

# Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission

In Person Public Hearing with Virtual Zoom Webinar. Full agenda, presentations, and video recordings are available at [www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC)

**Monday, June 24, 2024**  
**Detroit Marriot Southfield**  
**27033 Northwestern Highway,**  
**Southfield, MI 48034**  
**10:05 a.m.- 4:59 p.m.**

## MINUTES

### **PRESENT**

Elaine Andrade  
Donna Callaghan (*remotely from Mexico*)  
Juanita Curry  
Anthony Eid  
Brittini Kellom (*remotely from Detroit, MI*)  
Rhonda Lange (*remotely from Reed City, MI*)  
Steven Terry Lett  
Marcus Muldoon  
Cynthia Orton  
Rebecca Szetela (*remotely from Wayne County, MI*)  
Janice Vallette  
Erin Wagner (*remotely from Eaton Township, MI, left at 2:17 p.m., rejoined at 3:27 p.m.*)  
Richard Weiss

### **ABSENT**

None

### **OTHERS PRESENT**

Edward Woods III, Executive Director  
Michigan Department of State (“MDOS”) Staff  
Nate Fink, Fink Bressack  
Kim Brace, Election Data Services (“EDS”)  
John Morgan, EDS  
Dr. Lisa Handley  
Dr. Maxwell Palmer  
Mark Braden, Baker Hostetler  
Richard Raile, Baker Hostetler  
Thomas Ivacko, University of Michigan Center for Local, State and Urban Policy

Edward Pault, University of Michigan Center for Local, State and Urban Policy  
Elizabeth Gelman, University of Michigan Center for Local, State and Urban Policy

### **CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME**

Commissioner Eid, Chair, called the meeting of the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission (MICRC) to order at 10:05 a.m.

### **ROLL CALL**

MDOS staff called roll. A quorum was met.

### **ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

**MOTION:** Approve the agenda. Moved by Commissioner Lett. Supported by Commissioner Orton. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote on the motion to approve the agenda, by show of hands. **MOTION APPROVED.**

### **PUBLIC COMMENT PERTAINING TO AGENDA TOPICS**

Commissioner Eid, Chair, put a motion “to begin public comment pertaining to agenda topics portion of the agenda” forward without objection, which was adopted.

Three individuals provided remote public comment: Yousif Yousif, James Gallant, and Anthony Scannell.

A complete inventory of live and written public comment is available at:  
[www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC).

### **NEW BUSINESS**

- a. Review of Court order and Seven-ranked redistricting criteria  
Commissioner Eid, Chair, requested that Nate Fink and Richard Raile facilitate this topic. Richard Raile informed the Commission that while reviewing the proposed draft senate remedial maps they should review the core retention data specifically for the districts that were struck down by the court. Richard Raile also provided an overview of the seven-ranked redistricting criteria that the senate remedial map will be evaluated based upon.
- b. Voting Rights Act Compliance  
Commissioner Eid, Chair, requested that Mark Braden facilitate this topic. Mark Braden provided the Commission a legal analysis on the Voting Rights Act compliance of the proposed draft senate remedial maps. Dr. Maxwell Palmer provided an updated statistical analysis regarding the VRA performance of the 12 draft senate remedial maps.

c. Partisan Fairness

Commissioner Eid, Chair, requested that Dr. Lisa Handley facilitate this topic. Dr. Handley provided the Commission an updated analysis on the partisan fairness metrics of the proposed draft senate remedial maps.

d. Public Comments Analysis

Commissioner Eid, Chair, requested that Executive Director Woods facilitate this topic. Executive Director Woods indicated the University of Michigan Center for Local, State and Urban Policy provided an updated report aggregating and analyzing the public comments submitted to the Commission. Executive Director Woods turned it over to Edward Plaut and Elizabeth Gelman who provided an overview of their analysis.

**MOTION:** Recess until 2 p.m. Moved by Commissioner Lett. Supported by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by show of hands. **MOTION APPROVED.**

Commission recessed at 12:50 p.m. Commissioner Eid, Chair, called the meeting back to order at 2:09 p.m. and requested a roll call.

