

City of Ecorse

Receivership Transition Advisory Board Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, October 10th, 2017

Ecorse City Hall

Council Chambers

Albert B. Buday Civic Center

3869 West Jefferson

Ecorse, Michigan 48229

**RTAB MEMBERS PRESENT:**

**JEFF SYKES**

**ROBERT BOVITZ**

**JOAN BROPHY**

**Also Present:**

**ERIC CLINE**

**Michigan Department of Treasury**

Reported by:

Nina Lunsford (CER 4539)

Modern Court Reporting & Video, LLC

SCAO FIRM NO. 08228

101-A North Lewis Street

Saline, Michigan 48176

(734) 429-9143/nel

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

**Called to order at 9:08 a.m.**

**Tuesday, October 10, 2017 - Ecorse, Michigan**

**\* \* \* \* \***

MR. SYKES: Shall we do a call to order? Can we get a roll call?

MR. CLINE: All right. Jeff Sykes?

MR. SYKES: Here.

MR. CLINE: Rob Bovitz?

MR. BOVITZ: Here.

MR. CLINE: Joan Brophy.

MS. BROPHY: Here.

MR. CLINE: Quorum present.

MR. SYKES: Thank you.

All right, next item is the approval of the agenda. So I'll entertain a motion to approve the agenda as presented.

MR. BOVITZ: So moved.

MS. BROPHY: Support.

MR. SYKES: All those in favor, say aye. Aye.

MR. BOVITZ: Aye.

MS. BROPHY: Aye.

MR. SYKES: Those opposed, the same.

(No response)

MR. SYKES: The agenda is approved.

At this point, I'd like to remind the audience,

1 if you intend to speak during the public comment portion  
2 of the meeting, it'll be necessary for you to sign in at  
3 the sheet located at the podium.

4 Next, we have the approval of RTAB minutes of  
5 September 12th, 2017, so with that, I'll entertain a  
6 motion to approve the September 12th, 2017, RTAB minutes  
7 as presented.

8 MS. BROPHY: So moved.

9 MR. BOVITZ: Support.

10 MR. SYKES: All those in favor, say aye. Aye.

11 MR. BOVITZ: Aye.

12 MS. BROPHY: Aye.

13 MR. SYKES: Those opposed the same.

14 (No response)

15 MR. SYKES: They have passed.

16 Next, we have old business, which there is none.  
17 So we will now move on to new business. The first item we  
18 have here is the approval of resolutions and ordinances  
19 for city council meetings. First resolution, resolutions  
20 from the regular city council meeting of August 29th,  
21 2017. I'd also like to point out that the Resolution 623  
22 was approved at our last board meeting. Are there any  
23 comments? I have a few questions, but do you guys have  
24 any questions or comments?

25 MS. BROPHY: No, go ahead.

1 MR. BOVITZ: Well, the city attorney's report; I  
2 don't know if that's one of the ones you're going to  
3 comment on.

4 MR. SYKES: No, go ahead.

5 MR. BOVITZ: Yeah, just -- throughout the last  
6 couple meetings, there were some things that that we've  
7 wanted some more update. I was hoping that the city  
8 attorney would be here in the future, to answer some  
9 questions here on the lawsuits or like these opting out of  
10 the medical marijuana law, things like that.

11 MR. SYKES: Okay, so is the idea here to request  
12 that the city attorney shows up for the next meeting?

13 MR. BOVITZ: Or at least a representative of the  
14 legal department.

15 MR. SYKES: Okay. Can we put that on record?

16 MR. CLINE: Certainly.

17 MR. SYKES: Perfect. Okay, I do have a couple  
18 of questions. Tim, if you could address these? One of  
19 them is number 621, which is the renewable of insurance.  
20 And I'm just, out of curiosity, is there a big process for  
21 that, or is it just a negotiation?

22 MR. SADOWSKI: Yeah, so, the city tried to get  
23 insurance bids for the last three years. There is only  
24 one company that will insure the City of Ecorse, which is  
25 Old Republic, unfortunately. All the others declined.

1           MR. SYKES: So there is, I mean, so, obviously,  
2           it sounds like they're making an attempt; they're just  
3           getting the --

4           MR. SADOWSKI: That's been my project since I  
5           started. We don't have commercial insurance, we have  
6           excess surplus insurance line here, so, every claim is  
7           insured once you reach the \$150,000 threshold. The city  
8           pays the first \$150,000 on each claim and if the city was  
9           able to go to a commercial policy, the premiums would  
10          almost reduce by half.

