

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

MICRC

20240606-1000 Meeting

Captioned by Q&A Reporting, Inc., [www.qacaptions.com](http://www.qacaptions.com)

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Good morning everyone we are still waiting for a few more Commissioners to join I believe before we get started and I don't see Executive Director Woods quite yet so we will give them a few more minutes before we take this live.

>> CHAIR EID: Sounds good. Thank you.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Chair I want to acknowledge we don't need a quorum today because this is just a virtual town hall and doing no business. Would you like me to wait on Executive Director Woods until we take this live?

>> CHAIR EID: Let's wait until a few more people are here.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Okay, if you want to just let me know when you think we are good, that would be appreciated.

>> CHAIR EID: All right sounds good, thank you.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Okay Chair I do see Executive Director Woods now, am I good to take us live? You're muted if you are speaking.

>> CHAIR EID: How many Commissioners do we have right now? 123456, 7, 8, 9. I'm seeing nine.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Again we don't need a quorum given this is a virtual town hall.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay let's start up.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: I'm going to start the webinar, anything you can or anything you say or do can be seen or heard by the world at this point and I will let you know when we are good to go.

>> CHAIR EID: Good morning everyone. As Chair of the Commission I would like to welcome you to the Michigan independent citizens virtual town hall meeting at 10:03 a.m. This Zoom webinar is live streamed on YouTube on the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission YouTube channel.

For anyone in the public watching who would prefer to watch via a different platform than they are currently using, please visit our social media at Redistricting MI.

Our live stream today includes closed captioning. Closed captioning, ASL interpretation, and Spanish and Arabic and Bengali translation services will be provided for effective participation in this meeting. Please E-mail us at [Redistricting@michigan.gov](mailto:Redistricting@michigan.gov) for additional viewing options or details for accessing language translation services for this meeting.

People with disabilities or needing other specific accommodations should also contact Redistricting at [Michigan.gov](http://Michigan.gov).

This meeting is also being recorded and will be available On our website at [www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC) for viewing at a later date.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

This meeting also is being transcribed and those closed-captioned transcriptions will be made available and posted on the [Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://Michigan.gov/MICRC) website along with written public comment submissions.

There is also a public comment portal that may be accessed by visiting the website which is [www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC).

Members of the media who may have questions before, during or after the meeting should direct those questions to Edward Woods III, Executive Director of the Commission at [WoodsE3@Michigan.gov](mailto:WoodsE3@Michigan.gov).

For the purpose of this morning's town hall meeting I will turn it over to Executive Director Woods.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Good morning everyone. I hope everyone is feeling energetic and enthusiastic for the opportunity to participate in democracy. I just want you to be aware this is an opportunity for you, specifically for you, to get the questions you need answered and understanding the 12 maps being considered by the Commission. Once again, once again this is an opportunity for you to get any questions you have addressed with regards to the 12 maps being considered by the Commission. Many of you know next week we do have a public hearing where we want to hear from Metro Detroiters which map best represents them. You can identify which map that is or if you want to make some tweaks you can bring that to the Commission next week. This is an opportunity today to learn more about the maps so that you can make an informed decision. I want to remind you, you have 90 seconds, 90 seconds to address the Commission with regards to the maps. We are here. We created this opportunity so that we could hear from you as well as others so if there is family, friends, other people in your neighborhood, coworkers please invite them to join us and participate in this virtual town hall so that they too can get the answers to their questions. Once again this is to ensure through this educational process that everyone that would like to take advantage of the opportunity can understand each and every one of these maps, get their questions answered so that the Commission can make an informed decision by the deadline. Once again we want to thank you for coming. We want to thank you for your participation in democracy and once again want to reiterate we welcome your comments. Thank you so much.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, Mr. Woods. We will now move on to the overview of the draft proposed maps. The Commission has forwarded 12 maps for public consideration. These include six collaborative maps and six maps submitted by individual Commissioners. The six collaborative maps are dubbed with bird names. We have Cardinal. Crane. Dove, Finch, Herron and Starling and the individual maps come to us from submissions from Commissioners Juanita Curry, Brittini Kellom, Rhonda Lange, Cynthia Orton, Rebecca Szetela and Erin Wagner. We have requests from Commissioners to present these maps at different times to accommodate schedules. Is there anyone who would like to go first? Commissioner Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: I can go first, and I would actually like to start with Commissioner Lange's map.

>> CHAIR EID: Sure.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: We have Mr. Morgan with us from EDS today. Welcome, Mr. Morgan we can pull up Commissioner Lange's individual map.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay.

Sorry just taking a moment here.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: That's okay.

Okay, this is Commissioner Lange's map. It's 400 on the portal. And I have the map set up here.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Okay thank you. So I am sort of repeating from Commissioner Lange's presentation that she did twice during last hearing. So this map includes the four VRA districts which are 1, 3, 6 and 7. That was based on the analysis of our Council as to how many VRA districts there are on this map. She stated she did not use any other maps as a resource other than the Linden. It's entirely her own work and creation. It satisfies the partisan fairness analysis features. It's basically similar to all the other maps we have. They are all kind of in the same range. She did make a slight change to one from a prior version to make District 1VRA compliant and added Melvindale to District 2. She said that she kept District 9 the same. That's up in the kind of north suburbs Oakland, Macomb area there we go and kept District 9 the same as the original Linden. District 7 she changed to incorporate the Jewish community of interest and to make a VRA performing District. Livonia has been made whole in District 13. And she did say that this started from the framework of a collaborative map like indicated she used the Linden and some of the early drawings we had done together with this round of drawing. She used roads as guidelines. And used neighborhoods as guidelines in terms of where she was drawing those District boundaries. She said there are three Detroit primary districts. She has very little overlap into neighboring communities outside of Detroit. And her District 3 keeps Highland park and Bangla Town together. And then she said it was drawn blind to race, politics, no one submitted maps to her that she has copied or derived from so there could be no conflicts with anyone who is running for office either as a current candidate or incumbent. I think that is pretty much it for Rhonda's map. If you want to pull up partisan fairness I think it would be helpful to look at that.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay.

So the top lopsided margin 5.0 for republican. 3.3 on the mean median difference for republican. 1.9 on efficiency gap for republican. And on the seats vote ratio it's 21-17 in favor of democrats, 2.4 proportional bias towards the democrats.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: All right thank you. Unless there is any questions, I think we can move on to my individual map.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay.

Okay Commissioner Szetela this is your map 404 on the portal.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Okay, so for this map I tried to use Commissioner Curry's Detroit centric districts 1, 3 and 8 as the base. I did make some adjustments to those districts based upon communities of interest. This map does have four VRA compliant districts according to our Council, Mr. Braden, so that would be 1, 3, 8 and 7. 7 combines Pontiac and Southfield together and that is a configuration we had in the original Linden and received public comments asking that Pontiac Southfield District be kept intact for the most part and what I tried to do here. Has equal population. In terms of the communities of interest that I tried to focus on is this really was a community of interest focused map. So in District 1 we have that Latin X community of interest that had been identified that includes Lynn ton Ecorse River Rouge and portions of Detroit C2453 on our portal comment. In terms of District 3 I tried to keep it together that Bengali community of interest as much as possible. That was comments number C6211P1206. And P4107 so I tried to maintain that community. We also have Ferndale in with Detroit, that was very intentional and will see that in a number of maps with Ferndale and Palmer Park and Detroit designed to preserve a LBGTQ community of interest we had received and honored in the Linden map. That comment number was F3493 so that is why that portion of District 3 goes into north of 8 Mile.

District 1 includes the whole Dexter Linwood neighborhood. We were asked not to split that. District 8 includes Rosedale Park, Minnock park Grandmont together that was comment W9474 we were asked to keep those together and not split that community along Southfield. District 3 also includes Morningside, East English Village, Cornerstone together in a single District that was a comment we had received repeatedly which is C86 I'm sorry C826. Those individual neighborhoods wanted to be put together in a District and they are together in District 3. Harper Woods is put with Grosse Pointe. We had received a lot of comments about that in earlier mapping and so that District 12 is kept largely the same and that preserves that community of interest which is W9906. Lastly if we go over to District 7, if you notice that takes part of Oak Park and pulls it into the District that is designed to preserve that orthodox community in Oak Park and a little bit of Southfield. That was comment C1803. So I was trying to keep that community together as well. And then if we go down to District 2, we have the Mena Middle Eastern north African community of interest that is map C1510 that we were asked to keep together keeping Dearborn and Dearborn Heights together along with Melvindale and a portion of Detroit along Warren Dale avenue, that is the neighborhood and Warren is the avenue so precincts along there that have a high percentage of the Arab American population are included in District 2 as well to create that Mena District we had been asked to create. Lastly if we look at District six there is a Native American community of interest submitted by Meredith Kennedy that is P5527 we were asked to keep together, that is intact in this community. In general I tried to for District 4 to keep that mostly a Down River community and kind of the suburbs that are

more similar and more rural, so Romulus, Van Buren, Belleville, Sumpter and Huron are altogether along with the Down River communities to the east there. If you look at District 6, it keeps together Livonia as a whole District, does not combine it with western Detroit. Along with it does combine it with Wayne Westland, Garden City and Inkster. And then there is a rising horizontal or a rising district for Canton, Plymouth Northville and Novi, keeping those together along with Wixom. And then we can kind of Zoom over a little bit to District 10. So District 11 was redesigned because that was one of our struck down districts so I brought it more into Sterling Heights, that was that configuration was based on comments we received about the Chaldean community of interest and combining that with Fraser and Roseville so that is what I tried to accommodate here and also tried to make a more cohesive District than what we had before where it was kind of stretched out. And District 9 keeps the Chaldean community of interest as well as the seek community of interest at Troy and Rochester Hills together as well. And I think that's pretty much it. If we can pull up the partisan fairness, that would be helpful.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay.

The lopsided margin 4.0 for republicans. The mean median difference is 1.0 for republican. Efficiency gap is 0.8 for democrats. Seats vote ratio is 22 democrat to 16 republican with 5.0 bias towards democrats.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: All right and then the last thing I would add is just the Michigan advanced recently rated this map as being one of three that are fairer than the Linden in terms of partisan fairness. I don't necessarily wouldn't say I disagree, but they have a slightly different methodology they are using to look at maps than what we used in terms of analysis and access to different measures than we do. I'm not 100% sure that I fully agree with their analysis. But they did rate it as being fairer than the Linden which I think is important because we were challenged on the Linden for partisan fairness so just another factor there. And that's it unless there is questions.

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I don't understand that last comment. We were challenged on the Linden for partisan fairness. Can you explain what you mean?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: We had a lawsuit by the League of Women Voters over the partisan fairness on this map and the Hickory.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: So just somebody didn't like it, not successful lawsuit.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Right, no, but there was a lawsuit filed.

>> CHAIR EID: Commissioner Callaghan?

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: Commissioner Szetela, you said that this map was one of three rated by this Michigan advanced group. What were the other two?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Huron and the Kellom.

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: Okay, thank you.



>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: I will just add on that I mean one of -- I don't want to say it's an issue but it's a difference is that their composite index is based on equal weighting of elections going back to 2014. Our composite index is actually weighted so more recent elections have a higher ranking on how things are done. So I kind of don't feel it's really an apples-to-apples comparison necessarily. And they also have access to another analysis tool called the percent majoritarian outcomes and we didn't have access to, and I don't know if we can evaluate any of our maps on that. So, yes, it's a data point, it's interesting I think. But it's kind of hard to compare maps when we are using a different database to calculate our numbers.

>> CHAIR EID: Yeah, you know I would agree with that. We certainly welcome everybody who wants to make their own independent analysis to make them. But I would suggest we stick to our own data that this Commission has created using the metrics that are partisan fairness experts have come up with just, you know, to keep things consistent. That analysis does differ a little bit with what we have come up with as a Commission where we have that weighted. We have the weighted measures and also more election years I believe than what I think it was PTV was able to use. But I think Commissioner Szetela, you stated the partisan fairness numbers for this specific map. 4.0 for the lopsided margins test. 1.0 for mean median difference. 0.8 for efficiency gap. Commissioner Szetela?

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Yes, I stated the analysis based on our data. And I also just received a note from Commissioner Wagner, she is asking that I present her map as well. She is unavailable.

