

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

MICRC

20240430-1000 Meeting

Captioned by Q&A Reporting, Inc., www.qacaptions.com

>> CHAIR EID: We will get started in just a moment. All right. Good morning, everybody.

As Chair of the Commission, I call the meeting of the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission to order at 10:02 a.m.

This Zoom webinar is being live streamed on YouTube on The Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission YouTube channel.

For anyone in the public watching who would prefer to watch via a different platform than they are currently using, please visit our social media at Redistricting MI.

Our live stream today includes closed captioning. Closed captioning, ASL interpretation, and Spanish and Arabic and Bengali translation services will be provided for effective participation in this meeting. Please E-mail us at Redistricting@michigan.gov for additional viewing options or details for accessing language translation services for this meeting.

People with disabilities or needing other specific accommodations should also contact Redistricting at Michigan.gov.

This meeting is also being recorded and will be available at www.Michigan.gov/MICRC for viewing at a later date.

This meeting also is being transcribed and those closed-captioned transcriptions will be made available and posted on the Michigan.gov/MICRC website along with written public comment submissions. There is also a public comment portal that may be accessed by visiting the website which is www.Michigan.gov/MICRC.

Members of the media who may have questions before, during or after the meeting should direct those questions to Edward Woods III, Executive Director of the Commission at WoodsE3@Michigan.gov.

I will for the public watching and the record I will turn to Department of State to take note of Commissioners present.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Good morning, Commissioners. Please say present when I call your name. If you are attending the meeting remotely please announce during roll call you are attending the meeting remotely and unless absence is due to military duty state the county, City, Township or the village and state which you are attending the meeting remotely. I will begin roll call alphabetically with Commissioner Andrade?

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Yes. Present remotely from Imlay Township, Michigan.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Callaghan?
She is out.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Present and attending remotely from Detroit, Michigan.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Thank you. Commissioner Eid?

>> CHAIR EID: Good morning, present remotely attending from Detroit, Michigan.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Thank you Commissioner Kellom?
Commissioner Lange?

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Present remotely from Osceola County, Michigan.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Thank you.
Commissioner Lett?

Commissioner Muldoon?

>> MARCUS MULDOON: Present, Carrollton, Michigan.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Present attending remotely from Battle Creek Michigan.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Vallette? .

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Present attending remotely from Highland Township, Michigan.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Vallette?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Present; attending remotely from Highland Township Michigan.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Wagner?

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Present from Eaton Township, Michigan.
Commissioner Weiss?

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Present; attending remotely from Saginaw Township, Saginaw Michigan.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Thank you.

You have ten Commissioners present and you do have a quorum. Thank you.

>> CHAIR EID: We will move to the agenda.

Okay as reminder to the public watching you can view this afternoon agenda at www.Michigan.gov/MICRC. I would now entertain a motion to approve the meeting agenda.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: So moved.

>> MARCUS MULDOON: Second.

>> CHAIR EID: Motion by Commissioner Weiss and a second by Commissioner Muldoon. Is there any discussion? Commissioner Lange, I see your hand.

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Yes, I would like to add an agenda item. I think we need to discuss our Commission pay. I'm seeing that we have several Commissioners that are gone again and considering that the Commission voted to give themselves a pay raise while mapping and then people are not showing up mapping I think it's a disservice and I think we should have this discussion that is my motion to add it to the agenda.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: I will second that.

>> CHAIR EID: There is a motion by Commissioner Lange and a second by Commissioner Szetela to discuss the Commission's pay. Is there any discussion? Seeing none all those in favor please raise your hand and say aye.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Can we get a roll call, please?

>> CHAIR EID: Sure. Department of State if we can get a roll call vote we would appreciate it.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Yes, sir. Mr. Chair please state, restate the motion.

>> CHAIR EID: The motion is to amend the agenda to add an item to discuss the Commission's pay.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioners you have the motion before you from Mr. Chair. If you are in agreement with this motion please indicate that by saying yes and if not please indicate that by saying no. I will call Commissioners in alphabetic order beginning with Commissioner Andrade?

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Curry?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Eid?

>> CHAIR EID: No.

>> YVONNE YOUNG:

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Wait a minute.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: We need to put ourselves on mute if we are not speaking, please.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Can I ask a question first?

>> CHAIR EID: We are in the middle of a vote right now.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I know but I did not hear the vote all the way, so I don't know what I'm voting for.

>> CHAIR EID: Do you want the question restated?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Please, yes.

>> CHAIR EID: So back up an amendment to the agenda put forth by Commissioner Lange and seconded by Commissioner Szetela to add an item to the agenda to discuss Commissioner pay.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Oh, okay.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay, let's.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Can I ask another question chairman? Why are we discussing that? Did we vote on this a while back?

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Lange made a motion to discuss it. You would have to ask her. Can we just do the roll call over again please?

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Absolutely.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: We can pick up where we left off can't we? We had two people vote or three you voted no.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: We can pick up, it's up to Mr. Chair if he would like us to start from the beginning or if he would like us to pick up where we left off.

>> CHAIR EID: Let's start it over please.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: I wanted to do that one time and Julianne said no so just continue the vote please.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: We can't do that because I did not hear it.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: That is not a call.

>> CHAIR EID: Please wait to be acknowledged by the Chair before, I will give you the floor to speak. Department of State, can you please start the roll call vote over again? Thank you.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Yes Commissioner Andrade?

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Szetela?

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Yes.

>> CHAIR EID: All right do you have something to add Commissioner Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: I object to restarting a vote that's already in process. We do have rules on this in Robert's Rules of Order and you can't change your mind after you vote.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I'm not trying to change my mind I could not hear.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: You could have said lack of information and just noting for the record and please continue.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Curry?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: No vote. I don't know what y'all are talking about.

>> YVONNE YOUNG:

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I was out of the room for a moment, and I did not hear the vote so I don't want to be voting for something I don't know what I'm voting for and if you all can't restate it then I'm not voting.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Mr. Chair?

>> CHAIR EID: So once again, the motion is to amend the agenda to add a discussion about the Commissioner pay. So a yes vote would mean we will have a discussion on Commissioner pay. A no vote means we will not have a discussion on Commissioner pay.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: No, because we voted for that already.

>> CHAIR EID: Is that how you're voting?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I'm voting no.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Thank you.

>> CHAIR EID: Ms. Schaar I see your hand as well.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: I was going to indicate Commissioner Szetela and Wagner are correct once a vote is begun it does need to be completed. And so if Commissioner Curry is now changing her vote I will defer to the Chair.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I did not hear the vote, period, I'm sorry. You see I'm not on because I had to take care of some medicine that I was taking and I came in, tried to vote but I did not know you all were voting for that I'm sorry so scratch my vote if you don't want to accept my vote.

>> CHAIR EID: Ms. Schaar do you have anything else to add?

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: I do not. I will defer to you as the Chair.

>> CHAIR EID: All right Commissioner Wagner?

