

**City of Hamtramck**

**Receivership Transition Advisory Board Meeting Minutes**

**Tuesday, September 26, 2017**

**Hamtramck City Hall**

**Council Chambers - 2nd floor**

**3401 Evaline**

**Hamtramck, Michigan 48212**

**RTAB MEMBERS PRESENT:**

**DEBORAH ROBERTS  
KAREN YOUNG  
MARK STEMA  
AL BOGDAN**

**ALSO PRESENT:**

**KATHY ANGERER  
City Manager**

**ERIC CLINE  
Michigan Department of Treasury**

**Reported by:**

**Nina Lunsford (CER 4539)  
Modern Court Reporting & Video, LLC  
SCAO FIRM NO. 08228  
101-A North Lewis Street  
Saline, Michigan 48176  
(734) 429-9143/krs**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

**Tuesday, September 26, 2017**

**Called to order at 1:00 p.m.**

**\* \* \* \* \***

MS. ROBERTS: It's 1:00 on Tuesday, September 26, 2017, and I will call the Hamtramck City Receivership Transition Advisory Board meeting to order.

Mr. Cline, could you take roll, please?

MR. CLINE: Yes. Deb Roberts?

MS. ROBERTS: Here.

MR. CLINE: Mark Stema.

MR. STEMA: Here.

MR. CLINE: Karen Young.

MS. YOUNG: Present.

MR. CLINE: Al Bogdan.

MR. BOGDAN: Here.

MS. ROBERTS: And Peter McInerny is excused.

You have a quorum.

MS. ROBERTS: Thank you.

The first item on the agenda is approval of the agenda.

MS. ANGERER: Madam Chair?

MS. ROBERTS: Yes?

MS. ANGERER: I'd like to add an item to the agenda today, please.

We have a position, and you have it before you,

1 a memo where there's an internal transfer of an AFSCME  
2 posted position.

3 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. I will add that as item 15  
4 under the city manager's items.

5 MS. ANGERER: Thank you.

6 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. I would entertain a motion  
7 to approve the August 22nd -- or where am I -- no. The  
8 September 26th agenda as amended to add the one item.

9 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve.

10 MR. STEMA: Second.

11 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

12 (No response.)

13 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
14 say aye.

15 MR. STEMA: Aye.

16 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

17 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

18 MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

19 Opposed the same.

20 (No response.)

21 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

22 As a reminder to the public, if anybody would  
23 like to speak, I'll need you to sign up at the podium.

24 Next on the agenda is the approval of the August  
25 22nd RTAB meeting. I would entertain a motion to approve

1 the meeting minutes as presented.

2 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

3 MS. YOUNG: Second.

4 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

5 (No response.)

6 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
7 say aye.

8 MR. STEMA: Aye.

9 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

10 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

11 MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

12 Opposed the same.

13 (No response.)

14 MS. ROBERTS: Next on the agenda is public  
15 comment. Mr. Cline, has anyone signed up for public  
16 comment?

17 MR. CLINE: I believe so, yes. One moment.

18 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Can I just go first since  
19 you're reading my name?

20 MS. ROBERTS: We can wait a minute.

21 MR. CLINE: All right. Carrie Beth Lasey (sic).

22 MS. LASLEY: Lasley. That's all right.

23 MR. CLINE: I'm sorry. All right.

24 MS. LASLEY: It's a hard name.

25 I am speaking (sic) you today and to the city

1 council and presenting with you accompanying evidence  
2 related to the ineligibility of mayor pro tem, Anam Miah.  
3 I urge the city attorney and city manager to take  
4 appropriate action to review the mayor pro tem's  
5 eligibility and to mitigate legal risk to the city in the  
6 interim.

7 The Hamtramck City Charter states in Section 6-  
8 8:

9 "No person shall be elected or appointed  
10 to any office who is a defaulter to the City  
11 or to any board, or office, or department  
12 thereof, or to any school district, county, or  
13 other municipal corporation of the State, now  
14 or heretofore existing. All votes for the  
15 election or appointment of any such defaulter  
16 shall be void."

17 I have supplied members of this body with  
18 documents supporting the seizure of Anam Miah's property  
19 located at 5664 Harold Street, Detroit, Michigan, by the  
20 Wayne County Treasurer, and its subsequent conveyance to  
21 the Detroit land bank and then a private owner.

22 The records indicate that in March 2015, Mayor  
23 Pro Tem Miah, having failed to pay his taxes, was --  
24 defaulted his real property and was issued a judgment of  
25 foreclosure by the county treasurer. At the time of his

1 filing for candidacy, and at the time the votes being cast  
2 for him in the 2015 primary and general elections, his  
3 property was in default to the county and to the city land  
4 bank.

5 I have consulted property lawyers who assure me  
6 that a judgment of foreclosure is clearly indicated in  
7 state legal language as a default, not as a lien. The  
8 property was held by public or quasi-public bodies until  
9 May of 2016, extending default until at least this date.  
10 As such, all votes cast for him would be void, as defined  
11 by the City Charter, and he should not have been reelected  
12 or sitting before us for the past two years. I urge he be  
13 asked to immediately vacate the seat due to his  
14 ineligibility, and a review begin to determine if  
15 resolutions he has sponsored should be re-legislated or if  
16 decisive votes he cast should be re-tallied to avoid legal  
17 challenge. Please ask for legal action to remove the  
18 ineligible default to be swift so as not to further burden  
19 our community with this embarrassment, and to continue  
20 into this pettiness that we've been going into. And  
21 please mitigate the additional legal challenge --  
22 legislation, that it's not going to be in legal challenge.  
23 Thank you very much.

