

City of Hamtramck

Receivership Transition Advisory Board Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, January 26th, 2016

Hamtramck City Hall

Council Chambers - 2nd Floor

3401 Evaline

Hamtramck, Michigan 48212

RTAB MEMBERS PRESENT:

**DEB ROBERTS, Chair
KAREN YOUNG
PETER MCINERNEY
MARK STEMA**

Also present:

**Katrina Powell
City Administrator**

**DREW VAN de GRIFT
Michigan Department of Treasury
Office of Fiscal Responsibility**

Reported by:

**Nina Lunsford (CER 4539)
Modern Court Reporting & Video, LLC
SCAO FIRM NO. 08228
101-A North Lewis Street
Saline, Michigan 48176
(734) 429-9143/nel**

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Called to order at 1:01 p.m.

Tuesday, January 26, 2016

MS. ROBERTS: I will call the Receivership Transition Advisory Board for Hamtramck to order. Roll call please, Mr. Van de Grift.

MR. VAN de GRIFT: Albert Bodgan?

(No response)

MR. VAN de GRIFT: Absent. Peter McInerney?

MR. McINERNEY: Present.

MR. VAN de GRIFT: Deborah Roberts?

MS. ROBERTS: Here.

MR. VAN de GRIFT: Mark Stema?

MR. STEMA: Here.

MR. VAN de GRIFT: Karen Young?

MS. YOUNG: Here.

MR. VAN de GRIFT: Our quorum is present.

MS. ROBERTS: Thank you. As a reminder to the public, if anybody wishes to speak, if they could please sign up at the podium, at the appropriate time, we will call your name.

First on the agenda is approval of the agenda. I would entertain a motion to approve the agenda is presented.

MR. McINERNEY: So moved.

MS. YOUNG: Second.

1 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

2 (No response)

3 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor say
4 aye. Aye.

5 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

6 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

7 MR. STEMA: Aye.

8 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

9 (No response)

10 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next on the agenda
11 is approval of RTAB minutes. First, is the December 26th,
12 2015 regular minutes. Ms. Powell, I just ask, in the
13 future, under the consent agenda, if it's made sure that
14 it listed what consent items were approved. I think it
15 just says consent agenda on that month, and then the vote.

16 MS. POWELL: It did, and we changed it.

17 MS. ROBERTS: Okay, thank you. So I would
18 entertain a motion to approve the December 22nd, 2015 -- I
19 put that on the wrong --

20 MR. VAN de GRIFT: These are the RTAB minutes.

21 MS. ROBERTS: These are the RTAB minutes. I'm
22 sorry. I would entertain a motion to approve the December
23 22nd, 2015 RTAB meeting minutes.

24 MR. McINERNEY: I move to approve the minutes of
25 our meeting of December 22nd, as presented.

1 MS. YOUNG: Second it.

2

3 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

4 (No response)

5 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor say
6 aye. Aye.

7 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

8 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

9 MR. STEMA: Aye.

10 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

11 (No response)

12 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. First under old
13 business, is the resolutions from regular city council
14 meeting of November 10th, 2015. We did not formally
15 approve these minutes last month, and so I would entertain
16 a motion now to approve all ordinances and resolutions
17 from the November 10th, 2015 regular city council meeting.

18 MR. McINERNEY: I move that we approve it, but I
19 have a question. Just for clarification, I mean, we
20 didn't approve them because they weren't on the agenda,
21 isn't that right? It was kind of inadvertently left off
22 the agenda. It wasn't like we considered and refused to
23 approve them.

24 MR. VAN de GRIFT: Exactly right.

25 MS. ROBERTS: That's correct.

1 MR. McINERNEY: Okay, so just with that
2 clarification, I move we approve the item for November the
3 10th.

4 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. Second?

5 MS. YOUNG: Second.

6 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

7 (No response)

8 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor say
9 aye. Aye.

10 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

11 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

12 MR. STEMA: Aye.

13 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

14 (No response)

15 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next on the
16 agenda, a police study update? Ms. Powell, could you
17 please update the board on the status of this matter?

