

APPROVED - 11/24/15

City of Hamtramck

Receivership Transition Advisory Board Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, October 27th, 2015

Hamtramck City Hall

Council Chambers - 2nd Floor

3401 Evaline

Hamtramck, Michigan 48212

RTAB MEMBERS PRESENT:

KAREN YOUNG
CATHY SQUARE
MARK STEMA
DEB ROBERTS

Also present:

Katrina Powell
City Administrator

DREW VAN de GRIFT
Michigan Department of Treasury
Office of Fiscal Responsibility

Reported by:

Kristen Shankleton (CER 6785)
Modern Court Reporting & Video, LLC
SCAO FIRM NO. 08228
101-A North Lewis Street
Saline, Michigan 48176
(734) 429-9143/nel

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

(Meeting called to order at 1:01 p.m.)

MS. ROBERTS: It is Tuesday, October 27th, 2015, at 1:01, and I will call the Hamtramck Transition Advisory Board meeting to order.

Mr. Van de Grift, will you do roll call, please?

MR. VAN DE GRIFT: Deborah Roberts?

MS. ROBERTS: Here.

MR. VAN de GRIFT: Cathy Square?

(No response)

MR. VAN de GRIFT: Absent; Mark Stema?

MR. STEMA: Here.

MR. VAN de GRIFT: Karen Young?

MS. YOUNG: Here.

MR. VAN de GRIFT: The quorum is present.

MS. ROBERTS: Thank you. Just as a reminder to the public, if anybody wishes to speak, I'll need you to sign in, please, at the podium.

First item on the agenda is approval of the agenda. I would entertain a motion to approve the agenda as presented.

MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

MS. YOUNG: Second.

MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

(No response)

1 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
2 say aye. Aye.
3 MR. STEMA: Aye.
4 MS. YOUNG: Aye.
5 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.
6 (No response)
7 MS. ROBERTS: Agenda carries. Or, motion
8 carries, for the agenda. Next on the agenda is the
9 approval of the RTAB minutes for September 22nd, 2015. I
10 would entertain a motion to approve the September 22nd,
11 2015, RTAB meeting minutes.
12 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.
13 MS. YOUNG: Second.
14 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?
15 (No response)
16 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
17 say aye. Aye.
18 MR. STEMA: Aye.
19 MS. YOUNG: Aye.
20 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.
21 (No response)
22 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.
23 Next would be approval of September 28th, 2015,
24 special meeting of the RTAB. I would entertain a motion
25 to approve the September 28th minute -- meeting, minutes.

1 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve.
2 MR. STEMA: Seconded.
3 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?
4 (No response)
5 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
6 say aye. Aye.
7 MR. STEMA: Aye.
8 MS. YOUNG: Aye.
9 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.
10 (No response)
11 MS. ROBERTS: Next on the agenda is approval of
12 Tyler Technologies' contract for reappraisal for Hamtramck
13 properties. I was going to ask Ms. Powell for a brief
14 explanation.
15 MR. VAN de GRIFT: We just got the contract.
16 MS. ROBERTS: And we did get the contract. I'm
17 wondering if she --
18 MS. POWELL: I'm sorry.
19 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. I just called on you.
20 MS. POWELL: Oh.
21 MS. ROBERTS: Do you want to give us a brief
22 explanation of the Tyler contract?
23 MS. POWELL: Actually, I'm going to defer to our
24 city assessor who is here, Jay Singh.
25 MS. ROBERTS: Okay.

1 MS. POWELL: He can talk about the contract.

2 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. Jay Singh?

3 MS. POWELL: Jay Singh.

4 MS. ROBERTS: Jay Singh.

5 MR. SINGH: Well, this has been a long process,
6 of -- inviting debate, and exploring and examining what
7 the plan offered to do, and what we need to do. They
8 submitted an offer which looked better than others, so we
9 went to the second stage, asking for explanations, making
10 changes, what we need to do in order to be in compliance.
11 And taking into consideration the special situations with
12 this finally.

13 So, finally we came to an agreement, after we
14 got approved by the legal counsel, John Clark approved it,
15 and there were some last minute changes acquired, to
16 protect the city's interest, and finally a contract came
17 back about an hour or so back, it's right off the -- hot
18 off the press.

