

Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission

Virtual Meeting via Zoom Webinar. Full agenda, presentations, and video recordings are available at www.Michigan.gov/MICRC

**Tuesday, May 21, 2024
10:05 a.m.- 5:34 p.m.**

MINUTES

PRESENT

Elaine Andrade (*remotely from Imlay Township, MI*)
Donna Callaghan (*remotely from Mexico*)
Juanita Curry (*joined at 12:10 p.m., remotely from Detroit, MI*)
Anthony Eid (*remotely from Detroit, MI*)
Brittini Kellom (*remotely from Detroit, MI*)
Rhonda Lange (*joined at 12:30 p.m., remotely from Osceola County, MI, left at 3:30 p.m.*)
Steven Terry Lett (*remotely from Grant Township, MI*)
Marcus Muldoon (*remotely from Carlton, MI*)
Cynthia Orton (*remotely from Battle Creek, MI*)
Rebecca Szetela (*joined at 10:20 a.m., remotely from Detroit, MI,*)
Janice Vallette (*remotely from Highland Township, MI*)
Erin Wagner (*remotely from Charlotte, MI, left at 11:40 p.m.*)
Richard Weiss (*remotely from Saginaw, MI*)

ABSENT

None.

OTHERS PRESENT

Edward Woods III, Executive Director
Michigan Department of State (“MDOS”) Staff
Nate Fink, Fink Bressack
Kim Brace, Election Data Services (“EDS”)
Kent Stigall, EDS
Ryan Taylor, EDS
Dr. Lisa Handley
Dr. Maxwell Palmer
Mark Braden, Baker Hostetler
Taylor Thompson, Baker Hostetler

CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

Commissioner Eid, Chair, called the meeting of the Michigan Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission (MICRC) to order at 10:05 a.m.

ROLL CALL

MDOS staff called roll. A quorum was met.

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

MOTION: Approve the agenda. Moved by Commissioner Lett. Supported by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote on the motion to approve the agenda, by show of hands. **MOTION APPROVED.**

PUBLIC COMMENT PERTAINING TO AGENDA TOPICS

Commissioner Eid, Chair, put a motion “to begin public comment pertaining to agenda topics portion of the agenda” forward without objection, which was adopted.

Six individuals provided public remote comment: James Gallant, Jamie Roe, Alex McGuire, Tom Haji, Sandra Haroutunian, and Chris Gilmer-Hill.

A complete inventory of live and written public comment is available at: www.Michigan.gov/MICRC.

MAPPING

Collaborative mapping by the Commission.

ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

a. VRA Review

Commissioner Eid, Chair, requested that Mark Braden facilitate this topic. Mark Braden provided an updated VRA analysis to the Commission on all completed draft maps, collaborative and alternative (individual). This analysis principally addresses the opportunity of Black voters to elect representatives of their choice to the Michigan Senate.

b. Partisan Fairness Review

Commissioner Eid, Chair, requested that Dr. Lisa Handley facilitate this topic. Dr. Lisa Handley provided an updated partisan fairness analysis to the Commission, including partisan fairness metrics on all completed draft maps, collaborative and alternative (individual).

MAPPING

Collaborative mapping by the Commission.

Commission took a break at 12:39 p.m. Commission returned from break at 1:40 p.m.

ROLL CALL

MDOS staff called roll. A quorum was met.

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Roll Call</u>
Elaine Andrade	Present
Donna Callaghan	Present
Juanita Curry	Present
Anthony Eid	Present
Brittini Kellom	Present
Rhonda Lange	Present
Steve Lett	Present
Marcus Muldoon	Present
Cynthia Orton	Present
Rebecca Szetela	Present
Janice Vallette	Present
Erin Wagner	Not Present
Richard Weiss	Present

ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

a. Core Retention

Commissioner Eid, Chair, requested that Kim Brace facilitate this topic. Kim Brace demonstrated to the Commission how to view a map of each completed plan compared to the Linden plan. Kim Brace also presented summary charts that analyze the “percent retained” of each district from the Linden plan to the newly drawn districts in each of the plans completed by the Commission.

b. Advancing Draft Proposed Maps

MOTION: To review the completed collaborative maps that have four VRA performing districts first. Moved by Commissioner Lange. Supported by Commissioner Orton. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by show of hands. **MOTION APPROVED.**