>> CHAIR EID: Sure.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay, I will bring that up. This is Commissioner Wagner's map. It's 401 on the portal.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Unfortunately I was not prepared to present her map so I don't have as nice notes from Rhonda but I'm going to do the best I can. So again Commissioner Wagner was trying to create three Detroit centric districts. She I'm going to look at her VRA numbers quickly here because I believe I don't want to speak wrong so let me just open up this map real quick. So, yeah, she does have four VRA districts according to our expert Mr. Braden and includes 1, 3, 7 and 8. Similar to my map she kept that configuration of Southfield with Pontiac which was requested. District 9 is largely the same. For District 11, if you recall our prior map had Roseville East Point and just a little bit of Detroit hold up into 11, this instead puts the Macomb Township, the eastern portion of Sterling Heights, Clinton and Fraser together in a single District. It leaves District 12 intact from the Linden then District 10 places together the whole of Warren and keeps Warren whole, Roseville, Madison Heights and role Oak as well. And I believe, yes, and then District three includes East Point with Detroit. I believe that is actually one of our few maps that have that configuration, not 100 percent positive and District 7 includes portions of Detroit with Ferndale again to preserve that LBGQTQ

community along with Oak Park Huntington Woods Berkeley and Hazel Park. District 2 preserves the Mena community and also includes a portion of Detroit along with Melvindale. District 5 keeps Romulus whole but places it with Wayne Westland Inkster and Canton along with portion of Taylor. Van Buren, Belleville and Sumpter and Huron are together in this map and they had asked to be together along with the remainder of Down River. And then if we could Plymouth, Novi, Northville together along with the kind of Orchard Lake, west Bloomfield area as well. And then like I said it has the four partisan fairness districts, it's good on equal population. She tried to respect communities of interest as much as possible then I believe the partisan fairness is in line with the rest of our maps so if we can open up the partisan fairness I would appreciate that.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay.

Okay so the top line numbers on the lopsided margins is 5.2 for republican. The mean median is 3.4 for republican. The efficiency gap is 1.9 for republican. The seats vote ratio is 21 democrat 17 republican with the 2.4 bias towards democrats.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: It's in line with the remainder of our maps as well. So hopefully I did honor to Erin's intentions with this map. Like I said I had to kind of wing that so hopefully I summarized everything she wanted summarized.

>> MR. MORGAN: I helped her work on this map so I would say you covered most of what she intended, yes.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Okay, thank you.

>> MR. MORGAN: Yep.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you Commissioner Szetela. We have done three of the individual maps so far so why don't we go ahead and do the other three then move on to the collaborative. Let's see. That means we have Commissioner Orton's map, Commissioner Kellom's map and Commissioner Curry's map. Would Commissioner Orton, would you like to go next?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I can. I thought I saw Commissioner Curry's hand up earlier. So I'm okay going after her if she would like.

>> CHAIR EID: Sure, Commissioner Curry, would you like to present your map?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Yes, I might as well. Thank you Commissioner Orton. I kind of thought that Chair saw my hand.

>> CHAIR EID: I'm sorry, I didn't see it but please go ahead.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: That is quite all right. I'm a little more short-winded Rebecca is so accurate in all of this. And when it got to my map I had a Mr. Morgan worked with me and I had a few hours to get my computer working correctly and I made it and so I had to say a little prayer first to get myself together and get this map together and I concentrated, my concentration was mostly on the order, the criteria order. I wanted to make sure that equal population and VRA and everything was together. I wanted to keep the districts contiguous. And so to the best of my knowledge being a

resident of Detroit for many years, I did it according to what I thought would be the more corrected way. So I thank John for working with me in such a short notice. And I think it came out pretty good. I did not take race or politics into consideration at all. I made a statement a long time ago how can we do this without bringing up race. But obviously there was a way and I just kind of worked, in fact, he is the one who taught me when I first started and kept comfortable working with him and appreciate the help he gave me as far as helping to work on it. So my concentration of what the courts throughout told us to work on 1, 3, 6, 8, 10, 11 and spent my time trying to make those contiguous in the priority order. So, John, if you can just read the VRA or tell us how we came out on it?

>> MR. MORGAN: Sure. So there are three districts that satisfy both tests of the VRA, District 1, 3 and 6. But District 8 is very close and let me show you the data on that. I will bring up one map on the VRA first and then I will show the statistics that go with that.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay, just a second. All right I know what my problem is. I need to go, there, okay, so these maps show the VRA data in a map form. And so what this shows is District 1, 3 and 6 have both democrat primaries in 2018 and 2022 where the Black democrats outnumber the white democrats. And the numbers have to do with the primary composition. So what I will point out is you see the three here, 1, 3 and 6, and then District 8 I will go to the data. So 6, 1 and 3 are shaded green on the map because the Black primary turn out here in this yellow column out numbers the white democrat primary turnout in both elections of 2018 and 2022. And then this other District 8 as drawn, and I will reference it on the map here, so this District 8, which is Southfield, Oak Park, Huntington Woods, part of Farmington and part of Livonia, that shows up as 50% Black turn out version 46% white turn out in 2018 and 47.7 Black turnout and 47.7 white turn out in 2022 so it doesn't have the checkmark but it's really right there in terms of that analysis. Okay Commissioner Curry?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Sounds great to me. We did read the VRA. Did we read that, the partisan fairness?

>> MR. MORGAN: Partisan fairness, sure, so again the three VRA districts, potential fourth right here in District 8 and the partisan fairness. It will load here in just a moment. So the top line numbers for partisan fairness on the lopsided margins test is 5.1 for republican. The mean median is 3.3 for republican. The efficiency gap is 1.9 for republican and the seats vote ratio is 21 democrat, 17 republican, 2.4 bias towards democrats.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay, thank you, John.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay and I'm through with mine, Chair.



>> CHAIR EID: Thank you Commissioner Curry. Any questions for Commissioner Curry? Okay, thank you, Commissioner.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: You're welcome. Okay so we have Commissioner Kellom's and Commissioner Orton. Would you like to go next Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Sure.

>> CHAIR EID: Wonderful.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Okay.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay, I will bring that up.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: While he is bringing this up I can say I started with the Crane map, which was based on Commissioner Curry's map. And so there were just a couple changes I wanted to try making on the Crane map and didn't have time to do it in public, so I just made those changes. So it will be similar to that. So didn't look at race. Didn't look at partisan numbers. Didn't look at anything like that. Or incumbents or anything. Everything is geographically contiguous. And so I can explain it a little bit. In District 1 I kept River Rouge, Ecorse, Lincoln Park and Corktown and Mexicantown the Hispanic COI together. Then it goes up into neighborhoods of -- can you Zoom in? I think Midwest is in there. And up to Bethune I think. I'm not familiar with the names so much. But so then in District 2 it has the Middle Eastern, North African community of interest, including Dearborn, Dearborn Heights, Melvindale, Allen Park, all of Warren Avenue and most of Warren Dale. And District three is Detroit District, Highland Park and Hamtramck including Bangla Town. East Detroit. I kept the neighborhoods of Cornerstone Village, East English Village and Morningside together and it includes the Gold Coast. So District 4, it keeps the community of interest of Bellevue, Van Buren and Sumpter townships along with Huron and keeps Romulus whole with the area south of it, which was requested by public comment. And it keeps many Down River communities together. And District 5 is Canton with Plymouth. And Westland. And it also includes Garden City and Inkster. And District 6, is West Detroit with Redford and includes Brightmoor, Bagley and other neighborhoods. And District 7, this one was kept mostly like it was originally since it didn't have to be changed. Southfield with Pontiac. We had lots of public comment for that. District 8 keeps Livonia whole.

>> MR. MORGAN: Sorry, District 8 or 13?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Oh, yeah, it switched on this one. Right. Okay, District 13 keeps Livonia whole with Farmington with Farmington Hills whole. And Northville with some of that. And District 9 is mostly like it was. And that keeps the Chaldean community of interest with Troy, Sterling Heights, the west part, Rochester, Rochester Hills. And we received many comments about preserving that area. District 10, so District 10 and 11 originally were the long skinny districts and so I took, I switched them so 10 is the bottom half of that and 11 is the top part of that. So in 10 there is East Point and Roseville. With Fraser and the east part of Sterling Heights and Warren. And District 11 is, you know, the top part of what used to be that. So that

includes so Macomb and Shelby most of Shelby Township and part of Clinton Township. I would say is that most of it or? I can't.

>> MR. MORGAN: Most of it. Yes, I think so.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: And District 12 preserves the Lake St. Clair, lakeshore community of interest. And District 13, we did 13. So yep. I think that is oh, District 8 I guess I didn't describe District 8. So that keeps Royal Oak, Berkeley Huntington Woods, Pleasant Ridge, Oak Park, Royal Oak and Ferndale and Hazel Park with the Madison Heights and the west part of Warren along with Centerline. So that's the areas I was trying to keep together. And then it follows the rest of the ranked order criteria. Doesn't favor or disfavor. I did try to keep or take into consideration county, City and Township boundaries but only if it could be done with the population we need. And considering communities of interest. Because that comes first.

So I think that's all. Oh, do you want to show the partisan fairness?

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: It has four VRA districts.

>> MR. MORGAN: The VRA districts are 1, 3, 6 and 7.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Thank you.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay is partisan fairness the top line numbers lopsided margin is 5.1 for republican. The mean median difference is 3.4 for republican. Efficiency gap is 1.9 for republican. And the seats vote ratio is 21 democrat to 17 republican with 2.4 bias towards democrats.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Thank you. I think that's all I have. Unless there is any questions.

>> CHAIR EID: Do you want to just talk about the differences between this and the Crane? I know they are similar but there are a few differences in certain places.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Yeah, we would have to do an overlay because I've looked at both of them so much I get confused about which is which.

>> MR. MORGAN: You want me to put the overlay of Crane on this?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Do you want to see that Anthony?

>> CHAIR EID: I think it would be helpful. They are both very similar so helping differentiate them.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: One difference is up by Commissioner Vallette's area, Highland is with White Lake perhaps instead of with Milford. But I can't remember for sure.

>> MR. MORGAN: One moment, here.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I know there is no change in the Detroit area. The Detroit districts. So.

>> MR. MORGAN: The dark blue line is the Crane map. So you can see that these are the same districts in the Detroit area, which were based on Commissioner Curry's Detroit districts.

In fact, they are exactly, I believe, Commissioner Curry's Detroit districts 1, 3, 6. And then 2 is the same as Crane in the personal map. There are some differences here in District 5 and 13. And some differences in 23 and 24. District 9 in the Crane map has a little bit more of Shelby. And none of Oakland Township whereas in the personal map it has more of Oakland, less of Shelby. It's a little different in the Warren area.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Does anyone want to see anything, any areas specifically or?

>> CHAIR EID: I think that is good.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Okay, thank you.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Thank you, Mr. Morgan.

>> MR. MORGAN: Yep.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay, the last individual map is the one submitted by Commissioner Kellom. I will speak on that one since she is not here with us today.

>> MR. MORGAN: That is map 403 on the portal. Sorry I went to fast on that to reload it. Okay Commissioner Eid?

>> CHAIR EID: Okay.

So we are looking at now is Commissioner Kellom's individual submission. It was -- it's the same thing as the Phoenix collaborative map, which was based on hummingbird, flamingo and a little bit of Herron but did not have the votes to be a collaborative so Commissioner Kellom opted to submit it individually. It has four VRA districts. Those districts being 1, 8, 6, and 3. And it changes 14 districts from when compared to Linden. Now, if we talk about how the districts are configured, it's one of the ones that kind of have this stacked configuration with District 1 with many Down River from Allen Park up through Ecorse and River Rouge and then goes up through the river front of Detroit, through bell isle and going a little bit into the east side including East English Village, Morningside, and the Denby area. And right on top of that is District 8, which is a Detroit centered District. That comprises the more northern corridor of north and northeast Detroit including Highland Park and Hamtramck. Keeping those two communities together like we heard at the hearing we had in Southfield. Going to District 6, it is a District that has Livonia being whole and taking it eastward to include Redford as well as some of the west side of Detroit neighborhoods. And then District 3 is right above that. Has Farmington and Farmington Hills being whole. And moving eastward into Southfield, Oak Park and Royal Oak Township. That covers the VRA districts. For the rest of the districts you have District 2 that has Dearborn, Dearborn Heights, Melvindale and a little bit of Warren Dale. But instead of including some of the Down River communities like Allen Park and Lincoln Park with District 2 it instead goes westward to include Garden City and Inkster. The District we already talked about the District 3. The District 4, 4 and 5 here have a little different configuration than some of the other maps. In five, we wanted to create that C-shape in order to not split up

Romulus. So instead Romulus is whole with Taylor comprising of and the rest of the Down River communities from Wyandotte down through gross aisle to Maple beach. Whereas District 5 takes the C-shape including Westland, Canton, Van Buren Township, Sumpter and Huron charter Township. If we go to District 7, this is a little bit of a different configuration from what was in Linden. Instead of having a Pontiac to Southfield District it now includes Waterford so it's Waterford and Pontiac to Birmingham and Beverly hills. The District 9 is similar to the original Linden configuration. I believe it just doesn't go quite as north. But the whole of the District, being Rochester, Rochester Hills, Troy and Sterling Heights being split at Vandyke including that Chaldean community of interest on the west side of Sterling Heights. District 10 then includes some of the Oakland County neighborhoods like Berkeley, Huntington Woods and Royal Oak. That share a school District. They are together in here. Along with Ferndale, Hazel Park and then going east into most of Warren being whole along with Centerline. There is a little piece of Warren that is not included in 10, that is instead included in 11 and then the rest of 11 includes East Point, the remainder of Sterling Heights that isn't in 9 as well as Clinton Township. District 12 is a similar District to what was in the original Linden District 12 comprised of that lakeshore community of interest. I think the only difference is that it includes these two neighborhoods of Jefferson Chalmers in with the Grosse Pointes. And if we go a little further north to account for those changes in District 9 and District 7, districts 23 and 24 changed slightly. But we still tried to, you know, have them be Township based here. I don't think there are many townships split between 23 and 24. And it's a little bit of a more even split similar to what is in Crane.