24 MR. CLINE: Bob Zwolak.

25 MR. ZWOLAK: Good afternoon.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

THE BOARD IN UNISON: Good afternoon.

MR. ZWOLAK: That's a tough act to follow. But I do want to stress the fact if you're aware or not aware of it, that tonight's council meeting on the agenda is a resolution to censure one of our council persons. I would -- it would behoove you if you could possibly attend tonight's meeting and observe the actions that will be transpired. I think in terms of your responsibility in filing your reports with the state, the treasury, that they be cognizant of the actions that are being done here in Hamtramck. I know your oversight is primarily the approval of financial activities within the City of Hamtramck and not all legislative activity, but you do have great influence with respect to the state, the treasurer, and also the Governor of the State of Michigan. So I really strongly suggest, if you can, change your schedule and attend tonight's council meeting. I think we're going to have a lot of input, but primarily the fact that we have one group of individuals wanting to censure one council person does not bode well for democracy here in the City of Hamtramck.

So with that, I'd also like to make a strong comment and plea that we look at our acting city manager, who I have a lot of confidence in. She has a great depth of knowledge and experience for the City of Hamtramck, and

1 anything we can do to extend her stay here as an acting  
2 city manager certainly improve the situations that we have  
3 with our various departments. We have a lack of a police  
4 contract, we have mentioned the police department, and I  
5 think it's incumbent that we maintain and can have some  
6 consistency and continuity in their departments.

7 So with that being said, I understand that our  
8 search committee for a city manager will probably take  
9 another three months, which means we probably won't see  
10 anything until January or February of next year. And then  
11 if we do have a city manager appointed, it'll probably  
12 take another year for any orientation or familiarization  
13 with the City of Hamtramck. Thank you again.

14 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you.

15 MR. CLINE: One additional person, Ibrahim Al-  
16 Jahim.

17 MR. AL-JAHIM: Good afternoon.

18 THE BOARD IN UNISON: Good afternoon.

19 MR. AL-JAHIM: My name is Ibrahim Al-Jahim, an  
20 organizer and activist in Hamtramck.

21 I just want to say a few words about Councilman  
22 Ian Perrotta that's sitting right here. He is a leader.  
23 He comes to every event. He goes to a mosque, he goes to  
24 a church; he goes to anywhere they invite him to.  
25 Councilman Ian Perrotta is not racist. The comments that



1 was brought up, and I see over here new business, D,  
2 Resolution 2017-81, censuring Councilman Ian Perrotta for  
3 anti-immigrants and bigoted remarks. That's bull; excuse  
4 my language. If anybody that has a personal agenda in  
5 Hamtramck needs to keep it to himself or take it somewhere  
6 else. We don't -- this shouldn't even be on the agenda.  
7 Censuring a leader in the community? A person that helps  
8 every citizen in Hamtramck? This is wrong.

9 Thank you very much.

10 MR. CLINE: That's all for public comment.

11 MS. ROBERTS: The first thing on the agenda  
12 under old business, the approval to hire one full-time  
13 chief financial officer. Ms. Angerer, could you please  
14 provide a summary of this item for the Board?

15 MS. ANGERER: Thank you.

16 So at our last TAB board meeting we postponed  
17 this action of a candidate, and since that time we've  
18 called others that applied for the position. Two declined  
19 to be interviewed, and then we've interviewed two  
20 additional individuals, as well as this individual had a  
21 second interview. And after having those three interviews  
22 with candidates, I highly recommend this person to be our  
23 chief financial officer and controller.

24 MS. ROBERTS: Who was doing the interviewing?

25 MS. ANGERER: So we had, in two of the

1 interviews the HR director and myself and an individual  
2 from Plante Moran. In one of the interviews myself; our  
3 HR director was ill that day and Plante Moran was unable  
4 to attend. And in the other interview, all three of us  
5 total.

6 MS. ROBERTS: Have you gotten any feedback from  
7 council as to the candidate?

8 MS. ANGERER: I let the council members know the  
9 resume' of the person, and let them all know that this  
10 person came highly recommended, as well as interviewed,  
11 and that I would be recommending at this meeting.

12 MS. ROBERTS: Okay, thank you.

13 Anyone else have any other questions?

14 (No response.)

15 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to  
16 approve, deny, or postpone hiring one full-time chief  
17 financial officer.

18 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

19 MS. YOUNG: Second.

20 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

21 (No response.)

22 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
23 say aye.

24 MR. STEMA: Aye.

25 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

Opposed the same.

(No response.)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

Next under new business, the first item up is approval of resolutions and ordinances for city council meetings. The first is the resolutions from the regular city council meeting of August 15, 2017. I would note that Resolutions 2017-61 and 2017-62 were approved at our last board meeting. And I would entertain a motion to approve, deny, or postpone the remaining ordinances and resolutions from the August 15th, 2017 regular city council meetings.

MR. BOGDAN: Motion to approve.

MR. STEMA: Seconded.

MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

(No response.)

MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor say aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

Opposed the same.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

(No response.)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

Next on the agenda is resolutions from the regular city council meeting of August 29th, 2017. I would entertain a motion to approve all ordinances and resolutions from the August 29th, 2017 regular city council meeting.

MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve.

MR. BOGDAN: Second.

MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

(No response.)

MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor say aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

Opposed the same.

(No response.)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

Next on the agenda are the claims and accounts from the regular city council meeting draft minutes of September 11th, 2017. I would entertain a motion to approve, deny, or postpone claims and accounts from the regular city council meeting draft minutes of September

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

11th.

MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

MR. BOGDAN: Second.

MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

(No response.)

MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
say aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

Opposed the same.

(No response.)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

Next on the agenda is the city administrator  
items. And we've already approved the city council  
minutes.

Next would be the approval of the invoice  
register of preapproved expenditures. I would entertain a  
motion to approve, deny, or postpone the invoice register  
and preapproved expenditures.

MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve.

MR. BOGDAN: Seconded.

MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

(No response.)

1 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
2 say aye.

3 MR. STEMA: Aye.

4 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

5 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

6 MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

7 Opposed the same.

8 (No response.)

9 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

10 Next on the agenda is approval of budget to  
11 actual and cash flow reports.

12 Ms. Angerer, would you please provide a summary  
13 of this item for the Board?

14 MS. ANGERER: Thank you.

15 As you know, Plante Moran has been at the City  
16 of Hamtramck since the approval at the last meeting. We  
17 have totaled six days of work, so we're in the seventh day  
18 today. So the reports you have before you of course are  
19 with the process of reconciling bank statements in place,  
20 so there are transactions that may have occurred that  
21 haven't been recorded in the general ledger yet, for  
22 instance, property tax disbursements to other entities in  
23 the city's general fund haven't been recorded in the  
24 general ledger yet. So we're giving you, as we sit today,  
25 but after six days of having someone onsite this is as

1 close as we can get.

2 We are not audited yet, but we are preparing for  
3 audit, and things are looking good. She -- today I,  
4 before we came to this meeting, I said, "Tell me where we  
5 stand today." She said, "I've reconciled every account.  
6 I'm off \$420 from one; we'll figure that out." There's  
7 one other one that's around \$4,000 off, but she feels very  
8 comfortable with where we ended June 30th and where she is  
9 today. We are reconciled through August 31st at this  
10 point, and so now it's a matter of plugging some of those  
11 numbers into the accounts.

12 Thank you for the addition of adding two  
13 financial officer/controller because that is going to help  
14 with your next report as well, and so I feel very  
15 comfortable that after six-and-a-half days with Plante  
16 Moran that we are farther along, but we were months  
17 behind. So we are moving forward in a positive direction.

18 MS. ROBERTS: So we are caught up through June  
19 or through August?

20 MS. ANGERER: June we are, we feel like we're  
21 getting ready for audit at this point, and within a couple  
22 of weeks we'll be ready to call the auditor and verify  
23 that they're standing by waiting for us. You know, we  
24 have a third year of this contract in place. They are  
25 ready; they're waiting for us to call them and say we're

1 ready for the audit. So then we'll start doing the  
2 working papers and getting things ready, but we are also,  
3 our bank recs are done through August 31st.

4 MR. STEMA: Oh, so the bank recs are done, but  
5 the adjustments haven't been put in for the last few  
6 months?

7 MS. ANGERER: Correct.

8 MR. STEMA: Okay.

9 MS. ANGERER: So we're getting closer though.

10 MR. STEMA: Okay. No, I just wanted to clarify.

11 MS. ANGERER: Appreciate it.

12 MR. STEMA: Will we, when you actually make  
13 those adjustments are you going to provide us with the  
14 year-end numbers again?

15 MS. ANGERER: We will. We will.

16 MR. STEMA: That show more accurate numbers --

17 MS. ANGERER: And at this --

18 MR. STEMA: -- to what we were to budget?

19 MS. ANGERER: Yes, thank you. And so at this  
20 point we're unaudited as well.

21 MR. STEMA: Yeah, I understand.

22 MS. ANGERER: And so, you know, we'll give you a  
23 more thorough, and maybe we'll take a little time at the  
24 meeting to address these issues. I'm not sure it's going  
25 to be at the October meeting based on the fact that now



1 we'll call the controller to say, "Hey, can you come to  
2 work within two week?" So that, you know, we'll be two  
3 weeks into, well, a week into October by the time she  
4 starts. So with that, we'll do our very best to give you  
5 a more thorough report at the next meeting, and I think  
6 that'll satisfy, you know, everything we all need to know.  
7 So the department heads are waiting for this as well.

8 MS. ROBERTS: Do we think we're going to need to  
9 do any budget amendments to balance the year to close out?

10 MS. ANGERER: For last year?

11 MS. ROBERTS: Yes.

12 MS. ANGERER: For last year I don't -- I can't  
13 say that yet.

14 MS. ROBERTS: Any other questions?

15 MR. STEMA: No.

16 MS. ROBERTS: I would -- it's kind of hard to  
17 approve these things -- I would entertain a motion to  
18 approve, deny, or postpone the budget-to-actual and cash  
19 flow reports that we did receive.

20 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve.

21 MS. ROBERTS: Any second?

22 MR. BOGDAN: Second.

23 MS. ROBERTS: All those in favor say aye.

24 MR. STEMA: Aye.

25 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

Opposed the same.

(No response.)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

Next on the agenda is approval of Resolution 2017-71, participation in the MEDC Redevelopment Ready Communities Program. While action on this item occurred during a council meeting outside the normal review period for today's board meeting, the city manager is requesting that we bring this item forward for early review. City council past the resolution on September 11th, 2017.

Ms. Angerer, could you please provide a summary of this item for the Board?