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Well, I was in the exact same position as Commissioner Curry. And I requested it, and somebody can turn off their microphone while I got the floor. I requested the exact same thing, and I was told no we had to continue with the vote.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay, my determination on this issue that any of you can, you know, object if you want then we can take a vote to do that. But seems to me that Commissioner Curry wants to vote no and she did not know how she wants to vote previously. My determination is we restart the vote and have everyone vote so everyone can have their vote counted how they want it to be counted. It does not need to be that difficult. So that is what we are going to do. Is there an objection, Commissioner Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: I want to raise a point of order our Secretary of State just told us the rules do not allow what you are trying to do. This is not within your discretion. The vote has begun, the vote has been cast, the fact she wants to change it is unfortunate, but the vote has been cast so we have two yes votes at this point, one no vote and we should be continuing the vote, that is what the rules of procedure require. It's not in the discretion of the Chair to change the rules just because you want a different result.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I don't want a different result I did not hear the vote if you want to do that that is on you and would not oblige that to anyone else.

>> CHAIR EID: All right I think I made my determination. Is there -- would someone like to about to the ruling of the Chair?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Yes I object to the rule of the Chair.

>> CHAIR EID: All right there is an objection to the ruling of the Chair. We will take a vote on that objection. All those who are in favor, all those who agree with the objection of the ruling of the Chair please raise your hand and say aye.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Can we get a roll call.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Roll call.

>> CHAIR EID: Absolutely do a roll call.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Mr. Chairperson I just want to be clear Ms. Schaar can correct me what she is saying is that you have to continue with the vote. But you can make a decision as to whether or not you want to accept Commissioner Curry's change in vote. Once again if I'm correct -- incorrect Ms. Schaar please correct me.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: You are correct.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: A hand is up.

>> CHAIR EID: I thought I heard you say something.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Once a vote is cast it's cast for the purpose of voting on a motion so my position would be per Robert's Rules Commissioner Curry cast a vote and that vote would have to stand per Robert's Rules.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Simply no one knows what Robert's Rules are. We got two different opinions. You know.

>> CHAIR EID: All right hold on Commissioner Curry we have a motion on the table already. It has been seconded so let's continue with that. We were at the an objection to the ruling of the Chair so let's just continue with that. Let us see what the Commission wants to do.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: How about we follow the rules and continue.

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Wagner you have to be acknowledged by the Chair.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: You are looking down and pay attention to the bleeps when people have their hand raised.

>> CHAIR EID: I call on you all the time. Please let's continue with the vote.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: For clarity we are voting on the objection or are we voting are we going to finish the vote?

>> CHAIR EID: We are voting on the objection.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Okay, thank you.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: For clarity we are voting to overrule the decision of the Chair to stop the vote? Can we clarify what exactly we are voting on so people are aware.

>> CHAIR EID: I see your hand.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I just lost connection for a minute and I'm just asking to be brought up to speed.

>> CHAIR EID: Are you up to speed or?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I'm not, I just now got on.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay, Commissioner Lange motioned to have a discussion to add a discussion on Commissioner pay to the agenda, seconded by Commissioner Szetela. We started to take a roll call vote. We got to Commissioner Curry, Commissioner Curry voted, yes, but then changed her mind because she didn't hear what was on the -- what we were voting for. So we restated the motion. And I'd like to start the roll call vote over to make sure that her vote is cast in the way that she wants to cast it. However, there seems to be an objection to do that by Commissioner Szetela, which was seconded by Commissioner Lange.

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Points of order I did not second anything.

>> CHAIR EID: I'm sorry, seconded by Commissioner Wagner then. So now we are pretty much trying to figure out if we should restart the vote or not.

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: One more point of order.

>> CHAIR EID: Go ahead.

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: I think it's vital that Commissioner Orton know according to Secretary of State's office based off Robert's Rules of procedure that the roll call vote is what they're stating cannot be restarted based off of Robert's Rules of Order so that is where the objection is coming into play just so you have the full picture.

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Curry?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: After this I want to bring back up the rules for the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission application. I want to talk about that.

>> CHAIR EID: All right Commissioner Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: So I just want to correct you on one point, Chair.

>> CHAIR EID: Go ahead.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: The vote was, and Commissioner Andrade voted, Commissioner Curry voted after she voted you were called on and you voted, at that point after you voted Commissioner Curry raised a question and wanted to change her voice.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Let me be very honest and very pertinent about what I'm saying. I stepped out to take something to feel better because I don't feel so hot this morning. And when I came back I'm just thinking you all voting, and I voted before I heard you. Now, if you don't want to deal with it fine. But we are going to deal with something else I'm going to raise in a minute since you all are so ornery this morning.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Can I finish my statement.

>> CHAIR EID: Looks like let Commissioner Szetela finish.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: If she said no or wait a minute before we moved on to something else.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I did say that.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Can I please finish.

>> CHAIR EID: Let her finish.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: I think it would be a different situation but the voting progressed and her vote was recorded and Commissioner Eid's vote was recorded and moving on to the next person so under Robert's Rules of Order her vote has been cast and it cannot be changed so we are asking the rules be followed and that we adhere to the rules of procedure and Commissioner Eid has overruled that and wants to restart the vote from the very beginning so I raised an objection to the decision of the Chair so we are now going to vote whether we are going to overrule that decision and continue with the vote or whether we are starting from scratch with a new vote.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Not start from scratch. Why not just be there, you always.

>> CHAIR EID: Hold on, Commissioner Vallette? Yes.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: One thing to Commissioner Curry Juanita this is just a motion to put it on the agenda to discuss it. It does not mean we are going to change the pay. Okay, unmute yourself.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Commissioners please do not unmute yourself or begin speaking until you are addressed by the Chair. We are having ASL interpretation, and it can become very difficult for them to do their jobs. So please remain on mute until you have been acknowledged by the Chair.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: I just want you to understand it's just a motion to put it on the agenda. We are not voting on it.

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Did we not vote on this a couple weeks ago?

>> CHAIR EID: I promise you Commissioner Curry I will get to you, but we have a lot of people with hands up so let me make sure I get to everybody, and we will come back to you. Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: We have limited time for mapping we are trying to get maps done. Can we just get to the mapping, please?

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Yeah, I did want to address Commissioner Curry's comment. We did vote on salaries a couple weeks ago. And at that time I actually brought a motion asking that we not be allowed to bring it up again and that motion was voted down. So the issue of salaries can be brought up at any point by any Commissioner at this point because, you know, yeah.

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Sorry, I just forgot to put it down.

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Curry?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Are you asking me a question or what? What are you saying?

>> CHAIR EID: I thought you had your hand up.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: My hand is not up, dear.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay, all right so I lost my train of thought where are we.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Currently taking into about to start the recall vote objected to by Commissioner Szetela, supported by Commissioner Wagner. We have not begun that vote.

>> CHAIR EID: I'm going to try to make these and quick to get back to mapping. I will withdraw that ruling and we can move on with the original roll call vote. Where it stands now can you restate how people have voted so far and we can just continue?

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Absolutely the motion was to amend the agenda to discuss the Commission's salary. It was moved by Commissioner Lange, supported by Commissioner Szetela. The roll call vote was started. Commissioner Andrade voted yes. Commissioner Curry voted yes. Commissioner Eid voted no. We are now at Commissioner Lange.

>> CHAIR EID: Yes.

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Yes.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Commissioner Muldoon?

>> MARCUS MULDOON: Yes.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: No.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Commissioner Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Yes.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Commissioner Vallette?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: No.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Commissioner Wagner?

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Yes.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Commissioner Weiss?

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Yes.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Chair, with a vote of.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: 7 yes to 3.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Yes, 7 to 3 the motion carries.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you Department of State. Sorry that was so complicated. Looks like it wouldn't have been consequential any way. Okay now let's move to is there any other discussion on the agenda itself? All right seeing none, let's is there a motion to approve the agenda as amended?