11          The city is not in a place to get that. There's  
12          numerous reasons, most of them being public safety. This  
13          year public safety was uninsurable for the City of Ecorse;  
14          every other department was able to be insured. And if you  
15          look at our loss history in public safety, you'll see why  
16          that is. It's pretty evident.

17          MR. SYKES: Okay.

18          MR. SADOWSKI: We've had two in just the last  
19          five years. Nobody wants to insure us.

20          MR. SYKES: Okay. Do you guys have any --

21          MR. BOVITZ: Well, it's a half a million dollar  
22          contract, and I know that it's not -- can't be necessarily  
23          comparing apples to apples, because it's sort of a  
24          complete policy, and other insurance company -- carriers,  
25          won't even touch it.

1           Just, things I've noted, like an auto -- on a  
2 vehicle, very comprehensive, when you actually carry all  
3 these vehicles. Hopefully you have a good maintenance  
4 department, because some of these vehicles are so old to  
5 actually insure. You know, I could go way back, and I  
6 know Gallagher appears to be pretty comprehensive and all;  
7 you actually have the clause, the anti-terrorism, things  
8 like that, which may be new to what other policies would  
9 normally cover. So, any comment on that?

10           MR. SADOWSKI: So, the same for the auto policy,  
11 under that, is at \$150,000, so it's basically non-  
12 existent. Last year, the city was able to get an  
13 additional policy just for auto, and that is separate, so  
14 that premium was reduced by \$10,000.

15           The only reason why it was part of the bid  
16 package is because it was part last year. So they just,  
17 it's an identical proposal as last year. There are no  
18 changes, all they did was copy and paste it from last  
19 year.

20           So, because the city was able for the first time  
21 to get auto coverage, real, commercial auto insurance,  
22 that was removed from the bid, so that was actually --  
23 that proposal was \$10,000 less. So we have, actually, if  
24 somebody gets in a vehicle, we have insurance now.  
25 Starting from zero, up. All our policies are \$500, \$500

1 for comprehensive, \$500 deductible for collision, for any  
2 new vehicle 2016 or newer.

3 So we've put that policy in place. I don't know  
4 if you can recall, but we had a police car totaled by an  
5 ambulance right out front here, and we just took the loss.  
6 Because it's under \$150,000, so we put that in place. I  
7 put that in place last year.

8 MR. SYKES: Okay.

9 MR. BOVITZ: But a terrorism insurance -- it's  
10 interesting, reading about the United States government  
11 actually reimbursing; do you have any input on that?

12 MR. SADOWSKI: The terrorist coverage, the city  
13 has opted out every year except for this year, I put opted  
14 in. I selected to opt in for terrorism coverage.

15 MR. BOVITZ: Would that include our private  
16 businesses, like National Steel, U.S. Steel, because of --

17 MR. SADOWSKI: It would just cover this  
18 building, mostly, our infrastructure, the water mains, et  
19 cetera. So this building's valued at seven and a half  
20 million dollars, to replace. If it was an act of  
21 terrorism, somebody comes and shoots it up or blows it up,  
22 that's an act of terrorism; it wouldn't be covered.

23 Obviously, it's -- if you want to pay for that  
24 sort of expense you know.

25 MR. BOVITZ: Well and in a similar manner, too,

1 with the security cameras at the station, for remote  
2 monitoring, but also for security, I would imagine, right?

3 MR. SADOWSKI: Yes. So we have numerous  
4 stations. We have pump houses, we have lift stations, any  
5 of those could be subject to terrorism. I've been doing  
6 this 14 years, you know, things happen. Things have been  
7 sabotaged. I mean, we've had people go and sabotage all  
8 the fire hydrants with a wrench. Remove them all, and try  
9 to break the system, before.

10 I mean, we've had -- I've seen all kinds of  
11 stuff, so, it's whether you want to opt in or opt out of  
12 terrorism, and what terrorism is defined as today. It's  
13 probably above my scope for insurance, but it's not  
14 uncommon for police to face terrorism today, and it's been  
15 brought up, other police stations have been assaulted with  
16 AK-47s in the downtown, downriver area, in Detroit.