MS. ANGERER: Certainly. And I thank you for taking this up early. The City of Hamtramck, as you know, has been participating in the training classes for Redevelopment Ready Communities for about three years, however it was not brought to council until we had the capacity to move forward. This is a mutli-year venture that we're looking at, but engaging with the Redevelopment Ready Communities, we're going to take steps towards making sure that our zoning is proper, making sure our ordinances are in place. So it's going to be an all hands on deck process for several years with mayor and council,

1 along with the members of the community to have our city  
2 certified as a Redevelopment Ready Community. What that  
3 will do is help us attract business to our community.

4 MS. ROBERTS: Does this have any budgetary  
5 impact?

6 MS. ANGERER: Not at this time. Just staff time  
7 at this point. And there is also, by participating in  
8 this there are resources available from MEDC so that we  
9 can work on our ordinances, work on different aspects that  
10 we need to check all the boxes to be Redevelopment Ready.

11 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to  
12 approve, deny, or postpone Resolution 2017-71.

13 MR. BOGDAN: Motion to approve.

14 MR. STEMA: Second.

15 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

16 (No response.)

17 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
18 say aye.

19 MR. STEMA: Aye.

20 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

21 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

22 MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

23 Opposed the same.

24 (No response.)

25 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

1                   Next on the agenda is approval of Resolution  
2                   2017-72, purchase of three vehicles for the police  
3                   department. While action on this item occurred during a  
4                   council meeting outside the normal review period for  
5                   today's Board meeting, the city manager is requesting that  
6                   we bring the item forward. City council passed this  
7                   resolution on September 11th, 2017. However, we just  
8                   discovered, there's got to be a typo in this resolution.  
9                   So.

10                   MR. STEMA: The numbers don't work.

11                   MS. ROBERTS: Does somebody want to give us a  
12                   summary of the resolution, and then tell us what the  
13                   numbers should be?

14                   MS. ANGERER: Let me have her give her agenda  
15                   note, and then I'm going to do some math while we're  
16                   sitting here to see --

17                   MS. ROBERTS: I think it should be 28.

18                   CHIEF MOISE: Yeah, I put the resolution on  
19                   quick docs and there is a typo on the resolution, so.

20                   MS. ANGERER: Very good.

21                   Is the total correct?

22                   MS. ROBERTS: If the --

23                   MR. STEMA: It depends on what the cost per  
24                   vehicle is.

25                   MS. ROBERTS: If the per each is 28,000 --

1 CHIEF MOISE: Right.

2 MS. ROBERTS: -- then the total is correct, but.

3 MS. ANGERER: Yes. Okay, very good.

4 CHIEF MOISE: Okay, so thank you for pulling  
5 this forward. This is a little time-sensitive issue. The  
6 Hamtramck Police Department last purchased three marked  
7 scout cars to be used by the patrol division in 2014. The  
8 vehicles we have in existence, the older model ones are  
9 starting to obviously require some costly repairs. We did  
10 obtain a state bid price, and that expires on September  
11 30th, so we'd like to get this in because we don't know if  
12 it will be the same or go up, so we'd like to get this in.  
13 We are asking to purchase one vehicle per shift, so that'd  
14 be a total of three vehicles of the 2018 Interceptor sport  
15 utility vehicles. The actual price should be \$28,080 per  
16 vehicle, which would come to a total of \$84,240. Then  
17 you've got your minimal transfer title fees and things  
18 like that. And then we will need to outfit those vehicles  
19 with lights, graphics, and all of our necessary equipment  
20 that we use that we'll get some bid prices after the  
21 vehicles have been purchased if it's approved.

22 MS. ANGERER: Madam Chair, based on the  
23 resolution, I do see the typo as well, and I apologize  
24 that I didn't catch that after the resolution was drafted.  
25 It does say in the resolution the incorrect amount for

1 each car, but it does say "Or" and gives the total which  
2 is accurate, of \$84,240.

3 MR. STEMA: I agree with that. My only concern  
4 is it looks like you're paying more. I mean I don't know  
5 if this is technically a valid city --

6 MS. ROBERTS: Mr. Clark, if you can --

7 MR. STEMA: -- resolution. Clark, you could  
8 probably answer that.

9 MS. ROBERTS: If you can give us a little  
10 assistance on this. If the city council approved a  
11 resolution that has a typo in it --

12 MR. STEMA: And incorrect numbers that don't  
13 look right.

14 MR. CLARK: Yeah, I mean that's -- I mean this  
15 document has a total amount.

16 MS. ROBERTS: So we're okay with the total?

17 MR. CLARK: Yeah, so you're approving the total  
18 expenditure --

19 MS. ROBERTS: Okay.

20 MR. CLARK: -- for three vehicles.

21 MS. ROBERTS: Okay.

22 MR. CLARK: So that's fine.

23 MR. STEMA: So you don't -- I mean I'm fine; if  
24 you're good with it. It just looks weird that it's 28,  
25 and then if somebody read this like in a month and say why

1 are eighty-four when it says it's \$20,000 per vehicle, but  
2 --

3 MS. ROBERTS: I would think --

4 MR. STEMA: -- if the city doesn't need to  
5 change the resolution on file, then I'm fine with  
6 approving it.

7 MR. CLARK: It may be best for council meeting  
8 tonight or the next meeting to approve a corrected  
9 version, so long as the total amount doesn't change.

10 MR. STEMA: Okay.

11 MS. ROBERTS: Okay.

12 MS. ANGERER: Thank you.

13 MS. ROBERTS: Okay.

14 CHIEF MOISE: Any questions?

15 MS. ROBERTS: If I clarify it even further and  
16 say I would entertain a motion to approve, deny, or  
17 postpone Resolution 2017-72 in the total amount of  
18 \$84,240.

