

# Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission

In Person Public Hearing with Virtual Zoom Webinar. Full agenda, presentations, and video recordings are available at [www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC)

**Tuesday, June 25, 2024**  
**Detroit Marriot Southfield**  
**27033 Northwestern Highway,**  
**Southfield, MI 48034**  
**10:06 a.m.- 6:27 p.m.**

## MINUTES

### **PRESENT**

Elaine Andrade  
Donna Callaghan (*remotely from Mexico*)  
Juanita Curry  
Anthony Eid  
Brittini Kellom (*joined at 2:27 p.m.*)  
Rhonda Lange (*remotely from Reed City, MI*)  
Steven Terry Lett  
Marcus Muldoon  
Cynthia Orton  
Rebecca Szetela (*remotely from Wayne County, MI*)  
Janice Vallette  
Erin Wagner (*remotely from Charlotte, MI*)  
Richard Weiss

### **ABSENT**

None.

### **OTHERS PRESENT**

Edward Woods III, Executive Director  
Michigan Department of State (“MDOS”) Staff  
Nate Fink, Fink Bressack  
Kim Brace, Election Data Services (“EDS”)  
John Morgan, EDS  
Dr. Lisa Handley  
Dr. Maxwell Palmer  
Mark Braden, Baker Hostetler

### **CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME**

Commissioner Eid, Chair, called the meeting of the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission (MICRC) to order at 10:06 a.m.

**ROLL CALL**

MDOS staff called roll. A quorum was met.

**ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

**MOTION:** Approve the agenda. Moved by Commissioner Lett. Supported by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote on the motion to approve the agenda, by show of hands. **MOTION APPROVED.**

**PUBLIC COMMENT PERTAINING TO AGENDA TOPICS**

Commissioner Eid, Chair, put a motion “to begin public comment pertaining to agenda topics portion of the agenda” forward without objection, which was adopted.

Two individual provided in-person public comment: Alan Kewitch, and Kermit Williams.

Ten individuals provided remote public comment: James Gallant, Yousif Yousif, Mayor Rober A. McCraight, Saif Alsenad, Nomi Joyrich, William, Anthony Scannell, Chris Andrews, Kyle Stefanski, and Sherry Gay-Dagnogo.

A complete inventory of live and written public comment is available at: [www.Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://www.Michigan.gov/MICRC).

**UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

a. Senate Mapping Deliberations

Commissioner Eid, Chair, requested that the Commission’s experts provide updated analyses of the maps amended yesterday (6/24).

The Commission continued to review the 12 proposed draft senate remedial maps and considered minor changes that were the logical outgrowth of public comment.

**MOTION:** Accept Commissioner Callaghan’s Amendment to Heron, as drawn in Heron A1. Moved by Commissioner Lett. Seconded by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Eid, chair, held a roll call vote. By a vote of **8-4**, **MOTION APPROVED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	Yes
Donna Callaghan	Yes
Juanita Curry	Yes
Anthony Eid	Yes

<b>Rhonda Lange</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Steve Lett</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Marcus Muldoon</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Cynthia Orton</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Rebecca Szetela</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Janice Vallette</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Erin Wagner</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Richard Weiss</b>	<b>Yes</b>

**MOTION:** Recess until 2 p.m. Moved by Commissioner Lett. Supported by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by show of hands. **MOTION APPROVED.**

Commission recessed at 12:40 p.m. Commissioner Eid, Chair, called the meeting back to order at 2:10 p.m. and requested a roll call.

MDOS staff called roll. A quorum was met.

<b><u>Commissioner</u></b>	<b><u>Roll Call</u></b>
<b>Elaine Andrade</b>	Present
<b>Donna Callaghan</b>	Present
<b>Juanita Curry</b>	Present
<b>Anthony Eid</b>	Present
<b>Brittini Kellom</b>	Present, <i>joined at 2:27 p.m.</i>
<b>Rhonda Lange</b>	Present
<b>Steve Lett</b>	Present
<b>Marcus Muldoon</b>	Present
<b>Cynthia Orton</b>	Present
<b>Rebecca Szetela</b>	Present
<b>Janice Vallette</b>	Present
<b>Erin Wagner</b>	Present
<b>Richard Weiss</b>	Present

**UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

- a. Senate Mapping Deliberations

Commissioner Eid, Chair, requested that the Commission’s experts provide updated analyses of the maps amended this morning (6/25). Commissioner Eid, Chair, facilitated a discussion offering the opportunity for each Commissioner to express which maps they prefer and why.