>> So moved.

>> CHAIR EID: I think I heard Commissioner Lange is that correct?

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Chair you don't need another motion, there was a motion to approve the motion already made by Commissioner Weiss and supported by Commissioner Muldoon.

>> CHAIR EID: That is right. Thank you for reminding me.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: You can proceed with the roll call vote on that motion which would now be to approve the agenda as amended.

>> CHAIR EID: All right, all those in favor to approve the agenda as amended please raise your hand and say aye.

>> Aye.

>> CHAIR EID: Is there any opposed?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Nay.

>> CHAIR EID: The ayes have it. And the agenda is adopted.

We will move on to the public comment portion of the meeting. If there is no objection is there objection to moving on with public comment? All right we will move on.

Individuals who have signed up and indicated they would like to provide live remote public commentary to the Commission will now be allowed. I will call your name and our staff will unmute you.

If you are on a computer you will be prompted by the Zoom app to unmute your microphone and speak. If you are on the phone a voice will say the host wants you to speak and prompt you to press star six to unmute. I will call you by your name and when it is your turn. Please note if you are experiencing technical or audio issues or do not hear from you for three to five seconds we will move to the next person in line and return to you after you are done speaking. If your audio still does not work e-mail redistricting@Michigan.gov and we can help you trouble shoot to participate during the next public comment period at a later meeting.

You will have 90 seconds to address the Commission and please conclude your remarks when you hear the timer.

I'd like to note that Commissioner Kellom has joined us. Ms. Schaar if you would like to note that.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Commissioner Kellom can you tell us where you are joining remotely from today.

>> VICE CHAIR KELLOM: Sure joining remotely from Detroit Michigan.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Thank you very much.

>> CHAIR EID: We have four public comments speakers today. The first of which being Mr. James Galant.

>> James Galant these are opinions. Rather machiavellian of you not to say you changed the title of a unanimous consent rule by consensus. You didn't tell nobody and allowing the Department of State staff collectively to act as the secretary when Benson told you at the first meeting that she is quote very much the secretary without a vote. She has not signed any minutes, no spaces are provided on the Page. You should not approve any falsified records of the decisions at these meetings. Secretary is deleting the records of the public chat because they repost them back to the channel and just Google it. If you reset to the original settings after 24 hours they magically appear with a less swipe. I look forward to the eight minutes at the public hearings. Please hire a

real parliamentarian to fix these proceedings to comply with Robert's Rules of Order as instructed. And why wait until the last-minute to send the Zoom links when I just got one for the two days later meeting and Mr. Dindoffer did not get one for today's meeting. Why not send them as soon as practical instead of waiting an hour before the meeting and just this happened to me before too and Mr. Dindoffer will be what denied his first amendment rights because of your lack of, you know, what do they call that? Working knowledge of Robert's Rules of Order, the actual common law in America. This is a disgrace sir, and you are now the face of Marxist style Communism in Michigan and the United States of America based on Carl Marx's definition.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Your allotted time has expired thank you for addressing the Commission.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you Mr. Gallant.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: I want to address for the record an e-mail was sent to Mr. Dindoffer at 9:03 a.m. including the link to participate in today's public comment session.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you Department of State. Next up on the list is Mr. Chris Andrews.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: That participant is not present.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay, third is Mr. Robert Dindoffer.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: That participant is not present.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay and the last is Mr. Anthony Scannell.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: That participant is also not present.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay, how about that. That concludes our public comment. Please feel free to e-mail public comments at redistricting@Michigan.gov we appreciate everyone who offers public comment in what way you choose and keep sharing your thoughts in any which you would like to share. Next up on the agenda are items for consideration. The first is item 5A constitutional language. If there is no objection I will ask local counsel Mr. Fink to address this item. Is there any objection to Mr. Fink addressing this item? Commissioner Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Yes this is an item I requested so why am I not being asked to present the item that I requested?

>> CHAIR EID: Would you like to present the item Commissioner Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Yes, please.

>> CHAIR EID: Well the floor is yours go ahead. Is there any objection to that? Let's see. Okay go ahead, the floor is yours.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Okay, so hold on a second I have to find what I'm looking for. All right so I just have a question, and this is not really a legal issue this is more of a philosophical question for the Commission. You know, we've had people submit their maps to us including Mr. Scannell submitted a map last week I believe it was, may have been the week before and submitted another map. We also had will

and other frequent commenters to submit a map to us. There were some comments made last week in particular that effectively we are not going to consider them, individuals Commission was saying that, the Commission did not vote on that or anything and I do not want to create that impression. However, there was general rejection of those submissions from some Commissioners. And so the language of the Constitution says this is supposed to be a participatory process and says the Commission shall receive for consideration written submissions of proposed redistricting plans and any supporting materials including underlying data from any member of the public. These written submissions are public records. So I'm just trying to reconcile that language with the Constitution which enables and empowers the public to submit plans to us with the Commission's position of some Commissioners that they won't even consider it. So I'm just more like I said it's not about what we are doing right now with the Senate map it's just in general like why are we taking the position we are not going to look at individual maps when the Constitution specifically allows it and we encourage the public to speak out to us and submit us maps. So I just would like to hear from some other Commissioners about what their thought process is on that. Because I do think we are hamstringing ourselves a little bit by refusing to look at things that may, you know, maybe we would not accept the whole thing but maybe they have some good ideas in them.

>> CHAIR EID: All right thank you Commissioner Szetela. Commissioner Weiss?

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Thank you, Commissioner Szetela, yes. I originally thought that looking at other maps from individuals was a very good idea but I have changed my attitude since the Court basically complained about our, how we use the information to draw our districts. Since we do not know how these individuals drew their districts and why they drew them then why should we consider them because it may be a map we would pick would get us into the same issue again that it was drawn based on race or some other thing. I yield back.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, Commissioner Weiss. I'm wondering what our legal counsel thinks about this. I think there are some good points brought up and I would like that opinion.

>> Nate Fink: Thank you Mr. Chairman. Looks like Commissioner Wagner has a comment as well. But I see the constitutional language that Commissioner Szetela referenced. I had asked about what the question she had beforehand but didn't hear anything about that until this moment. But as I've indicated previously, I sort of echoing frankly what Commissioner Weiss just said, given where we are at in this remedial phase really still in the context of this litigation where the Court has explicitly instructed the Commission not to consider in the initial drafting of the maps until we deal with the V RA review and then adjust accordingly, I expressed my opinion, which is that there is significant risk for the Commission to take a map that was drawn by an outside individual or group, start from that map and, you know, essentially just submit that as a

collaborative map of the Commission. Given the uncertainty and frankly the impossible task of determining whether or not race was used in the drawing of that outside map.

That said, as I said previously, a couple days ago, I don't see any problem with the Commission looking at outside maps to get ideas. And even bringing them forward and you know, considering whether or not to incorporate certain aspects of the maps in a collaborative map that the Commission ultimately decides to move forward with. But, again, there is significant risk from my perspective with taking an outside map and essentially making that the Commission's map that it puts forward to the Court given the context that we are in, in this litigation. So thanks.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, Mr. Fink. Commissioner Wagner?