19 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

20 MS. YOUNG: Second.

21 MR. BOGDAN: Second. Oh.

22 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

23 Seeing none, all those in favor say aye.

24 MR. STEMA: Aye.

25 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

Opposed the same.

(No response.)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

Next on the agenda is approval of Resolution 2017-73, service agreement to Wayne Metropolitan Community Action Agency's Water Residential Assistance Program. While action on this item occurred during a council meeting outside the normal review period for today, the city manager is requesting that we bring this item forward for review. City council approved this resolution on September 11th, 2017.

Ms. Angerer, would you please provide a summary of this item for us?

MS. ANGERER: Absolutely. I also have our interim Department of Public Services director I'd like to come up to the podium and answer any technical questions.

This RAP program is funded through Great Lakes Water Authority, commonly known as GLWA, and we met on two occasions with the RAP representatives, and what this offers is bill assistance to those that qualify financially as well as helps them with water conservation measures. You're aware locally that there is some discussion about the water bills, and you'll see later on



1 the agenda our water rate setting that we've talked about  
2 before in meetings. And so this is one way to help low  
3 income residents not only get a credit on their bill, help  
4 them with arrearages if they stay current in the program,  
5 but lastly do a plumbing assistance inside of their home  
6 to detect leaks or find other conservation measures as  
7 simple as screwing a diffuser on their faucets, low flow  
8 showerheads, things like that that help conserve water at  
9 the front end. And so then there's bill assistance  
10 afterwards. So we're recommending this program for our  
11 residents. The only thing that you should be aware of is  
12 that as long as people stay active in the program, they'll  
13 get the help with their arrearages, but if they stay  
14 active, we would carry on the books for a six month period  
15 of time their arrearages and not do a shutoff. But that  
16 would be that they would have to participate and every  
17 month we'd be sure that they made their payments like  
18 they're supposed to. So that's one piece, that it's a  
19 delay, it's a slower pay rather than a, you know,  
20 immediately them paying their water bill, but what is  
21 helpful is they're getting that assistance, and after six  
22 months of participating they'll get the \$25 each month,  
23 but at the end of six months they'll get the lump sum  
24 toward their arrearages, and that comes directly from the  
25 RAP program versus the individual paying. They'll see it

1 as a credit on their water bill.

2 This is Rodney Johnson --

3 MR. JOHNSON: Hi.

4 MS. ANGERER: -- the interim director of public  
5 services.

6 MR. STEMA: So basically the only small risk is  
7 that cash comes in later and your receivables to be  
8 higher?

9 MS. ANGERER: Correct.

10 MR. STEMA: Okay.

11 MR. JOHNSON: So just a couple small questions.  
12 So the plan allows a person to be in it up to two years.  
13 In terms of getting all of your money it could take two  
14 years or more to collect your entire debt.

15 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. But they get a \$25 credit  
16 for 6 months or for two years?

17 MS. ANGERER: A \$25 credit per month. Per  
18 month.

19 MR. JOHNSON: Yes, you get \$25 per month that  
20 they send us, and then at the end of six months they send  
21 us \$300 towards your outstanding balance or arrearages.  
22 And in the twelfth month they send another \$350. I'm  
23 sorry. Per six months. So total would be 1,000 per year  
24 in terms of assistance, and then they could also reapply  
25 for a second year if they still owe more.

1 MS. ROBERTS: Will you advertise this to your  
2 residents?

3 MS. ANGERER: One-hundred percent. We'll have  
4 sign up locally as well. They've agreed to come and  
5 advertise in multiple languages as well as have local  
6 sign-ups.

7 MS. ROBERTS: Anyone else have any other  
8 questions?

9 MS. YOUNG: Do you have the income-based numbers  
10 in place yet for those who qualify? What's that amount?

11 MR. JOHNSON: So the program itself does the  
12 intake, and they determine if you qualify or don't  
13 qualify. The City of Hamtramck does not take part in any  
14 of that. They interview the person, they take in all the  
15 documentation. If they approve it, they send over the  
16 approval, and that person is placed on the program.

17 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you.

18 MR. JOHNSON: And they do it for all cities  
19 throughout the communities that's part of the Great Lakes  
20 Water Authority.

21 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. I would entertain a motion  
22 to approve, deny, or postpone Resolution 2017-73.

23 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

24 MS. YOUNG: Second.

25 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

(No response.)

MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor say aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

Opposed the same.

(No response.)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

Next on the agenda is approval of Resolution 2017-74, contract for water and sewer rate analysis. While action on this item occurred during a council meeting outside the normal review period for today's board meeting, the city manager is requesting that we pull item forward for early review. City council passed this resolution on September 11th, 2017.

Ms. Angerer, could you please provide a summary if this item for the Board?

MS. ANGERER: Thank you.

So two staff members need to be commended for working on this. First, our purchasing agent for putting out a quality RFP to attract vendors that were interested in this, and as you can see from the resolution, it went through the MITN, advertised through MITN for the water

1 rate analysis. And 566 vendors received the RFP; 29  
2 vendors downloaded it, looked it over and made a decision  
3 whether or not they wanted to participate or put in a  
4 proposal; and three did. And so at this time I'll have  
5 Rodney Johnson give an overview of what that rate analysis  
6 will look like and why we're recommending this company.

7 MR. JOHNSON: Yeah, so essentially this  
8 particular company is offering us a couple of components:  
9 one, the financial part of looking at our current rates,  
10 going through all of the numbers, and determining if  
11 that's the correct, I don't want to say correct, that  
12 that's approximately correct rate that we should be  
13 charging, or if we should be charging more or possibly  
14 less.