18 MS. POWELL: Gladly, ma'am. If you will recall,
19 last meeting, I told you that our police -- that I had
20 turned it over to our police chief to make this a priority
21 for her, and I am in possession of three proposals that I
22 will be submitting to the state for consideration. So
23 we'll be moving forward as soon as we can work out the
24 finances. That'll be next.

25 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. Thank you. Moving on --

1 MR. McINERNEY: These are to conduct a study?

2 MS. POWELL: Correct.

3 MR. McINERNEY: Okay, thank you.

4 MS. ROBERTS: Moving on to new business. First
5 on the agenda is resolutions from the regular city council
6 meeting of December 8th, 2015. I would entertain a motion
7 to approve all ordinances and resolutions from the
8 December 8th, 2015 regular city council meeting.

9 MR. McINERNEY: So moved.

10 MS. YOUNG: Second.

11 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

12 (No response)

13 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor say
14 aye. Aye.

15 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

16 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

17 MR. STEMA: Aye.

18 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

19 (No response)

20 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next on the agenda
21 is resolutions from the special city council meeting of
22 December 15th, 2015. I would entertain a motion to
23 approve all ordinances and resolutions from the December
24 15th, 2015 special city council meeting.

25 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

1 MS. YOUNG: Second.

2 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

3 (No response)

4 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor say
5 aye. Aye.

6 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

7 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

8 MR. STEMA: Aye.

9 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

10 (No response)

11 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next on the agenda
12 is the resolutions from the regular city council meeting
13 of December 22nd, 2015. I would entertain a motion to
14 approve all ordinances and resolutions from the December
15 22nd, 2015 regular city council meeting.

16 MR. McINERNEY: So moved.

17 MS. YOUNG: Second.

18 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

19 (No response)

20 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor say
21 aye. Aye.

22 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

23 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

24 MR. STEMA: Aye.

25 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

1 (No response)

2 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next on the agenda
3 is the resolutions from the organizational city council
4 meeting of January 5th, 2016. I would entertain a motion
5 to approve all ordinances and resolutions from the January
6 5th, 2016 organizational city council meeting.

7 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve.

8 MR. McINERNEY: Support.

9 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

10 MR. STEMA: I have a question. I notice they
11 moved the city council meetings to 6:30. Was there any
12 reason given for that? I know normally you like them a
13 little later so the public can make it and all that,
14 because of work?

15 MS. POWELL: We actually changed it back to 7:00.

16 MR. STEMA: Oh, you did?

17 MS. POWELL: They'll be considering that tonight,
18 on a resolution, so.

19 MR. STEMA: Okay.

20 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

21 MR. STEMA: No.

22 MS. ROBERTS: All those in favor say aye. Aye.

23 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

24 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

25 MR. STEMA: Aye.

1 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

2 (No response)

3 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next on the agenda
4 are the claims and accounts from the regular city council
5 meeting draft minutes of January 12th, 2016. I would
6 entertain a motion to approve, deny or postpone claims and
7 accounts from the regular city council draft minutes of
8 January 12th, 2016.

9 MR. McINERNEY: So moved.

10 MR. STEMA: Seconded.

11 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

12 (No response)

13 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor say
14 aye. Aye.

15 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

16 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

17 MR. STEMA: Aye.

18 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

19 (No response)

20 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next on the agenda
21 is the city administrator items. Approval of city council
22 meetings was already addressed in new business. Next up
23 is approval of budget to actual and cash flow reports. I
24 would entertain a motion to approve, deny or postpone the
25 budget to actual and cash flow reports.

1 MR. McINERNEY: I have a question on this, which
2 will probably come up later on the agenda when we talk
3 about member Bodgan's comments, but I'd like to have
4 someone explain exactly what this means, in terms of the
5 budget to actual, as opposed to monthly, or annual, or
6 exactly what, and I've looked at the document, it looks
7 like it's a six month report to me, but, there's going to
8 be discussion later about having more detailed reports.

9 And I guess I want to understand what this one
10 is. This seems to me the crucial document in terms of the
11 budget to actual, as well as the cash flow. I have no
12 problem with the documents presented, but I just want to--

13 MS. POWELL: Understand how to read it?

14 MR. McINERNEY: Yes.

15 MS. POWELL: Okay.

16 MR. McINERNEY: As opposed -- as opposed to a --
17 I mean, this one's a little bit simpler because it's a six
18 month, so it's easy to do the math for a half of a year.
19 But, and since I'm new, I'm trying to make sure I
20 understand as we go month by month, how we read this
21 stuff. And how we understand what's going to be
22 happening. I realize that's a little vague, sorry about
23 that.

