

# Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission

In Person Public Hearing with Virtual Zoom Webinar. Full agenda, presentations, and video recordings are available at [www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC)

**Wednesday, June 26, 2024**  
**Detroit Marriot Southfield**  
**27033 Northwestern Highway,**  
**Southfield, MI 48034**  
**10:05 a.m.- 4:31 p.m.**

## MINUTES

### **PRESENT**

Elaine Andrade  
Donna Callaghan (*remotely from Mexico*)  
Juanita Curry  
Anthony Eid  
Brittni Kellom (*remotely from Detroit, MI, joined in person at 10:16 a.m.*)  
Rhonda Lange (*remotely from Reed City, MI*)  
Steven Terry Lett  
Marcus Muldoon  
Cynthia Orton  
Rebecca Szetela (*remotely from Wayne County, MI*)  
Janice Vallette  
Erin Wagner (*remotely from Charlotte, MI*)  
Richard Weiss

### **ABSENT**

None.

### **OTHERS PRESENT**

Edward Woods III, Executive Director  
Michigan Department of State (“MDOS”) Staff  
Nate Fink, Fink Bressack  
Kim Brace, Election Data Services (“EDS”)  
John Morgan, EDS  
Dr. Maxwell Palmer  
Mark Braden, Baker Hostetler

### **CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME**

Commissioner Eid, Chair, called the meeting of the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission (MICRC) to order at 10:05 a.m.

## **ROLL CALL**

MDOS staff called roll. A quorum was met.

## **ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

**MOTION:** Approve the agenda. Moved by Commissioner Lett. Supported by Commissioner Muldoon. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by show of hands.

**MOTION APPROVED.**

## **PUBLIC COMMENT PERTAINING TO AGENDA TOPICS**

Commissioner Eid, Chair, put a motion “to begin public comment pertaining to agenda topics portion of the agenda” forward without objection, which was adopted.

Nine individual provided in-person public comment: Melinda Billingsley, Sarah Prescott, Darwin Griffin, Brittany Washington, Norm Clement, Joan Gist, Wayne, Lorenbell Kossa, and Gary Moorehead.

Forty individuals provided remote public comment: James Gallant, Yousif Yousif, Dylan Linklater, Nour Almahameed, Alex King, Kermit Williams, Omar Jazaerly, Taaha Najam, Alex McGuire, Renee Rapley, Madison Steigerwald, Kenya Willard, Mercedes C. Douglass, Aaron Mahoney, David Bell, Mari Rymar, Kyle Stefanski, Jamie Roe, Tracy Pease, Sherry Gay-Dagnogo, Mary Ann Fontana, Cameron Edward, Lori Boyce, Linda Kahn Gale, Judy Maiga, Karen Schaeffer, Virgil Smith, Nomi Joyrich, Aaron Martinez, Ginny Preuss, Angela Davenport, Nancy T., Paula Smith, Pam Powell, Andrea Thompson, Sheree Goodman, Kris McLonis, Oscar Castaneda, Michael Davis, and Scot A. Reynolds.

A complete inventory of live and written public comment is available at:  
[www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC).

**MOTION:** Reopen public comment to allow two individuals affected by a technical glitch (preventing their name from being visible in the attendee list) to speak. Moved by Commissioner Lett. Supported by Commissioner Muldoon. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by show of hands. **MOTION APPROVED.**

## **PUBLIC COMMENT PERTAINING TO AGENDA TOPICS**

Two individuals provided remote public comment: Anthony Scannell, and Jonathan C. Kinloch.

A complete inventory of live and written public comment is available at:  
[www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC).

## **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

- a. Senate Mapping Deliberations

Commissioner Eid, Chair, facilitated a discussion offering the opportunity for each Commissioner to express which maps they prefer and why.

**MOTION:** Recess for 30 minutes (until 2:02 p.m.). Moved by Commissioner Lett. Supported by Commissioner Kellom. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by show of hands. **MOTION APPROVED.**

Commission recessed at 1:32 p.m. Commissioner Eid, Chair, called the meeting back to order at 2:50 p.m. and requested a roll call.

MDOS staff called roll. A quorum was met.

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Roll Call</u>
Elaine Andrade	Present
Donna Callaghan	Present
Juanita Curry	Present
Anthony Eid	Present
Brittini Kellom	Present
Rhonda Lange	Present
Steve Lett	Present
Marcus Muldoon	Present
Cynthia Orton	Present
Rebecca Szetela	Present
Janice Vallette	Present
Erin Wagner	Present
Richard Weiss	Present

Commissioner Eid, Chair, resumed facilitating a discussion of the proposed draft senate remedial maps, offering the opportunity for each Commissioner to express which maps they prefer and why.

Commissioner Eid, Chair, called for a motion for the Secretary to conduct a roll call vote for the final selection of a final remedial state senate plan to submit to the District Court pursuant to the District Court's Order in the Agee, et al v. Benson, et al matter.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Lett moved for the 4th vote for final selection of a final remedial State Senate plan to move forward to the U.S. District Court for the Western District of Michigan in the *Agee* litigation, as the constitutional majority was not met in

Vote #3 to approve a plan. Seconded by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a roll call vote.