15 They will also be doing part of an engineering  
16 study to look at ways where we potentially will save money  
17 through either not needing as many water supplies that we  
18 currently have from the City of Detroit, potentially doing  
19 more water loss study to stop ourselves from losing water  
20 and having to pay for just water loss. So those two  
21 things together is part of their, it's approximately a  
22 three to four month study. They will also look at each  
23 line item that we currently charge on our water and sewer  
24 bills, to then dig into the, is this the correct amount,  
25 should it even be on the water bill; those types of

1 answers they will help us resolve.

2 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you.

3 MS. YOUNG: I have a question. When was the  
4 last time Hamtramck had such a study like this done?

5 MR. JOHNSON: I don't have that in -- yeah.

6 MS. ANGERER: Prior to when I was here, and I've  
7 been here five years.

8 MS. YOUNG: Okay.

9 MS. ANGERER: So I don't have an answer for when  
10 that was done, so that's all the more reason it's  
11 necessary.

12 MR. JOHNSON: And it'll also provide us a model  
13 document to carry us forward so that going year to year we  
14 can plug in the numbers and then move forward in terms of  
15 what's the rate going to be for the next year.

16 MR. STEMA: What's the cost?

17 MS. ANGERER: \$28,000.

18 MR. JOHNSON: It's roughly \$28,000.

19 MR. STEMA: And I'm sure that's fine budget-wise  
20 for whatever fund this is coming out of?

21 MS. ANGERER: Right.

22 MR. STEMA: Okay.

23 MS. ANGERER: This will come out of the water  
24 and sewer fund, and we do have dollars in that fund to  
25 accommodate the study.

1                   One of the things about this company, we had two  
2                   bidders -- or two -- we had three bidders; one was  
3                   extremely high, the other two were in similar. This one  
4                   went beyond just being a financial analysis and went into  
5                   an engineering analysis, and when we interviewed both of  
6                   the low bidders, there were two that were very close, it  
7                   was obvious that this one was something that Hamtramck  
8                   needed because they were talking about the engineering  
9                   part of it, and water loss, et cetera. Not just crunching  
10                  numbers with what we get from GLWA.

11                 MR. STEMA: The only thing I -- I mean I'm fine  
12                 with this.

13                 MS. ANGERER: Right.

14                 MR. STEMA: I just, in the future, I mean in the  
15                 past any time something goes out to bid, we normally get a  
16                 term sheet that shows who the bidders were and the dollars  
17                 for each month --

18                 MS. ANGERER: All right. Okay.

19                 MR. STEMA: -- so who we know it was a low bid  
20                 pick and all that, because normally that's always been  
21                 supplied --

22                 MS. ANGERER: Okay.

23                 MR. STEMA: -- so in the future if that can keep  
24                 going forward that'd be great.

25                 MS. ANGERER: Thanks for working with me on

1 that.

2 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to  
3 approve, deny, or postpone Resolution 2017-74, contract  
4 for water and sewer rate analysis.

5 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

6 MS. YOUNG: Second.

7 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

8 (No response.)

9 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
10 say aye.

11 MR. STEMA: Aye.

12 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

13 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

14 MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

15 Opposed the same.

16 (No response.)

17 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

18 Next on the agenda is approval to hire one part-  
19 time cashier in the treasurer's office.

20 Ms. Angerer, could you please provide a summary  
21 of this item for the Board?

22 MS. ANGERER: Sure. Thank you.

23 And this is a budgeted item that is a new  
24 position. You'll recall that in the past the treasurer's  
25 office had a treasurer, a deputy treasurer, and a clerk.



1 Now the make-up of the office will be a treasurer, a clerk  
2 that will also act as a cashier, and then a part-time  
3 cashier. So the staffing on the office has changed a  
4 little bit. This, after several interviews, and we, to  
5 the point we received about 200 applications for this  
6 position. Part-time positions in the City of Hamtramck  
7 are getting a lot of traction thanks to our HR director  
8 who is advertising them in the places where people are  
9 looking for jobs. So that's very helpful. But several  
10 interviews were held. The HR director and the city  
11 treasurer held those interviews and were recommending  
12 Rezwana Ahad (phonetic) for this part-time position for a  
13 29 hour per week position.

14 MS. ROBERTS: Does anybody have any questions?

15 (No response.)

16 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to  
17 approve, deny, or postpone hiring a one part-time cashier  
18 in the treasurer's office.

19 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

20 MS. YOUNG: Second.

21 MR. BOGDAN: Second.

22 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

23 (No response.)

24 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
25 say aye.

1 MR. STEMA: Aye.

2 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

3 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

4 MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

5 Opposed the same.

6 (No response.)

7 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

8 Next on the agenda is approval to hire one full-

9 time police officer. Ms. Angerer or Ms. Moise --

10 MS. ANGERER: The Chief will come up and speak

11 to this one.

12 MS. ROBERTS: -- please provide a summary of

13 this item for the board.

14 CHIEF MOISE: Hi, again. This month we have

15 Ryan Smith. Ryan Smith has successfully completed the

16 background investigation and all the pre-employment

17 testing requirements. He is a certified police officer,

18 and he is ready for immediate hire. He's filling a

19 vacancy within the police department --

20 MS. ROBERTS: It's already budgeted.

21 CHIEF MOISE: -- so there's no budget. Yeah,

22 already budgeted.

23 MS. ROBERTS: Okay, I would entertain a motion

24 to approve, deny, or postpone hiring of one full-time

25 police officer.