MOTION: Advance the Cardinal map to be published to the Court and for public comment. Moved by Commissioner Szetela. Supported by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by show of hands. **MOTION APPROVED.**

MOTION: Advance the Crane map to be published to the Court and for public comment. Moved by Commissioner Szetela. Supported by Commissioner Curry. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by show of hands. **MOTION APPROVED.**

MOTION: Advance the Dove map to be published to the Court and for public comment. Moved by Commissioner Szetela. Supported by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by roll call. **BY A VOTE OF 7-5, MOTION APPROVED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	Yes
Donna Callaghan	No
Juanita Curry	Yes
Anthony Eid	No
Brittini Kellom	No
Rhonda Lange	No
Steve Lett	Yes
Marcus Muldoon	No
Cynthia Orton	Yes
Rebecca Szetela	Yes
Janice Vallette	Yes
Richard Weiss	Yes

MOTION: Advance the Finch v2 map to be published to the Court and for public comment. Moved by Commissioner Eid. Supported by Commissioner Callaghan. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by roll call. **BY A VOTE OF 7-5, MOTION APPROVED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	Yes
Donna Callaghan	Yes
Juanita Curry	Yes
Anthony Eid	Yes
Brittini Kellom	No
Rhonda Lange	No
Steve Lett	Yes
Marcus Muldoon	Yes
Cynthia Orton	No

Rebecca Szetela	No
Janice Vallette	No
Richard Weiss	Yes

MOTION: Advance the Hummingbird map to be published to the Court and for public comment. Moved by Commissioner Eid. Supported by Commissioner Lett. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by roll call. **BY A VOTE OF 5-7, MOTION FAILED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	No
Donna Callaghan	Yes
Juanita Curry	No
Anthony Eid	Yes
Brittni Kellom	Yes
Rhonda Lange	No
Steve Lett	Yes
Marcus Muldoon	No
Cynthia Orton	No
Rebecca Szetela	No
Janice Vallette	No
Richard Weiss	Yes

MOTION: Advance the Phoenix map to be published to the Court and for public comment. Moved by Commissioner Eid. Supported by Commissioner Muldoon. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by roll call. **BY A VOTE OF 6-6, MOTION FAILED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	Yes
Donna Callaghan	Yes
Juanita Curry	No
Anthony Eid	Yes
Brittni Kellom	Yes
Rhonda Lange	No

Steve Lett	Yes
Marcus Muldoon	Yes
Cynthia Orton	No
Rebecca Szetela	No
Janice Vallette	No
Richard Weiss	No

MOTION: Advance the Robin map to be published to the Court and for public comment. Moved by Commissioner Lange. Supported by Commissioner Szetela. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by roll call. **BY A VOTE OF 3-9, MOTION FAILED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	Yes
Donna Callaghan	No
Juanita Curry	No
Anthony Eid	No
Brittni Kellom	No
Rhonda Lange	Yes
Steve Lett	No
Marcus Muldoon	No
Cynthia Orton	No
Rebecca Szetela	Yes
Janice Vallette	No
Richard Weiss	No

MOTION: Advance the Sparrow map to be published to the Court and for public comment. Moved by Commissioner Szetela. Supported by Commissioner Lange. Motion withdrawn by Commissioner Szetela.

MOTION: Advance the Starling v2 map to be published to the Court and for public comment. Moved by Commissioner Szetela. Supported by Commissioner Lange. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by roll call. **BY A VOTE OF 6-6, MOTION FAILED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
----------------------------	--------------------

Elaine Andrade	Yes
Donna Callaghan	Yes
Juanita Curry	Yes
Anthony Eid	No
Brittni Kellom	No
Rhonda Lange	Yes
Steve Lett	No
Marcus Muldoon	Yes
Cynthia Orton	No
Rebecca Szetela	Yes
Janice Vallette	No
Richard Weiss	No

MOTION: Advance the Starling v1 map to be published to the Court and for public comment. Moved by Commissioner Szetela. Supported by Commissioner Orton. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by roll call. **BY A VOTE OF 5-6, MOTION FAILED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	No
Donna Callaghan	No
Juanita Curry	Yes
Anthony Eid	No
Brittni Kellom	No
Steve Lett	No
Marcus Muldoon	Yes
Cynthia Orton	Yes
Rebecca Szetela	Yes
Janice Vallette	Yes
Richard Weiss	No

MOTION: Advance the Starling v3 map to be published to the Court and for public comment. Moved by Commissioner Muldoon. Supported by Commissioner Szetela.

Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by roll call. **BY A VOTE OF 10-1, MOTION APPROVED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	Yes
Donna Callaghan	Yes
Juanita Curry	Yes
Anthony Eid	Yes
Brittini Kellom	No
Steve Lett	Yes
Marcus Muldoon	Yes
Cynthia Orton	Yes
Rebecca Szetela	Yes
Janice Vallette	Yes
Richard Weiss	Yes

MOTION: Not advance any completed collaborative maps that only have three VRA performing districts. Moved by Commissioner Szetela. Supported by Commissioner Weiss. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by roll call. **BY A VOTE OF 3-8, MOTION FAILED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	Yes
Donna Callaghan	No
Juanita Curry	No
Anthony Eid	No
Brittini Kellom	No
Steve Lett	No
Marcus Muldoon	No
Cynthia Orton	No
Rebecca Szetela	Yes
Janice Vallette	No
Richard Weiss	Yes

MOTION: Reconsider the vote on the motion to advance the Hummingbird map to be published to the Court and for public comment. Moved by Commissioner Andrade. Supported by Commissioner Callaghan. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by roll call. **BY A VOTE OF 5-6, MOTION FAILED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	Yes
Donna Callaghan	Yes
Juanita Curry	No
Anthony Eid	Yes
Brittini Kellom	Yes
Steve Lett	No
Marcus Muldoon	Yes
Cynthia Orton	No
Rebecca Szetela	No
Janice Vallette	No
Richard Weiss	No

MOTION: Advance the Blue Jay v1 map to be published to the Court and for public comment. Moved by Commissioner Lett. Supported by Commissioner Eid. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by roll call. **BY A VOTE OF 3-8, MOTION FAILED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	No
Donna Callaghan	No
Juanita Curry	No
Anthony Eid	Yes
Brittini Kellom	No
Steve Lett	Yes
Marcus Muldoon	Yes
Cynthia Orton	No
Rebecca Szetela	No

Janice Vallette No
Richard Weiss No

MOTION: Extend the deadline for submitting an alternate (individual) map to be advanced and published to the Court and for public comment until May 21, 2024, at 8:00 p.m, so long as that map has already received VRA and partisan fairness analysis. Moved by Commissioner Kellom. Supported by Commissioner Lett. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by roll call. **BY A VOTE OF 7-4, MOTION APPROVED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	Yes
Donna Callaghan	Yes
Juanita Curry	No
Anthony Eid	Yes
Brittini Kellom	Yes
Steve Lett	Yes
Marcus Muldoon	Yes
Cynthia Orton	No
Rebecca Szetela	No
Janice Vallette	Yes
Richard Weiss	No

MOTION: Advance the Heron map to be published to the Court and for public comment. Moved by Commissioner Muldoon. Supported by Commissioner Callaghan. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by roll call. **BY A VOTE OF 8-3, MOTION APPROVED.**

<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>Vote</u>
Elaine Andrade	Yes
Donna Callaghan	Yes
Juanita Curry	Yes
Anthony Eid	Yes
Brittini Kellom	Yes
Steve Lett	Yes

Marcus Muldoon	Yes
Cynthia Orton	No
Rebecca Szetela	No
Janice Vallette	Yes
Richard Weiss	No

MINUTES

MOTION: Table Item 7 (Minutes) until a future meeting. Moved by Commissioner Kellom. Supported by Commissioner Muldoon. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by show of hands. **MOTION APPROVED.**

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR’S REPORT

Commissioner Eid, Chair, requested that Executive Director Woods facilitate this topic. Executive Director Woods reminded the Commission about the Virtual Town Halls taking place on Wednesday, May 29th, and Thursday June 6th from 10:00 a.m. until 1:00 p.m. and 5:00 p.m. until 7:30 p.m.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS/ANNOUNCEMENTS

None.

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Commissioner Lett requested that the topic of Commissioners conducting public outreach be put on a future agenda.

ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Adjourn the Meeting. Moved by Commissioner Lett. Supported by Commissioner Callaghan. Commissioner Eid, Chair, held a vote by show of hands. **MOTION APPROVED.**

The meeting was adjourned at 5:34 p.m.