

City of Hamtramck

Receivership Transition Advisory Board Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, August 22nd, 2017

Hamtramck City Hall

Council Chambers - 2nd floor

3401 Evaline

Hamtramck, Michigan 48212

RTAB MEMBERS PRESENT:

DEBORAH ROBERTS
KAREN YOUNG
MARK STEMA
PETER McINERNEY
AL BOGDAN

ALSO PRESENT:

R. ERIC CLINE
Michigan Department of Treasury

Reported by:

Nina Lunsford (CER 4539)
Modern Court Reporting & Video, LLC
SCAO FIRM NO. 08228
101-A North Lewis Street
Saline, Michigan 48176
(734) 429-9143/nel

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Called to order at 1:00 p.m.

Tuesday, August 22, 2017

*** * * * ***

MS. ROBERTS: It is 1:00 on Tuesday, August 22nd, 2017, and I will call the City of Hamtramck Receivership Transition Advisory Board to order.

Eric, would you take roll, please?

MR. CLINE: Yes. Deb Roberts?

MS. ROBERTS: Here.

MR. CLINE: Mark Stema?

MR. STEMA: Here.

MR. CLINE: Karen Young?

MS. YOUNG: Present.

MR. CLINE: Al Bogdan?

MR. BOGDAN: Here.

MR. CLINE: Peter McInerney?

MR. MCINERNEY: Here.

MR. CLINE: Quorum present.

MS. ROBERTS: Thank you.

Just a reminder to the public, that anybody that would like to speak, needs to sign up at the podium.

First item on the agenda is approval of the agenda. I would entertain a motion to approve the agenda as presented.

MR. MCINERNEY: So moved.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MS. ROBERTS: Second?

MR. BOGDAN: Second.

MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
say aye. Aye.

MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

Next on the agenda is the approval of the July
25th, 2017, regular meeting. I would entertain a motion
to approve the RTAB meetings as presented, with a change
to show that Mr. Bogdan did indeed vote aye, where it is
missing in the minutes.

MR. STEMA: Motion to change.

MR. BOGDAN: Second.

MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
say aye. Aye.

MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Next is public comment. Mr. Cline, is anyone signed up for public comment?

MR. CLINE: We have two signed up for public comment. First person, Andrea Karpinski.

MS. KARPINSKI: Hello, Andrea Karpinski.

Just a couple of quick things. At our last meeting, we approved to start the city manager search, to hire a company. There was a little bit of back and forth about if that was legal or not legal, because we didn't have a full number of council, so I just want you guys to pass that, so that we can move forward.

And then, the second thing is about the chief financial officer. As many of you know, it wasn't - the name or resume wasn't attached with the packet. So I would just ask you to use your best interest, in approving or denying that. I have no idea who it is, but I just trust your judgment. So, thank you.

MS. ROBERTS: Thank you.

MR. CLINE: Second person, Katrina Powell.

MS. POWELL: Good afternoon, Madam Chair and

1 board members. I would like to discuss an issue regarding
2 the purchase of the desktop computer I used prior to my
3 departure as City Manager, and the events leading up to
4 today regarding that purchase.

5 On June 15th, during my bi-weekly phone call
6 with Treasury, I discussed purchasing the computer, and
7 spoke at length about what steps I should take to do so
8 legally and ethically. As I had the authority to approve
9 purchases up to \$10,000, and the sole authority on the
10 public sale, disposal, and auction of surplus items, i.e.
11 computers, cars, equipment, et cetera, that are not
12 considered assets.

13 Assets are generally valued at \$5,000 or more,
14 and are land, buildings, major equipment, et cetera. I
15 was uncomfortable approving such without some sort of
16 approval, given the political climate at the time
17 regarding my contract.

18 During that call, the chairman of the board, and
19 state staff, suggested I have the purchasing agent provide
20 an estimate of value with depreciation, a memo approved by
21 the mayor, IT, and the city attorney verifying that steps
22 were taken to remove all data, emails and proprietary
23 software, that they were saved, and that I would submit a
24 check to the city in the amount decided by purchasing, as
25 we all agreed that it was not an RTAB approval issue.