So we talked about the VRA districts. Talked about the communities for the partisan fairness values. And this is a lopsided margins test of positive 3.8 towards the republicans. A mean median difference of 1.5% towards the republicans. And efficiency gap of 0.8 towards the republicans. Can we double check that efficiency gap?

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay so lopsided margin 3.8 republican. Mean median 1.5 republican. Efficiency gap is 0.8 towards the democrats.

>> CHAIR EID: Got you, okay.

And the mean median difference I mean I'm sorry the seats to votes ratio of 5.0 towards the democrats. I think that about covers it for this one. Okay that finishes the six individual maps. Let's move to the maps that the Commission worked on collaboratively. We will take those in alphabetical order. The first being Cardinal. Commissioner Weiss, I believe you wanted to speak about this one a bit?

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Yes, I will do it along with your wonderful help and its explanation. John, could you bring up the Cardinal, please?

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay, it will just be a moment. Let me take off the reference. Maybe, just a second. There we go.

>> CHAIR EID: Excuse me.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: All right, thank you. This is the first collaborative map we called Cardinal. I find it kind of an interesting map because we took the Linden Senate map and deleted the districts 1, 3, 6, 8, 10 and 11. Yeah, that's right. And then what we did is filled those districts in, Senate districts using from the Motown Sound, the rep districts and subbed those in place of that, which created the new Senate districts more or less incorporating all of the House representative districts. Mr. Eid, would you like to explain that a little better for them?

>> CHAIR EID: Yeah, I think you had it right. For the suburbs here were the same as what we had been doing collaboratively. But we wanted a different configuration for Detroit. So for the Detroit area districts, we tried to encompass the...we put on overlay of the Motown Sound map. That was the Commission adopted and then was approved by the courts and tried to approximate about three of them into a Senate District. Now, we couldn't get it perfectly lined up but I think we did a pretty good job in approximating what those districts were in this map. For example, the District 1 in this Senate map is an approximation of the House Districts 1, 9 and 7 in the House map. The Senate District 2 that we are seeing here is an approximation of the House Districts 2, 3 and 15. And the Senate District 3 is an approximation of the House Districts 4, 5 and 8. And we took it from there. It has four VRA districts. One, 3, 7 and 8. Can you guys hear me? Hello? Okay, I think I lost connection for a brief moment. We are good though.

Yes, so four VRA districts. One, 3, 7 and 8 and you know since it encompasses the districts from the House map, I think it has about the same COIs as the House map. If you go up to the suburbs, you have a District, we will just start westward. We will have a you have a District 13 that has West Bloomfield and greater lakes area with Farmington and Farmington Hills being whole. And combined with a little bit of Commerce, Walled Lake and Novi. You can see Northville is whole here. Crossing the county boundary because that is what that City does, being in with District 6, which is comprised of Northville, Livonia and going eastward into Redford and Detroit. The District 7 incorporates some of those Oakland County neighborhoods we just talked about on the last map like Berkeley Huntington Woods and Royal Oak being together. Instead of eastward it's westward with Southfield and dipping down into Detroit. The District 10 here is a little bit different. This is one of the maps that elects not to split up Sterling Heights and has it being whole with Troy. And then right south of 75 into Madison Heights. Nine I think was one of the first districts that was collaboratively drawn when we deleted the old District 7. And instead of having it be from Pontiac to Southfield it goes from Pontiac to Rochester Hills and south to Bloomfield hills and Birmingham. And then District 12 is unchanged from the Linden District 12 incorporating that lakeshore community of interest from you know the areas of the Detroit river through Lake St. Clair and anchor Bay. And then District 11 is the area



that's left in between districts 10, 12 and 8. Including some of the Macomb County townships of Warren, Fraser, Clinton Township, and this one does not include East Point. And it does not cross into 8 Mile. As far as the partisan fairness numbers for this map goes, it has seats to votes ratio of 5.0 towards.

>> MR. MORGAN: Hang on, let me pull up the correct one. There. Okay, so, yeah, 373 so the lopsided margin is 3.6 for republican. The mean median difference is 2.6 for republican. The efficiency gap is 0.8 towards democrats. And the seats vote ratio is 22 to 16 with 5.0 towards democrats.

>> CHAIR EID: Wonderful. So certainly in line with all the other maps. I actually think this is in line with the three that the Michigan advance Article had identified as well. Efficiency gap is the same. The mean median difference is a little higher than that group, but the lopsided margin score seems to be a little lower. But they are all in the same range in my opinion. And this map changes 12 districts when compared to Linden. Okay, I think that does it for this one. Let's bring up Crane. And Commissioner Orton, would you like to speak about this one?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Well, I can.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Go ahead.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I thought Commissioner Vallette was going to.

>> CHAIR EID: I don't have the whole list up from last week. Commissioner Vallette, let's hear it from you, please.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Okay, I would like to go over this in the ranked criteria that we were required, when we draw the maps. And the first is equal population. And the Voting Rights Act. Districts are within the population deviation. And race was not looked at when we draw this map. The VRA analysis was performed after the map was drawn. And there are four VRA districts. It's geographically contiguous. We did a dis-contiguity check and there were none. We went through the COIs. And in District 1 the Down River communities of River Rouge, Ecorse, Lincoln Park were together along with the Hispanic COIs including Corktown and Michigan town. Neighborhoods of Midwest up to Bethune and over to Dexter Linden were kept together. District 2, the COIs including Dearborn, Dearborn Heights, Melvindale, Allen Park and all of Warren Avenue and most of Warren Dale were kept together. District 3 Highland Park and Hamtramck including Bangla Town, east Detroit, Cornerstone Village, East English Village and Morningside. Includes the Gold Coast. District 4 keeps the COIs of Bellevue, Van Buren and Sumpter Township along with Huron. It keeps Romulus whole and the areas south of it which was requested by public comment. And it keeps many of the Down River communities together. District 5 Canton with Plymouth and Westland. Also includes Garden City and Inkster. District 6, West Detroit with Redford. It includes Brightmoor, Bagley and far West Detroit. District 7, keeps Southfield with Pontiac and that was a public comment for that COI. District 8 keeps Livonia whole. Keeps Farmington with Farmington Hills together. Northville and

some of Novi. District 9 keeps Chaldean COI together with Troy. West side of Sterling Heights, Rochester and Rochester Hills together. District 10 keeps Oak Park, Huntington Woods, Pleasant Ridge, Ferndale and Hazel Park together. District 11 keeps East Point with Roseville, Fraser and the rest of Sterling Heights. District 12 preserves the Lake St. Clair lakeshore community of interest. District 13 Milford with Commerce and White Lake. And District 13 keeps Highland and White Lake townships together. District 24 keeps most of Clinton Township and Shelby Township with Macomb Township. And that was originally in the north part of the District. There were no disproportionate advantage to any political party. We did not discuss this. Partisan fairness numbers were ran and they were within the requirements. We didn't take any incumbents or candidates into account while drawing this map so no favor or disfavor to an incumbent elected official or candidate.

We reflect the consideration of City, county and Township boundaries. Where possible we considered county, City, and Township boundaries if they didn't collect I'm sorry if they didn't conflict with population or community of interest consideration. And we did run a compactness score, and they were all reasonably compact. And that's it. If anybody has any questions.

>> CHAIR EID: I think you are good; did you say the numbers of the VRA districts?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: I did not and there are four.

>> CHAIR EID: 1, 3, 6 and 7.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you.

>> CHAIR EID: You're welcome. Thank you for presenting this map. Okay, next up is Dove.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay.

>> CHAIR EID: So what we are looking at now is the Dove collaborative map. This map once again has four VRA districts. And this map it's districts 1, 3, 7 and 10. The whole map changes 12 districts when compared to Linden. Let's talk a little bit about the VRA districts. So we have this District 1 that has a configuration that goes from the Down River communities of Ecorse and River Rouge. I lost my place, Ecorse and River Rouge up through Detroit. And it goes kind of northeast in this configuration, taking up Hamtramck and the areas around Hamtramck. But not Highland Park which is in District 3. And it goes eastward into the Morningside East English Village area.

District 3 then has Highland Park and some of the remaining portions of the northwest side of Detroit. Mostly the areas of Detroit above Dearborn.

The District 7 is similar to the original Linden configuration. It's comprised essentially of Pontiac down to Southfield including Bloomfield Hills and Southfield. I'm sorry, including Auburn Hills and Bloomfield Hills. But not Birmingham. And this one while Birmingham was in this original Linden District 7 in this map it's included in District 8 comprised of some Oakland County neighborhoods like Birmingham, Berkeley, Huntington Woods and Royal Oak. In this configuration those areas also include

Ferndale and a little bit of Detroit. Aligning with the communities of interest much like how it does in the other maps but in a little bit of a different way here.

District 10 is then the remaining VRA District. It is a Macomb County centered District having all of Warren be whole along with Centerline and East Point. And it goes south of 8 Mile into a little bit of the northeastern Detroit neighborhoods. And it also includes Harper Woods.

For districts 4 and 5 actually let's go to District 2. So District 2 has the configuration that the Middle Eastern community supports. It is Dearborn, Dearborn Heights and Melvindale along with Allen Park and Lincoln Park. This version does not have much of Warren Dale in it. Instead having Lincoln Park on the southeast side of it.

Then if we look at 4 and 5, we have a little bit of a different configuration here. Taylor is whole in four, but Romulus is split. In this configuration includes Sumpter Township with District 4 going eastward and southward to incorporate the rest of the Down River communities up until Monroe. Five then starts at Plymouth and then goes south. So Plymouth, Canton and Van Buren Township. It then takes the remainder of Romulus that isn't in four, puts it in five, and has Inkster and Wayne Township as well.

District 6 directly above District 5 then includes all of Livonia being whole along with the parts of Westland that were not with District 5 and also includes Garden City and goes eastward into Redford Township. It also takes a little bit of Farmington and Farmington Hills into District 6 as well.

We talked about 7 and 8. District 13 is a similar configuration to the original District 13. I think it doesn't go quite as far south and instead includes a little bit more of Walled Lake, but it is essentially the same District in spirit as the original 13. The District 9 is also a similar configuration to the original Linden map having that Rochester, Troy and half of Sterling Heights area. And then 11 and 12 are a little bit different here. It doesn't have the whole lakeshore, but instead the District 11 has the remainder of Sterling Heights that isn't in 9. And it goes southward into Macomb County to incorporate Fraser and St. Clair Shores and then south into the Grosse Pointes.

And then District 12 takes the remainder of that area that is directly north without messing with, you know, areas even further north of that. Taking up Mount Clemens, Clinton Township and the rest of the areas surrounding Anchor Bay.

Can we pull the partisan fairness numbers?

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay.

So the top line numbers are lopsided margin is 6.2 for republican. The mean median difference is 2.5 for republican. Efficiency gap is 4.6 for republican. The seats vote ratio is 20 democrat 18 republican with a 0.2 bias towards republican.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay, thank you. All right, we will move on to Finch V2. Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Yeah, I just have a question about this maybe you said at the beginning, and I missed it like where did that map originate? Do you know how it came about?

>> CHAIR EID: It was collaborative. I think, let me see. There were a few configurations that Commissioner Szetela made where she tried to keep 7 and 9 together. And have that, I'm sorry, I don't mean 7 and 9 together I mean approximate the old 7 and 9 configuration along with doing that change in districts 11 and 12. So I think it was -- I think that was the origination but we certainly all worked on it.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Thank you.

>> CHAIR EID:

>> MR. MORGAN: Commissioner Eid you said Finch next?

>> CHAIR EID: Yes, and I do see we have somebody that might be having trouble connecting with the Spanish interpreter. If we can make sure they get connected, that would be great. Okay so we are looking at Finch now. Commissioner Andrade, I believe you wanted to speak on this one? I thought I had seen her earlier. I must have been mistaken. Commissioner Callaghan, would you like to speak on this one a little bit?

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: Which one is this?

>> CHAIR EID: This is Finch.

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: I, let me see, okay Finch, I can start. I don't have a lot of notes, I don't have any notes prepared on Finch.

>> CHAIR EID: I will help you out. We will do it together.