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: So we give them a voice to take away their voice in the end. I personally helped Commissioner Curry draw my community of interest in my area. And places I go. And when y'all pushed the maps through my area all of a sudden extends to Howell and Brighton where we never go. And up to MSU where, you know, hey we don't make it up there either too much. So and as bringing forward and Mr. Fink's legal counsel I asked Ms. Pastula about the maps that showed up on the website and if they were put through our rigamarole and partisan fairness and she said no. Unless a Commissioner brings it forward they don't get looked at. So that's what I've got to say about that. And personally I think the scathing garbage that came out of Commissioner Lett mouth about a Michigan citizen who took the time, and we all know it's labor intensive to draw on that and have his map just torn apart by one of us who are supposed to represent our Michigan citizens. It's completely shameful to me. And this is not a legacy that I am going to leave my children. Because everywhere I go I hear bad comments about this Commission.

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I think we all understand the constitutional language and what it says. And I think I can speak for myself. I look at the maps that are presented by whoever and consider what they are saying about the map and communities of interest and things. And I think it's fine if we look at those maps and use them to give us ideas. But I do think we have to follow what the Court said in this remedial phase of drawing without race. So we can't just adopt something wholesale that someone else does and we don't know how it was done. It was not done in public. So I agree with Commissioner Weiss, and we can consider and should consider what the public says and most of us are considering what the public says.

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Lange?

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: I'm going to speak for myself also. I'm not going to speak for anyone else on the Commission as far as it goes for maps I'm very interested in maps imputed from the public. However, my interest is in maps that were presented that showed their communities of interest because how are we truly going to know what they are speaking of unless they submit a map. So in terms of the maps that were sent

saying this is any community of interest, I appreciate that. I encourage that. Now, as far as full maps that may have been sent from organizations, I do and I've stated it before in public, I do kind of have issues with it because I find that even some groups that say they are nonpartisan do have partisan leanings. Some groups do do lobbying. And to make it as fair as possible for everybody in Michigan I kind of step away from those personally. But I'm more than happy to look at any map from any area in the state as it relates to community of interest. That's all I have.

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Wagner?

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: My whole intent last week and bringing Mr. Scannell's map forward is for us to look at it as a whole as it has been, he has been one of our loyal fan base. And I say fan in quotes because I am really ashamed to be associated with this Commission at this moment. Due to what I saw transpire last week by someone who is a legal counsel or has been and even suggested we take away someone's first amendment rights. Rights entirely. So, you know, I don't know why we spend so much money saying, hey, let's listen to you. And if we are not going to listen.

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Andrade?

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Yes, I just wanted to put in my two cents. I think that we need to look at the maps from the public. I mean, if we need all the ideas we can get. Although we as Commissioners who have gone to public hearings and we hold the repository of information based on communities of interest. And I think we can take those maps and apply our knowledge to them and make them as good as they can be. And that's why I think we need to start with anybody's maps and all their ideas and go from there. Thank you.

>> CHAIR EID: I guess I'm just I'm a little confused at why we are even talking about this. Commissioner Kellom, go ahead, I will save my thoughts until after.

>> VICE CHAIR KELLOM: I was making sure you saw me and sometimes you have a habit of looking down so Anthony. So I watched last week's meetings back and I watched the beginning of this morning's meeting and I'm listening to the conversation now, some of what I have to say will be left for later but I will say that, yes, Commissioner Eid, I'm a little confused about how we are coming to this moment because of last conversations and things that were expressed, I can kind of track how we are getting into this conversation. I don't think that there is an I will start here I don't think there is an issue with taking in public comments that suggest communities of interest in areas regarding maps. I think though we would have to define where that stops and starts because we have already made a clear boundary that we are not going to listen to or it's hard to garner where these comments come from when we think of large organizations or entities that might have private interests in submitting maps. I think once we start that it begins to be a slippery slope. I think that some of this is born out of, again, like a broken record here people's discomfort in drawing. Some of us is older Commissioners, we have heard about the Metro Detroit area for years now. New

Commissioners, I've seen jump in and kind of let their hair down so to speak, to bend to that challenge. And that's been refreshing. I think that we can utilize people's maps, but we still have to trust those Commissioners that live in the Detroit area to say this is an okay map to maybe use. There are some things that are usable. This is not okay. Because for once if we are going to use an outside map or community-based map it should be Detroiters. That is what we are drawing for. And some of the commenters are not from the Detroit area. If they are from the Detroit area, those should be the ones that we are quote unquote favoring especially since we are asking to hear more from more from Detroiters. I've seen other communities of interest, other areas, other suburban areas we have drawn for, that is okay I get that. But the focus should be as it was for the House map for Detroiters and those that are Detroit Central. So I think some of it is we just need to work together and push through the fear or uncertainty of drawing. I think the other large part is we continue to need communications and input from an area that we are not getting just yet. And I would like to see us be patient to get that in and integrate those comments.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, Commissioner Kellom. I guess for me I'm just wondering why, it's just a little confusing because every one of you has the chance to bring up one of the public's maps on your turn. We did that last week. Commissioner Wagner wanted to see Mr. Scannell's map, and we did bring up Commissioner Scannell's map and did it the next day, but we still did. There are multiple opportunities now to look at it or edit it. So the opportunity is there. And the last time around with the House maps we looked at other people's maps too. We looked at the MSU map. We looked at Promote the Vote map. We did look at them. Now, they may be or didn't, you know, this Commission decided not to bring them forward but it's not like we didn't look at them and it's not like they didn't you know help shape some of the ideas in the maps that we did end up opting.

So I'm a little -- I just think, I don't know. I'm just confused to be honest. Any person can bring up a map on their turn. And I also have a question for Mr. Fink. And, you know, I understand we are under a Court order for this remedial redraw, right? We are not starting from scratch. We are under a specific order. Can you speak a little bit about like the realities behind that in terms of, you know, the Court order, with the constitutional language?

>> Nate Fink: We have to follow the Court's order. It's a Federal Court order. And any Court order we are required to follow. But it's an order from the three-Judge panel in the Agee case that ordered the Commission not to consider in the drafting of its maps. Do not allow race to predominate the maps. And I don't want to be redundant with what I said before. I don't see an issue with the Commission considering maps that are drafted by outside groups but there is significant risk in taking on a map that is drawn from an outside group and adopted as the Commission's map and put forward as the map that the Commission ultimately votes to adopt. Of course to the greatest extent

