marathon refinery and next to the steel mill and deal with some of the most pollution in the entire nation, that area includes Melvindale. Which those residents have to breathe as well. We are literally breathing the same dirty and hazardous air. The area does not include west Dearborn.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you for addressing the Commission.

>> CHAIR ORTON: Thank you so that concludes our public comment for this meeting. We really appreciate everyone who came out to speak to us today. As well as those who offered remote public comment and public comments on our public comment portal and on the map commenting Page. We really are grateful for this opportunity that we had to meet in this beautiful space and to be here in Detroit. Today and yesterday. And so now that our business is completed today, I would welcome a motion to adjourn. We don't have a quorum, so we are adjourned.