24 MS. POWELL: That's okay, I think I understand
25 what you're saying. Okay, so, in looking at the form, you

1 will see the -- well, the first sheet that you have are
2 the revenues.

3 MR. McINERNEY: Right.

4 MS. POWELL: And these are the revenues for the
5 general fund. Actually, these are the revenues for --
6 yeah, for the general fund. On the next page, you will
7 have, in the first column, the 2015-16 original budget;
8 that was the budget that was adopted by the city council
9 and it actually was approved by the state, Department of
10 Treasury. The next one is any amendments that were made
11 to that budget later on.

12 MR. McINERNEY: On a case by case basis? Kind of
13 a cumulative of the amendments?

14 MS. POWELL: Typically, we amend the budget once
15 a year.

16 MR. McINERNEY: Okay.

17 MS. POWELL: It's amended prior to, or right
18 after adoption. Of last year. I guess, in history, you
19 need to understand that the budget was approved, there was
20 a two year budget approved prior to our emergency manager
21 leaving the city, and this is her budget that she
22 presented. So any amendments that were made, we made
23 those prior to it being adopted this last year, in June.

24 The year to date balance shows you what's been
25 used of that budget, up until now, because it's six

1 months, if it were last month, you would see what had been
2 used up to that point. And you will see that total change
3 every month, based on whatever expenditures or revenues we
4 have coming in and going out. The percentage of budget
5 used is based on the amount that, for example, under the
6 first, actually, let's do--

7 MR. McINERNEY: We can just go to the bottom
8 line, the --

9 MS. POWELL: The line item one right there, look
10 at the bottom line.

11 MR. McINERNEY: Which is in your memo.

12 MS. POWELL: Correct. The bottom line will show
13 you, in each fund, in each, yeah, in each fund, it will
14 show you what percentage of that budget has been used up
15 to now. So we should be at about 50 percent, 51 percent.

16 MR. McINERNEY: And is this -- I mean, obviously,
17 there's a lot of things we have to watch, but in your
18 view, is this one of the crucial items we're looking at,
19 on a month by month basis? Where we are on revenue, not
20 to mention expenses?

21 MS. POWELL: Correct, yes.

22 MR. McINERNEY: Okay.

23 MS. POWELL: As well as the cash flow summary,
24 and we kind of summarize that in the cash flow summary
25 spreadsheet. We kind of show you where we are in each

1 fund.

2 MR. McINERNEY: Right.

3 MS. POWELL: With cash on hand. But yes, this is
4 a document that you really need to pay attention to. It's
5 what we pay attention to prior to giving it to you, so we
6 know where we are in each fund overall.

7 MR. McINERNEY: Right.

8 MS. POWELL: We don't really, I mean, we care
9 about what's happening on each line, but --

10 MR. McINERNEY: That's all right.

11 MS. POWELL: More importantly, we look at the
12 overall for that particular.

13 MR. McINERNEY: I'm going to move we approve this
14 item as requested, but as I said, we're going to be coming
15 back to this later, so I kind of wanted to start the
16 conversation a little bit, so.

17 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. Do I have a second?

18 MS. YOUNG: Second.

19 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion? Seeing
20 none, all those in favor say aye. Aye.

21 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

22 MR. STEMA: Aye.

23 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

24 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed the same.

25 (No response)

1 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carried. Next on the agenda
2 is the approval of the invoice register and preapproved
3 expenditures. I would entertain a motion to approve,
4 deny, or postpone the invoice register and preapproved
5 expenditures.

6 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve.

7 MR. McINERNEY: Support.

8 MR. STEMA: Second it.

9 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

10 (No response)

11 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor say
12 aye. Aye.

13 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

14 MR. STEMA: Aye.

15 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

16 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed the same.

17 (No response)

18 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next on the agenda
19 is approval of the citywide overtime report.