1 I consulted with our temporary city controller,
2 Plante Moran, regarding best practices, as well. I went
3 above and beyond what was required to ensure nothing
4 unethical, non-compliant or illegal was alleged.

5 I have provided you the purchasing agreement,
6 original invoice, bill of sale, memo with signature blocks
7 for the mayor, IT, and city attorney's approval regarding
8 the sale; text messages and emails between John Clark and
9 I, which he states he approves of the memo and purchase.
10 The mayor signed on June 20, and IT signed on June 30.

11 A check was submitted for the purchase of the
12 computer June 30, at approximately 3 p.m. It has not been
13 deposited as of today. The city has all the signed
14 documents.

15 On July 31st, I asked Mr. Clark to have his
16 client, the city, deposit my check for the purchase of the
17 computer, as my account was trying to close the books, and
18 the check was still outstanding on my account. I asked
19 again August 1st about the status of the check, and have
20 yet to receive a response to those messages. Instead, I
21 received a letter yesterday from the city attorney,
22 referencing EM Order 20 paragraph 23, referencing the
23 computer as an asset, and needs RTAB approval for the
24 sale, and therefore needs to be returned to the city.
25 I've also included EM Order 20 in the packet as well.

1 I respectfully ask the board to add this issue
2 during board comments for discussion, as I do not wish to
3 pursue legal options afforded me, because of someone's
4 lack of understanding of basic governmental accounting
5 standards as to what an asset is and what is not. A
6 \$10,000 server is an asset; a \$1200 desktop computer is
7 surplus and not an asset.

8 Lastly, I purchased the computer in good faith
9 according to the law, and the legal approval of the city
10 attorney. In addition, all of the city's documents were
11 saved and removed. Thank you for your time and
12 consideration.

13 MR. CLINE: That's all.

14 MS. ROBERTS: We have no old business, so we'll
15 move on to new business.

16 First item up is resolutions from the regular
17 city council meeting of July 11th, 2017. Please note that
18 Resolutions 46 and 58 were approved at our last RTAB
19 meeting. I would entertain a motion to approve the
20 remaining ordinances and resolutions from the July 11th,
21 2017, regular city council meeting.

22 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve.

23 MR. STEMA: Second it.

24 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

25 (No response)

1 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
2 say aye. Aye.

3 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

4 MR. STEMA: Aye.

5 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

6 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

7 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

8 (No response)

9 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next on the
10 agenda is resolutions from the regular city council
11 meeting of July 25th, 2017. I would entertain a motion to
12 approve all ordinances and resolutions from the July 25th,
13 2017, regular city council meeting.

14 MR. BOGDAN: Motion to approve.

15 MR. MCINERNEY: Support.

16 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

17 (No response)

18 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
19 say aye. Aye.

20 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

21 MR. STEMA: Aye.

22 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

23 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

24 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

25 (No response)

1 MS. ROBERTS: Next on the agenda is the claims
2 and accounts from the regular city council meeting draft
3 minutes of August 15th, 2017. I would entertain a motion
4 to approve, deny or postpone the claims and accounts from
5 the regular city council meeting draft minutes of August
6 15th 2017.

7 MS. YOUNG: Motion to approve.

8 MR. STEMA: Second it.

9 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

10 (No response)

11 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
12 say aye. Aye.

13 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

14 MR. STEMA: Aye.

15 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

16 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

17 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

18 (No response)

19 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

20 Next on the agenda is the city administrator
21 items. We've already taken care of the city council
22 meetings; next would be the invoice register and
23 preapproved expenditures. Attachments 5A, B, and C. I
24 would entertain a motion to approve, deny or postpone the
25 invoice register and preapproved expenditures.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MR. MCINERNEY: Move to approve.

MR. STEMA: Second it.

MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion? I have like one question. There's a lot of physicals, for -- a lot of payments for physicals on here, that were the interns? How many were hired? Like, how many went through the physicals and then were not hired.