MDOS staff called roll. A quorum was met.

| <u>Commissioner</u> | <u>Roll Call</u> |
|---------------------|------------------|
| Elaine Andrade      | Present          |
| Donna Callaghan     | Present          |
| Juanita Curry       | Present          |
| Anthony Eid         | Present          |
| Brittni Kellom      | Present          |
| Rhonda Lange        | Present          |
| Steve Lett          | Present          |
| Marcus Muldoon      | Present          |
| Cynthia Orton       | Present          |
| Rebecca Szetela     | Present          |
| Janice Vallette     | Present          |
| Erin Wagner         | Present          |
| Richard Weiss       | Present          |

**NEW BUSINESS**

e. Senate Mapping Deliberations

Commissioner Eid, Chair, facilitated this topic. The Commission reviewed the 12 proposed draft senate remedial maps and considered minor changes that were the logical outgrowth of public comment.

**MOTION:** Accept Commissioner Muldoon’s Amendment to Crane, as drawn in Crane A1 (changes to District 1 and 4). Moved by Commissioner Lett. Seconded by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Eid, chair, held a roll call vote. By a vote of **12-0**, **MOTION APPROVED**.

| <u>Commissioner</u> | <u>Vote</u> |
|---------------------|-------------|
| Elaine Andrade      | Yes         |
| Donna Callaghan     | Yes         |
| Juanita Curry       | Yes         |
| Anthony Eid         | Yes         |
| Brittini Kellom     | Yes         |
| Rhonda Lange        | Yes         |
| Steve Lett          | Yes         |
| Marcus Muldoon      | Yes         |
| Cynthia Orton       | Yes         |
| Rebecca Szetela     | Yes         |
| Janice Vallette     | Yes         |
| Richard Weiss       | Yes         |

**MOTION:** Accept Commissioner Eid’s Amendments to Crane A1, as drawn in Crane A2 (changes to Districts 8, 9, 10, 13, 23, and 24). Moved by Commissioner Lett. Seconded by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Eid, chair, held a roll call vote. By a vote of **9-2**, **MOTION APPROVED**.

| <u>Commissioner</u> | <u>Vote</u> |
|---------------------|-------------|
| Elaine Andrade      | Yes         |
| Donna Callaghan     | Yes         |
| Juanita Curry       | Yes         |
| Anthony Eid         | Yes         |
| Rhonda Lange        | No          |
| Steve Lett          | Yes         |

|                        |            |
|------------------------|------------|
| <b>Marcus Muldoon</b>  | <b>Yes</b> |
| <b>Cynthia Orton</b>   | <b>Yes</b> |
| <b>Rebecca Szetela</b> | <b>No</b>  |
| <b>Janice Vallette</b> | <b>Yes</b> |
| <b>Richard Weiss</b>   | <b>Yes</b> |

**MOTION:** Accept Commissioner Eid’s Amendments to Crane A2, as drawn in Crane A3 (changes to Districts 7, 13, and 23). Moved by Commissioner Lett. Seconded by Commissioner Muldoon. Commissioner Eid, chair, held a roll call vote. By a vote of **9-3, MOTION APPROVED.**

| <u><b>Commissioner</b></u> | <u><b>Vote</b></u> |
|----------------------------|--------------------|
| <b>Elaine Andrade</b>      | <b>Yes</b>         |
| <b>Donna Callaghan</b>     | <b>Yes</b>         |
| <b>Anthony Eid</b>         | <b>Yes</b>         |
| <b>Brittini Kellom</b>     | <b>Yes</b>         |
| <b>Rhonda Lange</b>        | <b>No</b>          |
| <b>Steve Lett</b>          | <b>Yes</b>         |
| <b>Marcus Muldoon</b>      | <b>Yes</b>         |
| <b>Cynthia Orton</b>       | <b>Yes</b>         |
| <b>Rebecca Szetela</b>     | <b>No</b>          |
| <b>Janice Vallette</b>     | <b>Yes</b>         |
| <b>Erin Wagner</b>         | <b>No</b>          |
| <b>Richard Weiss</b>       | <b>Yes</b>         |

**MOTION:** Send Crane A1, Crane A2, Crane A3, and Heron A1 to the Commission’s attorneys for review and analysis, and to allow a live public comment from a participant in the audience. Moved by Commissioner Lett. Seconded by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by show of hands. **MOTION APPROVED.**

**PUBLIC COMMENT PERTAINING TO AGENDA TOPICS**

One individual provided in-person public comment: Douglas A. Geiss.

**ADJOURNMENT**

**MOTION:** Adjourn the Meeting. Moved by Commissioner Lett. Supported by Commissioner Vallette. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by show of hands.  
**MOTION APPROVED.**

The meeting was adjourned at 4:59 p.m.