20 Ms. Powell, would you like to provide a summary
21 of the progress the city is making in regards to this
22 issue?

23 MS. POWELL: Yes ma'am. You can see that our
24 overtime is about the same. It's up a little more in this
25 particular month because of the three pay periods that

1 went into this month, versus, actually we have four pay
2 periods, I think; yeah, we had three pay periods. So,
3 you're seeing some of November in this as well. Versus
4 typically you'll just see two pay periods in the month.
5 This one we have three, so, it's up just a little bit but
6 overall it's basically the same.

7 And you will see, Board member Stema, we included
8 like the reimbursements column. You can see that we're
9 reimbursing the FBI piece, that's what we've got thus far
10 for reimbursement. And if the chief wants to say anything
11 more, she's --

12 MR. STEMA: I do have a couple of questions on
13 that, just based on the previous discussion. I know a
14 couple of these items, at least more than that, that -- on
15 the overtime, you guys said would be reimbursed; there was
16 some other form, and all that? I only see one item, so,
17 when I look at like the police, the, the traffic, I
18 thought was being reimbursed because it basically is
19 covered by tickets and all that, or to show that you're
20 actually --

21 MS. POWELL: It is covered, but that's not what's
22 depicted on this sheet; you get to see what we've
23 collected for the month in the other district court. One
24 that we provide you, you can see the revenue that's coming
25 in. It's not depicted on here because it's not really

1 reimbursed.

2 MR. STEMA: I know it's not a true dollar to
3 dollar, but for us to get a better idea of, you know, the
4 traffic's going, you know, where the overtime's going, if
5 we could actually see it and even coinciding revenue.

6 I mean, it's just a number to say okay we have
7 this, we have that, and what's negatively affecting the
8 budget. That's really the goal, of just to see the
9 reimbursement, to see what's truly affecting the budget,
10 what could be out of whack by the end of the year, and
11 what could cause issues.

12 MS. POWELL: Well, and a lot of that's depicted
13 in the budget to actual report that we give you.

14 MR. STEMA: Yeah, yeah.

15 MS. POWELL: You can kind of see where the
16 money's coming in, because we actually point out the fines
17 and forfeitures for the year. Granted, that money is not
18 going back into the police department budget, it's
19 actually going back into the fines and forfeiture line.
20 But, I understand what you're saying.

21 MR. STEMA: Yeah.

22 MS. POWELL: A lot of the revenue that's coming
23 in, we don't really know if the ticket was written the
24 month that the overtime was incurred, because it depends
25 on when they come in to pay their ticket, whether they

1 went to court, what was the outcome of that.

2 It's really hard for us to give an actual number
3 as to whether or not the revenue that came in covered the
4 overtime for this month.

5 MR. STEMA: So, basically, you're hope is that it
6 covers it, right?

7 MS. POWELL: Well, what has been budgeted is what
8 we're looking at, as we estimated that we would have this
9 amount of money coming in, in fines and forfeitures, and
10 we estimated this was what we're going to incur in
11 overtime. In traffic as well as regular police business.
12 And we actually break that out on the budget to actual; we
13 break it out as to whether this was overtime or whether it
14 was just regular overtime.

15 MR. STEMA: So from a budget standpoint, then,
16 compared to this overtime report, how does it look?
17 Percentage wise and all that?

18 MS. POWELL: Well, when you go to the police
19 department budget, actually it's kind of broken down
20 because you've got your auto theft broken out from the
21 police department.

22 MR. STEMA: How about instead of reimbursement in
23 that column, you actually put the budget amount, so we
24 could at least see it; have one report and not have to go
25 back and forth to do a comparison. Is that possible?

1 Bama?

2 MS. CAIRNS: Yes.

3 MS. POWELL: Sure.

4 MR. STEMA: Don't do the reimbursement; give me
5 the budget amount, so I can actually look, and say okay,
6 we spent 101, what's the budget for the year, just to see
7 if we're going over the budget.

8 MS. CAIRNS: It's on page seven. Page seven, the
9 first two lines. I can always possibly put that in the
10 spreadsheet.

11 MS. POWELL: We can put in a spreadsheet, so
12 it'll be a little easier for you to see.

13 MR. STEMA: I think that would just make it
14 easier.

15 MS. POWELL: Yeah.

16 MR. STEMA: And get a better understanding where
17 we're at.

18 MS. POWELL: Thank you Bama, I was searching for
19 it. Yeah, you can see, there's on page seven, you can see
20 the traffic overtime, as well as the regular overtime.