MS. ANGERER: We had two that were not hired. One due to the physical, one due to just too late. Came too late. We were already in session, so. We ended up hiring 12, and retaining 11 of the students, and hiring three adult workers. And that will all be reimbursed by the grant.

MS. ROBERTS: The motion before us is to approve the invoice registry and preapproved expenditures; all those in favor say aye. Aye.

MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

Next on the agenda is approval of Resolution 2017-61, awarding the boiler removal and installation

1 services agreement to Mechanical Systems Services.

2 While action on this item occurred during a
3 council meeting outside the normal review period for
4 today's meeting, the city manager has requested that we
5 bring this item forward.

6 Ms. Angerer, could you please provide a summary
7 of this item for the board?

8 MS. ANGERER: Absolutely.

9 I'll let our purchasing agent give you the
10 details on the actual, the bidding and the awarded bid.
11 But this item is for the replacement of the boiler, that
12 is in city hall, that heats the first floor, part of the
13 second floor, and the mezzanine.

14 And the reason I wanted this brought forward is
15 because of the timeliness of Michigan weather, and that we
16 need to move this forward as expeditiously as possible.
17 But I can bring up Dee Chase to address, our purchasing
18 agent, how the process of the bidding went.

19 MS. CHASE: Thank you. Good afternoon.

20 THE BOARD: Good afternoon.

21 MS. CHASE: The boiler, RFP, was submitted into
22 MITN, and we received quotes from four vendors. The low
23 bidder was considered, but we wanted to meet with all four
24 vendors, to make sure they were bidding on the same thing.

25 And we still came to the conclusion that the low

1 bidder was the appropriate vendor to hire, or recommend.
2 We did the reference checks, and we received positive
3 references from all of them. We also went on LARA, to
4 make sure that the licenses were up to date and correct,
5 and they were. So our recommendation is to MSS.

6 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to
7 approve, deny, or postpone Resolution 2017-61, for boiler
8 removal.

9 MR. MCINERNEY: I move to approve the low bid,
10 as recommended.

11 MR. STEMA: Second it.

12 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

13 (No response)

14 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
15 say aye. Aye.

16 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

17 MR. STEMA: Aye.

18 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

19 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

20 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

21 (No response)

22 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

23 Next on the agenda is approval of Resolution
24 2017-62, awarding a six-month contract with Plante Moran
25 for financial services. While action on this item

1 occurred during a city council meeting outside the normal
2 review period for today's board meeting, the city manager
3 has requested that we bring this item forward.

4 City council approved the resolution at their
5 August 15th, 2017, meeting. Ms. Angerer, could you please
6 provide a summary of this item for us?

7 MS. ANGERER: Thank you, Madam Chair. And as
8 you can see from the resolution, it's pretty clear that
9 Plante Moran has had a positive working relationship with
10 the city, to provide financial expertise.

11 At this time, we are not on schedule for
12 preparing the audit, the annual audit, for the city. And
13 so, in bringing in Plante Moran, they'll help us with our
14 reports. Budget amendments, budget documents; oversee
15 bank reconciliations and for the general fund ledger.

16 As you can see from this agenda, we do not have
17 a cash flow report, nor do we have a general fund document
18 in here for you to review. Along with Plante Moran, a
19 later agenda item, voting on a chief financial officer,
20 I'm sure that would be -- comply with those things, as
21 well.

22 The State of Michigan, and on our weekly phone
23 call, we agreed -- I mean, had asked one week, and the
24 second week, agreed that they would fund the \$60,000 for
25 this contract.