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: Okay, I believe there are four VRA districts. 1, 3, 8 and 7. We have three Detroit centered districts. District 1 there goes Down River includes Wyandotte and Ecorse and then does that wrap around the Mena community we have seen in several maps. D3 is the other VRA District. This one goes from the river front all the way up to 8 Mile and actually includes some of the inner ring northern I mean suburbs of Ferndale and Hazel Park. And goes off, this includes quite a bit, I mean we have Down River wraps up to 8 Mile, goes across 8 Mile into Ferndale and Hazel Park and extends west quite a ways around the District 1. And then the other VRA District is District 8. District 8 is more of the east side of Detroit and then extending up into some of the entering suburbs as well. It goes from the river front, includes the east side communities of Cornerstone, Morningside, east Indian village up through 8 Mile includes East Point, part of Warren it looks like. Centerline. That's also a VRA District. And the last VRA District is District 7. This is including again the southern suburbs of Oakland County there, Southfield, Lathrup Village, Royal Oak, Royal Oak Township, Oak Park and extends to the northwest suburbs of Detroit. What else can we say about the map? Those are the VRA districts. District Four keeps the communities of Van Buren Belleville and Sumpter together. It does split Romulus and include Taylor and some over the Down River communities like South Gate wood haven all the way down

to Flatrock. District 5 keeps your Plymouth Canton townships together. They share a school District, so they are pretty tightly tied. It also extends east into Westland and Inkster. Above that you have sitting on top of it on District 6 I believe that is which includes Northville, Northville Township, all of Livonia is whole and includes Redford and northwest Detroit neighborhoods. Above that in District 13 I believe Farmington Hills is whole. You slide up just a little bit more looks like olive greater West Bloomfield as part of Commerce, Walled Lake and Novi. What else can we say here, Anthony?

>> CHAIR EID: Yeah, so the suburbs in this one are similar to the suburbs in a few of our other ones. I think you hit maybe one District that is a little different, District 7 already. District 9 has that configuration with Pontiac, Rochester Hills up through Birmingham. District 10 has the Sterling Heights, Troy and Madison Heights configuration. District 12 is the same as the original Linden 12 incorporating that lakeshore COI and District 11 is essentially the areas between them including Warren, Fraser, and Clinton Township, but stopping at East Point and not dipping down across 8 Mile. But I think you covered. I know I put you on the spot there, sorry.

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: Could we take a look at the partisan fairness numbers?

>> MR. MORGAN: Yeah. Okay.

So the top line margins are republican 3.7 and the lopsided margin. The mean median difference is 2.7 republican. The efficiency gap is 0.8 for democrats. The seats vote ratio is 22 democrat to 16 republican with a 5.0 bias towards democrat.

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: So those partisan fairness numbers are pretty much in the middle of the pack along with the other numbers that we have.

>> CHAIR EID: Yeah. I think they are in line with just about everything else. I think this one is similar again to the ones that the Michigan advanced identified because the efficiency gap is the same as those three being 0.8. But you know different data metrics differ. It's important we look at all of this wholistically. And then this changes 13 districts when compared to the original Linden. I think that covers it for this map. We will now move up to Herron. I think you are up again Commissioner Callaghan.

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: Okay, so in this map we really started out, it was a collaborative map and we tried to start out with a different configuration for the Detroit districts. This is a real sharp contrast to the map we just looked at where you had districts 1, 8 and, I can't remember what the other one is that came out from the river in spokes and went out into the suburbs. In this one we really tried to stack the Detroit districts a little bit. And use that as our starting point. So this map does have the four VRA districts. Those districts are 1, 8, 6, and 3. Let's start with the District 1. Instead of wrapping around Dearborn like so many of the other maps do, this one stays on the river front. It does take in some of the Down River communities, River Rouge, Ecorse, Melvindale. And then it extends up around the river front and goes pretty far east includes the east side neighborhoods that always want to be kept together. And then just for population purposes a little bit further north than our normal in District 1 usually



does in most of the other maps. District 8 sits on top of District 1. And so it is comprised of like the northern and middle layer of neighborhoods in the City of Detroit. Includes Hamtramck, Highland Park, Bangladesh neighborhood. District 6, let's see, I'm trying to get to the VRA districts is why I'm skipping around a little bit. Where is District 6? Okay so District 6 is on the western edge. It makes Livonia whole, includes Redford and then also extends into the western neighborhoods of Detroit as well. And then the last VRA District is District 3. Did we talk about 3? Okay 3 has all of Southfield and some of the neighborhoods to the east Berkeley Huntington Woods, Oak Park Royal Oak Township and it also includes Farmington and the southern half of Farmington Hills, so Farmington Hills is split in this map. Other than that let's see so that is 1, 6, 3 and 8. Let's talk about District 2. District 2 is your Mena community with Dearborn, Dearborn Heights, Garden City and Inkster is included. Again I want to point out Melvindale is not included there with this District. District 4 your Down River communities and includes Taylor and does not include Romulus and goes up a little bit higher than some other District 4s into those communities of butting against Dearborn Heights southern half of Lincoln Park. It does not include Romulus or go east into the Huron Township. That's a little different from most of the other maps.

Let's see. District 5 has Canton at the northern end. And then goes south from there. And includes the Van Buren Belleville Sumpter area, includes all of Romulus. And Westland. D7, to the north, D7 includes Pontiac and instead of going south in this map it actually goes is more of an east-west, includes Rochester and the northwest corner of Sterling Heights. D9, just under District 7, has the Oakland suburbs of Birmingham, Bloomfield, Bloomfield Hills, Royal Oak, Madison Heights and Ferndale. D10 and 11 are north-south districts in Macomb County. 10 dips down a little bit into Detroit there. I believe we did that for population purposes. And then 11 is very similar to Linden, right? I believe 11 is similar to the original Linden map and District 12 is lakeshore community of interest and I don't believe it was changed here either.

>> MR. MORGAN: It was changed here in Detroit.

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: Is that Jefferson Chalmers there?

>> MR. MORGAN: Yes and took.

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: Jefferson Chalmers neighborhood.

>> CHAIR EID: And 11 took many mount Clemens and doesn't go as far as south as the original District 11.

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: Okay.

Did we look at the VRA numbers, I mean the partisan fairness numbers?

>> CHAIR EID: Not yet. This map has really strong partisan fairness statistics. We have a lopsided margin of 3.8 to republicans. A mean median of .3 to democrats. And efficiency gap of .8 to democrats. Seats vote ratio 22-16. With a 5% to democrats.

>> CHAIR EID: This map changed 12 districts when compared to Linden. Herron similar in some ways and different in other ways. That brings us to the final map, Starling V3. Commissioner Muldoon, I think you are going to start us off on this one?

>> MARCUS MULDOON:

>> Chair, just to acknowledge I don't believe Commissioner Muldoon is present.

>> CHAIR EID: Gotcha. Commissioner Lange?

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: I just want to say I'm present and attending remotely from Reed City, Michigan.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, Commissioner Lange. Okay, would anyone who has not spoken about a map yet like to do this one? Commissioner Lett maybe? I think we have heard from just about everyone today. If not I will go ahead and present this one. It's usually him and me. So all right we are looking at Starling V3, started off as V1 and went to V2, there were some improvements made. Especially around the Macomb County area. To make it into version 3. So let's start with the V RA districts. This map has once again four VRA districts. In this map it's 1, 3, 7 and 10. The District 1 configuration is similar to some other maps where it takes a some of the Down River communities like Lincoln Park, Ecorse and River Rouge. Goes up a little bit around Dearborn to incorporate that Latino, Latina into the river front into some of the east side neighborhoods. District 3 is on top of that. It incorporates both Hamtramck and Highland Park and then goes westward to incorporate some of the northwest areas of Detroit. District 7 then is north of District 3. It is more of an Oakland County District including Southfield, Berkeley, Oak Park and Huntington Woods. Along with Ferndale, Hazel Park and some of the areas crossing 8 Mile but in a way that makes sense for the COIs in that area.

District 10 on the other hand is the final VRA District and includes all of Warren, Centerline and East Point. It then goes south, crossing 8 Mile into some of the northeast portions of Detroit. And also has a little portion of Roseville in it as well.

Those are the VRA districts. The District 2 in this map again is the Dearborn centered District. It is comprised of Dearborn, Dearborn Heights, Melvindale and Allen Park. And instead of including Lincoln Park it includes more of Warren Dale. And I believe a little bit of the City of Detroit as well. That is directly north of Warren Dale. The four and five are also just a little different here. In this one, Romulus is whole, but Taylor is split. So you have Taylor being split but it's split right down the highway. The east side of it is included in District 4 along with the rest of the Down River communities including South Gate and Wyandotte. Which I think we heard might be a good delineation point between the more northern Down River communities and southern Down River communities. But it goes south. And then a little bit different here it goes westward to include that Van Buren, Sumpter COI with District 4.

District 5 then is, again, all of Romulus but includes the west side of Taylor. As well as Inkster, some of Westland and Canton. Canton is whole and goes north into

Plymouth. District 6 is similar to a few of the other configurations. It's kind of centered around Livonia but also includes Redford, Garden City and the parts of Westland that are not in District 5. And then Northville as well. If we go to District 8, so District 8 here is in between those two VRA districts so 7 and 10. It includes Royal Oak and Madison Heights. Yes, so Berkeley and Huntington Woods are with 7 and Royal Oak is with 8. It also includes Troy and the west part of Sterling Heights. Sterling Heights is split but it's split around Van Buren and the west side is incorporated with Troy. Instead of encompassing Rochester Hills like you see in other maps this goes south to incorporate Royal Oak and Madison heights in District 8.

District 9 is -- has a similar configuration to some, so their maps as well Pontiac Rochester Hills and Bloomfield Hills down into Birmingham. And then we have districts 11 and 12. So 12 is a little different from the original Linden. But I think still has that whole lakeshore COI in it. And then District 11 is the areas in between that river and that COI. And the rest of the districts incorporating the east side of Sterling Heights as well as Clinton Township, Fraser and I believe Commissioner Muldoon edited it to also include a little bit of Chesterfield for population reasons. And then finally the District 13 is, again, similar to what is seen in some of the other maps having West Bloomfield and Orchard Lake be together with Novi. And Farmington Hills and Farmington are whole in District 13 here. I think the real difference is it goes a little bit into Southfield on the bottom right portion. As far as some of the metrics goes, this one changes 14 districts when compared to Linden. For the partisan fairness values.

>> MR. MORGAN: The top line numbers are lopsided margin 5.0 for republican. Mean median is 1.3 for republican. Efficiency gap is 1.9 for republican. Seats vote ratio is 21 democrat, 17 republican with 2.4 bias towards democrats.

>> CHAIR EID: Wonderful, thank you, Mr. Morgan. All right, that's all 12 maps. I want to thank all the Commissioners who participated and presenting those maps both the collaborative and the individual. I think it's really good for the public that we are doing this so they have a good understanding of the differences in some of these maps and can let us know their thoughts. We will move on to the public comment portion as well as a Q and A for today's meeting. Is there any objection, Commissioners? All right. Hearing none we will move on. Individuals who have signed up or raised their hand in the participation lobby indicating they would like to provide remote public commentary or questions to the Commission will now be allowed. I'll call you by your name and our staff will unmute you. If you are on a computer you will be prompted by the Zoom app to unmute and speak. If you are joining us via telephone a voice will say the host wants you to speak and property you to press star six to unmute. I will either call you by your name or the last four digits of your phone number. Please note if you are experiencing technical or audio issues or we do not hear from you for three to five seconds we will be moving on to the next person in line and then returning to you when they are done speaking. If your audio still does not work you can e-mail us at

redistricting@Michigan.gov and we will help you trouble shoot so you can participate during the next town hall.

Today you will have 90 seconds to address the Commission. And please conclude your remarks when you hear the timer. We have three folks who signed up in advance for public comment. I do see we have a few more who are attending via the participants' list. We will start with the three that signed up in advance, the first being Jamie Roe.

>> Yeah. Thank you I live in the current 11th State Senate District that has been ruled to violate the U.S. Constitution. Of the bird maps that have been submitted to the Court I believe the Cardinal map does the best job protecting our vital communities of interest where I live here in Macomb County. It protects Lake St. Clair COI leaving the 12th District unchanged and combines important COI in the Clinton watershed in new 11. Unfortunately it changes the ninth District which best represents the Chaldean community of interest but a fairly good job of keeping all three of the large Chaldean Catholic churches contained in the District Shelby, Sterling Heights and Troy. It's my hope the Commission adopts the Cardinal map. If not Cardinal, then Dove does the best job protecting the Chaldean COI; but needlessly splits Lake St. Clair COI. Thank you Commissioner Curry for her map and several other individual maps that protect vital communities of interest in Macomb County in a similar map. The Commission must reject the Heron map which obliterates Chaldean into three districts and leaves 11 unchanged in a manner designed to protect the current incumbent in violation of the Michigan Constitution. If any Commissioner supports that map, tell the Chaldean community why the same standard was not applied to them that has been applied to so many others in this remapping project. You must reject Herron. Thank you for the opportunity.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, there Roe. Next up is Anthony Scannell.