**MOTION:** To appeal the decision of the chair in his point of order ruling (ruling that Commissioner Szetela’s comments were out of order). Moved by Commissioner Lange. Seconded by Commissioner Szetela. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a roll call vote. By a vote of **4-7-1, MOTION FAILED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	No
Donna Callaghan	No
Juanita Curry	Yes
Anthony Eid	Abstain
Brittini Kellom	No
Rhonda Lange	Yes
Steve Lett	No
Marcus Muldoon	No
Rebecca Szetela	Yes
Janice Vallette	No
Erin Wagner	Yes
Richard Weiss	No

**MOTION:** Commissioner Wagner moved to vote for final selection of a final remedial State Senate plan to move forward to the U.S. District Court for the Western District of Michigan in the *Agee* litigation. Seconded by Commissioner Lett. Commissioner Eid, Chair, ruled the **MOTION RULED OUT OF ORDER.**

**MOTION:** To compel the Chair or Vice-chair to call for a motion for the Secretary to conduct a roll call vote for the final selection of a final remedial state senate plan to submit to the District Court pursuant to the District Court’s Order in the *Agee, et al v. Benson, et al* matter. Moved by Commissioner Lange. Seconded by Commissioner Szetela. Commissioner Eid, Chair, ruled the **MOTION RULED OUT OF ORDER.**

**MOTION:** To appeal the decision of the chair ruling the motion out of order. Moved by Commissioner Lange. Seconded by Commissioner Szetela.

Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a roll call vote. By a vote of **4-8-1**, **MOTION FAILED**.

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	No
Donna Callaghan	No
Juanita Curry	Yes
Anthony Eid	Abstain
Brittini Kellom	No
Rhonda Lange	Yes
Steve Lett	No
Marcus Muldoon	No
Cynthia Orton	No
Rebecca Szetela	Yes
Janice Vallette	No
Erin Wagner	Yes
Richard Weiss	No

Commissioner Eid, Chair, resumed facilitating a discussion of the proposed draft senate remedial maps, offering the opportunity for each Commissioner to express which maps they prefer and why.

Commissioner Eid, Chair, called for a motion for the Secretary to conduct a roll call vote for the final selection of a final remedial state senate plan to submit to the District Court pursuant to the District Court’s Order in the Agee, et al v. Benson, et al matter.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Lett moved to vote for final selection of a final remedial State Senate plan to move forward to the U.S. District Court for the Western District of Michigan in the *Agee* litigation. Seconded by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Eid, Chair, called for a roll call vote.

By a vote of **6-2-4-1**, **MOTION FAILS**.

The political party affiliation vote breakdown is as follows:  
1 Democratic vote for Crane A1  
3 Republican votes for Crane A1  
2 unaffiliated votes for Crane A1

- 1 Republican vote for Crane A2
- 1 unaffiliated vote for Crane A2
- 3 Democratic votes for Kellom
- 1 unaffiliated vote for Kellom
- 1 unaffiliated vote for Szetela v3

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote by Stating Name Of Map</u>
<b>Elaine Andrade (D)</b>	<b>Kellom</b>
<b>Donna Callaghan (D)</b>	<b>Kellom</b>
<b>Juanita Curry (D)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Anthony Eid (U)</b>	<b>Kellom</b>
<b>Brittini Kellom (D)</b>	<b>Kellom</b>
<b>Rhonda Lange (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Steve Lett (U)</b>	<b>Crane A2</b>
<b>Marcus Muldoon (R)</b>	<b>Crane A2</b>
<b>Cynthia Orton (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Rebecca Szetela (U)</b>	<b>Szetela v3</b>
<b>Janice Vallette (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Erin Wagner (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Richard Weiss (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>

Commissioner Eid, Chair, again called for a motion for the Secretary to conduct a roll call vote for the final selection of a final remedial state senate plan to submit to the District Court pursuant to the District Court’s Order in the Agee, et al v. Benson, et al matter.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Lett moved for the 2nd vote for final selection of a final remedial State Senate plan to move forward to the U.S. District Court for the Western District of Michigan in the *Agee* litigation, as the constitutional majority was not met in Vote #1 to approve a plan. Seconded by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a roll call vote.