1 MR. BOGDAN: Motion to approve.  
2 MS. YOUNG: Second.  
3 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?  
4 (No response.)  
5 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
6 say aye.  
7 MR. STEMA: Aye.  
8 MS. YOUNG: Aye.  
9 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.  
10 MS. ROBERTS: Aye.  
11 Opposed the same.  
12 (No response.)  
13 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.  
14 Next on the agenda is approval to hire one part-  
15 time code enforcement officer and promote one part-time  
16 code enforcement officer to supervisor.  
17 Ms. Angerer, could you please a summary if this  
18 item for us?  
19 MS. ANGERER: Thank you.  
20 For the position of code enforcement officer, we  
21 held interviews and we're recommending Patrick McMahon at  
22 the rate of pay in budget item. This is a budgeted  
23 position. And he has passed all pre-employment  
24 requirements, and he's ready for immediate hire.  
25 MS. ROBERTS: Okay.

1 MS. ANGERER: Do you want me to go on with the  
2 supervisors?

3 MS. ROBERTS: Yes, because we have it as one  
4 item.

5 MS. ANGERER: The other is a promotion of a  
6 current code enforcement officer to code enforcement  
7 supervisor. It's a working supervisor position. He'll  
8 continue doing code enforcement. The supervisor for that  
9 department resigned in December of 2016, but this has not  
10 been filled because at that time there was no supervision  
11 of any individual. He absorbed the work related with  
12 court prep, monthly reports, et cetera, but there was no  
13 direct supervising of an individual. Now that we're  
14 hiring a code enforcement officer, he will supervise and  
15 train that officer, and the rate of pay is \$3 per hour  
16 more than the level he was currently at. He's been with  
17 the department for I think it's eight years -- no, ten  
18 years; excuse me.

19 MS. ROBERTS: It's going to remain a part-time  
20 position?

21 MS. ANGERER: Correct. It will be a 29 hour  
22 part-time position, but he'll assist with preparing court  
23 records, the monthly report, and all of the things that  
24 are supervisory and administrative tasks as well. As  
25 well, as do code enforcement. This is, this particular

1 item, as much as we need all of these other things, this  
2 is one we really need.

3 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to  
4 approve, deny, or postpone hiring one part-time code  
5 enforcement officer and promoting one part-time code  
6 enforcement officer to supervisor.

7 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

8 MS. YOUNG: Second.

9 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

10 (No response.)

11 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
12 say aye.

13 MR. STEMA: Aye.

14 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

15 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

16 MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

17 Opposed the same.

18 (No response.)

19 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

20 Next on the agenda is approval to hire an  
21 assistant city assessor.

22 Ms. Angerer, would you please provide a summary  
23 of this item for the board?

24 MS. ANGERER: Thank you.

25 The position of assistant assessor has been

1 posted for several months, and there was not one qualified  
2 applicant who stepped forward. The position was created  
3 and is budgeted in the 2017/18 year. And due to the fact  
4 that the current assessor has been talking about at some  
5 point retiring, and the need to train someone and have a  
6 smooth transition is apparent.

7 So in finding that we had no qualified  
8 applicants, there was a conversation between the former  
9 city manager and the current city employee, where the  
10 current city employee expressed an interest in not only  
11 applying for this job, but training for the job. City of  
12 course did not fund someone to go get training, but upon  
13 his own self this individual went and took the classes to  
14 make himself qualified for this position. We interviewed  
15 him along with the current assessor, the HR director, and  
16 myself. We have no other qualified applicants being an  
17 assessor and having this leave of training. You know,  
18 we've put it on MML, we've put it on Indeed.com and other  
19 places; found no one else. This employee is an excellent  
20 employee for the City of Hamtramck; has worked in the  
21 library and has a very good work record, and we believe he  
22 will do well in the assessor's office, and with the  
23 current assessor, Mr. Singh, is very much looking forward  
24 to training him in the items that you can't learn in a  
25 classroom. So he's qualified, ready to come to work now,

1 and so we'd like to fill that position.

2 MS. ROBERTS: This is a full-time position --

3 MS. ANGERER: It is a full-time position.

4 MS. ROBERTS: -- with benefits?

5 MS. ANGERER: We will be vacating the position  
6 at the library and he will be moving to City Hall on your  
7 approval as the assistant assessor. Going forward, we  
8 would look at is this the proper staffing for the  
9 department to have an assessor, an assistant assessor, and  
10 a clerk? We will review that, we'll do a time study of  
11 the work. So at this time it's for this fiscal year, and  
12 we'll look at that budgetary-wise next year.

13 MS. ROBERTS: Okay, thank you.

14 Does anyone else have any questions?

15 (No response.)

16 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to  
17 approve, deny, or postpone hiring an assistant city  
18 assessor.

19 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

20 MS. YOUNG: Second.

21 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

22 (No response.)

23 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
24 say aye.

25 MR. STEMA: Aye.

1 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

2 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

3 MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

4 Opposed the same.

5 (No response.)

6 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

7 Next on the agenda is approval of the citywide  
8 overtime report.

9 Ms. Angerer, would you please provide a summary  
10 of the progress the city is making on this item?

11 MS. ANGERER: Well, one good thing to report is  
12 that when you see a lot of overtime, and this particular  
13 report is through the end of August. I'm going to have  
14 both Chiefs come up and make comments about that because  
15 quite often, you know, we're doing the hiring for the  
16 police department, we've had an individual in the fire  
17 department that has been out on medical leave. When those  
18 things occur, that means we have to deal with other ways  
19 of staffing what needs to be staffed.