possible we need to be able to comply and follow all of the constitutional criteria that are set forth in the cons -- constitutional amendment that created this Commission. If anything conflicts with the Court's order we have to follow the Court's order and I don't see that in conflict with the particular provision that Commissioner Szetela raised. And as indicated we looked at an outside map already. There were a couple of maps looked at during the House process. I think ultimately we had a successful process that was followed and implemented by this Commission during the remedial phase for the House. It was a wonderful job. It was ultimately got to the Motown Sound map, and it was well received by the public. And by the Court. Just as importantly. To the greatest extent possible the Commission should follow that same procedure. And that same strategy. And in the Senate mapping process. So to the extent that you can do that I think that is going to be the best way forward. I don't want to short circuit the discussion here. But time is of the essence here. And time is limited. And these are important topics to discuss but I would encourage the Commission to move forward with mapping as soon as possible. Today you only have another hour and ten minutes. So, you know, I think to the greatest extent possibly you should move forward quickly to get to mapping. Thank you.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, Mr. Fink. Commissioner Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: So I have a couple of follow-up points. So the reason why I'm raising this is because we had what I would call a frequent flyer Mr. Anthony Scannell and watches religiously and submit a map and Commissioner Eid you said that people can bring in a map at any time, I mean really that wasn't true. Because we actually had to do a motion last week to enable Commissioner Wagner to even present that map. So what I'm trying to get at is some of the hypocrisy going on and we look at one person's map and say it's good and another person's map you have Commissioner Lett excoriating the person who drew it and in my person opinion it may be motivated by Mr. Lett's dislike of Mr. Scannell and not necessarily the map. There is a lot of inconsistency and I appreciate we are working within the context of a Court order. So for this situation there may be more restraints. But in general we sort of had this hypocritical approach with maps and some cases we say we will look at them and other cases we don't. Goes back to the point of what Commissioner Wagner made why do we ask people to submit maps if we are not going to seriously consider them. Commissioner Kellom mentioned people being afraid to draw maps I personally haven't seen that. I don't think anyone on this Commission is afraid to draw maps and maybe it's a misdirection on her part. I'm certainly not afraid to draw maps. It's more I feel we are cutting ourselves off from a valuable resource when we are not looking at what other people are submitting to us. And then, again, there is the hypocrisy because I know Commissioner Eid you had mentioned Chris Gilmer hill and the districts he had drawn, and some were incorporated into that Motown Sound map. So again why is that okay? But Mr. Scannell's map is very botent and very consistent. So I don't want to

belabor the point anymore. I want people to start thinking how we are approaching things to maybe be more open minded moving forward.

There is no action item on this I just kind of wanted people to think about it a little bit.

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Orton.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Orton I just want to clarify something it wasn't a motion that had to be brought forward before we even allowed Commissioner Wagner to look at Mr. Scannell's map. The motion she made was to put his map forward to the public before we had looked at it in public. So that was the only issue I believe. Nobody said we couldn't look at his map or a Commissioner could not bring it up in public.

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Wagner?

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Just to go on record it's completely incorrect due to all the inconsistencies and hypocrisies this Commission consistently puts forward to Commissioner Lange, myself and.

>> VICE CHAIR KELLOM: Point of order can we stop.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Stop.

>> VICE CHAIR KELLOM: Name calling I said point of order.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: That is okay.

>> CHAIR EID: What is your point of order.

>> VICE CHAIR KELLOM: Continue use of hypocrisy and name calling and we can talk about this but without these blanket statements of what we are calling other Commissioners. If we are talking about specific people handle that offline please but I'm growing tired of that in the meetings.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: I'm sorry I thought you were used to it.

>> VICE CHAIR KELLOM: Point of order.

>> CHAIR EID: Folks I hear you let's watch the language. Make sure we are acting in a respectful manner. There has been some charged language in this discussion. Just keep it civil.

Commissioner Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Yeah, I mean I would also disagree with what Commissioner Orton just said. She did have to do a motion because I actually had mentioned that in the past that Commissioner Lett was allowed to bring in I believe it was the Michigan State map with no concerns and I brought in the Promote the Vote map with no concerns. But Commissioner Eid did require a motion in order for her to present that map and put it out into our draft maps. So that was required and that is actually going to our next agenda topic if we can get to it, I did ask that be clarified in our procedural rules. Whether a Commissioner has the right to do that or not because I do think that that was unnecessary last week to have to have a motion for that when it's been allowed in the past and I think we just need clarification moving forward so if

someone wants to do that they have the freedom as a Commissioner to say hey here is this map I'm bringing in. But it was not something that she was just allowed to bring in.

>> CHAIR EID: My recollection of this coincides with what Commissioner Orton said. Commissioner Wagner didn't have the map as she wanted to see already prepared. Like how some folks have had other maps. She would have had the map prepared, then we would have looked at it during her turn. That's why we then motioned to have her go first the next day when the map was prepared. And we did bring up that map. We did look at it. We offered to help edit it and I have done that multiple times now so the opportunity is there Commissioner Orton and no action item and after that we can move on to the next item on the agenda.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I was going to say we end discussion on this topic and move forward.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Second.

>> CHAIR EID: There is a motion and a second to end discussion on this topic, requires a two thirds vote to end discussion. Does that require a roll call vote?

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: In order to know if there is a two thirds vote yes you would need to do a roll call.

>> CHAIR EID: All right let's go ahead then. There is no discussion on motions.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Edward has his hand up.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Since there is no motion currently on the floor do we even need to entertain this particular motion?

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: It's a motion to end discussion on this topic. So to end all discussion on the topic that the Chair has presented, yes, you can move to end all discussion.

>> CHAIR EID: There is a motion and a second. Let's take that roll call vote, please.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Yes, sir, Mr. Chair. This vote Commissioners is to end discussion on this topic. If you are in favor of the motion please respond by saying yes. And if you are not in favor of the motion please respond by saying no. I'm going to start with Commissioner Curry?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Eid?

>> CHAIR EID: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Kellom?

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Lange?

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Muldoon?

>> MARCUS MULDOON: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Yes.

>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Szetela?
>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Yes.
>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Vallette?
>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Yes.
>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Wagner?
>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Yes.
>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Weiss?
>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Yes.
>> YVONNE YOUNG: Commissioner Andrade?
>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Yes.
>> YVONNE YOUNG: You have 11 Commissioners present, Mr. Chair, and all 11 have responded affirmatively. Motion carries.
>> CHAIR EID: Thank you Ms. Young.
>> YVONNE YOUNG: You are welcome.
>> CHAIR EID: Next item for consideration mapping processes and procedures. Without objection I will ask local counsel Mr. Fink to facilitate this item. Is there any objection, seek none please proceed.
>> Nate Fink: Thank you Mr. Chairman. Given the short timeframe here today, I would perhaps recommend that the Commission consider tabling this to their next meeting, which I think is the next meeting which I think is on Thursday. Just so you have some time to complete some mapping today. I know this was a proposal from Commissioner Szetela, but that would be my recommendation. Commissioner Szetela had her hand up.
>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: I'm okay with moving it to Thursday.
>> CHAIR EID: Okay, is there a motion to table this until Thursday?
>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: So moved.
>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: I will second.
>> CHAIR EID: All those in favor, is there any discussion on the motion? Seeing none all those in favor to table this discussion for consideration mapping processes and procedure until Thursday please raise your hand and say aye.
>> Aye.
>> CHAIR EID: Any opposed? The ayes have it. All right we will now move on to the new item, Commissioner pay discussion. Commissioner Weiss?
>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Yes, I have to leave for a doctor's appointment and since we do need to get some mapping done I would like to move this be set until Thursday if possible.
>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Second.
>> CHAIR EID: There is a motion and a second to table this until Thursday, since it was already added to the agenda it will be on the agenda Thursday if it passes. Is there any discussion on the motion? Commissioner Lange?

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Yep, I'm against moving it until Thursday. I put it on this one. I can be quick, and I think a vote can go quick. I think it needs to be discussed and it was voted to put on today's schedule.

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Weiss?

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Thank you Ms. Lange I also agree but you may be quick, I will have some my side and it's my opinion and what you had asked me last week I believe on why I was talking to Mr. Fink and Mr. Brady I will not be quick, thank you.

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Yeah, I would talk about this today. We have already lost an hour. I think it's better just to do this today rather than on Thursday and possibly lose more time on Thursday.