>> Thank you. Good morning, Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission. I'm just excited to be here today. And just trying to keep my public comment streak really because I've said all my preferences but I kind of changed my mind on some of the maps I like and dislike. And I just try to be organized about it. I got a good okay and a bad for the preferences. And in the good column I put Curry, Orton and Crane. And in the okay column I would put Lang, Wagner, Szetela, Kellom. And in the bad column I would put most bird names except Crane, Cardinal, Dove, Finch, Heron and Starling. And based off my preferences the thing to look out for my people and family where I live, I'm not looking at every county, city in the area. I don't know nothing about Oakland County, Macomb County and don't pretend to. And I don't care about the partisan fairness even though it's a constitutional criteria because I think they are so corrupt it makes me sick. But good luck with your choices.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, Mr. Scannell. We appreciate your comments. Third to speak is Mr. James Gallant.

>> This is James Gallant Marquette these are my opinions. Please answer to us why you continue to refuse to follow the Robert's Rules of Order as instructed by Mike Brady. No debate before a motion second that's on Page 366 line 8. You are not respecting or preserving our community of interest. The entire State of Michigan. And it's repugnant to the Constitution of 1963 as amended. Today is probably your last best chance to distance MICRC from secretary state Benson's bullying. That started September 17, 2020, by her refusing to follow Robert's Rules while she presided over these meetings. And now she continues to refuse to act as secretary of state without a vote of the MICRC as she reiterated in a signed letter in the orientation materials. She said she was going to personally be here to be the secretary. And it also says in those materials that Robert's Rules is a framework you may want to adopt then directly contradicting the director of legal services Mike Brady saying you must follow it which he said at the meeting. I would light to say also objection here say. Who you are presenting absent members maps and making it up like you Mr. Chair did. Secretary of State did not do the roll call and establish a quorum today so you should have a motion to approve a constitutional Senate map right now, postponed then you bring it back every time you discuss a debate like you did today. Question-and-answers and oh, about this and about and Callaghan, oh, yeah, this and that and explaining.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, Mr. Gallant. We do appreciate your comments. Is there anyone in the waiting room who would like to provide comments to the Commission or have any questions about the maps themselves? That is what we are here to do answer questions about the actual maps. Anyone who has not gone already feel free to raise your hand in the chat and we will hear from you. Okay well it doesn't look like we have anybody who would like to have any questions or provide commentary right now. How about we go on break. We will come back at 12:30 and see if we have any more folks join us.

[ Recess until 12:30 PM ]

>> CHAIR EID: Well folks we have about 15 minutes left in the noticed meeting. And I'd like to note that we are going to be here also tonight from 5 p.m. to 7:30 p.m. Is there anyone who has not spoken yet who would like to provide comment to the Commission, comment about our maps, if you have any questions about the maps now is the time. We are here to answer them. I do see Chuck Altman has his hand up. Hello Mr. Altman.

>> Hello, thank you. I hope this is an appropriate question. I may have missed this explanation earlier. I had a question about the partisan fairness and how the scores within that partisan fairness were derived.

>> CHAIR EID: Yes. So you are talking about our partisan fairness scores, correct?

>> Yes.



>> CHAIR EID: So we have a number of different measures that were used. We had our partisan fairness expert talk about this a little bit at our meeting that was on, just let me get that date,.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: May 16th.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, Mr. Woods. So we have a fully detailed explanation on what each one of those numbers are and how they were derived on our May 16th meeting that is available on our YouTube Page. That's by Dr. Lisa Handley. Generally we have a few different partisan fairness metrics. We use the efficiency gap, the lopsided margin test and mean median difference as well as the seats to votes ratio. Now, this Commission is using a weighted average of the past ten years of election history that has taken place in Michigan plus the most recent election, 2022. So that gives us, I believe, 12 years of election history that goes into a composite that makes our numbers. Does that answer your question?

>> Yes, thank you very much.

>> CHAIR EID: You're welcome. And I invite you to take a look at our YouTube Page, watch the meeting so you can get the more detailed explanation from Dr. Handley herself.

>> Okay, will do.

>> CHAIR EID: And you can also, if you are interested, we can show you how to -- do you know how to access the partisan fairness metrics that are on each map?

>> I think so.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay, it's on our website, [www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC). Attached to each map is an excel spreadsheet that shows all four of those measures I just spoke about.

>> Okay, very good, thank you.

>> CHAIR EID: You're welcome. Would anyone else like to comment? I don't see anyone. Mr. Woods, do you have anything to add today?

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: No, but thank you for asking.

>> CHAIR EID: So just going forward we have a few different meetings scheduled. We have tonight's virtual town hall where we will redo what we did this morning. Go over all of the maps. So people can, you know, see why they were created, what is in some of them and see the difference between the 12 versions that the Commission has put forward to the Court. And then next week we have our in-person public hearings. We will be meeting on Tuesday, June 11, Wednesday June 12 and Thursday June 13. We are trying to hit the major Detroit public school system high schools. So on Tuesday, June 11th we will be at Cass tech high school located at 2501 Second Avenue, Detroit, Michigan, 48201. On Wednesday, June 12th we are going to be at Martin Luther King high school located at 3200 East Lafayette Street, Detroit, Michigan, 48207. And on Thursday, June 13th we are going to be at Renaissance high school. 6565 West Outer Drive, Detroit, Michigan, 48235. Now at these meetings the

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

Commission is going to be there from 10:00 a.m. until 7:00 p.m. as long as you are there somewhere in between those times we will make time to hear from you. We do have some breaks scheduled but generally we will be there from 10:00 a.m. to 7:00 p.m. and at the meetings we will have big blow ups of all 12 of the maps as well as the original Linden map and the map that the legislature created back in the 2010 census cycle so you can all see it in person and do a hard copy comparison if you would like. We certainly hope that folks watching this will attend. It's always nice to see folks in person and hear from them. Again, Tuesday, June 11th at Detroit Cass tech high school, Wednesday June 12th at Martin Luther King high school and June 13, Thursday at Renaissance high school. Are there any announcements or acknowledgments today, Commissioners? Or staff? Well, I don't see any and we don't have anyone else who would like to speak. Once again, we will reconvene later today at 5:00 p.m. and we will go from 5:00 p.m. to about 7:30. On behalf of the Commission I'd like to express my appreciation to all those who made this virtual town hall meeting possible that includes many partners from EDS to the Michigan Department of State, regional interpreting network, Q and A reporting, the translators, the sign language interpreters and most of all you the public for engaging with us to make sure that we can get fair maps. We will see y'all at 5:00. Enjoy the rest of your day.

[ Meeting concludes ]

---

5:00 Meeting

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Hi all it looks like we are still waiting for Chair to join, so we will give him just a few more minutes. I know we are coming up, on 5:00 soon but I will let you know before I take it live. Okay it looks like Chair is on. Chair, I'm going to go ahead and start the webinar and get us going live. So that the can be good.

>> CHAIR EID: Perfect, thank you, Megan.

Okay, welcome back everyone.

As Chair of the Commission, I call the meeting of the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission to Town hall meeting at 5:02:00 p.m.

This Zoom webinar is being live streamed on YouTube on the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission YouTube channel.

For anyone in the public watching who would prefer to watch via a different platform than they are currently using, please visit our social media at Redistricting MI.

Our live stream today includes closed captioning. Closed captioning, ASL interpretation, and Spanish and Arabic and Bengali translation services will be provided for effective participation in this evening's meeting. Please E-mail us at [Redistricting@michigan.gov](mailto:Redistricting@michigan.gov) for additional viewing options or details for accessing language translation services for this meeting.

People with disabilities or needing other specific accommodations should also contact Redistricting at [Michigan.gov](http://Michigan.gov).

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

This meeting is also being recorded and will be available on our website at [www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC) for viewing at a later date.

This meeting also is being transcribed and those closed-captioned transcriptions will be made available and posted on the [Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://Michigan.gov/MICRC) website along with written public comment submissions.

There is also a public comment portal that may be accessed by visiting the website which is [www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC).

Members of the media who may have questions before, during or after the meeting should direct those questions to Edward Woods III, Executive Director of the Commission at [WoodsE3@Michigan.gov](mailto:WoodsE3@Michigan.gov).

To present the purpose of today's town hall meeting I will turn it over to Executive Director Woods.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Thank you so much, Commissioner Eid. I hope this finds everyone well. It's 5:00. And we hope you are ready to engage in learning more about the maps. As you know we have six collaborative maps and six individual maps. Our purpose is to educate, to simply educate about each and every one of the maps. And answer any questions that you may have. So that when we have our public hearing next week in Detroit you can share which map that you like or which map that you like with some minor tweaks. So that we can have a robust engagement at our public hearings. But once again this is optional and it's an education process with regards to the maps. As always we welcome public comments whether they are in person or remote or whether you comment through the public comment portal or the mapping comment portal. We want your comments. You can also mail in your comments as well as e-mail them. I want to let you know we are once again want to engage the public as it relates to the comments regarding these maps. We want to thank you for your past engagement with the House and look forward to the same with the Senate and we look forward to seeing each and every one of you next week. But today, today, today is an opportunity to educate yourselves with regards to the maps and get your questions answered so that you can make an informed decision when you come before the Commission next week.

Once again thank you so much for engaging with us, thank you for being here and we hope that you will enjoy this meeting as the Commission shares details about each of the 12 maps being considered. Thank you and I will turn it back over to our Chair, Commissioner Anthony Eid.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, Mr. Woods. The Commission has submitted 12 maps, 12 draft maps to the Court for public consideration. These include six collaborative maps and six individual maps. The collaborative maps we gave bird names too and are as follows: Cardinal, Crane, Dove, Finch, Herron and Starling. While the individual maps come to us as submissions from individual Commissioners, Juanita Curry, Brittini Kellom, Rhonda Lange, Cynthia Orton, Rebecca Szetela and Erin Wagner. We are

going to go through all 12 of these maps this evening. And we have different requests from different Commissioners who would like to go due to time restraints so if anybody would like to go first please let me know. And we will make time for that. Commissioner Lange?

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Thank you. I would be happy to go first.

>> CHAIR EID: Please, that would be nice.

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Mr. Morgan, if you can bring up my individual map, please.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay, I will do that. Okay this is the Commissioner Lange map. It's map 400 on the portal.

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Okay, I'm going to make it kind of quick since this is the third time and I'm sure some have already heard this. So what we are looking at, I started off with a collaborative map that was started. And I concentrated on the Detroit area starting out. And trying not to change a lot of the outer districts that were already done. Therefore District 11 and 9 are the same as what they were in the Linden map. This map has four VRA districts, those districts consist of 1, 3, 6 and 7. The Detroit area District 1 you will see, this was a little bit of a redraw from the -- my initial map. I included Melvindale in with Dearborn. And then took some neighborhoods above that area and added them into one to make the new District.

I used neighborhoods as a guideline. Tried to keep as many neighborhoods whole as I could, and I also used major roads and highways as a guideline for this. District 7 consisted of Oak Park, pardon me, Farmington Hills, Southfield. What I did there, I tried to incorporate a District that encompassed the Jewish population community of interest. In District 13, Livonia, which was not whole in the initial map is now whole. You have in District 5 Canton is whole, which we received a lot of comment about that. And then you can see District 4 Taylor is whole. So we had a lot of comment about keeping Taylor whole.

District 1, 3 and 6 are initial first time around in mapping we heard a lot from the public stating how citizens of Detroit would really like somebody from the Detroit area that knows Detroit to be represented by them. So by trying to do three districts within the boundaries of Detroit and the Detroit area, I'm hoping that that satisfies what people were looking for. And partisan fairness was basically the same as all of the other maps, give or take a point, a percentage point or so. But all fell within the guidelines. I did not look at race when drawing this. I did not look at any political affiliations when drawing this. And the districts that I drew are from me. I did not look at any maps when doing these. There were no maps submitted to me. So these are all just for me.

And I think that pretty much sums it up.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, Commissioner Lange.

>> MR. MORGAN: If I may I think Commissioner Lange said that District 9 and 11 were the same as Linden. I think it's District 9 and 12.

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: It is. I apologize. I misspoke. 12 and 9, forgive me.

>> MR. MORGAN: Yep.

>> CHAIR EID: Wonderful. All right would anyone else like to go next presenting a map? Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I can go. Thank you.

>> MR. MORGAN: And this is the individual map that you want to see?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Yes, please.

>> MR. MORGAN: Computer says, no.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: While that is coming up, I think I changed 13 districts. Some just slightly. And I started with the Crane map. So it's very similar to the Crane map. I did not look at any race data or political data, incumbents or anything like that drawing the map. It does have four VRA districts, which we will see which ones those are. 1, 3, 6 and 7. I will just go through District by District. District 1 in this map, so I said started with Crane. I did not change any of these Detroit centered districts from what was in Crane. So District 1 contains River Rouge, Ecorse, Lincoln Park and down to South Gate. Contains the Hispanic community of interest that we've heard about, Corktown, Mexicantown. And it contains Detroit neighborhoods. There is Midwest. Bethune. And other neighborhoods. I followed the used the neighborhood map. Well, not I guess not in this one. This one is close to Crane and so we used the neighborhood map in Crane. And left it like it was. So District 2 contains the Mena community of interest that we've heard a lot about. Dearborn, Dearborn Heights, Melvindale. Allen Park. All of Warren Avenue and most of Warren Dale.