19 MS. ROBERTS: Hot off the press, okay.

20 MR. SINGH: So -- what they are going to do, is,
21 use the latest technology to do what is called a mass
22 appraisal. Earlier used to be -- I'm talking about the
23 time when I got into this profession. It used to be all
24 afforded by touch, smell and sight, everything by human
25 eye.

1 Now they are, technology has advanced so much
2 that they can actually zero in from the site, which is
3 called oblique imagery. And then they look at from the
4 top, and then they compare what do we have? So we,
5 whatever records we have, they are going to take those,
6 build a database, and then check it with the technology.

7 (Ms. Square is present at this time.)

8
9 Whether, or, sketches, as far as the size of the
10 structure is concerned, whether they are updated or not,
11 they need to be updated. If they need to be updated, they
12 have assured me that they are -- they can zero in on to
13 the extent of six inches, so, even a six inch variation
14 will be accounted for.

15 Then they are going to take a drive by picture
16 at a time when there are -- there's going to be minimum
17 obstructions, minimum number of people on their front
18 porch, to help protect peoples' identity and all that. So
19 that'll be used -- that, those kind of -- those pictures
20 will be used for other things, other than the size
21 metrics. Size, quantity, condition, all those things,
22 that play into the assessments.

23 So, then we will have a database which we could
24 probably boost up the twenty first century database, and
25 hopefully we'll be able to disseminate over the internet

1 for the convenience of the public. And the grant which we
2 secured from the state may not be enough, but, give or
3 take, it'll cover a major part of the cost.

4 And I think the time is just right, to have them
5 start the process. Because as soon as the leaves are
6 fallen, I'm going to give them a go ahead to take the
7 drive through pictures. And in the meantime, they could
8 probably start scanning the sketches, and start working on
9 the size part of the database.

10 MS. ROBERTS: Okay.

11 MR. STEMA: I just -- is this a competitively
12 bid, or was this tied to the grant, the company that had
13 to be used?

14 MR. SINGH: No. It was competitively bid,
15 first.

16 MR. STEMA: Okay.

17 MR. SINGH: We didn't even have the grant at
18 that time.

19 MR. STEMA: Okay.

20 MR. SINGH: In anticipation of the grant, we bid
21 it out.

22 MR. STEMA: For the amount of money that the
23 contract is going to cost, besides most of the grant, so,
24 is there something budgeted for the month that's not going
25 to be covered? Or was it already in the budget, or is

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

this going to have to be a budget adjustment?

MS. CAIRNS: It would have to be a budget adjustment.

MR. STEMA: Okay. When they -- any idea of how much more, or less?

MS. CAIRNS: I think it's about \$60,000 more.

MR. SINGH: Over a period of two years, so you can break it into 50 percentile, be one year, 50 percent next year.

MR. STEMA: Okay.

MS. ROBERTS: Any further questions?

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to approve, deny, or postpone Resolution 2015-39, Tyler Technologies contract for reappraisal for Hamtramck properties.

MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

MS. YOUNG: Second.

MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: All those in favor say aye.

Aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Thank you. Next on the agenda is resolutions from the regular city council meeting of September 8th of 2015. I would entertain a motion to approve all ordinances and resolutions from the September 8th, 2015 regular city council meeting.

MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve.

MR. STEMA: Seconded.

MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor say aye. Aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MS. SQUARE: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

Next on the agenda are resolutions from the city's council meeting of September 22nd, 2015. Resolution 2015-49, awarding the audit services contract to Allen C. Young was denied at last month's special RTAB meeting, so no further action is required on that.

But I would entertain a motion to approve all ordinances and resolutions from the September 22nd, 2015

1 regular city council meeting, with the exception of
2 resolution 2015-49.

3 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve.

4 MR. STEMA: Seconded.

5 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

6 (No response)

7 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
8 say aye. Aye.