17 That's why we did the upgraded for the --  
18 upgraded the front central dispatch. That was not  
19 bulletproof until I implemented that this year. They had  
20 one pane that was bulletproof glass, and all the rest  
21 wasn't. So, I mean, we're just going to take the risk.

22 MR. SYKES: Okay. Are there any questions on  
23 621?

24 MR. BOVITZ: Well, just the boat dock -- it was  
25 approving the scrapping the trailer that could not be



1 repaired. How did, was there much usage of the public  
2 access this year, at the boat launch?

3 MR. SADOWSKI: We -- the pay gain happened  
4 later. The city brought in \$14,000 in revenue.

5 MR. BOVITZ: That's not that much, right?

6 MR. SADOWSKI: It's not that much; it is more  
7 than the previous year's. Previous year's, the city only  
8 collected \$6,000 for rent. And everything else was profit  
9 for the person that ran it. This year, there is no person  
10 running it. We paid for the teller, the automatic  
11 machine, ATM, to collect the fees.

12 So that expense has been recaptured, so now  
13 everything is, you could say, profit. But there's still  
14 operating costs, you know, such as, you know, bank service  
15 charges and cable down there to run the cameras. We have  
16 security cameras.

17 So there's still, there's still costs. But that  
18 larger expense, for paying somebody to be down there, has  
19 been gone. Has been eliminated by the budget. So we have  
20 recouped those costs, so going forward, they'll be more  
21 profitable.

22 MR. BOVITZ: I just hate to see you cutting  
23 quality of life for the residents, you know, it has one  
24 for boaters and fishermen. But also then with the DTE,  
25 with the concession facility -- now, that's in the park,

1 right? That's a separate location? Where the -- the  
2 explosion in the bathroom?

3 MR. SADOWSKI: Yeah, so that was at the Dingell  
4 Park restroom, so Dingell Park, right on the river there,  
5 the new facility is up, and has not -- it does not have a  
6 certificate of occupancy. Because they have a punch list,  
7 a final punch list, to finish. But they have their  
8 temporary certificate of occupancy.

9 That is -- was paid for by DTE. But they're  
10 talking about removing the concession stand; it's a  
11 trailer. It's a trailer that sits at the boat launch,  
12 that a person that rented the facility would sit there and  
13 run their side business. Snacks, lure, baits, out of.

14 That's pretty ran down, so they voted to have  
15 that removed from the site. It was more like blight than  
16 it is like a -- it's not being used now. It's more like a  
17 rundown trailer sitting on the city boat launch.

18 MR. SYKES: Thank you. So I'll entertain a  
19 motion to approve the remaining resolutions; the remaining  
20 being all of them but 623, which was approved at the last  
21 board meeting, from the regular city council meeting of  
22 August 29th, 2017.

23 MR. BOVITZ: So moved.

24 MS. BROPHY: Support.

25 MR. SYKES: All those in favor, say aye. Aye.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. BOVITZ: Aye.

MS. BROPHY: Aye.

MR. SYKES: Those opposed, the same.

(No response)

MR. SYKES: These resolutions have been approved.

Next, we have the resolutions from regular city council meeting, September 12th, 2017. Are there any questions? Issues? Okay, I'll entertain a motion to approve the resolutions from regular city council meeting of September 12th, 2017.

MS. BROPHY: So moved.

MR. BOVITZ: Support.

MR. SYKES: All those in favor, say aye. Aye.

MR. BOVITZ: Aye.

MS. BROPHY: Aye.

MR. SYKES: Those opposed the same.

(No response)

MR. SYKES: These resolutions have passed.

Last, we have the claims and accounts from regular city council meeting draft minutes of September 26th, 2017. With that, I'll entertain a motion to approve the claims and accounts from the regular city council meeting draft minutes of September 26th, 2017.

MR. BOVITZ: So moved.

1 MS. BROPHY: Support.

2 MR. SYKES: All those in favor, say aye. Aye.

3 MR. BOVITZ: And that was one of the things that  
4 came up at that meeting, which we'll talk about at the  
5 next meeting, so I was -- I am requesting that a  
6 representative from the attorney can be here to talk about  
7 the Resolution 651, particularly.

8 MR. SYKES: Okay.

9 MR. BOVITZ: Well, 652.

10 MS. BROPHY: And 652.

11 MR. SYKES: Okay. All right, noted.

12 All right, next we have the city administrator  
13 items. First we have approval of city council meetings;  
14 this was addressed in new business. Next we have approval  
15 of budget to actual, July and August. Just, can I get --  
16 Tim, do you have a summary that you can discuss a little  
17 bit about the budget to actual?