By a vote of **8-3-2**, **MOTION FAILS**.

The political party affiliation vote breakdown is as follows:

- 1 Democratic vote for Crane A1
- 4 Republican votes for Crane A1
- 3 unaffiliated votes for Crane A1
- 2 Democratic votes for Kellom
- 1 unaffiliated vote for Kellom
- 1 Democratic vote for Szetela v3
- 1 unaffiliated vote for Szetela v3

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote by Stating Name Of Map</u>
<b>Elaine Andrade (D)</b>	<b>Kellom</b>
<b>Donna Callaghan (D)</b>	<b>Szetela v3</b>
<b>Juanita Curry (D)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Anthony Eid (U)</b>	<b>Kellom</b>
<b>Brittini Kellom (D)</b>	<b>Kellom</b>
<b>Rhonda Lange (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Steve Lett (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Marcus Muldoon (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Cynthia Orton (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Rebecca Szetela (U)</b>	<b>Szetela v3</b>
<b>Janice Vallette (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Erin Wagner (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Richard Weiss (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>

**MOTION:** For the Secretary to conduct a 5th vote for the final selection of a final remedial state senate plan to submit to the District Court pursuant to the District Court's Order in the Agee, et al v. Benson, et al matter. Moved by Commissioner Szetela. Seconded by Commissioner Wagner. Commissioner Eid, Chair, ruled the **MOTION RULED OUT OF ORDER**.

**MOTION:** To appeal the decision of the chair ruling the motion out of order. Moved by Commissioner Szetela. Seconded by Commissioner Wagner. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a roll call vote. By a vote of **2-10-1**, **MOTION FAILED**.

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	No
Donna Callaghan	No
Juanita Curry	No
Anthony Eid	Abstain
Brittini Kellom	No
Rhonda Lange	No
Steve Lett	No
Marcus Muldoon	No
Cynthia Orton	No
Rebecca Szetela	Yes
Janice Vallette	No
Erin Wagner	Yes
Richard Weiss	No

Commissioner Eid, Chair, resumed facilitating a discussion of the proposed draft senate remedial maps, offering the opportunity for each Commissioner to express which maps they prefer and why.

Commissioner Eid, Chair, again called for a motion for the Secretary to conduct a roll call vote for the final selection of a final remedial state senate plan to submit to the District Court pursuant to the District Court's Order in the Agee, et al v. Benson, et al matter.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Lett moved for the 5<sup>th</sup> vote for final selection of a final remedial State Senate plan to move forward to the U.S. District Court for the Western District of Michigan in the *Agee* litigation, as the constitutional majority was not met in Vote #4 to approve a plan. Seconded by Commissioner Lange. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a roll call vote.

By a vote of **8-3-1**, **MOTION FAILS.**

The political party affiliation vote breakdown is as follows:

- 1 Democratic vote for Crane A1
- 4 Republican votes for Crane A1
- 4 unaffiliated votes for Crane A1
- 3 Democratic votes for Kellom

1 unaffiliated vote for Szetela v3

<b><u>Commissioner</u></b>	<b><u>Vote by Stating Name Of Map</u></b>
<b>Elaine Andrade (D)</b>	<b>Kellom</b>
<b>Donna Callaghan (D)</b>	<b>Kellom</b>
<b>Juanita Curry (D)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Anthony Eid (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Brittini Kellom (D)</b>	<b>Kellom</b>
<b>Rhonda Lange (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Steve Lett (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Marcus Muldoon (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Cynthia Orton (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Rebecca Szetela (U)</b>	<b>Szetela v3</b>
<b>Janice Vallette (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Erin Wagner (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Richard Weiss (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>

The Commission proceeded to the Ranked Voting process, as described in article IV, section 6, subsection 14 of the Michigan Constitution, for the final selection of a final remedial State Senate plan to move forward to the U.S. District Court for the Western District of Michigan in the *Agee* litigation, as the constitutional majority was not met in Vote #5 to approve a plan.

The Commissioners each had the opportunity to submit one Draft Proposed Map for consideration in the Ranked Voting process.

<b><u>Commissioner</u></b>	<b><u>Name of Map Submitted for Ranked Voting</u></b>
<b>Elaine Andrade (D)</b>	<b>Kellom</b>
<b>Donna Callaghan (D)</b>	<b>Kellom</b>
<b>Juanita Curry (D)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Anthony Eid (U)</b>	<b>Kellom</b>
<b>Brittini Kellom (D)</b>	<b>Kellom</b>
<b>Rhonda Lange (R)</b>	<b>Lange</b>
<b>Steve Lett (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Marcus Muldoon (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>

<b>Cynthia Orton (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Rebecca Szetela (U)</b>	<b>Szetela v3</b>
<b>Janice Vallette (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Erin Wagner (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Richard Weiss (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>

A Microsoft Form was created live during the public session while screen sharing. The form contained all names of Draft Proposed Maps submitted, pursuant to Step 3(A) of the Ranked Voting process, for Commissioners to rank in order of preference, with number 1 being most preferred, and the last ranked plan being least preferred.