9 MR. STEMA: Aye.

10 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

11 MS. SQUARE: Aye.

12 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

13 (No response)

14 MS. ROBERTS: Next on the agenda is resolution
15 from the special city council meeting of October 2nd,
16 2015. It appears that there is no substantive resolutions
17 adopted during this meeting, and that the enforceability
18 of these resolutions has been questioned by the city's own
19 attorney. For these reasons, it seems that we should
20 refrain from approving these resolutions until the matter
21 is resolved on the local level. Unless other board
22 members disagree, we will move on.

23 MS. POWELL: I have an update. Actually, last
24 Friday we had a hearing, before a judge, and an individual
25 was appointed to the vacant city council seat. So it has

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

been resolved.

MS. ROBERTS: Was that the only thing on the agenda?

MS. POWELL: Yes.

MR. STEMA: So did they have the special meeting?

MS. POWELL: They were declaring a vacancy of the city council seat.

MS. ROBERTS: How would the Board like to proceed?

MR. STEMA: How should we proceed?

MS. ROBERTS: We can approve, deny?

MR. VAN de GRIFT: The filling of the seat can be resolved at a later resolution, because it was the -- the resolution to create the vacancy occurred at a later meeting. Also, the concern that the attorney had was that these were unscheduled agenda items at a special meeting. So there were really two issues during that meeting. I just wanted the Board be informed before you voted.

MS. ROBERTS: Okay. And we do have the resolution for declaring a vacancy later on the agenda.

MR. VAN de GRIFT: Yeah, I believe so. I believe so, so this whole matter can be -- it can be resolved at a later meeting, yeah.

MS. ROBERTS: So this one we can just pass at

1 this time. Yeah. Okay. So let's move forward, then.
2 Okay, next on the agenda is the claims and accounts from
3 the regular city council meeting draft minutes of October
4 13th, 2015. I would entertain a motion to approve, deny,
5 or postpone claims and accounts from the regular city
6 council meeting draft minutes of October 13th, 2015.

7 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

8 MS. YOUNG: Second.

9 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

10 (No response)

11 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
12 say aye.

13 Aye.

14 MR. STEMA: Aye.

15 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

16 MS. SQUARE: Aye.

17 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

18 (No response)

19 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next on the
20 agenda is the city administrator items. We approved the
21 city council meeting -- meeting minutes in new business.

22 Next is the approval of budget to actual and
23 cash flow reports. I would entertain a motion to approve,
24 deny or postpone the budget to actual and cash flow
25 reports.

1 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve.
2 MR. STEMA: Seconded.
3 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?
4 (No response)
5 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
6 say aye.
7 Aye.
8 MR. STEMA: Aye.
9 MS. YOUNG: Aye.
10 MS. SQUARE: Aye.
11 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.
12 (No response)
13 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.
14 Next on the agenda is approval of invoice
15 register and preapproved expenditures. I would entertain
16 a motion to approve, deny or postpone the invoice register
17 and preapproved expenditures.
18 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve.
19 MR. STEMA: Seconded.
20 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?
21 (No response)
22 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
23 say aye.
24 Aye.
25 MR. STEMA: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MS. SQUARE: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next on the agenda is approval of Resolution 2015-54, contract to Gregory Terrell and company for the citywide auditing services. While this action, on this item, occurred during a council meeting outside the normal review period for today's board meeting, the Board recognizes the city's need to have this item reviewed timely.

Ms. Powell, would you please provide a summary of this item for the Board?

MS. POWELL: Yes, ma'am.

At the last RTAB meeting, there was an item before you for approval for an auditing firm, and you actually had a special meeting for that. And, our request was denied by the Board, so we went back to the drawing board and looked at those auditors that had applied to provide auditing services to us and selected the next in line that met all of the qualifications, did not receive any bad reviews, and we called around and got references of various communities that had used the different auditors that applied, and decided that we needed to give the contract to Gregory Terrell and Company, for their

1 services. They received good reviews, and we had no
2 reservations.

3 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you. I would entertain a
4 motion to approve, deny or postpone Resolution 2015-54,
5 contract to Gregory Terrell and Company, for citywide
6 auditing services.

7 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve.

8 MR. STEMA: Seconded.

9 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

10 (No response)

11 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
12 say aye.