21 MR. STEMA: Okay.

22 MS. POWELL: But we'll put it in a spreadsheet so
23 you can see it all in one spot.

24 MR. STEMA: Great, thank you.

25 MS. POWELL: Yep.

1 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion? I think we
2 had a motion and second. Any further discussion?

3 (No response)

4 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor of
5 --actually, I don't think we did.

6 MR. VAN de GRIFT: I don't think we had a motion.

7 MS. ROBERTS: We didn't.

8 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

9 MS. YOUNG: Second.

10 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

11 (No response)

12 MS. ROBERTS: All those in favor say aye. Aye.

13 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

14 MR. STEMA: Aye.

15 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

16 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed the same.

17 (No response)

18 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Then we have the
19 report of the district court revenues; that is for
20 information only. And are, to -- public comment. Mr. Van
21 de Grift, do we have any signed up for comments?

22 MR. VAN de GRIFT: We do. Ms. Kathy Gordon. Two
23 minutes.

24 MS. GORDON: Thank you. I'm Kathy Gordon, 2758
25 Norwalk. I have a couple questions for this honorable

1 board, and thank you for allowing me to speak. I see
2 approval of invoice registers, budget to actual cash flow.
3 I guess my question is, you can approve all this, but
4 where are the budget amendments?

5 I mean, you have legal and you have overtime
6 that's over 98 percent. How do you approve this stuff
7 with no amendment to the budget? If you're at 97 percent
8 of the budget, and you still have six months to go? I
9 would kind of think you would mandate some budget
10 amendments.

11 The next thing I want to address is our income
12 tax board of review. Pretty it's much a public act,
13 income tax act. Any city or township that collects income
14 tax must have a income tax board of review. Now, four
15 years ago, this honorable council put a board of review
16 together; we made appointments.

17 This is going on four years and no board of
18 review has met. Now, I've had quite a few people contact
19 me. I guess we're going to be in big trouble if there's a
20 class action lawsuit. Because that's going to stop all
21 revenue coming in from income tax, just because three
22 people will not meet and have a board of review. I don't
23 understand that.

24 The next thing I want to address, are the
25 contacts -- are all the contracts that have been

1 cancelled, and all these new contracts that have been
2 issued. I see what happened to a young man that was on
3 tv, about a couple weeks ago, about being charged with a
4 felony over \$5600 because he would not -- related to some
5 no bid contracts in Detroit. Well, I've got to say to you
6 guys, the same gentleman had a contract here. And you
7 cancelled his contract, never bid it out, and we have a
8 new contractor. We've done that with IT, he was our IT
9 man. We've done that with our water contractor.

10 I mean, where are the bids? I'm saying to you
11 guys, how do you approve these contracts with no bids?

12 MR. VAN de GRIFT: That is two minutes.

13 MS. GORDON: Thank you.

14 MR. VAN de GRIFT: Bob Zwolak.

15 MR. ZWOLAK: Good afternoon.

16 MS. YOUNG: Good afternoon.

17 MS. ROBERTS: Good afternoon.

18 MR. ZWOLAK: I want to express my appreciation to
19 the TAB board for the number of questions that are raised
20 by the board members, relative to reports and the agenda.
21 Especially with Mr. McInerney and Mr. Bogdan for bringing
22 in some new perspective, so I really do appreciate the
23 questions that we're seeing here.

24 I'm wondering -- again, I voice the same concerns
25 that Ms. Gordon does, relative to the budget amendments.

1 In all the years that I've been familiar and involved with
2 city budgeting, we've seen, we have been experiencing
3 regular budget amendments when there were need to adjust
4 the budget.

5 And of course, our, always our biggest concern,
6 we always watch is that, legal fees. Which seems to be
7 really out of whack at this particular point in time. I
8 think from a standpoint of -- I may be mistaken, I thought
9 it was a state law. I know it's within our charter that
10 we cannot exceed our budget amendment -- our budget
11 allotments. And we need to deal with that on a more
12 regular basis, in order to keep track of our financial
13 situation.

