

APPROVED - 9/22/15

City of Hamtramck

Receivership Transition Advisory Board Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, August 25, 2015

Hamtramck City Hall

Council Chambers - 2nd Floor

3401 Evaline

Hamtramck, Michigan 48212

RTAB MEMBERS PRESENT:

KAREN YOUNG  
CATHY SQUARE  
MARK STEMMA  
DEB ROBERTS

ALSO PRESENT:

KATRINA POWELL  
City Administrator

DREW VAN de GRIFT  
Michigan Dept of Treasury  
Office of Fiscal Responsibility

Reported by:

Nina Lunsford (CER 4539)  
Modern Court Reporting & Video, LLC  
SCAO FIRM NO. 08228  
101-A North Lewis Street  
Saline, Michigan 48176  
(734) 429-9143/nel

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Called to order at 1:05 p.m.

MS. ROBERTS: I would call the Hamtramck Transition Advisory Board to order for Tuesday, August 25th. Roll call, Mr. Van de Grift?

MR. VAN DE GRIFT: Deborah Roberts?

MS. ROBERTS: Here.

MR. VAN de GRIFT: Cathy Square?

(No response)

MR. VAN de GRIFT: Absent; Mark Stema?

MR. STEMA: Here.

MR. VAN de GRIFT: Karen Young?

MS. YOUNG: Here.

MR. VAN de GRIFT: Our quorum is present.

MS. ROBERTS: Thank you. Just a reminder to the public, if anyone would like to speak during public comment, please sign up on the signup sheet. First item on the agenda is approval of the agenda. I would entertain a motion to approve the agenda as presented.

MS. YOUNG: So moved.

MR. STEMA: Second it.

MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor say aye. Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

Next on the agenda, I would entertain a motion to approve the July 28th, 2015 RTAB meeting minutes with noted clarifications.

MR. STEMA: Motion.

MS. YOUNG: Second.

MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor say aye. Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

First on the agenda under old business, the city's response to Treasury regarding the identified audit deficiencies has been received. Ms. Powell or Ms. Cairns, would you please update the Board on this matter?

MS. CAIRNS: Yes, would you like me to go through it, or do you have specific questions?

MR. STEMA: I just have one, on the, kind of on

1 your bank reconciliations and all that?

2 MS. CAIRNS: Yes?

3 MR. STEMA: How often -- when do guys do your  
4 monthly -- when you do a monthly close, you've got all  
5 your reconciliations, what, seven, ten days in? Do you do  
6 a monthly close with all reconciliations?

7 MS. CAIRNS: Yes, usually the treasurer's --  
8 previously, the treasurer's office performed that  
9 function. Currently, the city controller temporarily is  
10 working on catching up.

11 We have caught up with the general checking, the  
12 water fund, the property tax fund. But the treasurer's  
13 office is going to work on the income tax, so, we are kind  
14 of current, then.

15 MR. STEMA: Okay, pretty much, and so your bank  
16 recs (sic). How many days -- how far are you behind, like  
17 normally? Are you --

18 MS. CAIRNS: Normally about a -- this time, we  
19 were behind just because of a change in the treasurer's  
20 office. But usually, we hope to be behind about a month.  
21 It takes about a month to reconcile, yeah.

22 MR. STEMA: Yeah, okay, so. Okay. Let me just  
23 read through this and see if I have any other questions.  
24 I don't think I did.

25 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

either approve, deny or postpone the audit deficiency response.

MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

MS. ROBERTS: Motion to approve?

MS. YOUNG: Second.

MS. ROBERTS: All those in favor say aye. Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries to approve.

(Ms. Square enters)

MR. STEMA: I heard somebody running through the hall, I knew it was you.

MS. ROBERTS: Next under old business, is the board directive requiring council members to complete core courses for municipal government, per Emergency Manager Final Order 2014-20. Last month, the board discussion led to tabling of this matter.

The city has provided additional information, and absent any need for further information, we should clarify that the entire city council, mayor, and city administrator are required by the order to achieve the minimal level of training mandated by EM order 94.

I recommend that an additional amount of time be

1 allowed, because many city council members have not made  
2 any progress toward this certification during the previous  
3 eight months. I would entertain a motion to require the  
4 city administrator, mayor, and all council members, to  
5 complete the level one core courses as offered by the  
6 Michigan Municipal League at the next available  
7 opportunity.

