



GRETCHEN WHITMER
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF LICENSING AND REGULATORY AFFAIRS
LANSING

MARLON I. BROWN, DPA
DIRECTOR

PK Yale LP,
Petitioner,

MICHIGAN TAX TRIBUNAL

v

MTT Docket No. 23-001958

City of Yale,
Respondent.

Presiding Judge
Mark Perry

SUMMARY OF PREHEARING CONFERENCE

SCHEDULING ORDER

NOTICE OF HEARING

A Prehearing Conference on this matter was held on October 1, 2024. Thomas Klug appeared on behalf of Petitioner. Tom Schlichting appeared on behalf of Respondent. A scheduling order has been established and a hearing has been set for:

HEARING DATE:	December 12, 2024
*The hearing shall continue on December 13, 2024, as necessary.	
HEARING TIME:	9:00 a.m.
HEARING LOCATION:	611 W. Ottawa, 2 nd Floor, Lansing, Michigan 48933.

This is an important legal document. Please have someone translate the document.

Este es un documento legal importante. Por favor, haga traducir este documento.

এটি একটি গুরুত্বপূর্ণ আইনি দলিল, অনুগ্রহ করে কেউ দলিলটিকে অনুবাদ করুন।

هذا هو وثيقة قانونية هامة يرجى لديك شخص تترجم الوثيقة.

Ito ay isang mahalagang legal na dokumento. Mangyari lamang na magkaroon ng isang tao isalin ang dokumento.

PREHEARING CONFERENCE SUMMARY

I. SHOW CAUSE HEARING

- A. The prehearing conference commenced as a Show Cause Hearing given Respondent's failure to timely file and exchange its prehearing statement, as required by the Tribunal.

The Tribunal commenced the hearing noting that Respondent's valuation disclosure was timely received on or before June 4, 2024, but receipt of Respondent's prehearing statement was untimely received after June 4, 2024. Respondent's representative was not aware the prehearing conference was scheduled to commence as a Show Cause Hearing. Petitioner's representative acknowledged the notice of prehearing entered on August 22, 2024, was scheduled to commence a Show Cause Hearing. Petitioner's representative acknowledged he thought that the matter had been resolved and Petitioner's representative stated Petitioner has not been prejudiced.

- B. Without objection by Petitioner, Respondent showed good cause to admit the prehearing statement; thus, Respondent may offer the listed witnesses to testify.
- C. The Tribunal finds Respondent did show good cause to justify the admission of Respondent's witnesses.

II. VALUATION INFORMATION:

- A. The true cash value (TCV), assessed value (AV), and taxable value (TV) for each parcel and tax year at issue as established by the Board of Review:

Parcel Number: 08-065-0027-100

Year	TCV	AV	TV
2023	\$1,265,600	\$632,800	\$479,132

- B. The parties' contentions of TCV, state equalized value (SEV), and TV for each parcel and tax year at issue:

Parcel Number: 08-065-0027-100

Year	Petitioner			Respondent		
	TCV	SEV	TV	TCV	SEV	TV
2023	\$612,000	\$306,000	\$306,000	\$1,234,000	\$617,000	\$479,132

- C. Amounts in dispute for the tax year at issue:

Parcel Number: 08-065-0027-100

Year	TCV	SEV	TV
2023	\$622,000	\$311,000	\$173,132

III. TAX INFORMATION

The property’s taxes have been paid for the tax year at issue.

IV. FACTUAL STATEMENT OF CLAIMS:

A. Classification of property:

Parcel Number	Classification
08-065-0027-100	Commercial – Real Property

B. Highest and best use (H&BU) for the tax year at issue:

Tax Year	H&BU
2023	Residential Multi-family Housing

C. The property’s TCV and TV are at issue for each tax year under appeal.

D. Petitioner’s claims or counterclaims:

Based on multi-family subsidized residential housing rent, the AV/SEV and TV exceed 50% of TCV.