18 MR. SADOWSKI: So, yes, I -- I thought I filed  
19 one for July, and you guys told me I didn't, and I didn't.  
20 So, that was my mistake. That's why you didn't receive  
21 one, because I thought I did it. So, I went back, and it  
22 did make sense, so I have them both together.

23 And they're together, pretty much tax revenues  
24 were only 11 percent. Currently we're at 70 percent,  
25 which is much lower than we -- we closed at almost 84

1 percent last year, but currently we're only to 70 percent.  
2 And now they're delinquent, for summer. So, collections  
3 through the end of February; hopefully it comes up. But  
4 it's at 70 percent.

5 The DPW staffing for seasonal has been  
6 terminated. That notice has gone out, and Friday will be  
7 their last day, to cut the budgeting cost for landscapers.  
8 And so we're going forward with that.

9 MR. SYKES: Can I ask -- so, is there something  
10 that's taking place different? Was there something that  
11 was done in the past for collecting delinquent taxes,  
12 that's not being done, or is this just -- it's just what's  
13 taking place?

14 MR. SADOWSKI: It's just what's taking place.  
15 So, what happens now, taxes are due, you know, September  
16 14th. If they -- if they don't pay them, they get the  
17 interest and penalty. Penalty's three percent, one time;  
18 interest is one percent per month.

19 If they don't pay by February 28th, they get  
20 rolled over to Wayne County delinquent. Wayne County  
21 settles with us June 30th. Well, they settle before; they  
22 don't pay us until June 30th. And they deduct any  
23 captures they have taken in between March and June, when  
24 they actually write out the check. So we get a net check.

25 Everything they write up, except for personal

1 property tax. It's due to the fact that they basically  
2 eliminate a personal property tax. It's really not the  
3 ideal. So what we're dealing with now is, real  
4 properties, mostly residential and small commercial, that  
5 are not paying their real property taxes.

6 We jumped from, what did I say, 11 to 70  
7 percent, is our largest taxpayer, U.S. Steel, paid their  
8 bill. Like I said, it was going to jump up. U.S. Steel  
9 always pays their tax bill on time, the last, almost the  
10 last day, just like they pay their water bill at the last  
11 day. But they always pay.

12 So, we jumped up to 70 percent. So the  
13 delinquency is basically the residential, and small  
14 commercial, that are not paying their real property taxes.  
15 And that has been going down year, after year, after year.  
16 And I brought up that eventually, you will tax your  
17 residents to death, to the point that they will not pay  
18 their taxes because they're too high. People can't afford  
19 them.

20 And we've gone to that point, any time I raise  
21 the taxes, the tax collections drop. So you're at a  
22 tilting point. I know U.S. Steel's going to pay, they're  
23 our largest taxpayers, so if I keep increasing it, yes,  
24 I'm going to get U.S. Steel to pay their taxes. I'm going  
25 to get a drop on the residential side; does one outweigh

1 the other?

2 Then you get into do I really want to foreclose  
3 properties because of tax rates? So you go into the  
4 circle of what is just and what is not just. But that's  
5 why the delinquency rate's going down; it's residential  
6 properties not paying their taxes. Unfortunately, that's  
7 what it is.

8 When I talk about the Dingell Park restroom,  
9 that had been -- that money was collected through DTE.  
10 The city still has some escrows, which we're due to  
11 overcharge it, and some over -- some change orders will  
12 use most of that up. So there's very little left in the  
13 escrow fund.

14 The city will probably use those remaining funds  
15 for landscaping. Because it was a part of the specs. And  
16 if you look out there, there's no landscaping. So you got  
17 this nice building with no -- it's just like, you know,  
18 the grass is already dead. There's no trees, there's no  
19 plants, no -- I would imagine that's what they'll probably  
20 do, in spring, with the extra money. With that building.

21 And also, basically budget amendment number one,  
22 budget to actual, the real point that the city does not  
23 know, is the special assessment for the local community  
24 stabilization share. Are we going to receive that  
25 overpayment again? And that will be the big question;

1 they're supposed to make that payment in November. They  
2 postponed it until December last year -- that would be the  
3 Michigan Department of Treasury.