1 MS. ROBERTS: So when would they start working?
2 MS. ANGERER: Once you approve them, I'll call
3 when I get back to the office, and they agreed to start
4 right after Labor Day. They have the staff available. So
5 right after Labor Day, that Tuesday, they would begin here
6 in the city.
7 MS. ROBERTS: And if they get started on Labor
8 Day, we will have for September, our --
9 MS. ANGERER: Yes. Yes.
10 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. So those are very
11 important; it's hard for us to know where the city is when
12 we don't have financial reports to tell us.
13 MS. ANGERER: And I appreciate your indulgence
14 over the last two months.
15 MR. BOGDAN: Question. If Plante Moran is going
16 to be doing financial administration work, does that
17 create a problem for them to do the audit?
18 MS. ANGERER: They are not the auditor.
19 MR. STEMA: They don't do the audit.
20 MR. BOGDAN: Oh they're not the auditors?
21 MS. ANGERER: Not the auditors.
22 MS. ROBERTS: That would create a problem.
23 MS. ANGERER: Yes. That would.
24 MR. BOGDAN: Thank you.
25 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to

1 approve, deny, or postpone Resolution 2017-62, awarding a
2 six-month contract with Plante Moran for financial
3 services.

4 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

5 MS. YOUNG: Support.

6 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

7 (No response)

8 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
9 say aye. Aye.

10 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

11 MR. STEMA: Aye.

12 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

13 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

14 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

15 (No response)

16 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

17 Next on the agenda is approval to hire one full
18 time police officer. Ms. Angerer, would you please
19 provide a summary of this item for the board?

20 MS. ANGERER: Thank you. And I'm going to defer
21 to the police chief, as she interviewed and did the
22 background checks on this individual.

23 MS. MOISE: Good afternoon.

24 THE BOARD: Good afternoon.

25 MS. MOISE: So we have a police officer

1 applicant, a Mr. Naseer Gola. He has successfully
2 completed the background and all pre-employment testing
3 requirements. He is ready for immediate hire; there is no
4 additional budget impact on his hiring, as he is filling a
5 vacancy in the police department.

6 MS. ROBERTS: How many vacancies do we have
7 after this?

8 MS. MOISE: I'm anticipating two to three.
9 We're still looking at our numbers, we're making sure that
10 we're bringing everybody up to staff, and trying to
11 replace a special assignment, that went to another
12 department, as well, so.

13 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to
14 approve, deny, or postpone hiring of one full time police
15 officer.

16 MR. BOGDAN: Motion to approve.

17 MR. STEMA: Second it.

18 MS. ROBERTS: Any further discussion?

19 (No response)

20 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
21 say aye. Aye.

22 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

23 MR. STEMA: Aye.

24 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

25 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

(No response)

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

Next on the agenda is approval to hire one full time firefighter. Ms. Angerer, will you please provide a summary of this item for the board?

MS. ANGERER: And I do want to be clear, when you look at that memo, that it is one fulltime firefighter that we are hiring, not 12, at this time.

MS. ROBERTS: I was wondering if 12 was a level.

MS. ANGERER: Yeah, I think that was the bracket there. But I would invite the fire chief to come up and speak to that position.

MR. HAGEN: Yeah, we have one left, not 12. He will be the last one in the pecking order. I know it's been a long process; there's no fault of this administration. We've gone through many people, many applicants, and for different reasons, background being the biggest one, or they just changed their mind, there's been a huge delay.

Once this individual is hired, we can then apply and receive stuff from the SAFER grant. That's been the holding pattern with the SAFER grant, is that you had to have all ducks in a row.

MS. ROBERTS: Okay.

1 MR. HAGEN: And this is the last person.

2 MR. STEMA: So for the SAFER grant to kick in,
3 and for us to receive reimbursement, you had to have 12?

4 MR. HAGEN: Well, you had to have 14.

5 MR. STEMA: Oh, 14, okay, and this put the -

6 MR. HAGEN: This is the guy. Last one.

7 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to
8 approve, deny, or postpone hiring one full time
9 firefighter.

10 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

11 MR. HAGEN: Thank you.

12 MR. BOGDAN: Second.

13 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

14 (No response)

15 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
16 say aye. Aye.

17 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

18 MR. STEMA: Aye.

19 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

20 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

21 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

22 (No response)

23 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries.