And District 3 is Detroit, contains Highland Park and Hamtramck including Bangla Town. And in east Detroit it includes the neighborhoods of Cornerstone Village East English Village Morningside that wanted to stay together, and the Gold Coast is in there.

District 4, so this keeps the community of interest of Belleville and Sumpter townships together along with Huron. And it keeps Romulus whole. And with the districts south of it, which was requested in public comment, and it keeps a lot of the Down River communities together.

District 5, is Canton, Plymouth and Westland. It also includes Garden City and Inkster. District 6, West Detroit with Redford, includes Brightmoor and Bagley and other neighborhoods.

District 7 is mostly the same configuration as original. Just slightly changed. And it keeps Southfield with Pontiac, which is a community of interest we heard about. District 8, is so Royal Oak, with Oak Park, Pleasant Ridge, Huntington Woods, Ferndale and Hazel Park. And then Madison Heights is in there and Clawson.

District 9 keeps pretty much like it was originally, but slightly changed. I think it does keep the Chaldean community of interest we heard about together. It's got Troy, the west part of Sterling Heights. Rochester, Rochester Hills. And it does keep Utica with that District, which we did receive public comment about.



And District 10, so 10 and 11 were the long, skinny districts. And I changed those so that 10 is below and 11 is above. So those contain mostly the areas that were in 10 and 11. So 10 has East Point and Roseville. The east part of Warren, Fraser, part of Clinton Township and the remainder of Sterling Heights that isn't in 9. So then 11 has most of Clinton Township I would say. Almost all of Shelby Township, Macomb Township and what was above there already.

District 12 preserves the Lake St. Clair, lakeshore community of interest.

District 13 is over on the other side. It keeps Farmington with Farmington Hills, and it keeps Livonia whole, and it includes Northville and part of Novi.

And there were some slight changes to 23 and 24. Just slight when we did the overlay, it, you know, just a little bit for population purposes.

And I did not look at any political party information. Does not disfavor or favor any elected officials or candidates that I know of. I did not look at any of that. And I considered county, City and Township boundaries where it didn't cause a problem with population or community of interest wise.

So and partisan fairness. Do you want to bring the numbers up or should I just read them off?

>> MR. MORGAN: It's map 393. So the lopsided margins is 5.1 republican. The mean median is 3.4 republican. The efficiency gap is 1.9 republican. And the seats vote ratio is 21-17 with the bias of 2.4 towards democrats.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Thank you. Are there any questions or anything?

>> MR. MORGAN: I was going to add I believe that the three Detroit districts were the same as in Commissioner Curry's plan.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Yes, that's true. Yep. That's all. Thanks.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, Commissioner Orton. Good explanations, everyone. Anyone want to go next? Okay, well let's go with one of the collaborative maps then. Let's just start at the top. And start with Cardinal. All right Mr. Weiss do you want to help present this one?

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Yes with your help as well, this is the Cardinal map that is collaborative. This had six districts that were contested. They were District 3, 6, 8, 10 and 11. And we redrew those districts by erasing them completely. And substituting the House of representative districts in place of that, which maybe, John, if you want to bring up maybe an overlay might be helpful, I'm not sure. It contains, thank you, it contains four VRA District compliance, 1, 3, 7 and 8. And as you can see they were substituted in place of the Senate District. So obviously they are not all perfect. There was some changes, I believe, total there were approximately 12 districts that got changed in the process to make this work.

Let me see. I guess that is, okay, Mr. Eid, if you will take over, please, you are much better at this.

>> CHAIR EID: Well, I think you are doing a fine job.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Yes but you are much better.

>> CHAIR EID: Yeah, so as Commissioner Weiss was saying, with this version of the maps we for the Detroit area in particular we substituted in a few of the Motown Sound House Districts in order to create Senate districts since just about three House Districts makes a Senate District. That's for the Detroit area. For the suburbs it takes the same collaborative districts as there are in some of the other maps. But for example, you can see here for the Senate District 1, it's comprised pretty much of the House Districts 1, 7 and 9. For the Senate District 2, it's comprised of the House Districts 2, 3 and 15. And if you go up north to Senate District 3 it's primarily House Districts 4, 5 and 8. So we can take that approach in combining some of the Senate districts in comparing, combining some of the House Districts for this Cardinal map.

It does have four VRA districts. Those being 1, 3, 7 and 8. So for District 1 it's a Down River District that goes from some of the Down River communities starting in Wyandotte up through Ecorse and River Rouge up to through the river, up to Grosse Pointe and includes Highland Park and Hamtramck. The District 3 includes a lot of the rest of northwest Detroit, going up and crossing 8 Mile into Ferndale and Oak Park, trying to use the same COIs in crossing 8 Mile in a way that supports communities of interest. But not crossing it too much.

The District 8 then takes the east side of Detroit and puts it with a little bit, well, puts it with most of Warren, Centerline and East Point, along with Hazel Park. And in District 7, the last VRA District, it's comprised of Southfield, Detroit and some of those Royal Oak neighborhoods that share commonalities like Royal Oak, Berkley, and Huntington Woods. Now so those are the VRA districts. We will hit some of the other districts. District 2 is that Dearborn centered District that has the Middle Eastern community of interest in it and comprised of Dearborn, Dearborn Heights, Melvindale. This configuration also has Allen Park and Lincoln Park in it. Along with a little bit of Warren Dale.

The districts 4 and 5 are similar to what we see in a few of the other maps. In District 4 Taylor is whole. But in this configuration Romulus is split. So on four you have Taylor, South Gate, with some of the other more southern Down River communities basically all of them up into Monroe. And also includes Van Buren, Belleville and Sumpter in one District. District 5 is a little more Canton based and has the remainder of Romulus that is not in District 4, along with Westland and Inkster. District 6 then has Livonia being whole and also includes Redford, Garden City, a little bit of Detroit, and Northville. We talked about 7 and 8 already. Let's go up to District 9. So District 9 is a little different from the original District 7 configuration. If you recall general District 7 had Pontiac going south into Southfield. One of the things you see in a lot of our maps is this kind of District 9 that includes Pontiac, Rochester and Rochester Hills along with Bloomfield Hills. And this configuration includes Birmingham and other ones, it doesn't in one Birmingham is in there with District 9. District 10 likewise is changed. It is one of

the configurations that doesn't have a split in Sterling Heights. Instead of having it whole with Utica, Troy and also Madison Heights just south on 75.

District 12 is unchanged from the original Linden map. Meaning it has the same lakeshore COI that we've heard some folks like there with Linden. And District 11 is basically the areas that are left in between 8, 10 and 12. Being a little bit more of a Macomb County with Warren, Roseville, Fraser, Clinton Township. But does not include East Point as before and does not cross into 8 Mile like it did before.

Finally, the last one, District 13, it recombines Farmington and Farmington Hills putting it with West Bloomfield and the lakes as well as Novi and Commerce Township.

As Commissioner Weiss said, this version changes 12 districts from the original Linden configuration. Do we want to bring up the partisan fairness numbers?

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay, 373. 373. So the up sided margin is 3.6 republican. The mean median is 2.6 republican. Efficiency gap is 0.8 democrat. The seats vote is 22 democrat, 16 republican, with a bias of 5.0 towards democrats.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, John. So as you can see it performs quite well under the partisan fairness metrics. I think that is about it for this one.

Next up is Crane. Commissioner Vallette, will you help the public in explaining this one?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: I sure will. Okay, Mr. Morgan, are you pulling that map up. Thank you very much.

>> MR. MORGAN: All right and this is 385 from the portal.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you. The first ranked redistricting criteria was equal populations and Voting Rights Act. All of the districts are within the population deviation. And race was not looked at in the drawing of this map. VRA analysis was performed after the map was drawn. And there are four VRA districts and Commissioner Eid, will you help me remember what those four were?

>> CHAIR EID: Yeah. It is 1, 3, 6 and 7 on this one.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you. The second criteria was geographically contiguous. We performed a dis-contiguous check was performed. And there were no dis-contiguous, those words are so weird, but any way it was fine as far as that went.

And then to reflect the state's diversity and communities of interest, so District 1 the Down River communities of River Rouge, Ecorse, Lincoln Park were kept together. Hispanic COI including Corktown and Mexicantown were kept together. The neighborhoods of Midwest, up to Bethune and over to Dexter Linwood were kept together.

District 2, the COI including Dearborn and Dearborn Heights help Vin Dale Allen Park, all the Warren Avenue and most of Warren Dale were kept together.

District 3 Highland Park and Hamtramck including Bangla Town, east Detroit, Cornerstone Village, East English Village and Morningside were kept together and including the Gold Coast. District 4 keeps the COI of Belleville, Van Buren and Sumpter

Township along with Huron community. And it also keeps Romulus whole. And with the area south of which was requested by the public comment. Keeps many Down River communities together.

District 5, Canton with Plymouth and Westland. And it also includes Garden City and Inkster.

District 6, West Detroit with Redford includes Brightmoor, Bagley and far west Detroit.

District 7, Southfield and Pontiac and that was a public comment for that COI to stay together.

District 8 keeps Livonia whole. Farmington with Farmington Hills together. And Northville and some of Novi together.

District 9 keeps the Chaldean COI together with Troy. West side of Sterling Heights, Rochester and Rochester Hills together.

District 10 is Oak Park, Huntington Woods, Pleasant Ridge together and Ferndale and Hazel Park.

District 12 preserves the Lake St. Clair shoreline COI.

13 has Milford and Commerce and White Lake together.

District 23 keeps Highland and White Lake townships together.

And District 24 keeps most of Clinton Township with Shelby do you know ship with Macomb Township and what was originally the north part of the District.

There was no disproportionate advantage to any public party, political party. And the part, I'm sorry, so the partisan fairness numbers were in line with what was required. No favor or disfavor to an incumbent elected official or candidate. We did not take any incumbents or candidates into account while drawing this map. And it reflects consideration of City, county and Township borders. Where -- [ she froze ] Boundaries if they didn't conflict with population or COI consideration. And it is reasonably compact. And that's it. Any questions?

>> CHAIR EID: I don't see any. Well done, Commissioner Vallette..

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Thank you.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay, let's see, next up is Dove.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay this is Dove map 364 on the portal.

>> CHAIR EID: Great, great. All right. I will say a few words about this one.

Sorry now we are looking at Dove. Once again, it had four VRA districts in this version of the map, those districts are 1, 3, 7 and 10. For District 1 you have a little bit of a different configuration that is in some other maps, so I guess it's unique in that way. It has those Down River communities. This time starting in Ecorse going up through River Rouge. And incorporating much of the Detroit river, up until some of the east side of Detroit including East English Village, Morningside area, and it goes north to include only Hamtramck, but it's separate from Highland Park in this one which is in District 3.

That District 3 then has Highland park and the rest of that, you know, northern, northwestern portion of Detroit.

District 7 is similar to the original Linden 7 in that it goes from Pontiac down to Southfield but that did include Birmingham originally. In this one Birmingham is not included in 7 and is instead with District 8.

And then the District 10 is the rest of the northeastern portion of Detroit, along with all of Warren, Centerline and East Point. And Harper Woods in this configuration is in District 10 as well.

We spoke a moment about District 8 and Birmingham is included in it. If we look at the rest of the District it has many of the Oakland County townships being together here. Like Royal Oak, Berkeley, Huntington Woods going a little bit more south here into Oak Park, Ferndale and Hazel Park and south into Detroit covering some areas that makes sense from a COI perspective like Palmer Park.

If we go to District 2, so this is again the Dearborn centered community of interest. We've seen this one in a few of the other maps as the configuration that has Dearborn, Dearborn Heights Melvindale Allen Park and Lincoln Park. Let's see, in this one, Warren, there is a little bit of Warren Dale in there. But to a lesser degree and that is because Lincoln Park in totality is included in District 2 here.

We can go to four and five. So there are a few differences here. Again, with this District 4 we see Taylor is whole, but Romulus is split around the airport. Four then goes south to incorporate the rest of the Down River communities and this map includes Sumpter with District 4. Whereas Van Buren and Belleville are instead included in District 5. As well as the rest of Romulus, Inkster, parts of Westland and Plymouth.

It then brings us to District 6 which is directly north. It's once again a Livonia centered District with Livonia being whole here, also including Redford, Garden City, parts of Westland that are not in District 5 and goes north into Farmington and Farmington Hills as well as a little bit of Southfield.

We spoke about 7, 8 and 10. Let's go to District 9. So this is also similarly configured to the original District 9-inch colluding the west portion of Sterling Heights split up around Van Dyke avenue including Utica and Troy. And then going north into Rochester, Rochester Hills and Oakland.