4 So when the city receives that payment,  
5 hopefully we'll receive another overpayment, which will,  
6 then all of our revenue numbers will be set. The only  
7 adjustment for the year will be expenditures. Because the  
8 tax roll has been set. And the tax roll is most of our  
9 revenue, so once I get the special assessment revenue from  
10 the Michigan Department of Treasury, through the local  
11 community stabilization share, the revenues will be set  
12 for this fiscal year.

13 It will be, you know, over 90 percent of the  
14 revenues will be set. The only thing that will adjust is  
15 service costs. Fines and fees and forfeitures, for  
16 police; tickets. Very minimal.

17 And as far as the expenses, we always budget --  
18 I always budget very conservatively, so there's always  
19 room for adjustments, like I said. I use the incremental  
20 approach.

21 MR. BOVITZ: Well, we got a \$10 million budget,  
22 and a third of that is local community stabilization,  
23 revenue sharing from the state -- is that, that's expected  
24 to come in eventually?

25 MR. SYKES: That payment is supposed to be made



1 November, every November, by statute. And they push it  
2 off until December, because of a phase in of the program.  
3 That's what they said. They had to cut their --

4 MR. BOVITZ: So they're accountable now, for  
5 December, it's not just a dream?

6 MR. SADOWSKI: Those are accountable dollars;  
7 however, last year, we received an overpayment. The city  
8 budgeted 95 percent capture. And the city got a 260  
9 percent capture. So we took that extra percentage and  
10 transferred that money to MERS. And that's why we went  
11 from 30, 31 percent funded, all the way up to 40 percent.  
12 Is because we took that special assessment money and  
13 diverted it all to MERS. Anything that was non-  
14 restricted, in the city operating fund.

15 The city would like to do that again, or, either  
16 they would like to make that payment towards the emergency  
17 loans. Because in the five-year forecast, that is the  
18 hard expense. The city does not have the funds to pay  
19 back the emergency loans.

20 So if the city starts making early payments now,  
21 which is allowed under the agreement, that would reduce  
22 the obligation in the future, which would make it more  
23 easy. Obviously, the city doesn't expect our finances to  
24 get better, since our tax bases continues to go down.

25 So, if we can make additional payments with any

1 excess funds we have now, it will make the future easier  
2 for whoever's in office, in 2021. Whoever it is.

3 MR. SYKES: Right.

4 MR. SADOWSKI: So that was the --

5 MR. BOVITZ: The audit's coming along. I'm sure  
6 there'll be some audit recommendations along those lines.

7 MR. SADOWSKI: There will be audit  
8 recommendations. They have started their audit. The last  
9 three days I came in, our BS&A accounting software has  
10 been, server has been down. I even came in over the  
11 weekend to do worksheets, and it was still down.

12 So, it has been very challenging, to say the  
13 least, because every time I go to work on the audit, I  
14 can't. And IT services, if you read my city administrator  
15 report that's been in there for the last three months,  
16 that, it's non-existent. So, it's frustrating.

17 MR. BOVITZ: And it's one of the things I've  
18 noticed, the Department 171 executive and 223 controller,  
19 because of your situation, looks like you need to make  
20 some adjusting journal entries between the controller  
21 department executive, because right now there's nothing to  
22 charge against executive salaries for the year.

23 MR. SADOWSKI: There has been nothing charged  
24 for the executive salaries for the year. They have all  
25 been allocated to finance. They could be broken back out

1 into executive salaries. But you're correct; they have  
2 all been charged to finance.

3 MR. BOVITZ: Okay. You're aware, I just wanted  
4 to let you know.

5 MR. SADOWSKI: They have all been charged to  
6 finance, that budget has been still left. So when they  
7 combine the positions, I never reduced the budget.

8 MR. BOVITZ: Right.

9 MR. SADOWSKI: And on top of that, I increased  
10 the finance budget to pay for both the combination shares.  
11 So there's more than enough money to hire two people. So,  
12 I don't know, if you were aware of that or not, but I  
13 never reduced the budget, to put the city in a spot that  
14 it could never fill those positions.

15 I actually increased the budget in both line  
16 items, so they were not paying either of those positions  
17 \$100,000 a year when they left. They were paying me 76,  
18 and they were paying the city administrator 95. And so if  
19 I have \$122,000 in finance for the city controller, and  
20 \$100,000 in city administrator, you should be fine.