8 MS. SQUARE: So moved.

9 MS. YOUNG: Second.

10 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

11 MR. STEMA: Yeah, I -- what is, what is exactly  
12 that being? I -- here's my thing. I think there should  
13 be a timetable. Especially as a resident of this city, I  
14 think, you know, within the first year, 50 percent done,  
15 within the second year, it should be 100 percent done. I  
16 mean, letting it drag on, I'm just trying to figure out  
17 what the specifics are.

18 MS. POWELL: According to the League, it takes  
19 approximately a year to complete the core courses, and  
20 that's if they stay on track, attending conferences,  
21 watching webinars, doing additional things around the  
22 state of Michigan when they have classes for them to  
23 attend.

24 It takes about a year for them to complete that,  
25 and that's, once again, that's only if they're able to

1 attend all of these things in a timely manner. So, as  
2 long as it's completed within a year, or close to a year,  
3 obviously, we're not going to be completed in a year at  
4 this time because we're eight months behind, some of us.

5 And so as long as, moving forward, a year from  
6 now, if they're able to have all of that completed, then,  
7 we should be okay.

8 MR. STEMA: All right. Okay, I'm good with  
9 that.

10 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

11 (No response)

12 MS. ROBERTS: Okay, the motion before us is to  
13 require the city administrator, mayor, and all council  
14 members to complete the level one core of courses. All  
15 those in favor say aye. Aye.

16 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

17 MR. STEMA: Aye.

18 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

19 (No response)

20 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. New business.  
21 First up is resolutions from the regular city council  
22 meeting of July 14th, 2015. I would entertain a motion to  
23 approve all ordinances and resolutions from the July 14th  
24 regular city council meeting.

25 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MS. SQUARE: Support.

MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
say aye. Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next on the  
agenda is resolutions from special city council meeting of  
July 21st, 2015. I would entertain a motion to approve  
all ordinances and resolutions from the July 21st, 2015  
special city council meeting.

MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

MS. SQUARE: Support.

MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
say aye. Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next is



1 resolutions from the regular city council meeting of July  
2 28th, 2015. I would entertain a motion to approve all  
3 ordinances and resolutions from the July 28th, 2015  
4 regular city council meeting.

5 MS. SQUARE: So moved.

6 MS. YOUNG: Second.

7 MR. STEMA: Support.

8 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

9 (No response)

10 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
11 say aye. Aye.

12 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

13 MR. STEMA: Aye.

14 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

15 (No response)

16 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next on the  
17 agenda is claims and accounts from the regular city  
18 council meeting draft minutes of August 11th, 2015. I  
19 would entertain a motion to approve claims and accounts  
20 from August 11th, 2015 regular city council meeting.

21 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

22 MS. SQUARE: Support.

23 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

24 (No response)

25 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor

1 say aye. Aye.  
2 MS. YOUNG: Aye.  
3 MR. STEMA: Aye.  
4 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.  
5 (No response)  
6 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Under city  
7 administrator items. City council minutes were all  
8 addressed in new business; budget to actual and cash flow  
9 reports. Ms. Powell, anything you would like to add?  
10 MS. POWELL: No, ma'am.  
11 MS. ROBERTS: Okay.  
12 MS. POWELL: If you have any questions, Ms.  
13 Cairns is here to answer any questions you have.  
14 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. I would -- any questions?  
15 MR. STEMA: No.  
16 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to  
17 approve the budget to actual and cash flow reports.  
18 MS. YOUNG: So moved.  
19 MS. SQUARE: Second.  
20 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?  
21 (No response)  
22 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
23 say aye. Aye.  
24 MS. YOUNG: Aye.  
25 MR. STEMA: Aye.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Next on the agenda is approval of invoice register and preapproved expenditures. I would entertain a motion to approve the invoice register and preapproved expenditures.

MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

MS. SQUARE: Support.

MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor say aye. Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next on the agenda is approval of the citywide overtime report. The city has submitted its monthly overtime report, indicating almost \$60,000 in overtime expenses for the month of July. Ms. Powell, does this number stand out or alarm you?

MS. POWELL: Of course it alarms me. But we -- actually, Ms. Cairns is here as well as the police chief, so if you have any questions about their specific overtime, they're here to answer those questions.

1 MS. ROBERTS: Okay, I do have a question of how  
2 much is budgeted monthly for overtime?

3 MS. CAIRNS: I don't have it broken down by  
4 month, but let me look at it, here.

5 MR. STEMA: Give us the percentage, too.

6 MS. CAIRNS: Okay. The city's budget, the  
7 overtime we have used almost 22 percent. Sorry, the  
8 traffic overtime. The regular overtime is 12 percent.  
9 You want to talk about the traffic overtime, or you want  
10 me to?