20 One of the things that when you see the overtime  
21 report, we are getting reimbursed for some of the overtime  
22 when it is event related. You know, we do not allow the  
23 city to have to pay for any certain events, and so that  
24 you will end up seeing in the budgetary end year in the  
25 audit that those monies are moved to the proper line item.



1 So when you review our audit at the end of this year,  
2 you'll be able to see that some of the overtime expenses  
3 are returned back to that line item.

4 But I'll have both Chiefs come up and they can  
5 give a quick overview of what went on in August to create  
6 this report.

7 CHIEF MOISE: So we're continuing to make  
8 progress obviously with hiring. We've still got all the  
9 training involved. We've hired a number of officers in  
10 the last several months that we're still working on  
11 training. I believe in August we had soccer games that,  
12 as the city manager stated, will be reimbursed for the  
13 officers that worked the soccer games. We had a couple  
14 other activities, special events, things that will be  
15 reimbursed, and festivals, and then we also had, you know,  
16 some crime issues that we had to deal with as well that  
17 required some overtime and will come up from time to time.

18 CHIEF HAGEN: Good afternoon.

19 THE BOARD IN UNISON: Good afternoon.

20 CHIEF HAGEN: How are you?

21 As the acting city manager pointed out, we had  
22 one of our captains get hurt. As a result, overtime kind  
23 of went high. But to try and reduce some of that, I  
24 looked at the numbers, looked at the numbers are for each  
25 day for overtime versus what an acting position would be.

1           And an acting position is extremely low; it's like 75  
2           bucks a day instead of \$1,000 a day. So what I did with  
3           the approval, and we've got an agreement with the union,  
4           to move three people up into acting positions until said  
5           captain is back in service, active duty, to reduce the  
6           overtime. So what you see is August, the acting positions  
7           initiated early September. So hopefully by next month  
8           there'll be a reduction, and those, that number that you  
9           saw is just under eight days of overtime. Right;  
10          something's wrong here, so we're trying to fix that.

11                   MS. YOUNG: Absolutely.

12                   MS. ROBERTS: Okay, thank you.

13                   CHIEF HAGEN: Thank you.

14                   MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to  
15          approve, deny, or postpone the citywide overtime report.

16                   MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve.

17                   MR. STEMA: Seconded.

18                   MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

19                   (No response.)

20                   MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
21          say aye.

22                   MR. STEMA: Aye.

23                   MS. YOUNG: Aye.

24                   MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

25                   MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

1                   Opposed the same.

2                   (No response.)

3                   MS. ROBERTS: The next thing on the agenda is  
4 the District Court revenues; that's information only.  
5 Does anyone have any questions?

6                   (No response.)

7                   MS. ROBERTS: Okay, the last item on the agenda  
8 is the request for the internal transfer of an employee  
9 from the treasurer's department to the Department of  
10 Public Services.

11                   Ms. Angerer, could you please provide a summary  
12 of this item for the Board?

13                   MS. ANGERER: Thank you.

14                   So due to the resignation of a staffer in the  
15 Department of Public Services, an opening became  
16 available. According to the AFSCME contract, there's a  
17 posting provision. We posted that position internally and  
18 have one individual who is interested. We interviewed  
19 that individual, and upon having the interview and then  
20 also honoring the union contract, we're recommending  
21 Jennifer Kirksey be transferred. It's a lateral transfer.  
22 It's the same grade she's currently at. It is a budgeted  
23 position. It will now open a position in the treasurer's  
24 office.

25                   And I just want to mention to you that earlier

1 on this agenda you approved a part-time cashier. We  
2 recognize the fact that there'll be a new employee in the  
3 treasurer's office along with our treasurer, and that also  
4 there's a great need in the public services department.  
5 This employee, along with the two department heads, will  
6 work for a smooth transition; make sure the new employee  
7 is trained before we make that move. There's times that  
8 there's downtime between the offices; they've agreed to  
9 work cooperatively together. And, you know, in my mind  
10 this is an example of what we want in this City Hall; that  
11 department heads work together to make sure their  
12 departments are staffed properly. This will open up a job  
13 in the treasurer's department that we will then, upon  
14 approval, post internally.

15 MS. ROBERTS: Questions?

16 (No response.)

17 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to  
18 approve, deny, or postpone the hiring -- or not the hiring  
19 -- the transfer from the treasurer's department to DPS.

20 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve.

21 MR. STEMA: Seconded.

22 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

23 (No response.)

24 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor  
25 say aye.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

Opposed the same.

(No response.)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

MS. YOUNG: Thank you.

MS. ROBERTS: Next on the agenda is Board  
comment. Would anyone like to speak?

(No response.)

MS. ROBERTS: So then I would entertain a motion  
to adjourn.

MR. BOGDAN: Motion to adjourn.

MS. YOUNG: Second.

MS. ROBERTS: All those in favor say aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Aye.

Opposed the same.

(No response.)

MS. ROBERTS: Meeting is adjourned.

(Proceedings adjourned at 1:44 p.m.)

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22

STATE OF MICHIGAN  
COUNTY OF WASHTENAW ) .ss

I certify that this transcript is a complete, true, and correct transcript to the best of my ability of the RTAB meeting held on September 26, 2017, City of Hamtramck. I also certify that I am not a relative or employee of the parties involved and have no financial interest in this case.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED: September 29, 2017

*s/ Amy Shankleton-Novess*

---

Amy Shankleton-Novess (CER 0838)  
Certified Electronic Reporter