Once created, the Secretary sent an email to each of the Commissioners containing a link to the form.

Each Commissioner’s ranked voting results were read aloud and audibly confirmed on the record. The Ranked Voting results were as follows.

<b><u>Commissioner</u></b>	<b><u>Ranked Voting Order</u></b> <b><u>(first listed being most preferred)</u></b>
<b>Elaine Andrade (D)</b>	<b>Kellom, Crane A1, Szetela v3, Lange</b>
<b>Donna Callaghan (D)</b>	<b>Kellom, Szetela v3, Lange, Crane A1</b>
<b>Juanita Curry (D)</b>	<b>Crane A1, Szetela v3, Lange, Kellom</b>
<b>Anthony Eid (U)</b>	<b>Kellom, Crane A1, Szetela v3, Lange</b>
<b>Brittni Kellom (D)</b>	<b>Kellom, Szetela v3, Lange, Crane A1</b>
<b>Rhonda Lange (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1, Lange, Szetela v3, Kellom</b>
<b>Steve Lett (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1, Kellom, Szetela v3, Lange</b>
<b>Marcus Muldoon (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1, Kellom, Lange, Szetela v3</b>
<b>Cynthia Orton (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1, Lange, Szetela v3, Kellom</b>
<b>Rebecca Szetela (U)</b>	<b>Szetela v3, Crane A1, Lange, Kellom</b>
<b>Janice Vallette (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1, Lange, Szetela v3, Kellom</b>
<b>Erin Wagner (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1, Lange, Szetela v3, Kellom</b>
<b>Richard Weiss (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1, Lange, Szetela v3, Kellom</b>

Crane A1 received the highest total points (43 points), and was also ranked among the top half of plans by at least two Commissioners not affiliated with the party of the Commissioner submitting the plan, or in the case of a plan submitted by non-affiliated Commissioners, is

ranked among the top half of plans by at least two Commissioners affiliated with a major party. The Commission confirmed Crane A1's compliance with this requirement based on Commissioner Curry, Democrat, submitting the Crane A1 plan for consideration during ranked choice, and the plan being ranked in the top half of plans as ranked by four Commissioners affiliating as Republican and five Commissioners not affiliating with a major party.

The Crane A1 plan moves forward to the U.S. District Court for the Western District of Michigan in the *Agee* litigation.

**MOTION:** To table the remaining agenda items for today and adjourn after Announcements. Moved by Commissioner Lett. Seconded by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote, on the motion to table the remaining agenda items, by show of hands. **MOTION APPROVED.**

### **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

For the record, Executive Director Woods and Commissioners extended their appreciation to the vendors, MICRC Staff, and MDOS for adjusting their schedules to conduct in-person meetings this week.

The following individuals and organizations were recognized: Bethnay and Rebecca at Regional Interpreting Network for sign language; Annette Blough at QA captions for closed captioning; Michigan Department of State Team—Mike Brady, Sarah Reinhardt, Megan Scharr, Yvonne Young, and Erin Lillie for their work; Chase Creative—Mary Pratt, Alex, Matt, and Andrea for the audio visual and live streaming assistance; and the public for being engaged; and Kristin Taylor for logistics as the Event Planner/Administrative Assistant for MICRC.

Executive Director thanked the Commission individually and collectively. It's been an honor to work for the Commission in the purest form of democracy. We showed that democracy can happen for the people, by the people, with the people through 13 distinguished Commissioners as well as those who left us prior to. So in addition to Commissioner Marcus Muldoon, Commissioner Richard Weiss, Commissioner Juanita Curry, Commissioner Elaine Andrade, Cynthia Orton and Commissioner Janice Vallette and Anthony Eid and Commissioner Steven Lett and Commissioner Brittini Kellom and Commissioner Rhonda Lange and Donna Callaghan and Commissioner Erin Wagner and Commissioner Rebecca Szetela and thank the three former Commissioners and shout out to Doug Clark's family, MC Rothhorn, and Commissioner Dustin Witjes for an opportunity of a lifetime. Thank you so much.

Commissioner Brittini Kellom and the Commission joined to thank Executive Director Edward Woods III.



Commissioner Steve Lett, Executive Director Woods, and the Commission joined to thank Nate Fink and David Fink of Fink Bressack; Baker Hostetler, and John Morgan, Kent Stigall, Kim Brace, and Ryan Taylor of Election Data Services for their legal advice or mapping assistance.

Executive Director Woods and the Commission also expressed gratitude to the Voting Rights Act team of Mark Braden, Taylor Thompson, and Dr. Maxwell Palmer. In addition, they also thanked Dr. Lisa Handley for her partisan fairness analysis.

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

**MOTION:** Commissioner Lett moved to Adjourn the Meeting. Seconded by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by show of hands.

**MOTION APPROVED.**

The meeting was adjourned at 4:31 p.m.