>> CHAIR EID: I would like to get to mapping today. So I prefer we talk about it on Thursday. Especially if we are going to have another Commissioner leaving and it will leave us with, you know, fewer than a full body of Commissioners. We discussed this item, this is my opinion. Commissioner Vallette?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: I think we need to get on with mapping. That's what we are supposed to be doing. I think that we can table this until Thursday.

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Lange?

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Yeah, I would just like to make one point. Thursday is a longer meeting. Why not finish up the business. We keep moving business to the next meeting, to the next meeting, why don't we take this short meeting, finish business and take the Thursday meeting which is a longer meeting and commit to just mapping that meeting? Let's get the business out of the way so we can just focus strictly on mapping.

>> CHAIR EID: Is there any more discussion on this item? Okay there has been a motion and a second to table this item for consideration Commissioner pay until Thursday. All those in favor please raise your hand and say aye.

>> Aye.

>> CHAIR EID: Is there any opposed?

>> Nay.

>> CHAIR EID: The ayes have it, we will -- it will be on the agenda on Thursday. .

Okay, next up is mapping. Without objection I will ask the Commission return to their collaborative map drawing process as is outlined by our rules of procedure and mapping process document. Is there any objection? Hearing none we will move forward. Let's see, we were finishing up with Commissioner Andrade at the last meeting. Commissioner Andrade, the floor is yours.

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: No, I think I was done for now, thank you.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay, then the next person up to map is Commissioner Curry? So we have a lot of different, well not a lot, we have a few different drafts that have a few

different configurations right now. Commissioner Curry, do you know where you would like to start? I know you had talked about, you know, maybe reconfiguring one of the Detroit districts, if you would like to do that, I'm more than happy to help you. Just let us know where you want to go.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Just put me back on the first one I started.

I want to reconfigure it.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay, the first one that you started.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: That was the very first map we did.

>> CHAIR EID: The very first map, okay I remember it. Ms. Schaar?

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: I was just going to indicate the first map that Commissioner Curry worked on was called 042324 version one.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, Ms. Schaar. That's very helpful.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Do we want to make a copy or edit it?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I want to edit mine.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: It was posted to the website.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I can start another one, Kent.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Just make a copy of it for the sake of keeping up with where we are at. It will just be...let's get a couple of these so we can see them.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Because I can't see them.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Are you able to read the screen?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I cannot.

In fact, there is nothing I can see on it hardly. Didn't you have it cleared out for us?

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I thought we were looking at this earlier. Am I not...

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I can read the numbers on it. I can't see any names yet, if you have that.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I don't have neighborhoods up or anything like that.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay, we are okay, that is it.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Good. We are on the right place and want to bring in the neighborhoods right here.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: With my glasses I cannot see.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: We are getting there. Right now we are looking at a large area. Can you read that?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: No. I'm having trouble with my eyes that is why I was away this morning. I was taking something because my eyes are blurry.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I thought this morning when we looked at it, it looked good.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I can read it but it's straining but okay let's go.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay.

>> CHAIR EID: I will work with you Commissioner Curry. Let's do this together.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Do you know what, I will do it. I will do it. If you want to jump in maybe.

>> CHAIR EID: I'm here if you need me.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Thank you.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Just a second. How did I mess this up? Just a minute. It looks like this thing is not cooperating. Okay.

All right how about now?

>> CHAIR EID: It doesn't look like anything changed.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Either my eyes are blurry or I'm looking at blurriness. I don't know what is going on. That is a little better.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay, what are we seeing now?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I am seeing not -- what is this? You got to move this block so I can see the map. You still got me blocked. Okay.

Now I can't see it.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I don't know really. I'm just going to have to end this, end this session and come back to it.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: You can pass me, and I will work on one by myself.

>> CHAIR EID: Hold on, Kent, what do you mean end the session?

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: No, I'm going to restart it.

>> CHAIR EID: Restart it.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: The application. I changed the resolution, trying to get it.

>> CHAIR EID: I see. We will give you a moment to do this.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I don't really.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Come back to me, Anthony.

>> CHAIR EID: We will figure it out. We want to make sure you have your turn. So let's figure it out and just give them a moment and we will.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I can work on one, I can work on a map by myself.

And turn it in.

In fact, I would like to work on one by myself and turn it in.

>> CHAIR EID: All right.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay, right now what does it look like right now?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I'm seeing the upper something. I'm not seeing anything of the Detroit area.

>> CHAIR EID: So right now it looks like you have the neighborhood borders but not the names.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Right.

>> CHAIR EID: Outlined in red.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay now we go to layer manager. Layer properties. I'm going to do it, name, apply. So the name is up there at this time and maybe two seconds.

>> CHAIR EID: The names are there. They are in Black.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Right pretty big or legible? Juanita?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Yeah, I can kind of see it.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay can we work with this?

>> CHAIR EID: Zoom in a little bit.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Here is where Grosse Pointe park. What does that look like?

>> CHAIR EID: That is the Jefferson Chalmers neighborhood across from Grosse Pointe. So what are we thinking? Would you like to continue with this, Commissioner Curry? Or would you like.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I'm going to work on one by myself because this is not working for me.

>> CHAIR EID: All right.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: You can pass me. I have already made some kind of provisions to work on one by myself.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: And that is what I would like to do, just do a map by myself and turn it in.

>> CHAIR EID: If that is what you want. Okay, next up is me. So we have a few different maps now and I would like to start by just taking a look at what we have. So can we look at the maps that are completed so far?

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yesterday 1, 2 and 4 were completed.

>> CHAIR EID: Let's take a look at them. You don't need to make any copies let's just open it up.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Starting with the first one?

>> CHAIR EID: Yes. These were yesterday's plans. This is number one. Let me turn off that layer manager there.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This was the first one yesterday and I think it was predominately finishing up 7 and 8 if I remember right.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay, yes, this was the first one that Commissioner Szetela was working on; is that correct Commissioner Szetela? I see your hand is up.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Yeah so it actually was not 7 and 8 it was fixing 6 and 13 moving Northville.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yes.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Into 6 and moving the Farmington, Farmington Hills area into 13 so that is what the changes were here, and this was resaved as a different version and that next version I changed 11 and 12. And this was the map that had the almost perfect partisan fairness scores for mean median and efficiency gap. 0.5, 0.5 it had.

>> CHAIR EID: Right. Can we now look at the other one that came directly after it?

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay, and then the next one was for version two. Yes and this was you know a copy 6, 7 and 13 are like previously and this is where 12 became a shoreline District. And 11 retreated.

>> CHAIR EID: You are good. So the big difference I see here, as Commissioner Szetela just said there is a difference in this one keeps the shoreline COI and changes a little bit of District 11 and 10 to make up for that; is that correct Commissioner Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: What was the last part you said, something about ten?

>> CHAIR EID: 10 and 11 were different because of the District 12 change.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: I did not change 10. I originally tried to put Roseville into 12 and ended up backing that out so it's just 11 and 12.

>> CHAIR EID: So the only difference between those two are districts 11 and 12.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Yes.

>> CHAIR EID: All right, and, okay, that's that one. What else do we got?

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: And then plan three is a -- the third one yesterday is a partial plan. It's incomplete. Do you want to look at that one?

>> CHAIR EID: Yes.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay.

Turn off the neighborhood layer. So this has -- so this was a 12 shoreline community that Sterling height from Detroit through Sterling Heights is unassigned. So all this area.

>> CHAIR EID: Yes, this one does not change 12 from the original Linden configuration.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Shoreline.