21 MR. SYKES: Okay. Any other questions? All  
22 right, I'll entertain a motion to approve the budget to  
23 actual reports for July and August.

24 MS. BROPHY: So moved.

25 MR. BOVITZ: Support.

1 MR. SYKES: All those in favor, say aye. Aye.

2 MR. BOVITZ: Aye.

3 MS. BROPHY: Aye.

4 MR. SYKES: Those opposed the same.

5 (No response)

6 MR. SYKES: All right, these have been approved.

7 Next, we move on to the approval of Gallagher  
8 and Company insurance proposal; this was addressed in new  
9 business. Next, we have the approval to make part time  
10 employee Tracie full time. This was also approved in new  
11 business. Feel free, if you guys have something to speak  
12 up on. Okay.

13 MR. BOVITZ: Don't worry, I won't be shy.

14 MR. SYKES: Okay. Approval of investing surplus  
15 funds in tax-exempt investments. This was addressed in  
16 new business. Next we have the approval of installation  
17 of security system in pump station. Again, this was  
18 addressed in new business.

19 Then we have the approval of the 2017-2018  
20 budget amendment number one, which was addressed in new  
21 business. Last, we have checks released and this is  
22 information only. So with that, we'll move on to public  
23 comment.

24 MR. CLINE: One public comment; Mr. Sadowski.

25 MR. SADOWSKI: Hello.

1 MR. SYKES: Yes.

2 MR. SADOWSKI: I'm Tim Sadowski. As I'm sure  
3 you've been informed, I have put in my notice at the end  
4 of September, and so this would make my last RTAB board  
5 meeting. I don't know if you knew that or not. So, I'm  
6 hopeful that the city will move forward with interviews,  
7 and the candidate selection posting was through October  
8 7th. And that has been closed.

9 So there has been, the city has received four  
10 applicants that have governmental experience for city  
11 administrator, and two that have governmental experience  
12 for city controller. And those names are on the -- have  
13 been prepared for the city council tonight.

14 I hope that they will schedule interviews and  
15 move forward, because there's still the day to day  
16 operations. Just would like to thank you for letting me  
17 work here for the last two years. That's actually over  
18 two years; August 24th was my two years. So, it's been a  
19 challenge. I've learned a lot, and thank you for letting  
20 me serve for the last two years.

21 MR. SYKES: Thank you.

22 MR. BOVITZ: That was news to me -- I wasn't  
23 aware the you'd put in notice. Were you aware, Joan?

24 MS. BROPHY: I actually found out this morning,  
25 because I was here early, but, yeah, so --

1 MR. BOVITZ: Yeah, just when we finally get  
2 things going.

3 MS. BROPHY: I know.

4 MS. LAZO: (From audience) That's how we feel.  
5 So if we're voting, I'd like to put a "not", and note of  
6 that.

7 MR. BOVITZ: Don't let Tim leave? Or just let  
8 him resign as one or the other, but not both?

9 MS. LAZO: He's done a good job.

10 MR. BOVITZ: Yeah. Well, we've been through  
11 some lean times, and some tension. And so we want to see  
12 the positive vibes, that Tim has created here, continue.

13 FEMALE FROM AUDIENCE: That's why he shouldn't  
14 leave.

15 MR. SYKES: All right, so to end this awkward  
16 moment, we'll move to board comment.

17 MS. OLIVER: Thank you Tim, for all you've done  
18 for us.

19 MR. SYKES: Any board comment?

20 MR. BOVITZ: No.

21 MS. BROPHY: No.

22 MR. SYKES: All right, I guess, then, we have  
23 adjournment. I'll entertain a motion for adjournment.

24 MR. BOVITZ: So moved.

25 MS. BROPHY: Support.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. SYKES: All those in favor, say aye. Aye.  
MR. BOVITZ: Aye.  
MS. BROPHY: Aye.  
MR. SYKES: We are adjourned.  
(Proceedings conclude at 9:37 a.m.)

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

STATE OF MICHIGAN  
COUNTY OF WASHTENAW ) .ss

I certify that this transcript is a complete, true, and correct transcript to the best of my ability of the RTAB meeting held on October 10, 2017, City of Ecorse. I also certify that I am not a relative or employee of the parties involved and have no financial interest in this case.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED: October 16, 2017

*s/ Amy Shankleton-Novess*

---

Amy Shankleton-Novess (CER 0838)  
Certified Electronic Reporter