11 MS. POWELL: Ann can talk about it, if we have  
12 any questions about the traffic overtime or --

13 MR. STEMA: I actually have just a couple of  
14 questions on the overall overtime, because that's  
15 obviously higher than normally allotted for a month. How  
16 are you going to be able to make adjustments to make up  
17 for it, to kind of meet your budget for overtime?

18 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: We're still working on some  
19 of that, because that budget stuff is still a little new  
20 to me, so I'm working on some things. The traffic  
21 overtime, as we discussed the last time I was here, that  
22 is contractual, allowing each officer to work up to 32  
23 hours a pay period. That was -- it's my understanding  
24 that that was given as an incentive to some drastic  
25 changes and concessions that the union's made in the last

1 contract. So they were given the opportunity, from the  
2 rank of lieutenant down to patrolman, to work 32 hours a  
3 pay period, which ends up being 64 hours.

4 Not all of our officers take advantage of that;  
5 the last --

6 MR. STEMA: So it's optional, it's determined by  
7 the officer if they want to do it?

8 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: It is. It is. The last  
9 report that I had received of the number of traffic hours,  
10 we had 173 overall for that last report that I had. So  
11 that was -- I have them broken down by officer, if you  
12 just give me a real quick second.

13 And the -- I do not have the costs, obviously,  
14 for August, since the month has not ended. But the costs  
15 for, from the court of what the traffic programs were, I'm  
16 sorry; one second. For the month of July, the overall  
17 revenue collected by the court from traffic tickets was  
18 \$96,000.

19 So what I did was, I took the 173 hours and  
20 multiplied that by \$50 an hour, which is a gross over  
21 adjustment for most of the officers, because most of them,  
22 even at time and a half, do not make \$50 an hour. And it  
23 came out to like \$8800. So you figure the traffic program  
24 alone is almost -- is definitely offsetting anywhere near  
25 the costs of what it's costing in overtime per month.

1 MR. STEMA: So the revenue for the month is over  
2 what was budgeted for revenue, then, for traffic too,  
3 then?

4 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: As far as what -- I'm not  
5 sure what was budgeted for the month; I don't have access  
6 to that, so I don't know what was actually budgeted for  
7 the month. And, ticket revenue --

8 MS. CAIRNS: The budget for -- we don't have it  
9 separated, but the budget for court fines and forfeiture  
10 from courts, the court income. They will give us a  
11 monthly check. It's about \$1.6 million. You have your  
12 statement for the entire year.

13 MR. STEMA: Yeah.

14 MS. CAIRNS: And that has been consistent with  
15 about \$1.6 million, \$1.9 million every year, the court  
16 brings us.

17 MR. STEMA: Okay. I mean, just from a -- your  
18 standpoint, from the city, I would want the traffic and  
19 that, separated, just so you have an idea if your actual  
20 costs are actually covering your revenue floor, because  
21 then it justifies it. Then you kind of know, I mean, you  
22 know, the percentage of overtime sounds bad, but if you're  
23 actually covering your costs and it's actually revenue  
24 positive, then it's actually not that big of a deal.

25 But if you can't actually break it down, you

1 know, I think you might want to do that, just from a  
2 standpoint.

3 MS. CAIRNS: Okay.

4 MS. ROBERTS: You said contractually the  
5 employee decides whether or not to work overtime, does it  
6 matter if you --

7 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: As long as they don't go  
8 over.

9 MS. ROBERTS: If you determine whether or not  
10 you need them?

11 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: As long as it does not go  
12 over 32 hours a pay period, the contract is very specific  
13 that it states that they are allowed to work up to 32  
14 hours per pay period.

15 MS. ROBERTS: That just seems an odd thing, for,  
16 from my standpoint, for the employee to decide versus the  
17 city or the manager to decide whether or not they need to  
18 have that help. But -- I'll let you guys work on your  
19 contract.

20 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: Yeah, that one --

21 MS. ROBERTS: It seems an odd thing, but I don't  
22 know what you gave up to get that, but it seems very odd.

23 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: And then there were some  
24 other overtime hours that I had -- well, when I looked at  
25 the report, some things that were going to be reimbursed.

1 We had a fireworks detail, that I think it was roughly  
2 around 39 hours of overtime, and that's going to be  
3 reimbursed by the recreation department.