By a vote of **8-4-1**, **MOTION FAILS**.

The political party affiliation vote breakdown is as follows:

- 1 Democratic vote for Crane A1
- 4 Republican votes for Crane A1
- 3 unaffiliated votes for Crane A1

3 Democratic votes for Kellom  
 1 unaffiliated vote for Kellom  
 1 unaffiliated vote for Szetela v3

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote by Stating Name Of Map</u>
Elaine Andrade (D)	Kellom
Donna Callaghan (D)	Kellom
Juanita Curry (D)	Crane A1
Anthony Eid (U)	Kellom
Brittni Kellom (D)	Kellom
Rhonda Lange (R)	Crane A1
Steve Lett (U)	Crane A1
Marcus Muldoon (R)	Crane A1
Cynthia Orton (R)	Crane A1
Rebecca Szetela (U)	Szetela v3
Janice Vallette (U)	Crane A1
Erin Wagner (R)	Crane A1
Richard Weiss (U)	Crane A1

**MOTION:** Commissioner Callaghan moved to Adjourn the Meeting. Seconded by Commissioner Lett. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a roll call vote. By a vote of **5-8**, **MOTION FAILED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	Yes
Donna Callaghan	Yes
Juanita Curry	No
Anthony Eid	No
Brittni Kellom	Yes
Rhonda Lange	No
Steve Lett	Yes
Marcus Muldoon	No
Cynthia Orton	No
Rebecca Szetela	No

<b>Janice Vallette</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Erin Wagner</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Richard Weiss</b>	<b>Yes</b>

Commissioner Eid, Chair, again called for a motion for the Secretary to conduct a roll call vote for the final selection of a final remedial state senate plan to submit to the District Court pursuant to the District Court’s Order in the Agee, et al v. Benson, et al matter.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Lange moved for the 3rd vote for final selection of a final remedial State Senate plan to move forward to the U.S. District Court for the Western District of Michigan in the *Agee* litigation, as the constitutional majority was not met in Vote #2 to approve a plan. Seconded by Commissioner Orton. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a roll call vote.

By a vote of **8-1-2-2**, **MOTION FAILS.**

The political party affiliation vote breakdown is as follows:

- 1 Democratic vote for Crane A1
- 4 Republican votes for Crane A1
- 3 unaffiliated votes for Crane A1
- 1 unaffiliated vote for Crane A2
- 1 Democratic vote for Kellom
- 1 unaffiliated vote for Kellom
- 1 Democratic vote for Szetela v3
- 1 unaffiliated vote for Szetela v3

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote by Stating Name Of Map</u>
<b>Elaine Andrade (D)</b>	<b>Kellom</b>
<b>Donna Callaghan (D)</b>	<b>Szetela v3</b>
<b>Juanita Curry (D)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Anthony Eid (U)</b>	<b>Crane A2</b>
<b>Brittini Kellom (D)</b>	<b>Kellom</b>
<b>Rhonda Lange (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Steve Lett (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Marcus Muldoon (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Cynthia Orton (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Rebecca Szetela (U)</b>	<b>Szetela v3</b>

<b>Janice Vallette (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Erin Wagner (R)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>
<b>Richard Weiss (U)</b>	<b>Crane A1</b>

**MOTION:** To table the remaining agenda items for today and adjourn after Announcements. Moved by Commissioner Muldoon. Seconded by Commissioner Vallette.

**MOTION:** To call the question. Moved by Commissioner Lett. Seconded by Commissioner Eid. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by show of hands. **MOTION APPROVED.**

Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote, on the motion to table the remaining agenda items, by show of hands. **MOTION APPROVED.**

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

**MOTION:** To Adjourn the Meeting. Moved by Commissioner Lett. Seconded by Commissioner Orton. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by show of hands. **MOTION APPROVED.**

The meeting was adjourned at 6:27 p.m.