24 Had Next on the agenda is to approve hiring one
25 full time chief financial officer. Ms. Angerer, will

1 provide more than a summary of this item for us?

2 MS. ANGERER: Yes, I will. And I appreciate
3 your indulgence. I did check with legal as well as with
4 Treasury, before writing the memo that said I wasn't
5 giving you the name of the person. Because the applicant
6 did request confidentiality.

7 So with this item, you all know that we've been
8 without a controller for some time; position will be paid
9 out of the existing budget and will fill the need the city
10 has for a financial officer and controller.

11 And by the charter definition, the controller is
12 the chief financial officer of the city. This individual
13 has a Bachelor's Degree in accounting, Master's Degree in
14 finance, 20 plus years of municipal government accounting.
15 Member in good standing of MGFOA, as well as the national.

16 This will be a full-time position, and this
17 individual has begun the background investigation, pre-
18 employment requirements. And I'm asking to hire this
19 person. Now, as you'll see from the resume before you,
20 this person has been employed by the City of Hamtramck in
21 the past, and would be willing to come back again.

22 MS. ROBERTS: How many applicants did you have
23 for the position?

24 MS. ANGERER: We had about five.

25 MS. ROBERTS: How many did you interview?

1 MS. ANGERER: Only one. The others had had gaps
2 in their service, and this person has served in a failing
3 city, and came highly recommended. I made about 12 phone
4 calls; could be 11, could be 13. To other municipalities,
5 asking for recommendations. And in that, this person's
6 name came up four times, that may be ready to move, and
7 you know, that had been at recent meetings.

8 And since the city that the person had been
9 serving in was no longer under receivership or state
10 control in the same way, that the person might be
11 interested in coming here for a challenge. And when I
12 made the phone call, I found out that that was true.

13 MS. ROBERTS: So, did the person apply?

14 MS. ANGERER: Yes.

15 MR. BOGDAN: Why did she leave the first time?

16 MS. ANGERER: Because she had better opportunity
17 and more pay at the other city.

18 MR. BOGDAN: Okay.

19 MS. ANGERER: There was some discussion about
20 distance travel; that was something about, you know, was
21 also as a secondary, from home. But at this point, that's
22 no longer a concern, and she is interested in being our
23 controller. We are in great need, and she has the skill
24 set necessary.

25 MS. ROBERTS: And the compensation package is

1 what is budgeted?

2 MS. ANGERER: Correct.

3 MS. ROBERTS: Because this says total, including
4 pension and benefits.

5 MS. ANGERER: Yes. Yes.

6 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. And you said she has begun
7 the background check but hasn't finished?

8 MS. ANGERER: She did the drug testing; the
9 background check went out. The HR person is on vacation
10 this week, so I'm not -- I don't want to say that it has
11 come back. But I would ask that you would approve,
12 pending favorable outcome there.

13 MR. MCINERNEY: Say that again?

14 MS. ANGERER: I would ask that you would approve
15 this position, pending a favorable outcome from the
16 background check. If there's something that comes up that
17 is not, you know, if there's a history there that we're
18 unaware of at this time. Otherwise, I would ask that we
19 could hire the applicant immediately, upon completion of
20 that. I just don't know if that's in the inbox of the HR
21 director or on the desk; she's on vacation, started
22 yesterday.

23 MS. ROBERTS: Okay.

24 MS. ANGERER: We have not received the results
25 of that as of end of day Thursday.

1 MS. ROBERTS: Okay.

2 MR. STEMA: So you're only -- I understand there
3 were some gaps, but, normally you would interview a lot
4 more than one person for an important position like this.
5 Is it strictly because other people had time off, didn't
6 have the background, or -- it just seems really weird,
7 because on Tuesday when I was at the work session, you had
8 stated that you had interviewed one person, and you might
9 know what way you're going.

10 And then this shows up Friday. Any -- just
11 strictly because they had gaps? I mean, because normally
12 you interview a lot more people for a position like this;
13 I just wondered.