4 MR. STEMA: Okay.

5 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: There was a movie detail,  
6 that's going to be reimbursed. We do get reimbursed by  
7 the FBI and the drug forfeiture. The officers that are  
8 assigned to those units; that is reimbursed, as well.

9 We did have 40 hours of a report writing class  
10 that we felt was very necessary to send some of our newer  
11 officers to report writing. So we had some things that  
12 made this month stand out maybe a little bit more than  
13 some of the other months, due to ongoing investigations,  
14 things like that.

15 MR. STEMA: I just have one more question on the  
16 overall budgeting for the -- I'm just curious. Bama, you  
17 probably know this. How did you actually budget? Did you  
18 just take past year history, to guesstimate kind of how  
19 many hours are going to work and all that, when you're  
20 coming up with your budget for the traffic overtime? Is  
21 that how you calculated it?

22 MS. CAIRNS: Actually, the traffic overtime  
23 figures were given to me by the previous police chief. He  
24 and I went through the budget --

25 MR. STEMA: You don't know how he calculated it?



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MS. CAIRNS: No, I don't.

MR. STEMA: Just based on past history estimate, or when it maxed out?

MS. CAIRNS: I think he may have based it past history, yes.

MR. STEMA: Okay.

MS. CAIRNS: Also, a couple of years ago, when they had almost the same as what last year was, their personnel -- they had less full time personnel. So they were trying to fill out -- fill the vacancies.

MR. STEMA: Okay.

MS. CAIRNS: So when, once those were done, we kind of reduced, or at least, I reduced, the overtime, thinking that that probably should cover now, because earlier they didn't have the staff. So that's how it was done.

POLICE CHIEF MOISE: When I do look at a monthly, or a pay period breakdown, that what our traffic department does for me, is that they actually only had one officer that actually worked the full 32 hours.

MR. STEMA: Yeah. Okay.

POLICE CHIEF MOISE: And he's pretty consistent on working his 32 hours. Most of the officers work on an average of anywhere from 16 to 20 hours a pay period.

MR. STEMA: Okay.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

POLICE CHIEF MOISE: And we only had ten officers work the traffic the whole -- that whole pay period.

Any other questions?

MS. ROBERTS: And then, I know that there was quite a discussion last month when I wasn't here, about the police study? Has there been any further action on that?

MS. POWELL: Nope, still in search.

MS. ROBERTS: Okay. I would entertain a motion to approve the citywide overtime report.

MS. SQUARE: So moved.

MR. STEMA: Second it.

MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor say aye. Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

Approval of Resolution 2015-35 was taken care of in new business, and also approval of Resolution 2015-36 was addressed in new business. And next, we have approval

1 of employment position for a part time police dispatcher.  
2 Ms. Powell, could you summarize your request for the  
3 Board?

4 MS. POWELL: Actually, I'm going to defer to the  
5 chief, and this will come right in line with the overtime.  
6 A lot of the overtime that you're seeing, that 12 percent  
7 that you're seeing, is because we don't have full coverage  
8 in dispatch. And so the chief came up with a plan to  
9 cover those positions with part time dispatchers.

10 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: Actually, if I -- I don't  
11 know what, as far as your whole -- she had asked for one,  
12 but some things had come up that I was waiting for some  
13 testing to come up, so I'm actually currently requesting  
14 to hire three part time dispatchers.

15 We recently had eight, back as early as April of  
16 this year, we had eight dispatchers. That allowed us to  
17 pretty much eliminate any overtime that we had, because we  
18 were allowed to rotate the part time dispatchers. We had  
19 three full time dispatchers that are able to work 40  
20 hours. The part timers, as you know, we normally only  
21 have work 24 hours.

22 Hiring of three will bring us back up to eight.  
23 I have three candidates that have completely passed the  
24 background process. They have all been tested, they have  
25 had their drug screening; they are ready for immediate

1 hire today, if approved. So I do have three candidates  
2 that are ready to go.

3 MS. ROBERTS: Before us, we have one candidate  
4 name? Do you have the other two candidate names?

5 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: I do. I have a --

6 MR. STEMA: Wouldn't that be covered also in the  
7 item number three, where you go further down, to approve  
8 all positions?

9 MS. POWELL: If she's approved --

10 MR. STEMA: Yeah, if we do that, I think that  
11 will cover the filling the other two, and we can just  
12 handle this one, so.

13 MS. ROBERTS: Anything further?

14 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: No, not on that matter.

15 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to  
16 approve, deny, or postpone the hiring of a part time  
17 police dispatcher.

18 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

19 MS. SQUARE: Support.

20 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

21 (No response)

22 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
23 say aye. Aye.