14 At the last meeting, I had made a concern, and
15 I'm wondering whether or not the TAB board has received
16 the evaluation report that the council had made on the
17 city manager, that I think would be more appropriate,
18 also, for the TAB board to be aware of how the evaluation
19 how it was just conducted on the city manager.

20 That's about it, and thank you for your time and
21 patience.

22 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you.

23 MR. VAN de GRIFT: That concludes public comment.

24 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. Board comment. Mr. Bogdan
25 had some concerns but Mr. Bogdan is not here, so I don't

1 know if --

2 MR. McINERNEY: I'd like to comment on Mr.
3 Bogdan's comments. And I might say also that he regrets
4 he can't be here. He had a health issue a couple hours
5 ago, and an email was sent out. I just saw it before I
6 headed over here, so, he apologizes for not being here.
7 He also professed his interest in participating
8 electronically if that was possible. Apparently our rules
9 don't specifically provide for that, and so in the absence
10 of that, we're not going to get into that.

11 But his question, as I understand it, and Mark
12 has had a chance, I mean, he had a chance to just talk
13 briefly. I didn't get a chance to talk to Karen or the
14 chair, so chime in if you understand this better than I
15 do.

16 But I want -- this is the issue where we got to
17 the budget and the year to date expend -- you know,
18 revenue and expenditures issues. And he's asking, he
19 thinks that, at least he needs a monthly budget
20 projection and actuals, for the balance of the year.

21 So I'm not sure exactly what he means by that, as
22 I kind of -- that's why I was a little vague earlier in
23 the meeting when that item came up. I mean, it seems like
24 you're providing each month, a report, that shows that
25 including that month, and a percentage for the year.

1 So I guess at that time, I mean, if you -- you're
2 available, to field questions that we may have about that.
3 Is he, do you think he's asking for something in writing?

4 MR. STEMA: I think it was -- what he would have
5 wanted, is, you know, here's the expenditures, here's the
6 budget. But basically take the percentage net to the year
7 to date one. You know what I mean? The budget year to
8 date, like if it was nine months I think he was talking
9 about, you know?

10 Dividing the budget by nine, saying this is a
11 comparison to that, to the budget, you know what I mean?
12 I -- it's just, you know, you could normally do math like
13 he was saying; I think what he wanted was the nine months
14 in, instead of showing the year end budget, show what the
15 budget should be after nine months and compare it to that.
16 I think is what he wanted. Bama, you understand what I'm
17 talking about?

18 MS. CAIRNS: No.

19 MS. POWELL: No.

20 MR. STEMA: I think what he wanted in the report
21 was, obviously, actual is up to date to that month.

22 MS. CAIRNS: Right.

23 MR. STEMA: Budget wise, he wanted the report to
24 look at and say, okay, after six months, let's say the
25 budget is three million, to give you an example.

1 MS. CAIRNS: Okay.

2 MR. STEMA: Then we'd have what a -- he would
3 want it to show the budget 1.5 versus the actual. Because
4 up to that date, you should use six months of the budget,
5 and I think that's what he was talking about and would
6 like.

7 MS. CAIRNS: Okay.

8 MS. POWELL: So, excuse me, Bama. So that the
9 column that says the amount of the budget used --

10 MR. STEMA: The percentage wise.

11 MS. POWELL: The percentage, and tells you what's
12 been used up to this point of the budget.

13 MR. STEMA: Yeah.

14 MS. POWELL: So, I mean, you can kind of do the
15 math. We're in January, and our budget is from July 1st
16 to June 30th, so that's about 50 percent of the year. So
17 we should --

18 MR. STEMA: Yeah, yeah, you'd do the math really
19 quick that may be the reason he wanted it.

20 MS. POWELL: Yeah. So I'm trying to, I guess I
21 don't understand what would be the percentage?

22 MR. McINERNEY: Well, I think Mark's comment
23 helps me a little bit. I've seen budgets where there is
24 basically four columns. They're telling you what the
25 budget is for the year, and where you're at, and what the

1 budget would be for five months. And, or six months, or
2 seven months. And where you're at, as to that. So
3 there's really, you know, there's sort of four columns.