14 MS. ANGERER: I can understand your concern
15 there. I believe that this person has the skill set, has
16 the ability, and while I understand that at times, people
17 interview more people, it also was apparent that this
18 person has the ability, the training, the expertise, and
19 the desire to do this job. And I am recommending, with
20 the full appreciation of understanding your comment,
21 there.

22 MS. YOUNG: Well, would there be an opportunity
23 to interview the others who also applied?

24 MS. ANGERER: There's always an opportunity for
25 that, Ms. Young. When this person was interviewed, they

1 had stellar background, excellent skills, and I saw
2 nothing about the person's expertise that said any red
3 flag or caution.

4 MS. ROBERTS: Was there an interview panel, or,
5 are we still --

6 MS. ANGERER: No, it just was with two people,
7 and this individual.

8 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. So who was the other person
9 that sat on the interview panel?

10 MS. ANGERER: The HR director discussed it with
11 us.

12 MS. ROBERTS: The HR director here?

13 MS. ANGERER: She's not, she's on vacation this
14 week.

15 MS. ROBERTS: Oh that's right, she's on
16 vacation.

17 MR. BOGDAN: I guess I would think that you also
18 have some experience with the person working in Hamtramck?

19 MS. ANGERER: Correct. That's correct. And I
20 know, I mean, I was not in the position to evaluate that
21 at that time. And at that time, the person was going to
22 accept the job at the other city, as I understand it.
23 Sooner rather than later. And she ended up staying
24 longer, so there was no rush to have the person leave or,
25 you know, it was mutually agreed upon to finish out the

1 duties.

2 MR. STEMA: Do you know why she left the Charter
3 Township of Independence? Because she was there for a
4 long time; left to come to Hamtramck, and then lasted
5 basically six months here before she went off to her next
6 job.

7 MS. ANGERER: I don't recall it exactly. I
8 don't recall the exact reason for that, from talking about
9 it, so I apologize, Mark. I don't have an exact answer to
10 that. Was not a negative, in there.

11 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to
12 approve, deny, or postpone hiring one full time chief
13 financial officer.

14 MR. STEMA: Make a motion to postpone until they
15 pass background test. I don't think we should do it on
16 contingency, or anything like that. I think it should be
17 brought back.

18 MS. ROBERTS: Is there a second?

19 MR. MCINERNEY: Support.

20 MS. ROBERTS: All those in favor say aye. Aye.

21 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

22 MR. STEMA: Aye.

23 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

24 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

25 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

1 (No response)

2 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries, to postpone.

3 Next on the agenda is approval of the citywide
4 overtime report. Ms. Angerer, could you please provide a
5 summary of the progress the city is making in regards to
6 this issue?

7 MS. ANGERER: Certainly.

8 Madam Chair, can I ask a question?

9 MS. ROBERTS: Mm-hm.

10 MS. ANGERER: In the postponement, the direction
11 is that the background check become more clear?

12 MR. STEMA: Yes.

13 MS. ANGERER: I just want to make sure I
14 understood the motion.

15 MR. STEMA: Background check, and it probably
16 wouldn't hurt to interview a few more people, just in
17 case, to make sure you get the right one.

18 MS. ANGERER: You didn't indicate that in the
19 motion, so I just wanted to be clear.

20 MR. STEMA: No, I would say a couple more
21 people, probably, should be talked to. If this is the
22 best one, and the background check, and -- that's fine.

23 MS. ANGERER: Thank you. So. Overtime report.
24 Sorry for the delay. So our current month overtime hours,
25 as you see, the totals, we still continue to have issues

1 with overtime. And I did ask the police chief to speak to
2 that at this meeting, if she would.

3 MS. MOISE: So, as we continue to hire more
4 police officers, and filling those vacancies, I anticipate
5 that this will continue to lower the overtime as it
6 relates to manpower. With the understanding that
7 emergencies arise, there will be opportunities for
8 overtime on an emergency basis.