24 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

25 MR. STEMA: Aye.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next on the agenda is approval of employment position for a part time police officer. Chief, would you like to summarize your request for the Board?

POLICE CHIEF MOISE: When we went through the part time positions, we had, I believe, I'm still having a little trouble getting some numbers together, but we had talked about throwing out a number of six part time officers. That would allow two part time officers per shift, to kind of rotate with the limited amount of days that they're allowed to work a week.

So currently we have two part time officers. We have one that is limited because he is a retiree, so he's limited on the number of hours he can work. So at this time we have three. So this officer would fill a vacancy of part timers that we used to have by officers that have since left the department, some transitions that we've made from the previous part time positions into full time. So basically filling a vacancy of a part time officer.

MS. ROBERTS: And that's Mr. Zoleski?

POLICE CHIEF MOISE: Zoleski. Yes.

MR. STEMA: Do part time get the benefits, too then --

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

POLICE CHIEF MOISE: They do not.

MR. STEMA: Or is it just strictly the hourly?

POLICE CHIEF MOISE: They just, yeah, they do not -- they get an hourly rate, and they do not get benefits.

MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to approve, deny or postpone the hiring of a part time police officer.

MS. SQUARE: So moved.

MS. ROBERTS: To approve?

MS. SQUARE: Approve.

MS. YOUNG: Second.

MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor say aye. Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Approval of ordinance 2015-02 was addressed in new business, approval of Resolution 2015-39 was also addressed in new business. But as a reminder, Ms. Powell, we will need to have that contract brought to the RTAB for approval.

1 MS. POWELL: Yes, ma'am.

2 MS. ROBERTS: Approval of Resolution 2015-40 was  
3 addressed in new business. Approval of Resolution 2015-41  
4 was addressed in new business. Approval of Resolution  
5 2015-42 was addressed in new business. Next on the agenda  
6 for approval is settlement of worker's compensation claim.  
7 Ms. Powell, would you like to summarize your request for  
8 the Board?

9 MS. POWELL: Yes, I'm actually going to defer to  
10 the public works -- or, the -- wow, the human resources  
11 director, Margaret Scanion.

12 MS. SCANION: Good afternoon. We have had a  
13 suit in a worker's comp claim since 2013. Our workman's  
14 comp attorney, Jeffrey Roehm, has suggested that we take  
15 this \$90,000 settlement, and actually in the long run, we  
16 would have had to have pay out our total workman's comp  
17 liability; we're actually saving about \$175,000 if we take  
18 this payoff.

19 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to  
20 approve, deny or postpone approval of a settlement for the  
21 worker's compensation claim.

22 MR. STEMA: Move to approve.

23 MS. SQUARE: Support.

24 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

25 (No response)

1 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
2 say aye. Aye.

3 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

4 MR. STEMA: Aye.

5 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

6 (No response)

7 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

8 Next on the agenda is approval of advanced  
9 request to hire police department personnel. Ms. -- would  
10 you like to summarize your response for the Board?

11 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: Yes, I have, as I spoke  
12 ahead of myself, as we have candidates that we've been  
13 looking at. We have requests for the dispatchers, and we  
14 have candidates tested and ready to go, so I'd like to  
15 hire three dispatchers immediately to satisfy, and bring  
16 us back up to the eight that we had several months ago.  
17 To eliminate, or hopefully alleviate, a good portion of  
18 the overtime that is caused by the dispatcher shortage.  
19 Because if we don't have a dispatcher that can work, we  
20 have to have an officer work.

21 MS. ROBERTS: Is it three total, or four?

22 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: Three total dispatchers.

23 MS. ROBERTS: Three total?

24 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: Yes.

25 MS. ROBERTS: This is also approval to hire four



1 part time officers.

2 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: Okay. Yes. That would  
3 help alleviate some of the overtime that we've had, due to  
4 the rotating days off, and scheduling of when the  
5 sergeant's off, we have a corporal fill the vacancy. So  
6 in order to alleviate some of the overtime that is caused  
7 by people that end up having the same days off as they  
8 rotate. This would help alleviate, if we have more.

9 I do come before, you, though -- we've had some  
10 recent incidences in which we've only had one two officer  
11 car working on a shift due to the staffing levels. This  
12 is not safe. It's not safe for the citizens, it's not  
13 safe for the officers.