For 11 and 12 here we have a little bit of a difference. Instead of incorporating the whole lakeshore you have a District 11 that includes the points and St. Clair Shores but then heading westward to include the east part of Sterling Heights that is not in District 9. Then just north of that you have the rest of that lakeshore COI. That incorporates mount Clemens, and the border townships to Lake Augustine. Then finally if we look at District 13, it is similar to the original Linden configuration, although it doesn't go as far south. Instead it takes in more of Farmington, Farmington Hills and Walled Lake so you got West Bloomfield and the lakes in addition to Novi, Northville, parts of Farmington and Farmington Hills as well as Commerce and Walled Lake.

This map changed 12 districts from the original Linden configuration. As far as the partisan fairness values go I got 6.2% for the lopsided margin score. Towards



republicans. 2.5% towards republicans for mean median difference. 4.6% towards republicans for efficiency gap. And a 0.2 seats to votes ratio towards republicans with 20 to 18 vote share.

All right, I think that covers it for this one.

Next up we will bring up Finch. Commissioner Callaghan, can you help present this one again?

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: I think I can do that. Okay, so this is Finch. It also has four VRA districts, those are districts 1, 3, 7 and 8. We have three Detroit centered districts, 1, 3 and 8 all start at the river and kind of Branch up and out from there. I'm going to talk about the VRA districts first beginning with the Detroit ones. District 1 starts Down River, and it includes the Down River communities of River Rouge Ecorse and Wyandotte. Above that you have the Latino Latina community that's included then it wraps around the Dearborn community to include some of the western and northwestern Detroit neighborhoods.

Next door is District 3. District 3 starts at the river front includes bell isle and the Gold Coast. Then it extends north up to include Hamtramck, Highland Park. The Bangladesh community of interest. And also has a pretty good slice of the northern Detroit neighborhoods. Then it crosses into crosses 8 Mile to include Ferndale and Hazel Park. I think that encompasses the LBGTQ community, is that correct? Yes that is the COI that is kept together there.

Next door to that is District 8. District 8 again it starts with a small slice down at the river front and then moves very quickly north to encompass the eastern neighborhoods and northeast neighborhoods of Detroit. It's got the Morningside, East English Village, Cornerstone community. It's -- yeah it crosses 8 Mile and includes East Point, a good bit of Warren and Centerline.

All right, then the last VRA District is not Detroit centric it's District 7. It's mostly outside of Detroit. It includes Southfield, Franklin, Beverly Hills then it goes east to include Berkeley Royal Oak, Oak Park and royal Lake Township and dips just slightly past 8 Mile and includes a few communities there and it was done for population purposes. So those are the VRA districts. If we move outside of Detroit to other districts District 2 includes the Mena community of interest, you pretty much see this in all the maps. This version includes Dearborn, Dearborn Heights Melvindale and Lincoln Park and Allen Park and doesn't include the Warren Dale area north of Dearborn. A slice on Warren Avenue but that is about it.

District 4 includes all of the Down River communities that are not in either D1 or D2 also includes all of Taylor kept whole and Van Buren charter Township and Van Buren Sumpter and Belleville we received comments about keeping those areas whole there. This District does, however, split Romulus on there at the airport. ' Moving north we get District 5 and contains the northern half of Romulus along with western Inkster,

Westland and the Canton Plymouth. It's good to keep Canton and Plymouth, Plymouth Township together because they have strong ties in those communities.

Next is D6 another western suburban District. It has Northville, Northville Township, that's that little cross over 8 Mile line because that is the boundary for the town. It has all of Livonia which keeps that community whole addresses the comments received there. It also includes Garden City, Redford and a very small slice of some western Detroit neighborhoods.

D9 has the very similar configuration to what Anthony was just describing in the previous map. It has Pontiac grouped with the northern Oakland suburbs of hills, Rochester, Rochester Hills, Bloomfield, Bloomfield Hills and Birmingham. 10, District 10, straddles the Oakland, Macomb County line. It's got Troy and Madison Heights from Oakland and then all of Sterling Heights which is kept whole and Utica from Macomb.

D11 matches the Linden map at least on the northern end and I believe along the eastern border as well. The difference is it does include the northeast corner of Warren which the Linden map did not. And it also it does not include East Point and it doesn't cross down into 8 Mile which the Linden map did, so it stops a little shorter. D12 is the Lake St. Clair community of interest you see on a lot of the maps. Over on D13 you see Farmington, Farmington Hills is made whole. And it's grouped with the greater West Bloomfield area, Novi, Walled Lake and part of Commerce Township.

If we could take a look at the partisan fairness numbers.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay, this is 399 on the portal. So the top line number is the lopsided margin is 3.7 for republican. The mean median difference is 2.7 republican. The efficiency gap is 0.8 democrat. The seats votes is 22 democrat to 16 republican with a 5.0 towards democrats.

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: So that's all I had for that map unless someone has a comment or a question.

>> CHAIR EID: I think you about covered it.

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: Okay.

>> CHAIR EID: I will say one changed 13 districts compared to the original Linden. All right, next up is Herron.

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: Want me to do this one too?

>> CHAIR EID: If you could that would be great.

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: All right so this is the Herron map. With this map we started out by trying to see if we could come up with a different configuration for Detroit. To provide choices and to see what the maps could look like if we did something really different with Detroit. So here instead of having an east west divide or having one wrap around Dearborn like we have on a lot of the maps or the last map you saw with three districts that kind of came from the river and up and out, this one did some stacking of the districts. This map with the voting rights analysis I actually had four VRA districts as

well. Those were 1, 3, 6, and 8. 1, 3, 6 and 8. Yep. So I'm going to talk about those first. District 1 is hugging the river front down there. On the east it's a little higher than some maps to get enough population in and it includes the east side neighborhoods of Cornerstone, Morningside East English Village. Then it runs through downtown, midtown. Includes Latino community. Then the southern end includes Down River communities of Melvindale, Allen Park, River Rouge, Ecorse and parts of Lincoln Park.

After that D8 District 8 is the other VR District and sits on top of D1. And D8 is intended to be encompassing the middle and northern neighborhoods of Detroit. So you see we have Highland Park and Hamtramck in there Bangladesh community of interest and northern communities across the very top of the City. D6 is beside of D8 the other VRA District. D6 makes Livonia whole which we had a lot of comments for. Groups it with Redford and the far west neighborhoods of Detroit. Then the last VRA District is District 3. It's an east west District, has some of the entering suburbs from Oakland County. So you got Royal Oak Township, Southfield, Oak Park, Beverly Hills, Berkeley and part of Farmington, Farmington Hills. It does split Farmington Hills.

Okay now I'm going to get back to the non-VRA districts starting with District 2. This encompass the Mena community of interest and this iteration that includes Dearborn, Dearborn Heights combined with part of Warren Dale and didn't get all of the community but has a piece of it. Also Inkster City and part of Westland. It does not include Melvindale. I know we had a lot of comments about that but in District it wouldn't fit for population.

Next is District 4. Which is under two. District 4 doesn't extend as far west as some of the other maps. Doesn't have Romulus or any of the western communities however Taylor is whole and included in this District as all of the remaining Down River communities.

Moving over to District 5. District 5 has Van Buren Sumpter Belleville hear we heard so much about when we split them mistakenly and Romulus is whole and Huron charter Township also includes, let's see, Canton. However, Plymouth is split from Canton in particular iteration.

Next is D7. D7 still includes Pontiac like Linden did but instead of going south to 8 Mile like Linden it stretches to the east with northern Auburn Hills Rochester, Rochester Hills, dips down for a little bit of Troy and Sterling Heights.

D9 is Oakland suburbs. We have Birmingham, Bloomfield, Bloomfield Hills, Royal Oak Madison Heights and Ferndale. And then D10 and D11 they both run north south in Macomb County like in Linden, but the boundaries are a little bit different. D10 includes Utica, most of Sterling Heights and Warren and barely dips down into Detroit for population. Old D10 in Linden had a substantial footprint in Detroit and this version of ten does not.

D11 the northern and western boundary is like Linden. But changes include the addition of mount Clemens on the east. And it doesn't extend into Detroit on the southern boundary either. It stops at East Point.

D12 maintains the lakeshore District. D13 on the west side includes the greater West Bloomfield area, the northern half of Farmington Hills, it did not make it into District 3. Novi, Northville and Plymouth.

I think this map changed 12 districts. Is that right? Commissioner Eid?

>> CHAIR EID: Yep, 12.

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: 12, yep. And if we can take a look at the partisan numbers.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay this is 376. So the lopsided margin is 3.8 republican. 0.3 democrat on the mean median. The efficiency gap is 0.8 democrat. The seats vote is 22 democrat to 16 republican but with a 5.0 bias towards democrats.

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: So these are good partisan fairness scores. Some of the best that we have. That's all I have.

>> CHAIR EID: Go ahead.

>> DONNA CALLAGHAN: No, that is all I have.

>> CHAIR EID: Great, thank you for presenting that map.

We have one more collaborative map. And that is Starling. All right so what we are looking at here is Starling V3 with two other iterations Starling V1 and Starling V2 and it was improved upon iteratively. I think Commissioner Muldoon was the last to make a change on it with changes to District 11 there in the Fraser area.

But this map has once again four VRA compliant districts. In this one it's 1, 3, 7 and 10. District 1 is similar to what we saw just now in Herron where it's more 'a stacked configuration' and changes the borders and includes Lincoln Park with Ecorse and River Rouge going up through the Detroit river. And I believe it also includes the Midwest neighborhood on the northwest portion.

District 3 is then on top of it, it includes Highland Park and Hamtramck and goes westward to include much of the areas of Central and northwest Detroit. District 7 is then just north of District 3. And includes many of the southern Oakland County townships like Southfield, Southfield Township, as well as Oak Park, Berkeley and Hazel Park. And then it goes south to include Palmer Park and crosses 8 Mile in a way that I think supports the COIs that we've heard from before.

In this one the District 7 also includes Berkeley and Huntington Woods with District 7. And then Royal Oak is with District 8. Along with Troy and the west side of Sterling Heights. District 10 the final VRA District includes the northeast portion of Detroit along with all of Warren. Centerline and East Point. As well as a little portion of Roseville.

If we go to District 2, so this is once again a Dearborn centered District comprised of Dearborn, Dearborn Heights and Melvindale encompassing the Middle Eastern COI. It

also includes Allen Park. And in this one it doesn't include Lincoln Park but instead includes more of Warren Dale and a little bit of Detroit on that northern portion.

The District 4, in this map, so a lot of the ones we have seen before Taylor has been whole and Romulus has been split. In this one it's kind of opposite Romulus is whole, but Taylor is split. It is split right along the highway there, highway 24. And it incorporates the east side of Taylor, the rest of the Down River community south of Lincoln Park and Ecorse and goes westward to include Van Buren, Belleville and Sumpter townships. District 5 includes all of Romulus as well as Canton, Inkster, and goes north into Plymouth.

District 6 is once again a little bit more Livonia centered includes Livonia, the parts of Westland that were not included in District 5. Garden City. And Northville.

We talked about districts 7, 8 and 10. You've seen that same District 9 configuration as some of the other collaborative maps including Pontiac, Rochester, Rochester Hills and Bloomfield and Bloomfield Hills. This one also includes Birmingham with District 9. The District 11 here, so I'll talk about District 12 first. District 12 still has that lakeshore COI but it's slightly different. Includes Roseville with that COI and I believe a little bit more of Mount Clemens than the original Linden map did. To make up for that District 11, which borders District 12, and which borders the Lake, that includes the east side of Sterling Heights as well as Fraser, up to Chesterfield. The remaining population around District 12. Then I think there is a little difference in 13. It's similar to some of the other collaborative maps in that it has the greater West Bloomfield area along with Farmington and Farmington Hills being whole. And put in with Novi, Commerce and Walled Lake and also includes just a small portion of Southfield. This map changes 14 districts from the original Linden map. Four varied districts we spoke about. Do we want to pull up the partisan fairness numbers?

>>.

>> MR. MORGAN: This is 395. So lopsided margins are 5.0 towards republican. The mean median difference is 1.3 republican. Efficiency gap is 1.9 republican. The seats votes ratio is 21 democrat, 17 republican. With 2.4 bias towards democrats.

>> CHAIR EID: Wonderful. Thank you for that, John. That finishes up the collaborative maps. And we've already heard from Commissioners Orton and Lange for the individual. For the individual maps we still have Commissioner Wagner, Szetela, Kellom and Curry. Commissioner Lange?

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Yes I just wanted to say I've been in touch with Commissioner Wagner and Commissioner Szetela and unfortunately due to circumstances out of their control they cannot be here. I don't think anybody could do their maps due Justice like they can and so they requested that if the public would like an in-depth explanation of their maps that they could go to the previous U tube video and rewatch that and it will be explained perfectly to them. So I guess basically there's no need to present them.



>> CHAIR EID: All right, and you know they have presented it two other times earlier this morning and twice last week, so I do recommend that folks who want to see that please go watch the archive. It can be found on our YouTube channel.