9 And as we have issues that come up that require
10 our special attention, we may have to focus our direct
11 patrols, in certain situations, that arise, so that you're
12 going to see some overtime with that as well, but I'm
13 hoping, with the continuing filling vacancies, that you
14 will see an overall decrease in overtime.

15 MS. ROBERTS: Any questions?

16 (No response)

17 MS. ROBERTS: I would entertain a motion to
18 approve, deny, or postpone the citywide overtime report.

19 MR. STEMA: Motion to approve.

20 MR. MCINERNEY: Support.

21 MS. ROBERTS: Any discussion?

22 (No response)

23 MS. ROBERTS: Seeing none, all those in favor
24 say aye. Aye.

25 MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

1 MR. STEMA: Aye.

2 MS. YOUNG: Aye.

3 MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

4 MS. ROBERTS: Opposed, the same.

5 (No response)

6 MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. Next on the
7 agenda is the 31st District Court revenues. This is for
8 information only; does anyone have any questions?

9 (No response)

10 MS. ROBERTS: Board comment? Would anyone on
11 the board like to speak?

12 MR. STEMA: I actually just have questions about
13 the computer purchase? It seems pretty cut and dry to me,
14 and all that. I mean, I agree, read, you know, what we're
15 supposed to be approved and what's not, and it really
16 doesn't say the board's supposed to approve that. If
17 there's something internally, with the city, or anything
18 like that, then I will have a couple questions for
19 Katrina, too. Yeah, yeah, you go first, and then --

20 MS. ANGERER: So, upon taking the office of
21 acting city manager, John Clark came to me and said that
22 he had been asked on more than one occasion, to sign this
23 agreement. And he was uncomfortable signing the
24 agreement. And asked me, you know, to comment on it.
25 Even asked by the administrative assistant, you know,

1 could you sign this, could you sign this?

2 And so, and I think it was on two occasions.
3 And so, we sat together, we read through it; he said he
4 was not comfortable signing it. Whether or not there was
5 something that took place between the former city manager
6 and the attorney and/or the state on a phone call, I'm
7 unaware of that.

8 He did say that he was asked about it, but he,
9 I'm not going to say his words, but he did not agree to
10 sign the document that turned this over. So with that, I
11 sat on it for a while, because it was like I didn't want
12 to deal with it. And then he came to me and said that he
13 had received a text from the former city manager, asking
14 for his client to deposit the check.

15 So, in looking at this, he recommended that
16 because of the final order, where it says review and
17 recommend approval of all asset sales, that whether or not
18 this met the criteria of an asset at the \$10,000 range,
19 that it was a sensitive item, and that he would write a
20 letter to the former city manager, stating that it could
21 be returned through the city police chief. And that the
22 check would remain uncashed, and returned.

23 MS. ROBERTS: Does anybody have the final order
24 with them? Because I don't think that --

25 MS. POWELL: It's in your packet.

1 MS. ROBERTS: Well, that's just a section; I
2 don't think that's --

3 MS. POWELL: That's the section that he's
4 referencing.

5 MS. ROBERTS: I know it's the section that's
6 referenced, but I want to see what's before that.

7 MR. STEMA: And the purchasing agent came up
8 with the price, and all that? It was purchased '17.

9 MS. POWELL: Correct. So, as I stated during my
10 public comment, I discussed this with the state as well as
11 the chairman. Because I was concerned about the political
12 climate, and what was happening. Even though I had full
13 authority to sign off on the purchase without any
14 approvals from anyone, I didn't feel comfortable doing
15 that.

16 So I jumped through numerous hoops to do that.
17 The purchasing agent and as well as the attorney, you have
18 text messages there. Between the city attorney and I,
19 stating that he would sign it, that it wasn't perfect and
20 he wasn't crazy about it, but he was on the road. If it
21 needed to be signed, he'd sign it. And that the language
22 on the memo was not as important as the verification of
23 sale price, and verification that all the city information
24 had been properly downloaded and secured on the city's
25 server.