14 Last week, the afternoon shift one two man car  
15 handled 20 runs. They were anywhere from barking dogs,  
16 loud animal fighting, loud parties, to carjackings. And  
17 I'm actually coming before you, and I don't know if this  
18 is out of line; I apologize if it is. But to hire full  
19 time officers instead of part time officers.

20 I know it will increase the costs dramatically,  
21 however, we have -- Ms. Powell and I have discussed,  
22 possibly a contract negotiations and going to 12 hour  
23 shifts, to help allow the officers to rotate days together  
24 so at one time you could have as many as five officers  
25 working at the same time. This would help alleviate

1 overtime. This would allow more officers on the street.  
2 If we do that, we will not have enough officers  
3 to cover -- 12 hour shifts require four platoons; we would  
4 not have enough officers to cover four platoons with the  
5 current staffing levels that we have now. So I --  
6 MS. ROBERTS: Four -- so the request is four  
7 full time --  
8 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: Full time officers.  
9 MS. ROBERTS: And I assume that that is fully  
10 budgeted?  
11 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: I don't know.  
12 MS. POWELL: There is budget there for the part  
13 time officers, because we're not providing benefits.  
14 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: At this time, I --  
15 MR. STEMA: She wants to hire full time.  
16 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: I'm -- I guess we can start  
17 with, if we start with the part time officers, and then we  
18 can, as get them trained, then maybe I'll bring my request  
19 to you again for --  
20 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. Okay. We'll leave it at  
21 the four part time.  
22 MS. POWELL: Yes. Let's do that. We'll leave  
23 it at the four part time.  
24 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: I'm sorry. I apologize.  
25 Four part time officers that will help with -- allows us

1 to rotate --

2 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. And I want to clarify, this  
3 is four total, so it's three in addition to the one that  
4 we approved?

5 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: Yes.

6 MS. ROBERTS: Okay.

7 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: Do you have all my requests  
8 about bringing one of the current part time officers to  
9 full time? Is that part of this whole -- is that? Okay.

10 MS. POWELL: Yes. Yes. That's your memo, yes.

11 POLICE CHIEF MOISE: Okay. So we do currently  
12 have a part time officer that I would like to make full  
13 time, due to the staffing deficiencies made by the acting  
14 positions as people have rotated up into acting positions.

15 The contract requires that we have 15 full time  
16 officers; we currently only have 14. One of the -- day  
17 shift only has four. And to satisfy contractual  
18 requirements, I am requesting to take one of our current  
19 part time officers and just make him full time, which  
20 would allow him to have benefits; it would allow him to  
21 work 40 hours a week, which hopefully would also alleviate  
22 some of the overtime.

23 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to  
24 approve, deny or postpone the advanced approval of hiring  
25 police department personnel.

1 MS. SQUARE: Motion to approve.  
2 MR. STEMA: Second.  
3 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?  
4 (No response)  
5 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
6 say aye. Aye.  
7 MS. YOUNG: Aye.  
8 MR. STEMA: Aye.  
9 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.  
10 (No response)  
11 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.  
12 MR. VAN de GRIFT: Madame Chair, that was for  
13 part time?  
14 MR. STEMA: Yes.  
15 MS. ROBERTS: That was for part time.  
16 MR. VAN de GRIFT: Thank you.  
17 MS. ROBERTS: Board directive requiring council  
18 members to complete core courses for municipal government  
19 was addressed in old business. And corrective action plan  
20 for audit deficiencies was also addressed in old business.  
21 To public comment -- Mr. Van de Grift, do we have anyone  
22 signed up for public comment?  
23 MR. VAN de GRIFT: We do. Councilman Zwolak.  
24 Two minutes.  
25 MR. ZWOLAK: Thank you. Good afternoon.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MS. ROBERTS: Good afternoon.

MR. ZWOLAK: I just wish we had five other council people here to be informed of what's been going on because of the very enlightening session we're having today. Any my other concern is, will, what will be the penalty if the council person does not comply with the core requirements for MML? That would be my question, and I could refer back to the other councils, to let them know what the penalty is.

Also, when is the agenda, or when do you receive the agenda for the TAB board meetings?

MS. ROBERTS: Friday.

MR. STEMA: Fridays? I get them around Friday, so, Friday.

MS. SQUARE: Friday.

MR. ZWOLAK: Okay, well I would simply make a request on my part, as well as the rest of council, if we could get copies of those Friday also, so we could be a little bit aware of what's been going on, including the attachments; I'd appreciate that. If we could.