13 Aye.

14 MR. STEMA: Aye.

15 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

16 MS. SQUARE: Aye.

17 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

18 (No response)

19 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

20 Approval of Resolution 2015-53, declaring a
21 vacancy on the Hamtramck City Council, resulting from the
22 passing of Councilman Walters. So Ms. Powell, you've
23 already updated us on this one?

24 MS. POWELL: Yes, ma'am, I did.

25 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. So I would entertain a

1 motion to approve, deny or postpone Resolution 2015-53.

2 MS. SQUARE: Move to approve.

3 MR. STEMA: Seconded.

4 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

5 (No response)

6 MS. ROBERTS: All those in favor say aye. Aye.

7 MR. STEMA: Aye.

8 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

9 MS. SQUARE: Aye.

10 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

11 (No response)

12 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

13 Items six and seven are not in the current

14 review period for this meeting, therefore, no board action

15 will be taken on these items at this time. And items

16 eight, nine, ten and eleven have not been acted on by city

17 council; therefore, no board action will be taken on these

18 items at this time.

19 Approval of citywide overtime report for August,

20 2015. Ms. Powell, would you like to provide a summary of

21 this item for the Board?

22 MS. POWELL: Yes ma'am, I would.

23 You're looking at the overtime costs for

24 September 30th, ending September 30th, and you will see

25 that our overtime is going down and the police department,

1 under the police department's overtime. We are expecting
2 a \$10,000 payment for our services during our Labor Day
3 festival. We're going to be reimbursed by the Hamtramck
4 festival committee, so that will actually go down to
5 \$10,000.

6 You will also continue to see this to go down,
7 as we have completely filled all of our dispatcher
8 positions that, you know, were vacant. And we also,
9 hopefully, fingers crossed, we don't have any officers
10 leave, so our overtime, regular department overtime, will
11 go down.

12 MS. SQUARE: That's good. The chief's doing a
13 wonderful job.

14 MS. POWELL: She is.

15 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. I would entertain a motion
16 to approve, deny or postpone the citywide overtime report
17 for --

18 MS. SQUARE: Move to approve.

19 MR. STEMA: Seconded.

20 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

21 (No response)

22 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
23 say aye.

24 Aye.

25 MR. STEMA: Aye.

1 MS. YOUNG: Aye.
2 MS. SQUARE: Aye.
3 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.
4 (No response)
5 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. We have the
6 district court revenues as information; does anyone have
7 any questions they want to ask?
8 MS. POWELL: No.
9 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. No further action required.
10 Mr. Van de Grift, do we have public comment?
11 MR. VAN de GRIFT: We do. Councilman Bob Zolak.
12 MR. ZOLAK: Good afternoon.
13 MS. ROBERTS: Good afternoon.
14 MS. SQUARE: Good afternoon.
15 MR. ZOLAK: I want to, again, thank you for the
16 opportunity of speaking before you, and again, I'm not
17 representing the whole council, I'm representing myself,
18 my own personal observations that involve the city.
19 I just wanted to make one comment relative to
20 the one resolution we had for councilman that passed,
21 Titus. We postponed that particular resolution; at the
22 time that we had a special meeting. I thought it was
23 inappropriate because I personally didn't want to support
24 that because I thought we could have had that special
25 meeting any other time, other than the four hour wake

1 period of Mr. Titus. And that was the only time that
2 there was a wake period for Mr. Titus.

3 We did subsequently postpone our decision to the
4 next meeting. We could have had a special meeting, but
5 why have a special meeting when we had a meeting already
6 scheduled? So we did act upon that vacancy, and not for
7 any other reason, other than giving him due respect.

8 Now, I'm concerned, the fact that, again, we're
9 not getting reports on a timely basis, that -- we
10 necessarily are, so I want to hope that we can see some of
11 our reports at our council meetings, at our work sessions.

12 I again, I've invited and suggested many of our
13 TAB board members to attend our work sessions as well as
14 our council meetings, and get a little better
15 understanding of what we're going through, and that we are
16 doing some things during the work session and the council
17 meetings.

18 I am concerned with some of the pending
19 resolutions we have for tonight, especially with the
20 situation with our, our vehicle purchases. I know that
21 the TAB board had initially approved the capital equipment
22 for this year for snow removal equipment. I'm just
23 concerned that in light of the fact we are moving in on
24 this thing, and I've been asking what is the particular
25 program? What are the particular specifics on it? What's

1 going to be involved during the course of the season.