E. Respondent’s claims or counterclaims:

Based on multi-family residential housing market rent, and actual subsidized financing and revenue, along with local market sale of similar subsidized property, the property is fairly and uniformly valued.

V. PENDING MOTIONS OR DISCOVERY:

A. Motions:

Petitioner intends to file a motion to amend adding tax year 2024, and the parties intend to stipulate allowing 2024 to be amended. The Tribunal notes motions to amend a property tax appeal in a subsequent tax year is timely filed as prescribed by statute.¹ The Tribunal will retain jurisdiction of an assessment dispute of property classified as commercial, industrial, and developmental real property if a written petition has been timely filed on or before May 31 of the tax year involved.²

¹ See TTR 219

² See MCL 205.735a(1)(6)

B. Discovery: Discovery is closed unless otherwise stated below.

VI. WITNESSES

- A. As provided by TTR 237, a person, other than a rebuttal witness, who is NOT identified as a witness in the prehearing statement, shall NOT be permitted to give testimony, unless, for good cause shown, the Tribunal permits the testimony to be taken.
- B. Witnesses will testify under oath or affirmation at the hearing, are subject to cross-examination by the opposing party, and to questions by the administrative law judge.

SCHEDULING ORDER

- I. November 29, 2024 is the final date to file and serve upon the opposing party and the Tribunal a final exhibit list and to furnish the opposing party with a copy of each exhibit. **The parties must use the form prescribed by the Tribunal.** An exhibit will not be admitted into evidence unless the exhibit is disclosed and furnished in accordance with this Order (even though admissible) except upon a finding of good cause by the Tribunal.
- II. November 29, 2024 is the date for Petitioner to notify the Tribunal in writing of the name and telephone number of the court reporter retained by the parties to transcribe the hearing.

Failure to comply with this Order will result in holding the non-complying party in default and may result in the dismissal of the case or the conducting of a show cause or default hearing, as provided by TTR 231.³

Date Entered: October 2, 2024

By  _____

³ See also MCL 205.732.

HEARING INFORMATION – PLEASE READ IMMEDIATELY

GENERAL INFORMATION: An impartial hearing will be conducted in accordance with the Michigan Tax Tribunal Rules (R 792.10201-R 792.10297) and the Michigan Administrative Procedures Act, MCL 24.201 *et seq.* The Michigan Rules of Evidence and the Michigan Court Rules may be applicable. A party is expected to exercise proper respect and courtesy toward other parties, witnesses and administrative law judges, which includes attending the hearing on time, silencing cell phones, and dressing in appropriate clothing for in-person hearings.

REPRESENTATION: A party may be represented by an attorney or other authorized representative of the party's own choosing and at the party's own expense. The Tribunal does not recommend or appoint attorneys.

WITNESSES: Parties may present witnesses, if any, identified in the Prehearing Statements, to testify under oath or affirmation at the hearing, subject to cross-examination by the opposing party, and questions by the administrative law judge.

EXHIBITS: The parties shall bring two (2) copies of all proposed exhibits (i.e. file copy and Judge's copy) to the hearing. Each exhibit must display the docket number and exhibit number (i.e., P1, P2, R1, R2, etc.) in the upper right hand corner of the first page of each copy of each proposed exhibit. If an exhibit contains multiple pages, each page shall be numbered. The proposed exhibits must be separated into numerical order sets and indexed for easy reference.

COURT REPORTER: The parties shall not only provide a court reporter to transcribe the hearing but shall also provide an electronic copy of the hearing transcript to the Tribunal by e-mailing it to taxtrib@michigan.gov. The costs attributable to the court reporter shall be shared equally by the parties. If the parties fail to pay the costs of the transcript to the court report prior to the submission of the transcript to the Tribunal, the court reporter may report this to the Tribunal with the submission of the transcript. As a result, the party or parties who failed to pay the costs associated with the transcript may be held in default.⁴

WITHDRAWAL: If Petitioner no longer wants to continue with the appeal, Petitioner may submit a written request to withdraw the case. Respondent must concur with the withdrawal. The request must be submitted to the Tribunal and served on Respondent at least 14 days before the hearing. Respondent may file a concurrence or objection to the request within 7 days of the service of the request on that party. If Respondent does not timely submit a concurrence or objection to the request will be deemed to be a concurrence to the request. If the request is granted, the case will be dismissed. If a request is not granted or the Tribunal has not notified you that it has been granted, you are required to attend the hearing.