1 I said I agree, I will have them sign it, that
2 they've secured everything, and that the price is correct.
3 I'm not doing that. And he said, you better not, LOL.
4 And I said really, I would never. I've included the
5 original receipts. The city typically, an asset is
6 something that's \$5,000 or over. A \$1200 computer is not
7 an asset, not in any organization.

8 This is -- we, regularly, get rid of surplus.
9 Desks, computers, file cabinets, et cetera. Ms. Angerer
10 has gotten rid of quite a few in her few years that she
11 has been here. So I didn't see, and the city attorney had
12 ample opportunity to speak to this prior to my leaving.

13 You will see from the text messages that we
14 spoke more than ten days before I left here. If he had an
15 issue with it, he could have addressed it at that time.
16 Since I sent him the additional text messages that you
17 see, I've heard nothing.

18 This is a -- this is a normal approval, that the
19 city manager can make, but I went above and beyond, and
20 took my hand out of it, and put it in the hands of others
21 to decide. What the price should be, what the memo should
22 say, and who should sign it. It was only at the
23 recommendation of the state and the board chairman, during
24 our conversation, that we include the city attorney. That
25 was just a recommendation; it wasn't a requirement.

1 I felt that the requirement should have been the
2 mayor, as she's the chief executive officer. And the
3 computer program, the IT staff, because they wiped my
4 computer clean, and saved everything to the server, as
5 well as my emails. An asset would be a computer server,
6 not a computer. That's a surplus item, that we throw
7 away.

8 MR. STEMA: The purchasing agent is here,
9 correct?

10 MS. POWELL: She is.

11 MR. STEMA: Did you prepare the document, price
12 and all that, come up with the price, and all that?

13 MS. CHASE: I came up with the price, but not
14 the document that was signed by the mayor.

15 MR. STEMA: Yeah, but you came up with the
16 price, right?

17 MS. POWELL: Purchasing agreement --

18 MR. STEMA: But you came up with the price,
19 right, you did your due diligence, to look up, to see what
20 was the price?

21 MS. CHASE: I came up with the price. I went on
22 the internet, to find out what a computer, the exact
23 computer itself, one that's used. I got, I think, five of
24 those amounts, and averaged those amounts.

25 MS. POWELL: And that's on the invoice that she

1 wrote.

2 MS. ROBERTS: The section that the attorney, the
3 city attorney, is referencing, it is part of, the mayor
4 and council shall implement all of the following best
5 practices within the city. So, what best practices did
6 the mayor and the council implement, in regards to the
7 sale of assets?

8 MS. ANGERER: If there are any, I'm unaware.

9 MS. ROBERTS: Okay. So, it was not -- it does
10 not appear that this is an RTAB approval that was needed.
11 So I think the -- the city needs to --

12 MR. STEMA: It's pretty cut and dried.

13 MS. ROBERTS: Yeah. Figure out what the best
14 practices should have been. And if there aren't any in
15 place --

16 MS. POWELL: Which is why I did all of this.
17 Because there is nothing, and I wanted to make sure that
18 everyone was covered. There was nothing about it, so,
19 thank you.

20 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you. Any further board
21 comment? Seeing none, I would entertain a motion to
22 adjourn.

23 MR. STEMA: Motion to adjourn.

24 MS. YOUNG: Second.

25 MS. ROBERTS: All those in favor say aye. Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MR. BOGDAN: Aye.

MR. STEMA: Aye.

MS. YOUNG: Aye.

MR. McINERNEY: Aye.

MS. ROBERTS: Motion carries. The meeting is
adjourned; it is about 1:32.

(Proceedings adjourned at 1:32 p.m.)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATE OF MICHIGAN
COUNTY OF WASHTENAW) .ss

I certify that this transcript is a complete, true, and correct transcript to the best of my ability of the RTAB meeting held on August 22nd, 2017, City of Hamtramck. I also certify that I am not a relative or employee of the parties involved and have no financial interest in this case.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED: August 29, 2017

s/ Amy Shankleton-Novess

Amy Shankleton-Novess (CER 0838)
Certified Electronic Reporter