>> CHAIR EID: I thought we finished this one up.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Well, it's finished in version four.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay let's take a look at that.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I think three on this plan a lot of three was done around through here but in four it was completely done.

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: I was going to say three is not a complete map but four was a complete map and that was the difference.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You know, this is where I think Commissioner Weiss did three in that area and this was completed. The 8, 11, 10.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay, and this is.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Version four, yesterday's date.

>> CHAIR EID: Right, this was the one that a lot of us were working, right. Okay so all of these though have the District one that it combines the Down River communities with up through the Detroit river to bell isle up to Grosse Pointe. We had a few with a

different Detroit configuration and I don't think those were complete. So let's see if we can look at those.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I'm not sure which ones. So that would have been prior.

>> CHAIR EID: They were a little further back. I think.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Here is the 25, 24, 25, 25, 23, 24, 24, 24. 25V3 and V3.

>> CHAIR EID: Is there a 24, yeah, 24V3. Let's open that one up.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yes.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: E did not assist in drawing these and where we came from 12 looks original. This is an incomplete plan. North Detroit, Sterling Heights area is all unassigned. 3, 8, 10 and 11.

>> CHAIR EID: So this is four. 24 version 3.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yes.

>> CHAIR EID: Now, I think, you know, with this one the main difference is that distribute one instead of going up to the river it's like the Down River and then it curves around Dearborn to take in the west side of Detroit. But I think there was still one verdict of this that had this District one but was a little bit more complete. Can we see if we can find that? It might be a version four on the 24th or it might be on the 25th.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: So we just looked at here is 424 version 4.

>> CHAIR EID: Let's open it up.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Chair, if I may.

>> CHAIR EID: Please.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: 042424SDCOL version 3 becomes 042524 version 3. The next day. You actually began with that one. You pulled in 424 version 3. And began working on it from there. So I think that might be what you're looking for. So 42524 version 3.

>> CHAIR EID: I think you are correct, let's open that one up.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Backing out and here is 2424 version 4.

>> CHAIR EID: Yeah so again this one has that District 1 that's all of the, you know, Down River through the Detroit river up until Grosse Pointe. I'm looking at.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This is District 11 and looks unassigned.

>> CHAIR EID: No, I can see it.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay.

>> CHAIR EID: Let's open the one that Ms. Schaar just referenced 42524 version 3.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 425 version 3.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay, and right but then there was something else done to this. Is there a 425 version 5?

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Version five from 425 is a copy of this version three and Commissioner Lange made that copy to consider the Jewish community. And that's

where she began making the changes to Farmington and Farmington Hills, Bloomfield, that area.

>> CHAIR EID: Got you, got you Commissioner Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Just like to thank Schaar for doing such a wonderful job of keeping track of all these versions because it's helpful.

>> CHAIR EID: It's extremely helpful. I echo that. Okay let's stick with this one..

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yes.

>> CHAIR EID: But I could have Schwann Commissioner Muldoon added to this and drew in another District. But maybe that got incorporated into a different map.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: If I may jump in that should be in this version five.

Commissioner Muldoon started a new District 11 in Macomb County with Macomb and Clinton Township, Fraser and, sorry if I said that wrong and Roseville so that should be included in this 42524 version 5.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay that was version three. 425, this one.

>> CHAIR EID: Got you. This is the 425 version 5. And this is where 6 and Detroit are significantly, 6 and 1 are significantly different.

>> CHAIR EID: Yes but this one has the different District 7 as well. Okay, here's what I want you to do. Make an overlay of this and put it on the one we were just looking at, the 42425 version 3.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: If I can remember how to do that.

>> CHAIR EID: Right now there are a couple of configurations that I kind of am thinking about working on. I like what we all collaborated on yesterday. The 429 version 4. That is where Commissioner Andrade ended. I also do like the second of the two that Commissioner Szetela drew. You know, I'm considering taking a look at that and seeing if we can maybe look at Sterling Heights area a little bit more but generally I think that's a pretty good one. But all of those have that same configuration for Detroit and I would just like to offer up this other configuration we started on the other day. So there are a few options out there. So, yeah, so we are looking at 424, sorry, 425 version 3.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Version five.

>> CHAIR EID: No version three.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Which one do you want to work on? I saved this one I have highlighted right here as a shape file to overlay on something. You said you wanted to overlay it on something.

>> CHAIR EID: I want you to overlay that one on top of version three.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: There we go, okay.

Need to get on the same Page. Now I got an error here.

>> CHAIR EID: It's all right we are opening up a lot of maps and it's a good refresher for people too going on the different options we have right now.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I'm logging back in and share screen. Is my screen still being shared?

>> CHAIR EID: It is not.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay then we need to do that. Yep. Yep. I guess you are all looking at it now.

>> CHAIR EID: We can see the screen now.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: All right, and this is the version three from the 25th and then we will go over here and I'm going to bring in that version five outline. Do you have a preference for the color?

>> CHAIR EID: No.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I just want to make it a little bigger.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay so this is incomplete now. I think in order to have a second configuration for specifically the Detroit area, we should try to complete this. So first I want you to put in the overlay. You have the District 11 that Commissioner Muldoon drew and the other version. Let's just fill it in on here and then I will work on a new District.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: All right do we want to edit this version 425V3?

>> CHAIR EID: I'll take a copy of it. Give it today's date.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This is what we will do is close this plan. Will this be the first one of today? I believe so.

>> CHAIR EID: Yes.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I created one for Commissioner Curry. So we want to create this 11.

>> CHAIR EID: Copying the 11 that was already drawn from another map into this one. I think it was drawn by Commissioner Muldoon. And then from there I will draw a new District.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Did it not select them?

>> CHAIR EID: It's a Peach color if you want to make it blue or something.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Make them dark, okay.

>> CHAIR EID: Add to selection, it may be a little easier. There you go.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: There is 11.

>> CHAIR EID: Population on 11 is okay are the population on the other ones more or less okay?

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 11 yes but the other is 2.44 low. So I don't know.

>> CHAIR EID: This one did not change 12.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: We got some feedback about one of these Grosse Pointe, it may not have been this plan, but I heard somebody saying one Grosse Pointe precinct was left out.

>> CHAIR EID: No, that was in the House we got a correspondence from somebody about that.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I didn't know if that had been taken into account.

>> CHAIR EID: We will have to respond to that and let her know what happened.

Okay let's so that puts in what Commissioner Muldoon drew. All right now I'm going to we got two or three districts left, I think it's two, it might be three.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Show all districts so you have 8 and 3.

>> CHAIR EID: 8 and 3, okay.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: And they are all.

>> CHAIR EID: What is going on between 2 and 1 on here?

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 2 and 1 are how they are tied together. Yeah, two very different Detroit's.

>> CHAIR EID: Two very different Detroit's, okay, I see.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Number one districts going down to South Gate.

>> CHAIR EID: Some other configurations did not include South Gate here and included South Gate either with I believe by the outlines it looks like South Gate is with District 4 which probably makes a little bit more sense than being with District 2. But we can do that small change later if somebody wants.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: There is a larger change right here between 1 and 6. This is the red fix there.