SETTLEMENT: Parties may submit a written agreement settling a case (i.e., stipulation). The stipulation must be on a form made available by the tribunal or shall be in a written form that is in substantial compliance with the tribunal's form and be signed by the parties' attorneys or authorized representatives, if they have attorneys or authorized representatives, or by the parties, if they do not have attorneys or authorized representatives. There is a \$50 fee for the filing of the stipulation. If the stipulation with appropriate filing fee is received by the Tribunal or the parties email a copy of the signed stipulation to the Tribunal by 4:30 p.m. on the business day immediately preceding the day of the scheduled hearing, the hearing may be adjourned.

⁴ See TTR 231.

Parties that email a copy of a signed stipulation to the Tribunal for purposes of adjourning a hearing are also required to submit the original signed stipulation with appropriate filing fee. The stipulation, once submitted, will be reviewed and, if accepted, the Tribunal will issue a consent judgment.

FAILURE TO APPEAR: The failure of a party to timely appear or otherwise participate in a hearing will result in adjournment of the hearing and the holding of that party in default. The defaulted party will be given an opportunity to show good cause for the failure to appear. Failure to respond or show good cause may result in dismissal of the case or the conducting of a default hearing.

REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION: All hearings are conducted in a barrier-free location in compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act. An individual requiring reasonable accommodation for effective participation in a hearing, including accessible documentation such as braille, large print, electronic or audio reader, should contact the Tribunal by telephone at (517) 335-9760, or complete and submit an accommodation request form at <https://www.michigan.gov/taxtrib/-/media/Project/Websites/taxtrib/ET-Sample-Petitions-and-Forms/Disability-Accommodation-Form.pdf?rev=0b4e75a81f1e4cd186b0fcf956fe9f4c&hash=679AB1FBC0EFE783181CD8637BFEF027> within five (5) days of receipt of the Notice of Hearing to ensure availability of accommodation.

Hearing participants and observing members of the public who need assistance with speech or hearing may also participate in a telephonic or virtual hearing by dialing 7-1-1 and using the Michigan Relay service. More information about this service may be found at https://www.michigan.gov/mpsc/0,9535,7-395-93308_93325_93425_94040_94041---,00.html.

PRIVACY OF INFORMATION: In order to conduct a comprehensive and fair hearing, a party's private or confidential information, such as health or financial information, may be disclosed to the Tribunal and other parties and their attorneys or representatives. The Tribunal will use the private information solely for purposes related to the hearings process. A party may file a motion to request that a public hearing be closed in part or file a motion for protective order to deem certain information private and confidential in order to afford that information special protection.

CONTACT INFORMATION:

Michigan Tax Tribunal
611 W. Ottawa St., Lansing, MI 48933
U.S. Postal Mailing Address: PO BOX 30232, Lansing, MI 48909
Other Carriers (UPS, FedEx, DHL):
2nd Floor MTT, 2407 N. Grand River Avenue, Lansing, MI 48906
Phone: (517) 335-9760
E-Mail: taxtrib@michigan.gov
Website: www.michigan.gov/taxtrib
E-Filing: <https://eFiling.apps.lara.state.mi.us>
Office Hours: 8:00 a.m. – 5:00 p.m., our office is closed from 12:00 p.m. – 1:00 p.m.

PROOF OF SERVICE

I certify that a copy of the foregoing was sent on the entry date indicated above to the parties or their attorneys or authorized representatives, if any, utilizing either the mailing or email addresses on file, as provide by those parties, attorneys, or authorized representatives.

By: Tribunal Clerk