4 MR. STEMA: Yeah, I think that's a -- that's a,
5 based on my brief discussion I had with him, that's what
6 he was looking for. That's the dollar --

7 MS. ROBERTS: Because it's really, if you do that
8 math, and I --

9 MR. STEMA: Yeah.

10 MS. ROBERTS: The city doesn't collect their
11 revenues on a monthly basis.

12 MR. STEMA: No, I agree.

13 MS. ROBERTS: And a -- so I'm not sure --

14 MR. STEMA: It would probably be better if he was
15 here to explain it.

16 MS. ROBERTS: Yeah. I think we'll have --

17 MS. POWELL: Yeah, and well maybe --

18 MR. STEMA: What he's exactly looking for,
19 because I mean, I do everything in my head, so, when I
20 look at everything.

21 MS. POWELL: And maybe if he wanted to come in
22 and sit down with Bama and I, to maybe have a one on one
23 class on how to read this document, and what it actually
24 means. It's confusing when you aren't familiar with how
25 this stuff is laid out.

1 MR. STEMA: Yeah.

2 MS. POWELL: So, maybe he --

3 MR. McINERNEY: He's also sensitive to merely
4 creating another administrative burden for the city. So,
5 I mean, you might. He said that, I didn't make it up.
6 So, I guess in anticipating, I mean obviously, we all need
7 to be comfortable with the information we're receiving,
8 so, he's new but he's not quite comfortable with the
9 information we're receiving, so, I guess we could hold
10 this, don't you think?

11 MR. STEMA: Maybe it's better for Al to be here
12 to explain that one.

13 MS. POWELL: Yeah, so we're, I mean, like I said,
14 he can come in with Bama and I, and sit down, and we can
15 kind of go through and kind of explain it to you in
16 detail. Because I mean, you, quite honestly, you guys
17 were like, appointed, and you came in, and we -- everyone
18 automatically assumed you know how to read this stuff.
19 But that's not always the case, so you know, maybe we can
20 you know, sit down if we need to sit down with each of
21 you, and kind of discuss this. We can do that. Or we can
22 do it here. Whatever the case may be.

23 But if the rest of you get it, and you understand
24 it, and you're comfortable with it, then maybe he and I
25 and Bama can just sit down and we can kind of discuss it a

1 little.

2 MR. McINERNEY: I think that's probably a good
3 move, and I think then his job will then be -- in some
4 sense, he has to kind of make sure we all have a common
5 understanding of what we're asking for.

6 MS. POWELL: Yeah.

7 MR. McINERNEY: He has no intention of, as a
8 single member, trying to do anything, you know.

9 MS. POWELL: Correct.

10 MR. STEMA: There was actually, he has one other
11 thing, maybe for the next meeting, if we could get an
12 update on if, any development, what the developments,
13 department's doing on, for the city? Because I think we
14 all know that we have to increase revenues in the city,
15 where eventually we want to meet our future budget and
16 what we need to cover all our historical costs.

17 He'd like just an updated report on what the, any
18 development that's going on, what you guys are working on
19 to bring more revenue into the city.

20 MS. POWELL: Oh, okay. What we're doing to bring
21 more revenue, as well as what we're doing to cut
22 expenditures?

23 MR. STEMA: Yeah, that would be great too. I
24 mean, I'm good with that. I think a development side is
25 probably an area that will help, because eventually

1 there's only going to be so much you can cut, with our
2 historical costs, what they're going to be, in the future.

3 MS. POWELL: Okay.

4 MS. ROBERTS: Any further board comment? Seeing
5 none, I would entertain a motion to adjourn.

6 MR. STEMA: Motion to adjourn.

7 MR. McINERNEY: Support.

8 MS. ROBERTS: Meeting is adjourned. Thank you,
9 everyone. It is approximately 1:30.

10 (AT about 1:30 p.m. meeting adjourned.)

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

STATE OF MICHIGAN

COUNTY OF WASHTENAW) .ss

I certify that this transcript is a complete, true, and correct transcript to the best of my ability of the RTAB meeting held on January 26th, 2016, City of Hamtramck. I also certify that I am not a relative or employee of the parties involved and have no financial interest in this case.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED:

February 1, 2016

s/ Amy Shankleton-Novess .