2 And whether or not, if this wouldn't justify or
3 have considered amending the budget to cover all the
4 incidental expenses that we are going to be incurring and
5 developing and spending, the DPW department, in snow
6 removal and plowing. So, I'm really concerned that if
7 it's budgeted again, or if you're going to have a special
8 meeting after our meeting, that we have some consideration
9 about the entire cost factor.

10 Maintenance, fuel, insurances, things of that
11 nature, that may have to be considered in the budget.
12 Those are some of my concerns, and anything. I wish you a
13 happy halloween.

14 MR. VAN de GRIFT: Mr. Omar Nakash.

15 MR. NAKASH: Good afternoon everybody.

16 MS. SQUARE: Good afternoon.

17 MS. ROBERTS: Good afternoon.

18 MR. STEMA: Good afternoon.

19 MR. NAKASH: Number nine was brought to my
20 attention, approval of vehicle and equipment purchase for
21 Department of Public Service. This contract was put out
22 twice already, and my company, Platinum Landscape, was the
23 lowest bidder both times. It's a three year contract, you
24 know, I purchased salt, equipment; I upgraded equipment.

25 And it's October 27th, and I haven't been

1 notified in any way that my company's not doing the
2 project. That's number one. Number two, I was awarded
3 the lot cleanup also, and other companies are doing the
4 work at this time, so, these are two things that I'd like
5 to address, before anything -- before you guys proceed
6 with anything, so, I just wanted to make a note of that.
7 At this point, you know, I just -- I'd like to make that
8 noted. Thank you.

9 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you.

10 MR. STEMA: Thank you.

11 MS. SQUARE: Thank you.

12 MR. VAN de GRIFT: Ms. Kathy Gorman.

13 MS. GORMAN: Thank you ladies and gentlemen;
14 happy holiday, in case I forget to say that. I want to
15 thank you for what you guys have been doing; I think
16 you're doing a great job, and I'm glad you're here.

17 The only question I have is, the way I see this,
18 and maybe I see the process wrong, but this is supposed to
19 be, like the title says, Transition Advisory Board. Could
20 somebody please explain to me where is the transition? I
21 don't understand how we're accommodating a transition
22 here.

23 I mean, again, I think this is the second or
24 third meeting that you've had things on the agenda that
25 haven't been approved by council first. And --

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MS. ROBERTS: Well, we can take them up.

MS. GORMAN: I understand that, but, I guess we're the only two that understand that. And my next question, for you is, what happens if you have an item on the agenda that the council doesn't approve? Do you go ahead and approve it anyway? How does that work?

MS. POWELL: Ms. Gorman, this is public comment. They aren't -- they're not to respond back to you; this is public comment. It's not dialogue back and forth.

MS. GORMAN: Thank you. So, I guess that's kind of my question, and that's what a lot of people are wondering. And I think that's as a potential councilwoman, and a candidate for that office. I guess I would have to ask what's happening, I think, is, that the council is just nodding yes now because they feel like no matter how they vote, that it's going to be superseded by you anyway.

So, I guess my question would be, if they vote no and don't approve these things, and then it comes to you, what happens? Or does it not come to you until it's approved by them? And that's my question. And thank you and have a great week.

MS. ROBERTS: Thank you.

MR. VAN de GRIFF: That concludes public comment.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MS. POWELL: Okay.

MS. ROBERTS: Board comment?

Seeing none, I would entertain a motion for adjournment.

MS. SQUARE: Move to adjourn.

MR. STEMA: Seconded.

MS. ROBERTS: All those in favor? Aye.

MS. SQUARE: Aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carried.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATE OF MICHIGAN
COUNTY OF WASHTENAW).ss

I certify that this transcript is a complete, true, and correct transcript to the best of my ability of the RTAB meeting held on October 27th, 2015, City of Hamtramck. I also certify that I am not a relative or employee of the parties involved and have no financial interest in this case.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED: November 3, 2015

s/ Amy Shankleton-Novess

Modern Court Reporting & Video, LLC
(734) 429-9143