MS. POWELL: We don't get the attachments. We get the agenda on Friday, it's posted on Friday. As soon as we receive it, it now -- you all approved last month that it goes to the city clerk, it goes to my assistant, it goes to several other people, as well as to myself,

1 with the authority to post. And then it's being posted as  
2 soon as it's received.

3 MS. ROBERTS: The agenda is posted on the city's  
4 website.

5 MS. POWELL: Yes ma'am. And out in our lobby.

6 MS. ROBERTS: Okay.

7 MR. ZWOLAK: The other concern I have, and since  
8 we brought up the traffic program, one of the things  
9 within the contract, and this is, that we have to have a  
10 sustainability report every six months. We've already  
11 passed a year, we haven't received one sustainability  
12 report in terms of the actual traffic overtime program.  
13 So how can we even evaluate where we're going on that?

14 So we're in trouble today, we're \$3 million a  
15 year in the hole because of our overtime programs going  
16 back to the eighties, and I don't see us making any  
17 corrections in that particular situation, especially with  
18 overtime and traffic.

19 The TAB board has been somewhat blamed for our  
20 delayed program in terms of the street patching, we're  
21 still going through that right now, but if maybe the TAB  
22 board -- since the TAB board has approved the hiring or  
23 the -- capital improvement equipment for snow removal  
24 equipment, as well as for the storage site, and we're  
25 about maybe two months away from, maybe, our initial snow

1 season.

2 MS. ROBERTS: Wishful thinking.

3 MR. ZWOLAK: And I -- well, I mean, as far as I  
4 know. Well, it's not wishful thinking but the concern I  
5 have is that we're establishing a DPW department for snow  
6 removal, buying equipment which the TAB board's approved.  
7 We have no idea what the program is going to be for this  
8 winter, or what our options or terms are going to be. So  
9 we're looking for some guidance from the TAB board.

10 MR. STEMA: I'm going to say this, that maybe it  
11 was at the one meeting that I missed earlier in the year;  
12 I don't remember approving any snow equipment.

13 MR. ZWOLEK: Yes you did. The capital equipment  
14 program. You approved the capital --

15 MS. ROBERTS: Yeah, we approved the capital  
16 equipment program.

17 MR. STEMA: Oh, it was in the total capital  
18 equipment. Okay, yeah.

19 MR. ZWOLEK: Okay. So, I mean, we've already  
20 gone and started that process.

21 MS. ROBERTS: But then the council would be  
22 working with this --

23 MR. ZWOLEK: I'm seeking some direction here.  
24 Some information.

25 MS. POWELL: That's the city manager role. We'd

1 run the operation.

2 MR. STEMA: Yeah.

3 MS. POWELL: So, as long as there is funding  
4 available, in the Act 51 fund, which there is, it is  
5 completely up to the discretion of management to decide  
6 how that operation is ran.

7 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you, councilman. Any  
8 additional public comment?

9 MR. VAN de GRIFF: Indeed. Ms. Kathy Gordon.

10 MS. GORDON: Good afternoon, ladies and  
11 gentlemen.

12 MS. ROBERTS: Good afternoon.

13 MS. SQUARE: Good afternoon.

14 MS. YOUNG: Good afternoon.

15 MS. GORDON: I respectfully thank you for  
16 allowing me to speak. This will probably be the last TAB  
17 board meeting I attend, until I get a seat behind that  
18 council counter. Kind of frustrated, as a resident. I've  
19 heard a lot of complaints.

20 I had my 50th year class reunion this weekend; I  
21 was ashamed to say I even lived here. Because all I heard  
22 was how people came back after 50 years and how filthy the  
23 streets were. How filthy the community was. And how  
24 economically depraved the main business district is.

25 I really don't see any democracy here. I see



1 you guys sit here as rubber stamps to whatever she wants  
2 to do. And that's fine -- I mean, maybe you have the  
3 power and maybe you don't. Maybe I don't understand how  
4 the system works. Being on council for six years, I would  
5 like to think I did, but I don't.

6 I guess my main concern is, what is council's  
7 role here? I mean, you guys approve things, hire police  
8 officers without even notifying council about giving  
9 council a chance to even give you some input on this.  
10 It's like you really don't care what the community thinks,  
11 because our liaison is this council.

12 So if we can't give feedback to the council,  
13 because they don't know, therefore, you don't know. All  
14 you know is what this young lady tells you. Where are we  
15 in the picture and the scheme of all this? Where are the  
16 people? I mean, we have two residents here.

17 I live on Norwalk; have you guys driven these  
18 streets? I had three feet of water on my front lawn  
19 Sunday, all the way to my front step. Three feet of  
20 water.