>> CHAIR EID: Let's leave that, fine. I want to try to complete this so that there are a couple of different Detroit configurations available. This one obviously it takes the Down River Areas, puts it into the downtown, midtown areas and curves around the municipality of Dearborn, which kind of juts into the land area of Detroit. Kind of similar to the House District one in the Motown Sound map. But you still need two districts left so let's make an east side centered District. Let's start at let's start right there and let's take in Morningside, East English Village, Devony, those areas you are on and let's just start drawing.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Do we need the neighborhood layer up here?

>> CHAIR EID: That would be good.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Sometimes it helps me keep up. And I'm going to make these Black just to be different. Now they are really big. Where do you want to start at?

>> CHAIR EID: Start at Cornerstone village.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay and do you have a number preference 8 or 3?

>> CHAIR EID: You said 8 or 3?

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yes.

>> CHAIR EID: Let's do 8. Is 12 locked?

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: No but it can be.

>> CHAIR EID: Let's lock 12 and you can continue working with presents. I want this whole area up to Regent Park, which is the area north.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: East English Village, Morningside.

>> CHAIR EID: Yes, all of those, Chandler Park, Wade, outer drive.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Do you want to go north or south?

>> CHAIR EID: Continue going to include don't go south but you see Fox creek?

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yes Eid aye include that and go up to Wade, Eaden Gardens. Maple ridge, yep. All right, assign those. Go up to Regent Park. We will go up and add East Point and the remainder of Warren. We can have population and have another District that is almost totally in Detroit that has Detroit and Hamtramck and Highland Park and the rest of Detroit. If you add centerline and the rest of Warren to District 8.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Do you want to come down in here?

>> CHAIR EID: Let's assign all of it and see where we are with population.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You still need 60,000.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay so let's take in more of the east side of Detroit. Let's include those neighborhoods of corner ridge, up until airport sub.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Like up through here?

>> CHAIR EID: Yep.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: We have some split neighborhoods down here, but we will fix those as we go. We still have 36,000. Do you want to come?

>> CHAIR EID: I'm trying to decide if this type of a configuration should include Jefferson Chalmers and River Bend, I'm kind of leaning towards not because I think that would be better in another District that has like the mid portions of Detroit. But is there any opinion on that from my -- of my fellow Commissioners? All right let's stay in the northern portion then instead of going south.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Take this area like.

>> CHAIR EID: Up to Buffalo Charles. So and Pershing and Davison.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: The precincts blow up, don't assign that and just put Davison in there.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Let's see here. Getting down to 13,000 and they are the census blocks and should we move to the block level now.

>> CHAIR EID: Go to block and complete the neighborhoods and complete the numbers, we are not too far off.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: And there is a piece down in the southern District. This part right in here you have got either and we want to take that out or do you want to start. I don't know how many times it's going to do that I will make that three just for this.

>> CHAIR EID: That will work.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Structural and do it once.

>> CHAIR EID: How many folks, can you check the population and river and Jefferson Chalmers and see where that puts us at.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: So river bend is 2400. Chalmers and river bend are 8,000.

>> CHAIR EID: All right and this needs about that much.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 11,000.

>> CHAIR EID: All right I don't really like it but in the spirit of getting something done that we can then home in on later let's put that in 8.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay.

So that is in 8. Do you want to put Connor creek industrial?

>> CHAIR EID: That is okay for now. We are out of time anyway unfortunately.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You are at 1%.

>> CHAIR EID: Yeah, I know but I don't like that, but we can conclude for now and finish it back up when we start on Thursday and move on to the next Commissioner. Just have some different options out there, folks. Well that concludes mapping for today. We do have just a couple more things on the agenda. I know we have a hard stop at Noon. So let's move on to adopting the minutes. I will now entertain a motion to adopt the minutes for April 23rd, the April 24th a.m. and p.m. sessions as well as the April 25th a.m. and p.m. sessions. Commissioner Andrade?

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Can I make one change to the April 23rd or do we have to go through it.

>> CHAIR EID: Yes.

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Just a minor change. It says I was calling in from falls church Virgin Islands. I would like to make sure they know I was in Virginia not the Virgin Islands.

>> CHAIR EID: That is quite the difference. We will make note of that.

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: I wish, you know.

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Was that only on that set of minutes.

>> ELAINE ANDRADE: Yes, just that set. Let's make note of that Department of State. Any other edits? Is there a motion to adopt all of the minutes as amended? Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I move to adopt the minute as amended.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Second.

>> CHAIR EID: All of them.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: All of them.

>> CHAIR EID: There is a motion by Commissioner Orton and please correct me if I get this wrong to adopt the minutes as amended for April 23rd, 24th a.m. and p.m., 25th a.m. and p.m. And that was seconded by Commissioner Vallette. So is there any more discussion? Okay hearing none, we will go ahead and vote. All those in favor to adopt the minutes please raise your hand and say aye.

>> Aye.

>> CHAIR EID: Is there any opposed? The ayes have it and the minutes are adopted.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Nay.

>> CHAIR EID: We have one nay, and the ayes still have it, and the minutes are adopted. Are there any announcements today? I will just note that our next meeting is on Thursday at 10:00 a.m. We will be meeting from 10:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m. so it's a

little bit of a longer meeting. Please check the meeting notice to sign up for public comment. And also please join the Commission for our first round of in-person public hearings. We will be meeting on Tuesday, May 7th, in Macomb County at the Warren community center. 5460-Arden Avenue. We will be meeting on Wednesday, May 8th in Oakland County at the Pearls Event Center, 26100 northwestern highway and on Thursday, May 9th we will be meeting at Wayne state University in the student center. In Wayne County. I see some hands, Commissioner Kellom?

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Yes, I just wanted this to be on record because I know that I should.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Nay.

>> VICE CHAIR KELLOM: Is that, okay, I share my absences with you, Commissioner Eid, Commissioner Orton kind of checked in on me and I also share my absences with my brain just stopped. Our Executive Director. So I had two funerals and I had two deaths in my extended family and a huge work project that took me out of three days. I know we are in the beginning of mapping process, but I don't want to be limiting my personal business when it comes to that as to why I wasn't there. So just so we are clear in case there were any questions, or anyone cared.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, Commissioner Kellom. Commissioner Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Um, I was muted, okay we had a few people who were chatting in the YouTube chat who had signed up for public comment Chris Andrews Robert Dindoffer and one person who said they did not have the proper link to the meeting and missed public comment. I wonder and this is something we can address with a motion next meeting make sure they get the time like their time doubled next meeting if they show up again because they were all on YouTube chat saying they could not sign in because they were sent the meeting date for May 2nd and therefore could not make their public comment.

>> CHAIR EID: Yes, I think that is a fine idea. We will trouble shoot and make sure that get the correct link so they can comment in the future, and we can look at their time on Thursday. Thank you. Are there any more announcements? Commissioner Lange?

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: I just want people to be aware if you're sending messages in Zoom they are not always private. So I would really refrain from doing that. I believe our attorney has made that statement himself so I just want to restate that if there are comments that need to be made it should be made in Zoom. Thank you.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you. Okay, well, that concludes the agenda items for today's meeting and the business of the Commission is complete. I will now entertain a motion to adjourn.

>> MARCUS MULDOON: So moved.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Second.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> CHAIR EID: We have a motion to adjourn by Commissioner Muldoon and a second by Commissioner Orton. Is there any discussion on the motion? Hearing none we will move to vote, all those in favor to adjourn please raise your hand and say aye.

>> Aye.

>> CHAIR EID: Any opposed? The ayes have it, we are adjourned at 11:55 a.m. See you folks on Thursday.