Okay, then let's bring up Commissioner Kellom's map.

>> MR. MORGAN: This is Commissioner Kellom's map. Number 403 on the portal.

>> CHAIR EID: All right, so we are looking at now is the map that Commissioner Kellom submitted. It was originally the Phoenix collaborative map, which was kind of based on hummingbird and Herron and flamingo, but she wanted to submit it as an individual Commissioner. So that's what we are looking at now.

It has some similarities to some things we have seen before. And some changes elsewhere. For that District 1 we kind of have that stacked configuration that we saw in Herron where it starts in the Down River communities and does go a little further in this one taking in most of Allen Park. And then going up through Ecorse and River Rouge. Up through the Detroit river. Not going quite far north as we have seen some of the other districts stopping below Highland Park and Hamtramck. Then going up to the east side of Detroit including East English Village. District 8 is then stacked right on top of it. It includes Highland Park and Hamtramck. As well as the rest of that Central/northern Detroit area, stopping at 8 Mile Road. District 6 then includes Livonia, Redford, and the some of the west side of Detroit neighborhoods. Where District 3 then includes Farmington, Farmington Hills, Southfield, Oak Park and a portion of northwest Detroit.

Those four, 1, 8, 6 and 3, are the VRA districts in this map. If we look at District 2, this is similar to the District 2 found in Herron although this includes Melvindale there. And because Allen Park and Lincoln Park are in District 1, this configuration goes west to include Inkster and Garden City. It also includes parts of Warren Dale. If we go south to districts 4 and 5, this is also similar to Herron but it's a little different in that both Romulus and Taylor are whole here. And in order to do that you have this C-shape with District 5 that includes Canton, Van Buren, Sumpter, and Huron. Along with Westland and Wayne.

Whereas the District 4 has Romulus, Taylor, both being whole. And then the rest of the Down River communities south, up through Monroe.

If we go north into Oakland County, we spoke about three. Can you Zoom in there on 3 and 10? So three ends at Oak Park and Royal Oak Township. Ten then includes some of those Oakland county townships that we've spoken about like Berkeley, Huntington Woods and Royal Oak. As well as Ferndale and Hazel Park. And goes eastward into Warren where most of Warren is in District 10 along with Centerline.

For District 7, there is a little bit of a change here. Instead of it being Pontiac going south into Bloomfield and Bloomfield Hills and including Rochester Hills, this now includes Waterford, so one Township west. The District 9 is similar to the original Linden configuration having that split in Sterling Heights around Van Dyke encompassing that west side of Sterling heights, Chaldean COI, with Troy and

Rochester and Rochester Hills. Only it doesn't go as far north into Oakland as it did previously.

The District 12 is mostly the same as the original Linden configuration. However, there are two neighborhoods of Detroit that are adjacent to Grosse Pointe park, being the Jefferson Chalmers area. That is also attached. And also along the river.

District 11 then includes the remainder of Sterling Heights. So the east side. That is not included in District 9. And then the rest of this area that's not included in District 12, East Point, Roseville and Fraser.

If we look at District 13, it is quite similar to the original Linden configuration. I'm not sure if there is any change here. If there is then I think it does add a little more of Commerce and Wixom into 13 but it primarily has the greater West Bloomfield area going south through Commerce into Novi, Northville and Plymouth.

Then in order to account for those changes in 7 and 9, we rearranged some of the counties in Oakland County in 23 and 24. Similar to how they're configured in Crane.

This map changes 14 districts when compared to Linden. So a few more I think 23 and 24 are changed.

And if you want to pull up the partisan fairness?

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay this is 403. The lopsided margin is 3.8 for republican. Mean median difference is 1.5 republican. Efficiency gap is 0.8 for democrats. Seats vote ratio is 22 democrat to 16 republican with a 5.0 bias towards democrats.

>> CHAIR EID: Wonderful. All right, I think that covers this map. And that's all of them. Once again I'd recommend the public go back and watch the earlier meeting or last week's meeting to get a presentation on the remaining individual Commissioners' maps.

>> MR. MORGAN: Did you want to do Commissioner Curry's map?

>> CHAIR EID: No. I was, the public can go watch her do it herself. I don't think I can do her map justice.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay.

>> CHAIR EID: Okay, so that concludes the presentation of the maps. I'd like to thank Mr. Morgan for helping out us out with that. And without objection we will begin this evening's public comment and question-and-answer portion of this town hall.

Is there any objections, Commissioners?

Hearing none we will proceed. Individuals who have signed up or raised their hand and indicated they would like to provide remote public commentary or questions to the Commission will now be allowed. I will call your name and our staff will unmute you. If you are on a computer you will be prompted by the Zoom app to unmute your microphone and speak. If you are on the phone a voice will say the host wants you to speak and prompt you to press star 6 to unmute. I will call you by your name or the last four digits of your phone number. Please note if you do not -- please note if you are experiencing technical or audio issues or we do not hear from you from three to five

seconds we will move on to the next person in line then return to you after they are done speaking. If your audio still does not work you can e-mail [redistricting@Michigan.gov](mailto:redistricting@Michigan.gov) and help you trouble shoot to participate at the next meeting. You will have 90 seconds and please conclude your remarks when you hear the timer.

We have two folks who signed up in advance for public comments. And we have a few more that are in the waiting room. The first being Fatima-Din.

>> Hi everyone. This is Fatima-Din, organizer in Warren. During my review of the Senate State Senate maps I'm trying to seek out which will be the most fair and serve.

>> MEGHAN SCHAAR: Sorry, Fatima I just muted you because we are having a very difficult time hearing you. So that the public on YouTube can hear you and our interpreters and translators. So if you don't mind when you unmute yourself starting again and trying to speak a little bit louder into your microphone if possible. Thank you.

>> Absolutely. Is this better? Great, I will continue unless I'm stopped otherwise for audio issues hi my name is Fatima-Din community organizer and Pakistan resident in Warren. During my review of the State Senate maps I'm trying to seek out which would be most fair and serve my communities and BIPOC communities best as much as a lay person can understand all the metrics and complex implications of these maps any ways. Based on what I've been seeing, reading and understanding it currently seems map 374 the Huron map with partisan fairness with 404 as a close seconds and I believe it is part of the communities I'm with geographically and specifically leading to fair maps. I lived in the edge of Warren and Sterling Heights so a lot of my life overlapped among the two cities. That is why in the Huron map I feel it makes sense to pair it for that and appreciate both maps have a Hamtramck mostly together and other BIPOC communities kept together. In the 374 Huron map it would have been great to keep all of Warren together but considering the stats are showing partisan fairness it makes sense. And for the 404 map 14 Mile Road makes sense for Royal Oak so we do a lot of commuting back and forth and my understanding is people could be working in Warren but living in Royal Oak. So I see how both maps are beneficial. And appreciate your guys' work. Thank you.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you for addressing the Commission. Next is Mr. James Gallant.

>> Hello James Gallant Marquette, Marquette county suicide prevention coalitions these are my opinions. Chair Eid please answer my questions on the process of parliamentary procedure. You said you had no hands raised earlier when I had questions in the Q and A why do you continue not to follow the rules of procedure as Robert's Rules of Order as instructed by Mike Brady the director of legal services for the department at the first meeting. Secretary Benson why is she not here? In her personal letter in the orientation terms she said she signed the letter I am the secretary. I will be being secretary at the meetings, she said that. Now, this is just completely out

of control man. You have no pending motion now. And can you answer about the procedure processes and why you're not following it because this does seem like you all are colluding behind the scenes to circumvent our Constitution and oath of office, a RICO act violation if I heard it, Trump for RICO stuff but it's you right here. It's a good process you people do not understand the rules. Mike Brady had done a disservice to the state by not providing you with a rule book at the first meeting. Everybody he said did not follow Robert's Rules and did not give you a rule book but a nonprofit cheat sheet in the subcommittee to hire Hammersmith had no public experience all nonprofit and you institutionalize Marxist style Communism because you don't know what will happen next. No semblance of order and made decisions by unanimous...

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, Mr. Gallant, always appreciate your passionate comments.

That completes the list of people who have signed up in advance to speak. I do see a hand in the participants' lobby. I think that is Anthony Scannell. It's Anthony S.

>> Thank you so much, Michigan Commission. And I'm going to this Michigan Central whatever thing they got some tickets, got a day off work why not, got some tickets so that will be interesting. And got to head down there. And I'm looking at the maps again I think good okay and bad I'd say good, Curry Orton, grain okay, Lange Wagner Szetela Kellom and bad Finch Herron Starling and all the other birds except Crane in my opinion. And I'm really interested in all the process items that James Gallant has brought up about should there be a motion to I don't know motion to consider. He says that is not an order so I don't know what the correct motion would be to consider these maps, but I'm interested in what he has to say more. And thank you very much, talk next time.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, Mr. Scannell. I'm headed there too after this. Maybe I will see you there. Great event for Detroit today, the grand opening of the train station. Historic day in our City and in our state.

I don't see anybody else who would like to provide comment. We will be here until 7:30. As long as you're online before then we will make time to hear from you. I'd also like to take this time to just reiterate that we have in-person public hearings next week. We are trying to hit the major DPS high schools. We will be meeting over there on Thursday, I'm sorry, Tuesday, June 11, Wednesday, June 12 and Thursday June 13th. On Tuesday June 11th we will be at Detroit Cass tech high school. 2501 Second Avenue, Detroit, Michigan, 48201. On Wednesday, June 12th we will be at Martin Luther King high school. 3200 East Lafayette Street, Detroit Michigan 48207. And on Thursday, June 13th we will be at Renaissance high school, 6565 Outer Drive, Detroit, Michigan, 48235.

At these meetings the Commission will be there from 10:00 a.m. to 7:00 p.m. and really encourage folks to come out in person and provide comments. We will have large hard copies of blow ups of all the different mapping configurations as well as the original

Linden map. And the old map drawn by the legislature during the 2010 census cycle. That way you can do a comparison, in person, and maybe after looking at them let us know exactly what you have to think. So once again please join us Tuesday, June 11, Wednesday June 12 and Thursday June 13. Show up, speak up. Since I see no hands right now, we will take a break. We will come back at let's say 7:15. And I will see you all then.

[ Recess until 7:15 p.m. ]

>> CHAIR EID: All right everyone it's 7:15 and we are back. Has anyone joined who would like to provide comment the Commission? Well, it doesn't look like we had anyone new join. I do see James Gallant has his hand up. But he already spoke once. And today we are having one turn per speaker.

And I don't see anybody else who wants to have any input. Mr. Woods, do you have anything for tonight?

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Thank you, Commissioner Eid. I think you covered everything with the upcoming public hearings and locations. So with regards to everyone being there. So I appreciate that.

>> CHAIR EID: For sure why don't we plug it just one more time.

>> MR. EDWARD WOODS: Sure, let me share my screen. Just a second. All right ladies and gentlemen, on Tuesday, June 11th we will be at Detroit Cass tech high school, Detroit Cass tech high school, that will take place from 10-12:30. There will be a lunch break from 12:30 to 1:30 and 1:30 to 3:00 and come back and take a break 3-4 and come back 4-7. Cass tech is located at 2501 Second Avenue in Detroit, Michigan. Tuesday June 11th. Wednesday June 12 at Martin Luther King high school at 3200 East Lafayette Street in Detroit Michigan. Once again Wednesday June 12 we will be at Martin Luther King high school 3200 East Lafayette Street in Detroit Michigan. You see the times are the same for the public hearings on each and every one of those days. Than last but not least on Thursday June 13 at Renaissance high school located 6565 West Outer Drive for these public hearings. Once again we want to make a big push, I repeat a big push to get each and every one of you to come out and if you cannot come in person consider signing up remotely or if you can't sign up remotely please fill in the comments in the public comment portal off of the Commission's or mapping comment portal and that is at [www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC). Thank you so much.

>> CHAIR EID: Thank you, Mr. Woods. Well, seeing as we don't have any one new we will conclude the public comment period for this evening. Please feel free to e-mail at [redistricting.gov](mailto:redistricting.gov) or visit our website [www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC). To use the public comment portal and we look forward to hearing your thoughts and appreciate everyone who offer public comment in whatever way you choose. I'll allow you to keep sharing your thoughts especially in person next week during the in-person public hearings. Are through announcements or acknowledgments tonight? Okay, well, on behalf of the Commission, I would like to express my appreciation to all those that made this virtual



DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

town hall meeting possible. And that includes all of our partners including EDS, Michigan Department of State, regional department network, Q and A reporting. All of our translators, everyone that helps us, you know, keep this thing going in a smooth fashion, we appreciate you. So it's a team effort and it can't happen without all members of the team being on top of their game. So I appreciate y'all. And most importantly I appreciate the public for engaging, for learning about these maps and trying to participate to ensure that we have a fair democracy here in Michigan. And ensure we have fair maps. Please enjoy the rest of the day. We will see you all next week on June 11th. Good night everyone.