21 MS. ROBERTS: Well, if you were in Lansing, in a  
22 car, it was up to the middle of its door.

23 MS. GORDON: Because the storm drain -- storm  
24 drain wasn't draining. I had to go out there Monday  
25 morning and sweep it. I mean, I don't mind, but, I think

1 there's more important things that need to be addressed by  
2 the council, and if the council doesn't know, and it comes  
3 to you before council --

4 MS. ROBERTS: Things don't come to us before  
5 council. If you went through this -- council approves,  
6 and then we approve their agendas. The hiring is -- sits  
7 with your city manager.

8 MS. GORDON: I would bet you -- I would believe  
9 you, what you say, I'm not disputing that. I highly doubt  
10 that council knows that there's a request to hire police  
11 personnel.

12 MR. VAN de GRIFF: It's been two minutes.

13 MS. POWELL: That's --

14 MS. GORDON: Is that on the agenda? I never  
15 saw it on the agenda.

16 MS. POWELL: It -- first of all, this is public  
17 comment; it's not supposed to be back and forth.

18 MS. GORDON: Okay, well then, don't answer.  
19 Please. Don't interrupt.

20 MS. ROBERTS: Your two minutes are up.

21 MS. GORDON: That's all I'm saying. And I have,  
22 respectfully request, to see -- is it possible I could get  
23 on the mailing list, to get a complete packet of the TAB  
24 board's agenda?

25 MS. ROBERTS: The agenda is available on the

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

website.

MS. GORDON: I know that, but it's just the agenda, not the attachments.

MS. ROBERTS: Only as the agenda's posted.

MS. GORDON: Well, how do we get the attachments?

MS. ROBERTS: I don't know that the attachments are the --

MS. GORDON: Are we not privy to that, is that what you're saying?

MS. ROBERTS: I'm not sure.

MR. VAN de GRIFT: I can speak to that.

MS. GORDON: Okay, well, who know?

MR. VAN de GRIFT: I would know.

MS. GORDON: Okay, thank you.

MR. VAN de GRIFT: Yep. So, we have administrative staff at Treasury, that put together the agenda with input from the chair of the board. We ask the city for the packets from the -- that come from the city council meetings. And so, so for example, the overtime report, that was something that was requested at a previous meeting. It was, I believe, available to the city council as well, so --

MS. GORDON: Was it, Mr. Zwolak?

MR. ZWOLAK: We see a monthly report, but we

1 don't see a current breakdown. Again, sustained -- we  
2 brought up a sustainability report, which is not --

3 MR. VAN de GRIFT: So, I suppose the only thing  
4 I can say is that the -- the information that the board  
5 members receive in their monthly packets that go out on  
6 the Friday before the following Tuesday, it's an  
7 amalgamation of reports that have already been submitted  
8 to the city council. So, then an agenda is produced by  
9 the --

10 MS. GORDON: Well I can tell you this as a  
11 resident -- the council members I spoke to, not just Mr.  
12 Zwolak, do not concur with that. That's not what we're  
13 getting from the councilmembers.

14 MR. VAN de GRIFT: I can't speak to what you're  
15 getting; I can say what we're getting. And what we're  
16 getting is directly from the city. So the notion that  
17 there are somehow, you know, additional documents that are  
18 unknown to the council are, and by extension to the  
19 residents, I think is not correct.

20 MS. GORDON: Okay, so somebody's lying, is what  
21 you're saying.

22 MR. VAN de GRIFT: That's not what I'm saying.  
23 I'm telling you what we get and what we give to the RTAB  
24 members.

25 MS. GORDON: Okay, well I won't be here again.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Thank you.

MS. ROBERTS: Thank you. Any board comment? I would entertain a motion to adjourn.

MS. SQUARE: Move to adjourn.

MR. STEMA: Second it.

MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

(No response.)

MS. ROBERTS: We are adjourned. It's 1:34.

1 STATE OF MICHIGAN  
2 COUNTY OF WASHTENAW ).ss  
3

4 I certify that this transcript is a complete, true, and  
5 correct transcript to the best of my ability of the RTAB  
6 meeting held on July 14, 2015, City of Ecorse. I also certify  
7 that I am not a relative or employee of the parties involved  
8 and have no financial interest in this case.  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13

14 RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED: September 2, 2015,  
15

16 *s/ Amy Shankleton-Novess*  
17

18 Amy Shankleton-Novess (CER 0838)  
19 Certified Electronic Reporter  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25